

**THE IMPACT OF THE INTERVENTION OF NGOs AND CBOs ON
LESOTHO'S GOVERNANCE**

AN ANALYSIS OF THE IMPACT OF INTERVENTION OF NON-GOVERNMENTAL
ORGANISATIONS AND COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANISATIONS ON LESOTHO'S
GOVERNANCE PROCESSES

BY

SEEMOLA. S. KOALI

Student Number: 2020895450

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements in respect of the Master of Arts in
Governance and Political Transformation

in the

Faculty of the Humanities

at the

University of the Free State

Supervisor: Dr T Coetzee

2023

DECLARATION

I, Seemola Sylvia Koali, declare that this study, The impact of the intervention of NGOs and CBOs on the governance of Lesotho, is my own work. I declare that the master's mini dissertation for the degree in Governance and Political Transformation at the University of the Free State is my original and independent work that I have not previously submitted for a qualification at another institution of higher education. All citations and references used throughout the study have been acknowledged according.

I declare that I am aware that the research may only be published with the Dean's approval.

Signed:

Seemola Sylvia Koali (2020895450) _____ Date _____

I confirm that the work reported in this project was carried out by the above-named candidate under my supervision.

Signed:

Supervisor: _____ Date: _____

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to give praise and thanks to the Holy Trinity, God the Father, God the Son, and God the Holy Spirit for being my help and my guide throughout this project and in life at large.

I can hardly begin to credit by names all the people and life experiences that have helped me to achieve what I have today; I would however like to pay tribute to a few of them:

I am very thankful to my supervisor, Dr Tania Coetzee, for her perceptive comments; I cannot imagine how I would have completed this project had it not been for her esteemed supervision. I am truly thankful.

I'm very grateful to my family, my two beautiful and supportive sisters, Mahlape and Motseoa Koali, who are my pillars, and my late brother-in-law Reverend Bohlale Phakoe who always motivated me and made me believe that I can be anything I dreamt to be.

Thank you very much. May the Almighty God bless and keep you.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACBF	African Capacity Building Foundation
ADB	Asia Development Bank
AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
AGGN	African Good Governance Network
AJBM	African Journal of Business Management
AU	African Union
AUDA	African Union Development Agency
BOS	Bureau of Statistics
BTI	Bertelsmann Transformation Index
CBOs	Community-Based Organisations
Covid-19	Coronavirus Disease of 2019
CSOs	Civil Society Organisations
CHAL	Christian Health Association of Lesotho
CIPFA	Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy
CTB	Central Tender Board
DCEO	Directorate on Corruption and Economic Offences
DCI	Development Cooperation Ireland
DfID	Department for International Development
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
EDF	European Development Fund
EIDHR	European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights
EISA	Electoral Institute for Sustainable Democracy in Africa
ESCAP	Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific

EU	European Union
FBOs	Faith-Based Organisations
FRM	Financial Resource Management
GoL	Government of Lesotho
GTZ	German Technical Assistance
HDI	Human Development Index
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
HRH	Human Resources for Health
ICS	Information and Communication System
IFAC	International Federation of Accountants
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INGOs	International Non-Governmental Organisations
IOs	International organisations
KfW	Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau
LCN	Lesotho Council of NGOs
LCS	Lesotho Correctional Services
LDCs	Least Developed Countries
LED	Local Economic Development
LENA	Lesotho News Agency
LENASO	Lesotho Network of AIDS Service Organisations
LENEPHWA	Lesotho Network of People Living with HIV/AIDS
LePHIA	Lesotho Population-based HIV Impact Assessment
LGs	Local Governments
LMIC	Lower-middle-income country

LUNDAP	Lesotho United Nations Development Assistant Plan
MCC	Millennium Challenge Corporation
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MNCs	Multinational Corporations
MOHSW	Ministry of Health Social Welfare
NACOSEC	National Covid-19 Secretariat
NEPAD	New Partnership for Africa's Development
NPO	Non-Profit Organisation
NIILM	Northern Institute for Integrated Learning in Management
NRA	National Reforms Authority
NSSO	National Sample Survey Office
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
PCA	Police Complaints Authority
PEPFAR	President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief
PESTEL	Political, Economic, Social, Technological, Legal and Environment
PFM	Public Financial Management
PHC	Primary Health Care
PPE	Personal Protective Equipment
PRS	Progress Reports
PSIRP	Public Sector Improvement Reform Programme
PVO	Private Voluntary Organisations
QPRs	Quarterly Progress Reports

RSA	Republic of South Africa
SACU	Southern African Customs Union
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SSA	Sub-Saharan Africa
STI	Sexually transmitted disease
TB	Tuberculosis
TI	Transparency International
TNC	Transnational corporation
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNESCAP	United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and Pacific
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund Activities
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
US	United States
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WFP	World Food Programs
WHO	World Health Organisation
WLSA	Women and Law in Southern Africa
YMCAs	Young Women's Christian Association

Table of Contents

DECLARATION	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	iii
Table of Contents	vii
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 MOTIVATION	1
1.2 REASON FOR THE RESEARCH	3
1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT	4
1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND OBJECTIVES	8
1.5 RESEARCH DESIGN	8
1.5.1 Methodology	8
1.5.2 Methods of collecting qualitative data	10
1.5.3 Data analysis	10
1.6 LITERATURE REVIEW	11
1.6.1 Roles of NGOs and CBOs	11
1.6.2 Development	11
1.6.3 Service Delivery	12
1.6.4 NGO's relations to governance	13
1.6.5 CBOs' relations to governance	14
1.7 RESEARCH LAYOUT	15
CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPTUALISATION AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	17
2.1 INTRODUCTION	17
2.2 NGOs and CBOs as concepts	18
2.2.1 The origin of NGOs	18
2.2.2 Definition of NGOs	19
2.2.3 Types of NGOs	20
2.2.4 Definition of CBOs	20
2.2.5 The purpose of CBOs	21
2.2.6 Types of CBOs	22
2.3 ROLES OF NGOs AND CBOs	23
2.3.1 Social development	23
2.3.2 Sustainable Development	24
2.3.3 Sustainable community development	24
2.4 ROLES OF CBOs	25
2.4.1 Promoting community/citizen participation	25

2.4.2 Sustainable Development	25
2.5 THEORIES OF NGOs AND CBOs.....	26
2.5.1 Development theory	26
2.5.2 Stakeholder theory	27
2.5.3 Collaborative public management theory	28
2.6 ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY OF NGOs	28
2.6.1 Accountability	29
2.6.2 Transparency.....	30
2.7 MONITORING AND EVALUATION	31
2.8 EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS.....	31
2.9 SERVICE DELIVERY	32
2.9.1 Community participation	34
2.9.2 Corruption	35
2.9.3 Control corruption	36
2.10 DEVELOPMENT	37
2.10.1 Social development.....	37
2.10.2 Economic development	37
2.10.3 Sustainable human development	39
2.11 POVERTY ALLEVIATION.....	40
2.12 GOVERNANCE AS A CONCEPT	42
2.12.1 Good governance	43
2.12.2 The importance of good governance.....	44
2.13 THEORIES ON GOOD GOVERNANCE	45
2.13.1 Traditional authority theory	46
2.13.2 Network management theory	46
2.13.3 Cultural theory	47
2.13.4 Agency theory	48
2.14 ACCOUNTABILITY IN GOVERNANCE	48
2.15 PROMOTING HUMAN RIGHTS – GOOD GOVERNANCE	50
2.16 LESS ACTIVE CIVIL SOCIETY	51
2.17 FIGHTING FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRIMINALISATION OF POLITICS	53
2.18 CONCLUSION.....	53
CHAPTER THREE: CHALLENGES/CONSTRAINTS FACING NGOs AND CBOs IN PROVIDING SERVICE DELIVERY	55
3.1 Introduction.....	55
3.2 Funding for NGOs and CBOs	57
3.2.1 Accessing donors.....	58

3.2.2 Funding conditions and limitations.....	59
3.2.3 Corruption and embezzlement of funds.....	62
3.3 Dynamics between government and NGOs and service delivery	64
3.3.1 Service delivery	64
3.3.2 Interaction of government and NGOs.....	66
3.4 Dynamics operating within NGOs and CBOs	68
3.4.1 Poor accountability	68
3.4.2 Poor governance	70
3.4.3 Strategic planning	70
3.5 Constraints in monitoring and evaluation in NGOs.....	72
3.6 Political environment and service delivery	75
3.7 Constraints in implementing.....	76
3.7.1 Lack of resources (human and financial)	77
3.7.2 Dynamics in leadership in NGOs and CBOs.....	80
3.8 Poor networking and communication	83
3.8.1 Networking.....	83
3.8.2 Communication.....	85
3.9 Dynamics of limited capacity.....	87
3.9.1 Capacity building.....	89
3.10 Summary	91
CHAPTER FOUR: THE IMPACT OF NGOs AND CBOs ON LESOTHO'S GOVERNANCE	93
4.1 INTRODUCTION	93
4.2 Governance and Good Governance	95
4.3 ACCOUNTABILITY	97
4.3.1 Non-Governmental Organisations.....	98
4.3.2 Community-Based Organisations.....	99
4.4 Transparency	100
4.4.1 NGOs	102
4.4.2 CBOs.....	102
4.5 RULE OF LAW	103
4.5.1 NGOs	104
4.6 PARTICIPATION	106
4.6.1 NGOs	107
4.6.2 CBOs.....	109
4.7 Effectiveness and Efficiency	110
4.7.1 NGOs	112

4.8 Responsiveness	113
4.9 Conclusion.....	116
CHAPTER FIVE: FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION	118
5.1 Introduction.....	118
5.2 Chapter overview.....	120
5.3 Findings.....	121
5.3.1 Good governance is the hallmark of governments.....	121
5.3.2 Effectiveness in the provision of services through NGOs and CBOs.....	122
5.3.3 Funding of NGOs a serious challenge	123
5.3.4 Citizen participation in governance issues enhanced through NGOs and CBOs	124
5.3.5 Corruption in NGOs and CBOs	125
5.3.6 NGOs and CBOs improve transparency	126
5.3.7 The rule of law needs more attention	127
5.4 Interpretation of the research	128
5.4.1 The roles and functions of NGOs and CBOs in government	128
5.4.2 How NGOs and CBOs assist the Lesotho Government in service delivery	130
5.4.3 What actions should be taken in dealing with the challenges faced by NGOs?	131
5.4.4 Determining if NGOs and CBOs have a positive or negative impact on the governance of Lesotho.....	131
5.5 RECOMMENDATIONS	133
5.5.1 Good governance must be encouraged.....	133
5.5.2 Increased funding of NGOs and CBOs.....	133
5.5.3 Improving service delivery	134
5.5.4 Promoting and strengthening the rule of law, accountability and transparency.....	134
5.5.5 Monitoring and Evaluation in NGOs must be enhanced	135
5.5.6 Public participation must be encouraged	136
5.5.7 Value of the research.....	136
5.6 Conclusion.....	136
REFERENCES.....	138

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 MOTIVATION

Lesotho is a small, mountainous landlocked country, it is land locked by South Africa. It has a population of almost 2.3 million and nominal gross domestic product (GDP) per capita of \$1,045.9 in 2022 (World Bank 2023). Like other African countries in its pursuit to strengthen its democracy and reduce poverty, Lesotho became a member and signatory to several sub-regional, regional, and international convention. These organisations include the Southern African Development Communities (SADC), the Southern African Customs Union (SACU), the United Nations (UN), and the African Union (AU).

As mechanisms to help in the fight against poverty and global development, many countries introduced Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) and Community Based Organisations (CBOs) to their governance (processes/structures?) to fill gaps that the government either cannot or do not wish to fulfill. Loise (2017) notes that NGOs are one of the basic elements of democratic societies. It is incontestable that NGOs and CBOs have come to play a prominent role on the African continent, including Lesotho. They are regarded as one of the mechanisms used in poverty reduction initiatives and programmes. The roots of NGOs and CBOs in Africa are found in the arrival of missionaries on the continent who dispensed charity and engaged in the provision of education and health services (Manji and O’Coill 2007: 568). Matthews and Nqaba (2017: 5) argued that while the history of NGOs could be traced back to the colonial period, it was in the 1980s that they were increasingly recognised as important institutions in the broader development aid sectors in Africa, as well as the rest of the world.

Khatai (2018: iii) observed that the prevalence of NGOs and CBOs in most developing countries is linked to the availability of foreign aid and a modernisation agenda for developed countries to invest in the development of the Global South countries. Khatai (2018) states that, for these reasons, the governments of developing countries have embraced the existence and importance of NGOs in the improvement of the livelihoods of poor people within their regions.

Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs)

NGOs can be described as non-governmental and non-profit organisations that operate without the government's control. Lewis and Kanji (2009: 11) define NGOs as agencies that are primarily engaged in work relating to certain areas of development or humanitarian work at a local, national, or international level. While the importance and relevance of the NGO have rightfully been questioned and challenged, their ubiquity and influence in the Lesotho government cannot be denied. Lesotho established an organisation in 1990, popularly known as the Lesotho Council of Non-Governmental Organisations (LCN), which is an umbrella organisation for NGOs in Lesotho. Its main objective is to provide supportive services to the NGO community. LCN's strategic plan (2014-2019: 10) states that the primary mission of the Council is to stimulate, promote and build capacity within Lesotho NGOs so that they are stable, democratic, transparent, skilled, empowered, sustainable and responsive to their beneficiaries' needs and those of the voiceless and marginalised.

Community-Based Organisations (CBOs)

CBOs are non-profit, non-governmental, or charitable organisations that represent the community's needs and work to help them. The Firefighter Foundation (n.d.) defines CBOs as not profit-making organisations incorporated for the purpose of providing services or other assistance to economically or socially disadvantaged persons within its designated community. It may be a United Nations agency or an Intergovernmental Organisation. We saw the emergence of CBOs in Lesotho during the early days of the HIV/AIDS crisis, when they were at the frontline of the response. Many of these CBOs began as local support groups for community members living with HIV, which then grew to serve thousands of vulnerable children and families in the community with essential service support (Carleton n.d.).

NGOs (and CBOs) are key components of a participatory process that helps to raise the status of vulnerable groups, build confidence, and enhance the ability of people to participate in development (African Development Bank 2006: 25). The African Development Bank (2006: 25) further states that these organisations have a significant role to play in promoting and strengthening good governance in Lesotho. To be able to do this, the organisations themselves must be credible, strong,

independent, and be seen to be transparent. CBOs normally are driven by community residents in all aspects of their existence, while professional personnel drive NGOs. NGOs and CBOs make a sincere effort to help the needy, and once they become popular, the funds start rolling in.

The Lesotho Government recognised that, together with NGOs, donors, and other sectors of society, it will need to adapt rapidly if the threat of growing poverty is to be minimised and full advantage should be taken of opportunities to improve the welfare of the nation (Lesotho Country Report 2006: ix). Poverty in Lesotho has become a critical issue for the country's government; NGOs are seen to be stepping in to fill the gaps. Caritas Lesotho (2020) emphasises that many international non-profit groups, such as Caritas Lesotho, operate in the country which seek to help individuals escape poverty by teaching them technical skills. Their primary focus is on vulnerable children and teaching them a trade such as farming or woodworking. Through skills and trades, they can make a living and be able to provide for themselves.

NGOs in Lesotho also assist in development through joint projects with the government. They also employ a myriad of strategies in their efforts to economically empower Lesotho's unemployed people and the rural poor. The strategies employed by NGOs depend on factors such as the genesis, nature, and agenda of the particular organisation (Hapazari and Hapazari 2019: 77). The results obtained from this research will be valuable to NGOs, CBOs and the Lesotho Government as it will offer suggestions on ways to deal with the challenges faced by the organisations.

1.2 REASON FOR THE RESEARCH

The last decades have witnessed extraordinary growth in NGOs in all spheres of human activities worldwide, especially in developing countries (Bromideh 2011: 197). National governments' responsibilities include economic empowerment and the advancement of economically disadvantaged groups. However, NGOs and CBOs are seen to play fundamental roles in economic empowerment, poverty reduction, and the advancement of disadvantaged groups.

Hence, it is worth researching the extent of their intervention and their impact on the governance of Lesotho. Khati (2018: 8) argues that these organisations appear to be

promoters of the development process in Lesotho, while the state is increasingly seen as incapable of responding sufficiently to the needs of citizens. It is worth noting that these organisations face challenges in assisting the government. Researching this topic will assist both the government and these organisations to tackle the problems and challenges facing these organisations. When the challenges facing NGOs and CBOs are addressed, efficiency in both entities will be attained.

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

In Africa, NGOs play a leading role in responding to various issues, including in the areas of Health, Education, Child Development, Poverty, Youth Development, Women empowerment, and Peace and Human Rights (FundsforNGOs 2020).

Teguru (2016: iii) states that the challenges faced by these organisations include political interference, government policies, political instability, funding, donor priorities changing, community members' participation, and economic instability. These challenges hinder the effective implementation of community development projects, which lead to project failure or the partial success of projects.

Funding for NGOs is a source of concern in Lesotho as no formal procedures guide domestic or foreign fundraising and NGOs and CBOs independently source the funding. Lesotho NGOs fear the closure of embassies and donors, not just for their funding, but also for their strategic positioning. With the Danish Embassy closed, the British Embassy's closure imminent, and the Irish Embassy's closure, many Lesotho NGOs believe this is due to a lack of confidence in the potential for the country to develop and to strategic position themselves in more lucrative markets in South Africa (archive.globalpolicy.org n.d.).

Lack of funding has led to the lacklustre performance of NGOs on set goals. For example, the United Nations Children's Emergency Fund (UNICEF) Lesotho 2020/21 Social Protection Budget Brief stated that protracted delays in the disbursement of promised funds, for instance, observed for the child grant programme in 2020 caused major inconveniences. It also stated that in 2020 extensive delays in disbursing external funds prevented new needy households from receiving cash transfers on time, while the 40 000 households receiving child grants could not receive their promised top-ups.

Many projects that Lesotho deals with are HIV/AIDS projects. For these projects to be successful, NGOs need funds. The US Embassy in Lesotho (2020) states that according to the 2020 survey by the Lesotho Population-based HIV Impact Assessment (LePHIA), HIV prevalence stood at 23%, which corresponds to approximately 324 000 adults living with HIV in the country. Lesotho needs donor funding to meet its HIV obligations, although funds are scarce. While the importance and relevance of NGOs have rightfully been questioned and challenged, their ubiquity and influence in the Lesotho government cannot be denied. Matthews and Nqaba (2017: 2) state that while it is evident that the number and influence of NGOs in Africa have grown over the last few decades, it is worth noting that there are some concerns around declining funding for NGOs.

When the Covid-19 pandemic hit the world, the Lesotho government was not prepared to deal with a national emergency of the magnitude of the Coronavirus pandemic. The country declared a state of emergency to tackle the pandemic. However, the government was unable to mobilise sufficient resources to fight either the pandemic or the subsequent hunger and economic crises, which resulted from restrictions on people's movement (Lesotho Country Report 2022: 28). In response to the Coronavirus pandemic, NGOs like the Red Cross Society in Lesotho played a critical role in providing essential personal protective equipment to crowded places, like bus terminals, and hard-to-reach rural areas. The Lesotho Chamber of Commerce and Industry also led efforts to mobilise donations from private businesses, which were then distributed to the National Coronavirus Secretariat and others (BTI 2022 Country Report: 17).

NGOs have filled the gap that the government is failing to fill due to the social, economic, and political problems in Lesotho. However, NGOs, as an integral part of civil society, are facing challenges in their bid to foster community development (Teguru 2016: iii). Apart from its regulatory role, the government does not seem to play any significant role in how NGOs go about assisting the poor in the country, apart from its provision of grants to those NGOs that look after orphans and elderly people.

Civil society (NGOs and CBOs) at all levels has gained recognition. However, it is noted that the lack of a comprehensive legal and policy framework adversely affects

the effectiveness of the sector. Moreover, the current government of Lesotho hinders participation and shared views, based on the community they represent; they also threaten CSOs that voice their concerns (Rakhare 2019: 15).

According to Kaldor et al. (2012: 19), the number of international NGOs more than doubled between 1989 and 2000. This shows that there is a greater need for NGOs and CBOs in African countries. But the question remains, does the presence of NGOs and CBOs have a positive or negative impact on governance?

This study uses a governance framework as a means of identifying the strengths, weaknesses, and opportunities brought about by these organisations in Lesotho. NGOs need good governance for effective functioning. FundsForNGOs (2016) states that the principles of good governance, in the dynamic environment NGOs face today, are accountability, transparency, responsibility, disclosure practices and organisational relationships among the board and stakeholders. A poor governance framework in these organisations can be a hindrance to them delivering the services they aim to provide.

Lesotho Governance

Governance can be viewed as a system in which organisations are controlled and directed. The United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP) (2009) defines governance as the process of decision-making by which decisions are implemented or not implemented. The International Bureau of Education (2016) however states that governance has been defined to refer to structures and processes, which are designed to ensure accountability, transparency, responsiveness, the rule of law, stability, equity and inclusiveness, empowerment, and broad-based participation. This is what many authors and scholars refer to as good governance.

Good governance has been extensively promoted by the Bretton Woods Institutions and donor partners for the critical role they play in the development of any state. Lehobo (2017:1) states that the World Bank, being a donor, coined the term 'good governance' during the period in which corruption was soaring, aid was ineffective, and there was a lack of commitment to implement reforms by countries that received donations (World Bank 1989). That is when the World Bank and other international agencies made it a precondition for receiving any form of financial assistance. Good

governance continues to drive international development policy, as Lehobo (2017) states. The World Bank, together with the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and donor countries, influenced the global economic policy by ensuring that good governance was central to any policy framework.

Lesotho's governance has been characterised by an unstable democracy, high corruption, and a lack of accountability and transparency. According to Lesotho.un.org (2019), frequent government changes in Lesotho – three in less than five years – reflect governance challenges. The country, therefore, faces several challenges to enhance the framework for good governance (African Development Bank 2006).

Firstly, accountability is still a major challenge in Lesotho's governance. UNESCAP (2009) states that accountability is a key requirement of good governance. Not only governmental institutions, but also the private sector and CSOs, must be accountable to the public and their institutional stakeholders (Coursehero.com 2022).

The African Development Bank (2006) defines accountability as the obligation to render an account for a conferred responsibility. Considering the three forms of accountability, namely political, financial and administrative accountability, it can be said that Lesotho has failed to be accountable. Isbell and Malephane (2018) point out that the Lesotho government's resistance to accepting a Southern African Development Community Commission of Enquiry Report on the assassination of the former army commander Maaparankoe Mahao (ENCA 2015; Shale 2015) is seen as tantamount to refusing to be accountable to the nation (Southern African Litigation Centre 2016).

In Lesotho, corruption usually occurs in the police, the government, and in business administration. Lesotho has seen a rise in corruption since the formation of the fragile coalition governments that normally collapse midway through their term of office. Moletsane (2020) states that coalition politicking has led to an increase in government expenditure, largely because of rampant corruption. He (2020) further states that despite warnings by international financial institutions, the squandering of funds has gone on unabated and, by the Finance Minister's admission, the country does “not have money”. This shows that Lesotho has a long way to go in attaining good governance through being thoroughly accountable.

1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND OBJECTIVES

1. What are the roles and functions of NGOs and CBOs in the Lesotho government?
2. How do NGOs and CBOs assist the Lesotho government in service delivery?
3. What actions should be taken in dealing with the challenges faced by NGOs?
4. Are NGOs and CBOs having a positive or negative impact on Lesotho's governance?

AIMS AND OBJECTIVES

The primary aim of this study is to indicate whether the intervention of NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho's governance in contributing to the development of the country and reducing poverty. The roles played by these organisations will be outlined and the challenges they face will be identified. Moreover, this research aims to add to the existing literature on the intervention of NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho's governance in general. The study will use a governance framework as a means of identifying the strengths, weaknesses, and opportunities brought about by these organisations in Lesotho.

The main objectives of the study are as follows:

1. To analyse the roles and function of NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho's government;
2. To investigate how NGOs and CBOs assist the government of Lesotho in service delivery;
3. To identify and analyse the challenges faced by these organisations in pursuit of fulfilling their roles; and
4. To determine if NGOs and CBOs have a positive or negative impact on the governance of Lesotho.

1.5 RESEARCH DESIGN

1.5.1 Methodology

The purpose of this study is to examine the interventions of NGOs and CBOs in the governance of Lesotho. The research methodology is the manner/way in which the

topic will be understood and how the research will be conducted, as well as how the data will be collected using different methods and techniques. Somekh and Lewin (2005: 346) define methodology as both "the collection of methods or rules by which a particular piece of research is undertaken" and the "principles, theories and values that underpin a particular research approach". Hence, the basis of methodology in research is to explain and clarify the methods that the researcher will use and it helps to provide detailed explanations of how the data will be collected and analysed (Silverman 2006: 275).

The study will make use of the interpretative research paradigm because this paradigm is concerned with understanding the world as it is from individuals' subjective experiences. This paradigm uses questioning and observation to uncover a deep and rich understanding of the phenomenon being investigated.

The method of data collection and analysis to be employed in this study is the qualitative method. Hilipsen and Vernooij-Dassen (2007: 5-12) define qualitative research as the study of the nature of phenomena, including their qualities, different manifestations, the context in which they appear, or the perspectives from which they can be perceived, but excluding their range, frequency, and place in an objectively determined chain of cause and effect. The qualitative data obtained will provide information on the contributions of NGOs and CBOs to Lesotho's governance. Based on the data accumulated, this study also aims to investigate the challenges these organisations face in fulfilling their roles.

Qualitative research also seeks to enquire about subjects in their original settings, which are not enhanced or disturbed. According to Domegan and Fleming (2007: 24), "Qualitative research aims to explore and to discover issues about the problem on hand because very little is known about the problem". This method employs inductive methods, which emphasise interpretation, which will be more useful to interpret the behaviour of NGOs and CBOs in terms of the Lesotho government. This study will focus on the roles of these organisations in the governance of Lesotho and the challenges they face in delivering services.

Creswell (2003) states that in qualitative research, different knowledge claims, inquiry strategies, and data collection methods and analysis are employed. There

are different sources of data for qualitative studies, such as questionnaires, interviews, and observation. For this study, the researcher will use desktop data.

1.5.2 Methods of collecting qualitative data

This research will use secondary data and observations will be used. For the collection of data, the study will make use of a desktop literature review.

Merriam (2002:5) states that the advantage of using a qualitative research method is that "the researcher is the primary instrument for data collection and data analysis". As understanding is the goal of this research, the human instrument, which is immediately responsive and adaptive, would seem to be the ideal means of collecting and analysing the data.

For this study, secondary data will be used. The secondary data will be collected from documented materials such as journal articles, theses and dissertations, and other texts on NGOs and CBOs. The secondary data will be collected to cover every aspect of the study. The secondary data will indicate the roles, contributions, and challenges of these organisations in Lesotho.

1.5.3 Data analysis

After the data is collected, it will be analysed. Data analysis is considered as the thoughtful interpretation and explanation of the data collected. Mouton and Babbie (2001: 101) elaborate on the process by stating, "We interpret the collected data to draw conclusions that reflect on the interests, ideas, and theories that initiated the inquiry".

Content analysis is used for making sense of the information gathered from texts to articulate and present arguments and reach a logical conclusion. There will be no human participants in the study and the researcher will adhere to the ethical guidelines for research by acknowledging all the sources and avoiding plagiarism, and by also ensuring that the data collection process is not biased.

1.6 LITERATURE REVIEW

Non-Governmental Organisations

In the course of the last 25 years, Africa has witnessed an astounding growth in the number and influence of NGOs (Hearn 2007). Many scholars and authors have attempted to define these organisations. Some definitions, like Vakil's (1997), have suggested their legal status, economic and/or financial considerations, functional areas, and organisational features. The African Union Report (2013: 1) states that the term 'NGOs' cover a large variety of groups ranging from community groups, grassroots activist groups, research organisations and advocacy groups to corporate think-tanks and emergency/humanitarian relief focused groups. It is worth noting that the term is often used loosely, sometimes idealistically and sometimes pejoratively, and at different times interchangeably with names such as civil society, private voluntary organisations, and charity/non-profit institutions (African Union Report 2013: 1).

Lewis and Kanji (2009: 11) define NGOs as agencies that are primarily engaged in work relating to areas of development or humanitarian work at a local, national, or international level. Pallipedia.org (2021) defines an NGO as a not-for-profit organisation that is independent of the state or international governmental organisations. They are usually funded by donations, but some avoid formal funding altogether and are run primarily by volunteers (Pallipedia.org, 2021).

1.6.1 Roles of NGOs and CBOs

The existence of NGOs has changed the ways that governments and corporations do business and it has further changed the relationship between the two entities (Khati 2018). Turning to Lesotho, NGOs have a key role to play in promoting and strengthening good governance in the country. The African Development Fund (2013: 25) states that to be able to do this, the organisations must be credible, strong, independent, and seen to be transparent.

1.6.2 Development

Across the developing world, states with limited finances and which are riddled by poor governance and corruption have failed to lead to development for all their

citizens (Banks and Hulme 2012: 3). Within this context, alternative forms of development have been pursued, and since the 1980s, according to Banks and Hulme (2012: 3), NGOs have increasingly been seen as a means through which the gulf between citizens' needs and existing services could be bridged. Furthermore, NGOs play a crucial role in the development of society in developing countries. Grobman (2008) emphasises that NGOs often play an interesting role in a nation's health, economic or social activities, as well as in assessing and addressing problems in both national and international issues, such as human, political and women's rights, economic development, democratisation, inoculation and immunisation, health care, or the environment.

In May 1990, Lesotho established a council of organised NGOs called the Lesotho Council of Non-Governmental Organisations (LCN). The Council's main objective is that of providing supportive services to the NGO community. Its focus is primarily on strengthening civil society, and economic justice and social development. Desai (2002) states that NGOs have played a prominent role in formulating and implementing development policy and they are key agents in the development discourse. There has been heightened collaboration with governments and aid agencies throughout this period due to the growing belief that NGOs offer an alternative to development processes and could play a key role in fostering democratisation.

1.6.3 Service Delivery

For many developing countries, they attain efficiency and effectiveness by working together with NGOs to deliver services to their communities. McLennan (2009: 21) states that service delivery is the provision of public goods and services by the state or private organisations to the users who demand them. Major services provided by NGOs in Lesotho are health, food security, and education. For any institution to provide efficient, effective and quality services, Rakhare (2019: 30) states that they should abide by the principles noted in the White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery (1997: 13-22). The principles are the following:

- consulting the users of services,
- setting the service standards,

- increasing access,
- ensuring courtesy,
- providing more and better information,
- increasing openness and transparency,
- remedying mistakes and failures, and
- obtaining the best value for money (White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery 1997: 15).

NGOs provide services by implementing projects that focus on improving health, access to education, and nutrition.

In as much as NGOs are commonly understood as voluntary, not-for-profit organisations, independent of government business (Michael 2004), the boundary lines are blurred. Most of these organisations are involved in service provision and development in communities and thus need to work hand-in-hand with the government for sustainable development and service provision. Although Khati (2018: 39) argues that NGOs should have no relations with government organisations, this might not be possible in Lesotho. Considering the degree to which NGOs are involved in the provision of education, the management of health care, and the delivery of social services in Lesotho, it is no wonder that the government and NGOs have found a way to work together.

1.6.4 NGO's relations to governance

Good governance motivates better service delivery, enhances and strengthens accountability, and enhances decision making (IFAC, 2013: 2; Mutahaba, 2012: 25). In developing countries, the inferior quality of public services has been attributed to the slow progress of development (Mehrotra, 2005: 263). The growing reputation of NGOs has resulted in a global call for improved accountability of NGOs, This has been encouraged by donors who have increasingly seen NGOs as an additional, if not alternative, resource for national development (Lesotho PVO/NGO Assessment 1993: 60).

Community-Based Organisations (CBOs)

Community-Based Organisations (CBOs) are considered one of the major institutions involved in community development, apart from state and non-governmental organisations (Mgawanyemba 2008).

Many authors have defined CBOs as similar to NGOs. According to Law Insider (n.d.), CBOs are not-for-profit organisations incorporated to provide services or other assistance to economically or socially disadvantaged persons within their designated community. UniversalClass.com (2019) states that CBOs are local non-profit groups that work to generate improvements within a community on the local level. As implied by their name, these are organisations that are found at the community level and they are involved in the developments taking place in the community.

Through these organisations, public participation is attained as these organisations operate at community level. As Luvai (2012: 1) puts it, CBOs are presented as a means to mobilise and organise local communities for participation in the development of their communities.

CBOs have come up to respond to the many socio-economic and development challenges facing poor communities. Abegunde (2009: 234) states that the mediocre performance of government in meeting the socio-economic quests of citizens has been identified as one of the reasons behind the proliferation of community-based organisations in the new millennium.

In 1991, the Lesotho Network of AIDS Services Organisations (LENASO) was established as an umbrella nationally recognised network of CBOs. Its objectives are to support the coordination and management of CBOs implementing HIV and AIDS services and to strengthen community linkages for the uptake of public health care services effectively and efficiently to ensure equity, availability, and accessibility through capacity building, resource mobilisation, networking, information sharing, advocacy and lobby, and monitoring and evaluation at the community level.

1.6.5 CBOs' relations to governance

According to Mule (2001: 73), governance enables public organisations like CBOs to provide public services to their clients in an effective, efficient, transparent, and accountable manner under the rule of law resulting in capable and effective administration and functioning institutions. However, in Lesotho, the government has

identified the inadequate involvement of important non-state actors, notably NGOs, Faith-Based Organisations (FBOs) and CBOs, the role of these stakeholder groups, and the need to facilitate them to contribute effectively to national and local development processes (Ministry of Local Government, Chieftainship and Parliamentary Affairs 2014: 8).

1.7 RESEARCH LAYOUT

The research consists of five chapters, which will provide an in-depth understanding of NGOs and CBOs and how they interact with and impact the governance of Lesotho.

Chapter One: Introduction

This chapter introduces the topic, examines the background and the intention of the study, and provides a description of the title. It includes the research problem, the objectives of the study, the research questions, and an overview of the research methodology.

Chapter Two: Conceptual frameworks (Governance, good governance, CBOs and NGOs)

This chapter will provide detailed theory related to governance, NGOs and CBOs. Governance can be termed good when it effectively facilitates the generation and utilisation of public resources in a manner that secures the human development imperatives of a society.

Chapter Three: Challenges facing NGOs and CBOs in providing service delivery in Lesotho

This chapter will identify the roles played by NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho and examine the challenges facing them in rendering services to communities in the country.

Chapter Four: Assessment of the impact of NGOs and CBOs on Lesotho's governance

This chapter will assess the contribution and impact of NGOs and CBOs on Lesotho's governance. It will also determine whether the NGOs and CBOs have a positive or negative impact on the governance of Lesotho.

Chapter Five: Summary, findings, recommendations and conclusion

This chapter will look at the summary, recommendations, and conclusion of the study. It will also discuss the findings of the study.

CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPTUALISATION AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The term 'non-governmental organisation' first came into currency in 1945 because of the need for the United Nations (UN) to differentiate in its Charter between participation rights for intergovernmental specialised agencies and those for international private organisations.

The history of CBOs goes back to the American Civil War, when charity groups were designed to aid those who were displaced, disabled, or impoverished by the war (Wanjohi, 2013). Between the 1980s and the 1990s CBOs expanded to a point that they were referred to as a movement, and the process of community organising expanded into many community organisations. In the 1950s and 1960s, Africa saw the rising prominence of NGOs and CBOs as important features of development (AU 2013). Jinmi (2013) states that it was in the 1970s and 1980s when the activities of these organisations became more noticeable as they began filling gaps that either governments could not or did not wish to fill. However, long before governments came into being, people organised themselves into social groups that drew on community spirit and the need to tackle social problems concerning the rights of people and common property, resources, health, safety, danger, equity, disease, and poverty (Jinmi, 2013).

NGOs and CBOs have proven to have had a great impact on the governance of countries through their interventions. Evidence from studies has revealed that these organisations, when allowed to intervene in a country's governance, could greatly affect the development of the country.

The purpose of this chapter is to provide a theoretical framework and conceptualisation of NGOs, CBOs, governance, and good governance. The discussions in the chapter will enable the reader to understand the impact of NGOs' and CBOs' intervention in the governance of Lesotho. In this way, the researcher also hopes to clarify the pertinence of these terms in the literature. Moreover, explanations will be provided about the usage of these concepts, as the basic

notions of this study. While doing so, the researcher will indicate the characteristics and roles of NGOs and CBOs, which are salient in governance in terms of scale and scope and their potential strengths and weaknesses.

This section provides an overview of the impact on governance through the intervention of NGOs and CBOs. At the end of the chapter, the readers will be able to identify the contributions of these organisations to development and service delivery in Lesotho's governance. Good service delivery is urgently need in communities because through it, poverty could be alleviated.

The study further intends to educate the reader on the contribution of NGOs and CBOs to governance. This chapter will provide the context in which NGOs and governments operate. This is important to be able to understand the particular role that the researcher believes NGOs should play in governance.

The chapter is divided into two sections: the conceptualisation of NGOs and CBOs, and the theoretical framework of governance and good governance.

2.2 NGOs and CBOs as concepts

At the end of this section, the reader will understand the roles, functions, and context in which NGOs and CBOs intervene in governance. However, it is essential to first define the concepts of NGO and CBO.

2.2.1 The origin of NGOs

Globalisation, as stated by Boskov and Spire (2011: 2), is a movement that brings unification among states, markets, technology, and firms around the globe. The world is witnessing an increase in the levels of trade and foreign direct investment worldwide and we are also seeing a growing interdependence of world economies due to globalisation. This brings an increase in private investment, which introduced NGOs as important providers of aid and development services in low-income economies.

NGOs have existed in some form for centuries. As far back as 1850, more than 100 000 private and not-for-profit organizations with an international focus have been

founded. Francis (2015) states that many problems within a nation could not be solved. International treaties and international organisations such as the World Trade Organisation were perceived as being too centred on the interests of capitalist enterprises. Some argued that to counterbalance this trend, NGOs developed to emphasise humanitarian issues, developmental aid, and sustainable development (Francis, 2015).

2.2.2 Definition of NGOs

Many authors and institutions have attempted to define NGOs. These Organizations have come across as the helping hand of many governments as they are not for profit making but solely for the welfare of the people. The World Bank (1995: 7) defines them as private organisations that pursue activities to relieve suffering, promote the interest of the poor, protect the environment, provide basic services, and undertake community development Coppola (2020), in turn, define an NGO as an organisation independent of the government whose primary mission is not commercial and that focuses on social, cultural, environmental, educational, and other issues.

There is no generally accepted definition of an NGO, and the term carries different connotations in different circumstances (NGOs for UNESCO Encyclopaedia, 2001). However, there are some fundamental features. Clearly, an NGO must be independent from the direct control of any government. Himanshu (2020) agrees, stating that while the term 'NGO' has various interpretations, it is generally accepted to incorporate private organizations that operate without government control, which are non-profit and non-criminal.

While NGOs have no fixed or formal definition, they are generally defined as non-profit entities independent of government influence, although at times they may receive government funding. This shows that defining an NGO often underlines its idealistic roots. Hence, an NGO is a full-fledged organisation volunteered by a passionate workforce who work day in and day out for other people's welfare.

Kaldor *et al.* (2003a), amongst others, see the rise of NGOs as a function of the space left by the declining reach of the state, coupled with a growth in globalisation and the emasculation of local political ability. Moreover, the structures of NGOs vary

considerably. They can be global hierarchies, with either a relatively strong central authority or a looser federal arrangement or they may be based in a single country and operate transnational.

2.2.3 Types of NGOs

Willetts (2001) states that there are different types of NGOs, and they are classified by organisation, geographical location, and main purpose. The World Bank (1995) places NGOs into classes of (i) Operational NGOs, whose primary purpose is the design and implementation of development-related projects, and (ii) Advocacy NGOs, whose primary purpose is to defend or promote a specific cause. The World Bank (1995) further classifies operational NGOs into three main groups: i) CBOs, which serve a specific population in a narrow geographic area; ii) national organisations, which operate in individual developing countries; and iii) international organisations, which are typically headquartered in developed countries and carry out operations in more than one developing country.

Maricar R. Chan, Maria Kristina S. Galvez, and Ergilio Ferreira Vicente(2011:9) elaborates on the three types of operational NGOs. CBOs arise out of people's own initiatives. These can include sports clubs, women's organisations, neighbourhood organisations, religious or educational organisations. There are a large variety of these, some supported by NGOs, national or international NGOs, or bilateral or international agencies, and others independent on outside help. National NGOs include organisations such as the Red Cross, YMCAs/YWCAs, and professional organisations. Some of these have state branches and assist local NGOs. International NGOs range from secular agencies such as Save the Children, OXFAM, CARE, UNDP, UNICEF and the Ford and Rockefeller Foundations, to religiously motivated groups. Their activities vary from mainly funding local NGOs, institutions and projects, to implementing the projects themselves.

Community Based Organisations (CBOs)

2.2.4 Definition of CBOs

CBOs are local non-profit groups that work to generate improvements within a community on the local level. They are the community development process in the

form of formal organisations. Himanshu (2020) defines them as nonprofit groups who work at an area level to create equality across societies and to enhance the lives of residents in the fields of health care, quality education, and sustainable development.

2.2.5 The purpose of CBOs

The primary purpose of CBOs is the improvement of the physical, economic, and social environment of their geographic area of operation. Aideyan (2018) states that they achieve these goals by addressing one or more critical problems in the area – for example, housing, health, education, microfinance, safe water, or sanitation. CBOs are deemed a smaller version of NGOs. CBOs work on common ground, but at a modest level. Moreover, as Himanshu (2020) states, CBOs are typically, and almost necessarily, staffed by local members – community members who experience first-hand the requirements within their neighbourhoods.

Governments are increasingly delegating responsibility to CBOs and relying on them to gather local concerns and to develop, plan, and help deliver solutions. CBOs are storehouses and gatekeepers of local information, valuable for their purposes, but this data is also useful to other organisations and government agencies. Hence, the role of CBOs is becoming knowledge management – to compile, sort, store and retrieve local data.

The UNHCR Innovation Service (2018) states that in CBOs, members often live within the community, which brings in multiple advantages that are often not afforded to international organisations. These members are familiar with the community they are part of and their services and, therefore, CBOs are better equipped better at communicating appropriately through their existing networks.

There is no doubt that NGOs and CBOs can be instrumental in achieving development and reducing poverty in communities. These organisations can do this through promoting participation of poor community members, so that they can be involved in alleviating their own poverty. This concept attaches value to the participation of members of communities who are economically and politically disempowered (Mosweunyane, 2009). Moreover, these organisations should be accountable and transparent to the communities they work with.

However, these organisations are not without critics. There are concerns regarding the intervention of NGOs and CBOs in governance. NGOs are seen to play a role in politics, although mainly focused with welfare. Many NGOs operate in unbalanced, dangerous, and conflict-prone communities or collaborate with predatory individuals, such as those who cause political interference or who may abuse the funding or grants allocated for the NGOs for their own benefit (.Abiddin, N.Z., Ibrahim, I. and Aziz, A. 2022: 9). Tortajada (2016) emphasises that many NGOs are as much a part of national and international politics as any other interest group, and their practices and activities are not always in the service of a “good society”, as mentioned by the Centre on Governance at the University of Ottawa (Trent, 2013:page number?).

Secondly, the issue of accountability and transparency has been increasingly questioned, mostly in cases where these organisations have falsely claimed to represent the poorest and most deprived, mainly for fundraising purposes (Kaldor 2003). Many NGOs working in developing countries are partly funded by their own governments and have been criticised as being a front for foreign government policy. Critics argue that this makes NGOs accountable to their funders, not the people they work with (Lemmons, 2022:page number?).

Numerous studies and practices have demonstrated that NGOs face obstacles, such as political interference, a lack of funding, ineffective networking, and poor governance (Abiddin, Ibrahim and Azziz 2022: 9). This could have a negative impact on governance through NGOs’ interventions.

2.2.6 Types of CBOs

Impact of Community-Based Organisations (2019) discusses the four types of CBOs. Firstly, there is Common Interest Groups. These are usually organisations that involve community members who have shared goals and interests. These organisations can be simple and are flexible enough to be modified while still retaining their core structure. Secondly, Micro Finance Institutions are CBOs that focus on financial elements in the community, such as lending and savings. Thirdly, Village Development Committees are CBOs that act as collective governance in villages. They have a set of rules that govern not only the committee’s actions, but the community. Fourth, Faith Based Organisations are CBOs and non-profits with a

religious element to them. They can have similarities to other types of CBO, depending on how they are set up initially.

The conclusion is that NGOs and CBOs are driven by the urge to do “good”, without the motive of attaining profits or being politically influenced. For international development, NGOs are viewed as an engine for development and their efficiency in development is drawing positive feedback (Edwards & Hulme 1996: 3). They have also gained popularity in changing mindsets and attitudes towards service delivery (Keck & Sikkink 1998).

2.3 ROLES OF NGOs AND CBOs

NGOs and CBOs work on identical grounds and share a common motive: the welfare of society and the people. Their functions can vary widely from service organisations to human rights advocacy and relief groups.

NGOs play miscellaneous roles within the societies they operate from; their key objective and underpinning principle is the betterment of the lives of people within their target communities. Banks and Hulme (2012: 3) opined that it was the perceived failures of state-led development approaches throughout the 1970s and 1980s that fueled interest in NGOs as a development alternative, offering innovative and people-centred approaches to service delivery, advocacy, and empowerment. Hapazari and Hapazari (2019:68) state that empowerment as a tool for advancing economically and politically disadvantaged groups is an ongoing process and is not confined to any continent, region, or country.

2.3.1 Social development

Social development is about improving the well-being of every individual in society so they can reach their full potential. The success of a society is linked to the well-being of every citizen (Government of New Brunswick, Canada 2009).

Additionally, social development means investing in people. It requires the removal of barriers so that all citizens can journey toward their dreams with confidence and dignity (Government of New Brunswick, Canada 2009). Furthermore, it is about refusing to accept that people who live in poverty will always be poor. It is therefore about helping people so that they can move forward on their path to self-sufficiency.

Social development further entails the development of a country's human and social capital, which encompasses aspects such as health, education, citizen security, and employment. It is realised by reducing the levels of poverty, inequality, exclusion, isolation, and vulnerability of the groups most in need. The state promotes social development from its different agencies and institutions, which are responsible for implementing social protection policies and programmes to promote inclusion, and which are designed for the benefit of those living in the most precarious conditions (The Black Sheep Community, 2022).

NGOs assist in the social development of communities. They play an important role in global social development work, which has helped facilitate achievements in human development, as measured by the UN Human Development Index (HDI) (n.d.). A social development approach needs to be considered by countries to reduce poverty and invest in their people. By investing in people, poverty can be reduced.

2.3.2 Sustainable Development

NGOs play an important role in promoting sustainable development. NGOs focus their attention on the social and environmental impacts of business activity, helped in part by advances in information and communications technology. The Government of New Brunswick, Canada (2009) states that many NGOs promote dialogue and other initiatives, which address the needs of minorities, and marginalised and disadvantaged groups. The corresponding outcomes are new or revised policy frameworks, as well as an increased governance capacity to enforce them. This has created improved conditions and creative communities with the clearly defined roles, ethics, and values necessary for sustainable living.

2.3.3 Sustainable community development

NGOs have shown leadership in promoting and advancing sustainable community development. Due to their ideology and nature, NGOs are good at reaching out to the poor and remote communities and mobilising these populations. They can also empower communities to regain control of their lives and they can work with and strengthen local organisations. Lastly, NGOs can carry out projects more efficiently

and at lower costs than government agencies and, most importantly, promote sustainable development (Nikkhah & Redzuan, 2010: 85).

2.4 ROLES OF CBOs

Hussain (2008: 740) states that the purpose of CBOs is to plan, implement and monitor social and economic development programmes, and provide technical and financial help to communities. Moreover, according to Hussain (2008), CBOs positively affect the process of rural change; that is, increases in income and improvements in health, nutrition and the literacy status of populations.

CBOs play a key role in the development of marginal communities. Eswarappa (2020: 35) states that CBOs' presence and participation in the development process could help to minimise the problems of unemployment, poverty, and illiteracy.

2.4.1 Promoting community/citizen participation

CBOs are tasked with the role of educating stakeholders and the public about local government decision-making, as well as determining the incorporation of public needs and values into local government decision-making.

Silverman (2005) states that CBOs are increasingly the beneficiaries of state and federal grants, and they are charged with implementing publicly-funded programmes at community level. As they are more responsive to grassroots constituencies than institutions traditionally involved in the formulation and implementation of local public policy, this places them in a better position to deal with the community and influence their participation (ibid.).

2.4.2 Sustainable Development

CBOs play a significant role in promoting development, especially in rural communities. They have emerged in the contemporary world with better representation of the public voice against injustice and suppression than any other organisations. Miriti (2009: 17) states that CBOs in poor rural communities could influence local governments to be accountable to form coalitions with other social forces and build larger organisations, which could influence regional and national policy in favour of poverty reduction. Miriti (2009) emphasises that with adequate

capacity building, rural institutions could make a major contribution to community mobilisation in support of the judicious use of national resources and environmental protection.

2.5 THEORIES OF NGOs AND CBOs

Angielczyk (2017) defines a theory as a carefully thought-out explanation for observations of the natural world, which has been constructed using a scientific method, and which brings together many facts and hypotheses.

2.5.1 Development theory

The word 'development' in the English language connotes ideas such as 'unfolding', 'growth', 'the fuller working out of the details of anything', and 'bringing out the potential that is latent in something'. Harriss (1992) states that the ability of NGOs to cut across multiple roles and functions is promoted by the need to respond to a plethora of multidimensional challenges facing communities today. Lewis and Kanji (2009: 49) state that to be considered developmental, an organisation should have the ability to ensure desirable change or growth over a significant period.

Harriss (1992) further says that development theories are about understanding how the processes of change take place in societies. According to Harriss (1992), scholars from historically less developed parts of Europe and the colonial world contributed to the construction of modern theories of development in the 1940s, stressing the role of the state.

Thomas (2000:3) states that this theory examines the ability of organisations to bring significant social and economic changes to communities by employing different approaches and methods to solve existing challenges. In employing these different methods and approaches, the relationship between NGOs and government is regarded as a necessity to achieve significant change in communities (Thomas, 2000). This, in turn, would promote greater cooperation among more stakeholders where service delivery is concerned.

2.5.2 Stakeholder theory

Stakeholder theory was first described by Dr. F. Edward Freeman, a professor at the University of Virginia, in his landmark book, "Strategic Management: A Stakeholder Approach" in 1984.

Lewis (2001: 202) defines a stakeholder as "any person or group that is able to make a claim on an organisation's attention, resources, or output or who may be affected by the organisation". Stakeholder theory addresses business ethics, morals and values when managing stakeholders involved with a project or organisation. It seeks to optimise relations with stakeholders, thereby improving efficiency throughout the project or organisation (Keup, 2022).

Jones and Wicks (1999: 21) assert that organisations exist because of their ability to create value and acceptable outcomes for various groups of stakeholders, for example, government or people who have an interest, claim, or stake in the organisation, in what it does, and how well it performs. Basically, stakeholders are motivated to participate in an organisation if they receive incentives that exceed the value of the contributions they are required to make.

Freeman (1984) suggests that a company's stakeholders are "those groups without whose support the organisation would cease to exist". These groups could include customers, employees, suppliers, political action groups, environmental groups, local communities, the media, financial institutions, and governmental groups (Simon, 2016). Employees are however considered major stakeholders in any company. They expect to be compensated fairly and work in safe conditions. If the company does not meet these basic expectations and treats its employees like cogs in a wheel rather than valued team members, it can harm the business in the long run (McAbee, 2022)

When the opinions and influence of all stakeholders are used to help shape a project, the project will be better positioned for success. It can be concluded that attention to the contributions of NGOs in their partnership with governments and their employees need to be taken into consideration. This cooperation will ensure maximum outputs and achievements in community development.

2.5.3 Collaborative public management theory

According to O’Leary and Vij (2012), the collaborative public management theory refers to a process of facilitating and operating in multi-organisational arrangements to solve problems that cannot be solved or easily solved by single organisations. Collaborative public management theory, as described by McGuire (2006), would be the best theory to describe the nature of the relationship between NGOs and a government. Collaborative, according to McGuire (2006: 33), “means to co-labour, to achieve common goals, often working across boundaries and in multi-sector and multi-actor relationships”.

Weisbrod (1975; later 1988) asserted that NGOs are, in part, a response to the limitations of government. A government’s ability is often restricted, and to increase effectiveness and efficiency, the assistance of NGOs is needed to respond to the high demand for goods and services by the voters.

Another important reason is provided by McGuire (2006: 34) regarding the nature of social problems that are predominant, and which are crippling vulnerable communities. McGuire (2006) states that these social problems have become so complex and vast in scope and nature that they can no longer be solved by public organisations alone.

Public sectors often find themselves in need of others’ support to resolve issues. Hence, they call on the support of other public organisations or even private partnerships. It is important to understand collaborative public management as an additional tool in the toolbox to become better public administrators.

In conclusion, an increased collaboration among organisations is required to deal with the complex reality of today’s societies (Pollitt, 2003). The collaboration is not only needed to improve public services, but to also create the capability of solving the contemporary problems of public sector service delivery (Keast & Brown, 2002).

2.6 ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY OF NGOs

NGOs have taken an increasingly prominent role as development assistance implementers in recent years, especially in fragile states where they often provide essential services that are traditionally fall under the responsibility of the public

sector (Chene 2013: 2). Chene (2013: 2) adds that with the growing influence of the non-profit sector over service delivery, as well as their increased involvement in the development of national and international policies, the transparency and accountability of NGOs have become an area of concern.

2.6.1 Accountability

According to Wigmore (2022), accountability is an assurance that an individual or an organisation will be evaluated on their performance or behaviour related to something for which they are responsible. In Walker's (2002: 63) opinion, accountability has a wide range of definitions. For Srinivas (2015), accountability means empowered and responsible staff and managers who have the authority and responsibility for decision making, can improve the delivery of the NGO's aims and objectives, and can improve the management of human and financial resources. Haque and Ali (2008:6), in turn, define it simply as holding officials responsible for their actions and establishing criteria to measure the performance of officials, as well as the rights and mechanisms to ensure that the standards are met.

Srinivas (2015) discusses examples of accountability in NGOs. Firstly, NGOs and CBOs can be accountable to a donor agency for the use of funds received for an intended objective and purpose. Secondly, they are accountable to a government agency in terms of maintaining their non-profit status and providing documentary evidence of their expenditure. Thirdly, they are accountable to their constituencies in terms of delivering on their projects and assisting them in finding solutions to the problems they face.

During the past two decades, there has been a substantial discussion to find out a way for how NGOs can be made more accountable to the beneficiaries. Aktar and Masud (2020) noted this extra focus on how to attain unbiased accountability has undermined finding out why imbalances in accountability exist and to find out whether any structural barriers hinder improvement in beneficiary accountability. The African Development Bank (2006: 4) states that public accountability, thus, requires public officials to respond to the requirements of the citizens without prejudice.

Finkelstein (2020) discusses the principles of accountability: for remarkable accountability, you must be answerable; and, when someone has a query, you need

to be clear and honest in your answer and justification. Clear reasoning for your actions is also vital for accountability.

It has been found that many NGOs conceal information; therefore, accountability and transparency are progressively important in the non-profit sectors. Originally, calls for transparency were for governments to show citizens how their tax money was spent, and the purpose was to improve accountability, build trust, and prevent corruption.

2.6.2 Transparency

The concept of transparency has attracted several interpretations and meanings because defining it is not as easy as it may seem. Fung (2013: 185) understands transparency as availing information to citizens and accentuates that it should be done fairly and equitably. Porumbescu (2015:2) agrees that transparency is providing information and adds that the latter should be of such a nature that the public could utilise it to hold the government accountable. Moore (2017: 1) states that government institutions should be open to the public and not operate in secrecy. Information should neither be hidden from any person or group, nor shared only with specific persons. Thus, information should reach all citizens, including those in remote areas.

Moreover, transparency implies being honest in all communications, transactions, and operations. Institutions should be honest and truthful and they should comply with applicable rules and regulations (Wehmeir and Raaz 2012: 338). Ali (2008: 8) asserts that transparency allows stakeholders to use critical information and, hence, defend their interests.

Policies are helpful to both NGOs and donors in the grant cycle. With more information available, NGOs are better equipped to research and submit higher-quality grant applications. Thus, they can more quickly find the right donors and submit tailor-made applications (Alonzi 2018). Alonzi (2018) adds that in the context of international development, transparency typically means being open and honest. This can apply to donor goals and objectives, staff diversity, the application process, and contact information. However, the call for being open and honest is usually about grants to NGOs.

2.7 MONITORING AND EVALUATION

To meet the growing demands in the world, NGOs are now under greater pressure to demonstrate development success to donors in a clear, comprehensive, compelling, and innovative manner (Toladata 2019). NGOs and CBOs are expected to make their operations as transparent and accountable as possible; hence, monitoring and evaluation practices should be in place in NGOs and CBOs.

Monitoring and evaluation are two terms that are closely linked but they mean slightly different activities. Monitoring can be defined as the systematic process of collecting, analysing, and using information to track a programme's progress toward reaching its objectives and guiding management decisions (UN WOMEN 2010), while evaluation is defined as the systematic assessment of an activity, project, programme, strategy, policy, topic, theme, sector, operational area, or an institution's performance. Evaluation requires an external evaluator to look at whether the allocated resources were used effectively to achieve the desired results (Humanitarian Global 2021). The researcher is of the view that this will curb corruption, which is prevalent in African countries.

FundsForNGOs (2013) states that monitoring and evaluation are separate practices dedicated to the assessment of an NGO's overall performance. Governments and NGOs normally set up projects that are run by NGOs. Therefore, to determine that transparency and efficiency are achieved by an NGO, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) practices ought to be in place. As FundsForNGOs (2013) state, M&E practices can be seen as a way to make the activities of an NGO transparent and easy to account for.

In addition, well-planned M&E can help a project team to gain a better understanding of a target population's needs (Toladata, 2019). This will lead to effective service delivery. With donors and taxpayers directing significant amounts of funds to help vulnerable populations or to solve some of the most urgent problems in the world, understanding how that money is being used, the results of the programmes, and their impact on stakeholders is very important (Humanitarian Global, 2021).

2.8 EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS

As a part of the third sector, NGOs face issues of trust and accountability (Amagoh 2015: 221). Özbek (2015: 95) states that NGOs should constantly search for ways to work with high efficiency.

Britannica Dictionary defines efficiency as the ability to do something or produce something without wasting materials, time, or energy; or the quality or degree of being efficient. Kreitner (2005: 7) suggests that efficiency entails balancing the number of resources used to achieve an objective against what was accomplished. Hence, organisational efficiency can be viewed as achieving an objective concerning cost and time. Thus, NGOs are said to be efficient when they attain project objectives with the minimum costs possible and on time (Ochuodho, 2015: 39).

Devon (2019) states that effectiveness refers to how an organisation has achieved full self-awareness due in part to the following: leaders setting well-defined goals for employees and outlining ways to efficiently execute those goals; management implementing clear decision-making processes; communication pipelines; and engaged employees who are carefully selected and fairly compensated producing work that prioritises results.

NGOs perform a variety of services and humanitarian functions, bring citizens' concerns to governments, monitor policy and programme implementation, and encourage the participation of civil society stakeholders at the community level (Brown 2009: 3). Furthermore, NGOs are perceived as being more effective at delivering development aid and they are more responsive and flexible than governments (Lenihan & Walsh, 2006: 412); this is because they are generally staffed by hardworking, qualified, and dedicated employees. For NGOs to be perceived as efficient, they should be able to clearly explain their vision, mission, and programmes, and have clear indicators to measure progress towards the achievement of agreed goals.

2.9 SERVICE DELIVERY

Service delivery remains a pressing issue to this day throughout Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA). Many authors have defined it and in most cases definitions are similar. Avis (2016: 15), like other authors, defines the term service delivery as the provision of a

sufficient, affordable, and quality basic service. Lovelock and Wright (2002), in turn, define it as the actual delivery of service and products to a customer or client. Hub Knowledge's (2020) definition is similar to the other two, but it adds that the services are provided by the government (local, municipal and national). These services range from health care and water to education and sanitation licenses. Service delivery is considered a core function of urban governments, meaning governments have the mandate to make sure that all citizens are provided with services to satisfy their basic needs. According to Municipal Service Delivery (2020), these services have a direct and immediate effect on the quality of the lives of the people in a community, as the provision of sufficient, affordable and quality basic services is considered a core function of urban governments (Avis, 2016: 15).

According to Foster and Briceno (2010: vii), service delivery in Africa lags significantly behind that of other developing countries and is considerably more expensive than anywhere else. African governments, like most countries in the developing world, face a daunting task in their attempts to provide effective and equitable public services (Kenosi, 2011: 20). Hence, over the past few decades, there has been a major trend toward the private sector taking responsibility for the delivery of public services that have traditionally been provided by governments (e.g., postal services, transportation, waste management). As Odaro (2012: 37) states, in many places in the developing world, a large share of service activity comes from the private sector and community participation.

Kenosi (2011: 20) states that poor quality and a lack of the widespread availability of services like electricity, water and sanitation, and roads are common in some SSA countries. Kenosi (2011: 21) adds that the provision of water and other basic services needs to be documented, not just for the ruling party to boast about its service delivery record, but also to allow international bodies like the UN to measure its progress towards the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). However, in most African governments it is not the case.

Many governments have decided to outsource the provision of some services to the private sector, mainly NGOs, as many African governments are characterised by poor service delivery. According to Kalonda and Govender (2021: 1), factors that contribute to poor service delivery in Africa are lack of community participation, lack

of leadership, inadequate service delivery, a lack of skills, financial difficulties, corruption, and ineffective strategic management.

2.9.1 Community participation

Many development thinkers and practitioners have pondered over community participation for the last few decades (Botes & Van Rensburg 2000: 41). To a large extent, the current decade of social movements, NGOs, and CBOs are a manifestation of organised community participation (Botes & Van Rensburg 2000: 41).

Hischimuti (2015) defines community participation as a process by which a community mobilises its resources, initiates and takes responsibility for its development activities, and shares in decision-making for and implementation of all other development programmes for the overall improvement of its health status. The European Union (2005: 177), in turn, defines community participation as the involvement of people in the community in projects to solve their own problems.

Participation is one of the means of facilitating inclusive governance, active citizenship, and resilient cities. Avis (2015: 25) states that participation is one means of facilitating inclusive governance, active citizenship, and resilient cities; thus, promoting democracy, as well as checks and balances and the attainment of community-felt needs, and the enhancement of good governance (Abdullahi and Abdullah 2018). Moyo (2012: 16), on the other hand, states that throughout the world community participation is the basic objective of governments and decentralisation is considered as an effective device for achieving such development.

UNESCAP and UN-Habitat (2015: 161) are of the view that city managers must be more responsive to communities and civil society groups and involve those affected by changes in policy or planning. This will motivate people to work together to better their own lives. However, most Africans still fail to take part in their communities because of the unfair distribution of work or benefits amongst the members of the community. Treating the community with respect and listening and learning from them will go a long way towards building a successful programme/project.

2.9.2 Corruption

Various definitions of corruption exist; therefore, setting a precise definition of corruption has been a difficult task in academic literature as it tends to mean different things to different people. Across Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) any countries are making considerable progress towards the vision of a democratic, prosperous, and peaceful continent outlined in the African Union's Agenda 2063. However, gains are threatened by high levels of corruption (Hub Knowledge, 2022:1).

Corruption is one of the greatest obstacles to Africa's growth and development. Corruption entails the unauthorized utilisation of power or influence by someone in the public or private sector by means to enrich himself and/or herself at the expense of the general populace (Mlambo, D., Mubecua, M., Mpanza, S. and Mlambo,VB 2019:40). Examples of these corrupt behaviors may vary between the appropriation of public assets and property for personal use, cronyism, nepotism, embezzlement, bribery, and extortion. Azeez (2018: 45) states that corruption can further be broken down into other broad forms such as petty corruption, grand corruption, and looting. Corruption activities that take place usually fall under these three broad forms.

Wherever corruption occurs, represents a decline in our value system as a nation. If left unchecked, it poses a grave threat to our democratic values and our dream of being an ethical and developmental state. Corruption is a major challenge to economic, social, and political developments in SSA. Although differing significantly across countries and public institutions in Africa, corruption undermines the chances of hundreds of millions of citizens to have a stable and prosperous future (Jones, 2021).

According to Transparency International (2023) that not only is corruption a barrier to economic growth and good governance, but also to basic freedoms such as freedom of speech or citizens' right to hold governments to account. The high-level damage and systemic corruption inflicted on already struggling African economies cannot be ignored or written off as normal or negligible. The illicit activities of elected officials, bureaucrats, and industry leaders are leaving states unable to deliver the most basic services to their citizens (Mhaka, 2022).

Lawal (2007: s1) observes that the consequences of corruption are normally drawn from a triad of spheres that encompass political, economic, and social driven motives. From a political perspective, corruption may trigger political instability and brain drain. Unrest may occur driven by individuals who have had enough of corruption activities, as it limits the speed of service delivery and diverts resources intended for economic development to corrupt individuals. When viewing it from a social perspective, corruption grants individuals the platform to loot the state for personal gain and/or self-enrichment (Mlambo *et al.*, 2019: 42).

2.9.3 Control corruption

The World Bank Group considers corruption a major challenge to its twin goals of ending extreme poverty by 2030 and boosting shared prosperity for the poorest 40 percent of people in developing countries (World Bank, 2016). There is no silver bullet for fighting corruption, as Transparency international (2016) has stated. Many countries have however made significant progress in curbing corruption; but, practitioners are always on the lookout for solutions and evidence of the impact.

Recently, the African Development Bank and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) led calls among partner institutions for greater vigilance to tackle corruption and to ensure the best environment to build back African economies after the Covid-19 pandemic (Africa Development Bank, 2021). As a means to fight and curb corruption, the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS), the Southern African Development Community (SADC), and the African Union (AU) have each established protocols on corruption.

In terms of SADC, the SADC Protocol against Corruption has as its primary objective to improve and harmonise anti-corruption policies and laws in and across the region and to facilitate regional cooperation (SADC 2002). ECOWAS, in turn, aims to promote and strengthen the development of each of the state's effective mechanisms to prevent, suppress, and eradicate corruption. According to Mbaku (2000), comprehensive institutional reforms to establish and sustain participatory, accountable and transparent governance structures, and economic systems that guarantee the individual the right to engage in exchange and contract are the only ways to deal effectively with corruption and other forms of political opportunism in Africa.

2.10 DEVELOPMENT

In 1974, a group of ten of the world's development experts met at Cocoyoc, Mexico, to attempt to set a new agenda of alternative development for what they considered to be the failure of development in the 1950s and 1960s (Slim, 1995). The international agenda then began to focus on development, beginning in the second half of the twentieth century. The Society for International Development (2021) explains that an understanding developed that economic growth did not necessarily lead to a rise in the level and quality of life for populations all over the world. There was a need to place emphasis on specific policies that would channel resources and enable social and economic mobility for various layers of the population.

Referring to development, Rabie (2016) states that it involves the application of certain economic and technical measures to utilise available resources to initiate economic growth and improve people's quality of life. As stated in the MDGs (2016), the word 'development' is widely used to refer to a specified state of advancement or growth. The Society for International Development (2021) defines development as a process that creates growth, progress, positive change, or the addition of physical, economic, environmental, social, and demographic components. According to the MDGs (2016), each country has its own unique set of priorities in their development policies.

2.10.1 Social development

The Government of New Brunswick Canada (2009) states that social development is about improving the well-being of every individual in society, so that they can reach their full potential. The success of a society is linked to the well-being of every citizen.

2.10.2 Economic development

Economic development first became a major concern after World War II, states Desai (2016). As the era of European colonialism ended, many former colonies and other countries with low living standards came to be termed 'underdeveloped countries', to contrast their economies with those of the developed countries, which were understood to be Canada, the United States, Western Europe, most Eastern

European countries, the then Soviet Union, Japan, South Africa, Australia, and New Zealand. As living standards in most poor countries began to rise in subsequent decades, they have renamed them 'developing countries' (Desai 2016). Their economies were slowly seen to develop.

Gurbax (2020) states that economic development is the creation of wealth from which community benefits are realised. It is more than a jobs programme, it is an investment in growing the economy and enhancing the prosperity and quality of life for all residents. Economic Recovery and Innovation (n.d.) defines economic development as programmes, policies, or activities that seek to improve the economic well-being and quality of life for a community. Economic development is also taken to be the structural transformation of an economy by introducing more mechanised and updated technologies to increase labour productivity, employment, incomes, and the standard of living of the population (Panth 2020). Economic development should be accompanied by improvements in infrastructure, as well as social, political, and institutional factors to facilitate the transformation of the economy (Myint & Krueger 2016). It is worth mentioning that if an economy is undergoing significant development, it is naturally expanding and growing, hence economic development can also be referred to as economic growth or advancement.

Communities normally develop a plan on how to tackle the challenges of development. As emphasised by Economic Recovery and Innovation (2020), an economic development plan helps realise a community's economic vision and takes control of the community's economic future. An economic development plan can also help bring together a community's residents with the private and public sectors. Together a community can choose their economic development goals and outline how to accomplish those goals. Economic development strategies are normally put in place in communities to create more jobs and more job variety, keep existing businesses and attract new ones, and create a better quality of life; hence, more people and businesses pay taxes (ibid.).

Community economic development is also known as Local Economic Development (LED). It is an approach toward economic development, which allows and encourages local people to work together to achieve sustainable economic growth

and development, thereby bringing economic benefits and an improved quality of life for all residents in a local municipal area (Local Economic Development 2016).

2.10.3 Sustainable human development

In 1986, the General Assembly of the UN in the preamble of its Declaration entitled 'Rights in Development' declared, "Development is a comprehensive economic, social, cultural and political process, which aims at the constant improvement of the well-being of the entire population and all individuals based on their active, free and meaningful participation in development and the fair distribution of benefits resulting there from".

The concept of sustainable development can be interpreted in different ways, but at its core is an approach to development that looks to balance different, and often competing, needs against an awareness of the environmental, social, and economic limitations we face as a society (Sustainable Development Commission 2019). Youmatter (2020) defines sustainable development as the idea that human societies must live and meet their needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.

Human development is expanding the choices of all people in society. This means that men and women, particularly the poor and vulnerable, are at the centre of the development process. It also means "protection of the life opportunities of future generations... and the natural systems on which all life depends", according to the UNDP Human Development Report (1996).

Returning to sustainable development, it was first adopted by the United Nations Member States in 2015. According to Sustainable Development (2019), the concept of sustainable development aims to encourage the use of products and services in a manner that reduces the impact on the environment and optimises the resources to satisfy human needs. The concept of sustainable development is rooted in three main pillars that aim to achieve inclusive growth as well as create shared prosperity for the current generation and continue to meet the needs of future generations. The three pillars are economic, social and environmental development. They are interconnected and reflect the goals of community development and social and environmental stability.

The three pillars of sustainability lack a clear and consistent definition. While interpretations of the individual pillars vary, together the three pillars are meant to work in connection with one another, with true sustainability occurring when the three pillars are balanced (Green Reporter 2021).

Economic sustainability strives to promote those activities through which long-term economic growth can be achieved without harming the environmental, social, and cultural aspects of the community, while social sustainability is a form of social responsibility that significantly takes place when a community's stable and unstable components need a revival of depleted resources. Culture is one of the main components of the concept of sustainable development. The need for cultural sustainability arises from the growing awareness of the importance of cultural rights and the preservation of cultural heritage.

Participation is one means of facilitating inclusive governance, active citizenship, and resilient cities. This promoted democracy, as well as checks and balances, the attainment of community-felt needs, and the enhancement of good governance.

2.11 POVERTY ALLEVIATION

Poverty is one of the major problems worldwide, especially in developing countries; therefore, poverty alleviation is an ethical requirement. According to Ferguson (2011: 2), despite the endeavours to meet the first MDG and other anti-poverty campaigns in the last two decades, it is an understatement to acknowledge that there has not been universal success in eliminating world poverty. At least 1.4 billion people live in extreme poverty and with the current worldwide financial crisis, researchers have estimated that another 100 million people may become extremely poor (Ferguson, 2011).

Poverty and poverty alleviation will be defined in this chapter for a mutual understanding by the researcher and the reader. According to the World Bank (2015), poverty is pronounced deprivation in well-being and comprises many dimensions. It includes low incomes and the inability to acquire the basic goods and services necessary for survival with dignity (World Mayor 2021). Adongo and Deen-Swarray (2006) further defined poverty alleviation as any process that reduces

income fluctuation between poor and non-poor scenarios. Poverty alleviation aims to improve the quality of life for those people currently living in poverty.

Although poverty is a multi-dimensional phenomenon, poverty levels are often measured using economic dimensions based on income and consumption. As per the Planning Commission of India, the level of poverty in a country can be estimated based on the consumer expenditure surveys that are conducted by the National Sample Survey Office (NSSO) under the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation.

After independence in some African countries, it became clear that state intervention in the economy was not necessarily leading to sustained wealth creation that could improve the lives of the poor (Nyong'o, 2001: 7). Hence, NGOs and governments took hands in the fight against poverty. They then identified many policies and practices which could improve the success of the efforts to alleviate poverty (Ferguson 2011). Rohman (2009) explains that in the context of poverty eradication, NGOs have two roles – providing direct social services and influencing government policies to meet the needs of the poor. According to Rohman (2009), this can be seen in some of the characteristics of NGOs, which emphasize participation processes, empowerment, and programme sustainability.

Nyong'o (2001: 6) states that under good governance, a national anti-poverty plan involves not only policy papers setting out what government intends to do about poverty, but also how the system of government is to be structured to enhance participation, accountability, citizenship rights (both political and economic), and political inclusion.

In 2000, the United Nations launched the MDGs, a coordinated international effort to eradicate poverty and raise living standards worldwide by 2030 (Savoia & Asadullah 2019). Then, in 2015, the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), also known as the Global Goals, were announced in Africa. The SDGs were adopted by the United Nations as a universal call to action to end poverty, protect the planet, and ensure that by 2030 all people enjoy peace and prosperity (UNDP 2015). The United Nations 2015 Report stated that this agenda acknowledges that eradicating poverty in all its forms and dimensions, including extreme poverty, is the greatest global challenge and an indispensable requirement for sustainable development. The first

SDG aims to "end poverty in all its forms everywhere". Its associated targets aim to eradicate extreme poverty for all people everywhere, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women, and children of all ages living in poverty, implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable (United Nations 2015).

Research has shown that many people have escaped extreme poverty in the first three years after the goals were adopted – between January 2016 and July 2018. Savoia and Asadullah (2019) emphasised that, according to their research, the adoption of the goals in 2000 played a significant part in accelerating the process of poverty reduction in the world.

Fighting poverty requires direct policy interventions. As Savoia and Asadullah (2019) state, to accelerate the end of poverty, African states should focus on developing enough capability for designing and delivering poverty reduction strategies. In addition, Ayo (2022) states that poverty reduction can be attained in the following ways: by stimulating economic growth to increase incomes and expand employment opportunities for the poor; undertaking economic and institutional reforms to enhance efficiency and improve the utilisation of resources; prioritising the basic needs of the poor in national development policies; promoting microfinance and small-scale business; developing and improving marketing systems to improve production; providing incentives to the private sector, like NGOs and CBOs; and implementing affirmative action, such as targeted cash transfers to ensure that the social and economic benefits of poverty reduction initiatives reach the demographics that might otherwise be excluded.

2.12 GOVERNANCE AS A CONCEPT

Recently the terms 'governance' and 'good governance' are increasingly being used in development literature (UNESCAP n.d.). The concept of 'governance' is however not new. Moreover, it means different things to different people.

The World Bank (1992) defined 'governance' as a method through which power is exercised in the management of a country's political, economic, and social resources for development. UNESCO (2016), in turn, states that it refers to structures and processes that are designed to ensure accountability, transparency, responsiveness,

the rule of law, stability, equity and inclusiveness, empowerment, and broad-based participation. According to Human Rights (2015), governance refers to all processes of governing the institutions, processes, and practices through which issues of common concern are decided upon and regulated. Thus, governance not only encompasses but transcends the collective meaning of related concepts like the state, government, regime, and good government.

Governance can be subtle and may not be easily observable. In a broad sense, governance is about the culture and institutional environment in which citizens and stakeholders interact among themselves and participate in public affairs (UNESCO 2016). In addition, USAID (n.d.) states that in governance, citizens are rightly concerned with a government's responsiveness to their needs and the protection of their rights. In general, governance issues are about the ability of a government to develop an efficient, effective, and accountable public management process that is open to citizen participation and that strengthens rather than weakens a democratic system of government.

Governance has three legs: economic, political, and administrative. Economic governance includes decision-making processes that affect a country's economic activities and its relationships with other economies. It has major implications for equity, poverty, and quality of life. Political governance is the process of decision-making to formulate (Good Governance and Sustainable Human Development, 2009), while administrative governance is the system of policy implementation (UNDP 2014).

2.12.1 Good governance

The term 'good governance' came to prominence at the end of the 1980s during an era of unique political changes (Uddin and Joya 2007: 9). In the meantime, it has become a buzzword in the vocabulary of polity and administrative reform, mainly due to the importance given to it by the international community (Tripathi 2017). According to Addressing Good Governance in Africa (AGGN) (2010), the concept of good governance "is emerging as a principle of international law", and state Chowdhury and Skarstedt (2005: 3), African countries and their agencies are expected to adhere to it.

We retain the definition of good governance, suggested by the World Bank (1989), as the traditions and institutions by which authority in a country is exercised. It was in a study that was conducted by the World Bank on SSA when the then World Bank president first used the term "good governance", which he referred to as efficient public service, a reliable judicial system, and an accountable administration (World Bank, 1989: xii).

In the introduction to the report, *Sub-Saharan Africa: from Crisis to Sustainable Growth* (in World Bank, 1989, xii), it was asserted that the major cause of poor economic performance in Africa was "the failure of public institutions", and that "private sector initiative and market mechanisms are important but must go hand-in-hand with good governance..." (AGGN 2010). However, Ngobo and Fouda (2012: 436) assert that the problems facing African countries are not framed entirely as cultural or economic issues but mostly as political issues; poor development is argued to result primarily from poor governance. If Africa is to attain sustainable development, good governance must be viewed through a more comprehensive lens, rather than the narrow political and economic views, which have overshadowed other important aspects of the lives of Africans (AGGN 2010). According to Tripathi (2017), good governance signifies a participative manner of governing in a responsible, accountable, and transparent manner based on the principles of efficiency, legitimacy, and consensus to promote the rights of individual citizens and the public interest; thus, indicating the existence of a political will for ensuring the material welfare of society and sustainable development with social justice. Furthermore, good governance strengthens the legitimacy of government by making public administration more transparent. Moreover, it is the mandate of any government to ensure that free and fair democracy exists so that the rule of law can be applied, and effective and efficient services can be provided to the users of services (Rakhare 2019: 38).

2.12.2 The importance of good governance

In the 1990s, the World Bank became the first international institution to adopt the concept of good governance into lending arrangements in developing countries and introduce the idea to the public (Admin 2021). In the 1992 report by the World Bank, good governance was defined as how power is used to regulate the economic and

social resources of a country for development; moreover, it is defined as the process of measuring how public institutions conduct public affairs and manage public resources and guarantee the realisation of human rights in a manner essentially free of abuse and corruption and with due regard for the rule of law.

Good governance, as stated by Admin (2021), aims to minimise corruption, consider the opinions of the minorities, listen to the voices of the oppressed people in the decision-making process, and respond actively to the needs of the community now and in the future. According to the OHCHR, the key question for assessing good governance is: Are the institutions of governance effectively guaranteeing the right to health, adequate housing, sufficient food, quality education, justice, and personal security?

UNESCAP (n.d.) observes the eight major characteristics of good governance. They are participatory, consensus oriented, accountable, transparent, responsive, effective and efficient, equitable and inclusive, and follows the rule of law. Good governance further ensures that political, social, and economic priorities are based on broad consensus in society and that the voices of the poorest and the most vulnerable are heard in decision-making over the allocation of development resources (UNESCAP n.d.).

Good governance is hugely important in any country or state, as it leads to economic, social, and political development (Biswas 2020). Without good governance in a state, the economic development of that state is not stable; therefore, good governance is considered key to achieving sustainable development and human well-being (ibid.). Biswas (2020) adds that good governance is the proper management of the state, society, and resources. It also seeks to protect the interests of people of all classes. Therefore, it is an ideal concept to achieve a country or state's goals. Yet, implementing good governance is not as easy as it appears on paper (Admin 2021), but when good governance is established in a state, it is obvious for all to see.

2.13 THEORIES ON GOOD GOVERNANCE

Over the last two decades, a vast array of researchers, research centres, journals, and conferences were devoted to the study of governance, and many new theories of governance have been promulgated.

Theories of governance are analytical lenses that help us understand our contemporary world. These theories have different purposes. Some of them bring into focus how different actors, jurisdictions, levels, and institutional arenas interact to exchange knowledge and ideas, coordinate action, and collaborate in making authoritative decisions that produce collective outcomes (Ansell & Torfing 2022: 1).

2.13.1 Traditional authority theory

Traditional authority is one of the three forms of authority identified by sociologist Max Weber's tripartite classification of authority, alongside charismatic authority and rational-legal authority (HR Zone 2013). Max Weber was the first to define traditional authority as part of a larger classification system for types of authority based on sources of power and leadership styles (MasterClass 2022). The Weberian system identifies traditional domination as one of three types of authority.

The starting point for a consideration of governance theories is the traditional notion of top-down authority in the state. Governments are the only legitimate embodiment of the general will and it is the possible source of governance in these models.

A significant shift is that the state becomes a substitute for the family system. This is because a market-based economy requires law and order to be guaranteed on a national level. The state increasingly takes responsibility for reproductive/social functions as it organises education and health services. It establishes a system of secondary distribution to give care to the elderly, the disabled, or the unemployed, which were responsibilities previously within the domain of the family system.

2.13.2 Network management theory

One axiomatic statement provided by the governance perspective is that governing is about the operation of networks of a complex mix of actors and organisations. As Rhodes (1997a) argues, initial work on policy networks that focused on policy-making in particular sectors of the economy and society gave way to a wider appreciation of the way that networks are central for many of the elements of

governing, including implementation (Hill & Hupe 2002), to the extent that many academics began to take the view that “governance is about managing networks” (Rhodes 1997a: 52).

Another way to think about the power and significance of society in governance is to think of the literature on civil society. Civil societies include organisations that are separate from the legislative, administrative, and judicial power of the state and these may include religious groups, cultural and educational associations, labour unions, sports clubs, ethnic groups, and political parties, which adhere to their rules of conduct and distinctive customs. Municipalities are responsible for effective service delivery and offer established contracts to and obtain the co-operation of the relevant institutions in the society (Cloet 1996: 5).

An effective civil society is important to the democratic aspects of governance. Rather than competing with the government, civil society is seen as complementary and cooperative; therefore, it enhances good governance.

2.13.3 Cultural theory

Cultural theory is a constructivist theory, developed by Mary Douglas, Aaron Wildavsky and others, which seeks to participate in the positivist project of discovering, explaining, and predicting regularities in human behaviour (Swedlow 2014). The theory compels an organisation to establish its governing structures based on its norms, behaviours, and practices.

According to the theory, an organisation makes decisions based on four distinctive cultural biases, namely egalitarianism, hierarchism, individualism, and fatalism (Swedlow 2014: 469). The individual dimension takes a self-centred approach to decision-making and individualist abilities and interests determine the governing approach. Loyens (2013: 34) argues that the individual dimension encourages competition rather than cooperation Nelson, Singh, Elenkov, Ma, Krug, Davis and Wright (2013:4) concur that the individual dimension adopts an opportunistic approach and is mainly concerned with what they can do and achieve, rather than adopt a collective approach. Hierarchism focuses on group identity, but like egalitarianism, discourages influence from the external environment. The hierarchism dimension inhibits innovation and change, as the organisation only

bases its decisions on the group identity (Joseph Ripberger, Geoboo Song, Matthew C, Nowlin, Michael D, Jones and Hank C.Jenkins-Smith 2012: 4), while fatalism plays a significant vital role in the external environment decision-making process. Lastly, egalitarianism accentuates drawing policies or governance practices from the group traits and excludes external environmental pressures.

Suh *et al.* (2012: 5090) state that individuals are dependent on external forces to direct their course of action and there is no room for collective action. However, Ripberger *et al.* (2012: 6) assert that dependency on external forces alienates individuals from being part of influential social groups.

The reintroduction of cultural theory as an important tool for political analysis is closely linked to some key issues of contemporary politics: the changing behavior of consumers and voters, the loosening of traditional social relations as well as of political affiliations, and the transformation of society towards new cultural group patterns. This reopened the question of political culture(s) as a basis for democratic governance in advanced societies (Gibbins 1989; Gibbins & Reimer, 1999).

2.13.4 Agency theory

Agency theory was developed by Jensen and Meekling in 1976. The primary focus was to develop governing structures or mechanisms to manage the probability of managers using the organisation's resources for their own benefit. According to the agency theory, there will always be a goal conflict between the manager and the organisation, as Van Puyrelde, Caers, Du Bois and Jeggens (2012: 435) noted. Furthermore, the manager will always be perceived as the culprit.

Nelson *et al.* (2013: 22) state that the agency theory focuses on protecting the power delegated to managers to inhibit probable abuse. Organisations which derive their governing style from this theory will develop internal and external governance mechanisms, such as an Independent Boards of Directors and Monitoring and Evaluation Boards to compel controlling and monitoring, as alluded to by Pepper and Gore (2012: 3).

2.14 ACCOUNTABILITY IN GOVERNANCE

Accountability lies at the heart of democratic government. Hence, strengthening domestic accountability has been a growing component of development assistance in recent decades. Accountability is also a key requirement of good governance. Not only governmental institutions, but also the private sector and civil society organisations must be accountable to the public and their institutional stakeholders (UNESCAP n.d.).

Accountability is defined as the ability to provide answers to higher authorities over the actions of a person/group of people to the wider community within an organisation (Khotami 2017). The definition by Columbian University (n.d.) of accountability runs along the same lines. It is defined as the degree to which local governments must explain or justify what they have done or failed to do.

Accountability is one of the steps that must be taken to maintain and increase public confidence in government performance. Guerin, McCrae and Shephard (2018) observed that strong accountability matters – and when it works, it benefits everyone. It enables people to know how the government is doing, and how to gain redress when things go wrong. It ensures that ministers and civil servants are acting in the interests of the people who they serve. Lastly, creating a culture of accountability improves employee morale, increases effectiveness, and protects against liability risks.

Drishti (2022), in the article 'Accountability and Governance', discusses the advantages of accountability in governance. He firstly refers to democratic governance, stating that accountability to citizens is a fundamental principle of democratic governance. It is not limited to accountability to seniors in the hierarchy, only as part of the chain of command, but also to stakeholders including citizens and civil society. Secondly, Drishti (2022) discusses answerability. Accountability is an answerability component to justify actions and an enforcement component, which is to act in cases where an act of omission or commission is established. The third advantage, according to Drishti (2022), is remedial measures. These measures provide for punishment in the case of deviations from norms.

Hopwood and Tomkins (1984) and Elwood (1993) discussed the dimensions of accountability that must be met by public institutions. Firstly, they discuss accountability law and honesty. In this dimension, public institutions should behave

honestly in their work and comply with applicable legal provisions. Secondly, they refer to process accountability. In this dimension, accountability processes associated with procedures used in performing tasks are good enough in terms of the adequacy of accounting information systems, management information systems, and administrative procedures. Thirdly, programme accountability is concerned with whether the objectives set out are achievable or not, and whether the organisation has considered alternative programmes that provide optimal results for a minimal cost (ibid.).

The democratic local governance initiatives underway in many countries hold promise for developing effective systems of public accountability that will ensure that government servants are responsible to elected officials and that the latter in turn are responsible to the public who elected them in the first place.

2.15 PROMOTING HUMAN RIGHTS – GOOD GOVERNANCE

There is no doubt that nurturing good governance is essential to ensuring respect for human rights. Without the rule of law, independent courts and other institutions of modern society, which are essential components of good governance, the promise of human rights may remain a promise unfulfilled (Kirby 2005).

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which was adopted by the UN General Assembly on 10 December 1948, was the result of the experience of the Second World War. With the end of the War, and the creation of the United Nations, the international community vowed to never allow atrocities like those to happen again (United Nations 2021). Human rights advocates agree that 60 years after its issue, this Universal Declaration is still more a dream than reality (United for Human Rights 2009).

Schwie (2019) defines human rights violation as the disallowance of the freedom of thought and movement to which all humans legally have a right. While individuals can violate these rights, the leadership or government of civilisation most often belittles marginalised persons. The OHCHR (2022) states that the goal that every human being should have full enjoyment of their human rights implies that nobody should suffer violations of those rights. Violations of rights place people in a cycle of poverty and oppression. Examples of violation are acts typically deemed ‘crimes

against humanity', including genocide, torture, slavery, rape, enforced sterilisation or medical experimentation, and deliberate starvation.

According to Ssenyonjo (2018: 2), Africa has historically been a region with widespread human rights violations manifested in several forms, including slavery, (neo)-colonialism, apartheid, and multidimensional (extreme) poverty. He (2018) adds that during colonialism Africa's human and material resources were largely exploited for the benefit of outside powers. This left Africa in poverty, which reflects an acute "deprivation of the resources, capabilities, choices, security, and power necessary for the enjoyment of an adequate standard of living", states Ssenyonjo (2018). Hence, the adoption of the Charter of the Organisation of African Unity (OAU) in 1963, among others. This aimed to achieve a better life for the peoples of Africa and to eradicate all forms of colonialism from the continent.

According to Human Rights Careers (2020), states bear the primary burden of responsibility for protecting and encouraging human rights. When violations occur, it is the government's job to intervene and prosecute those responsibly. The government must hold everyone (and itself) accountable.

Soken-Huberty (2020) observes that violations by the state may either be direct or indirect. Violations can either be intentionally performed by the state or occur because of the state failing to prevent the violation. The second type of violation – failure by the state to protect – occurs when there is a conflict between individuals or groups within a society (Soken-Huberty 2020).

Achieving a sustainable, practical, and effective method of protecting human rights around the globe that also allows local values and culture to remain intact is a difficult ambition. Humans must recognise the beauty of individual differences and attempt to understand each other before change can occur.

The Honourable Justice M. Kirby (2005) states that good governance needs to aim for justice, while the element of the rule of law is extremely important as part of good governance for the promotion of human rights. That element should not merely imply respect for the national law, but rather for law that is consistent with the international human rights framework, which promotes justice.

2.16 LESS ACTIVE CIVIL SOCIETY

A World Bank Group Report (2013: 22) stated that civil society all over the globe had experienced a dramatic expansion in size, scope, and capacity, aided by the process of globalisation and democratic governance, telecommunications, and economic integration. Civil society organisations have played a significant role in global development assistance, as well as shaping domestic and global policies through their campaigns for debt cancellation and environmental protection (Azu 2019).

Civil society is the ecosystem that influences social change outside of the family, or government. It is often referred to as the space where we act for the common good (Shaw 2020); whereas, Ingram (2020) says that civil society comprises organisations that are not associated with the government, including schools and universities, advocacy groups, professional associations, churches, and cultural institutions (business sometimes is covered by the term civil society and sometimes not).

Ingram (2020) points out that civil society is an essential building block of development and national cohesion. Shaw (2020) elaborates on the roles of civil society. Firstly, there is social accountability; that is, they hold corporations, faith-based, and other organisations accountable for their actions (or inactions). Secondly, civil society empowers communities and gives a voice to the disorganised, voiceless segments of society; and lastly, they ensure good governance, which means civil society works hand-in-hand with the government, striving to develop policy and implement new strategies.

To add to Shaw's (2020) list of the roles of civil society, Ingram (2020) states that in a country blessed with peace and stability, civil society fills the space untouched by the government and the private sector. In a fragile and conflict-ridden country, it plays an even more important role in providing services, which are normally the responsibility of the state and business, and it can lay the foundation for reconciliation.

Harju (2020) states that civil society is based on individuals' freedom of choice, freedom from administrative regulations, and freedom from profit-making. Thus, when civil society has this freedom, they become efficient in their work. Paffenholz and Spurk (2010: 14) provide seven functions that civil society plays in peace building. These functions are protection, service delivery, monitoring, advocacy, public communication, social cohesion intermediation, and facilitation and service

delivery. According to ACTED (2022), the monitoring function involves monitoring the performance of government and other stakeholders in the provision of services and holding them accountable for their work in local planning and budgeting. Secondly, civil societies are tasked with delivering basic services, such as primary education, health, water and sanitation, and providing shelter, counseling, and support services to disadvantaged groups. The protection function means advocating for human rights and for the needs and priorities of their constituency (especially of marginalised groups), advocating against government deficiencies, contributing to mediating and resolving conflict, and lastly, contributing to social innovation.

2.17 FIGHTING FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRIMINALISATION OF POLITICS

Justice must be accessible, speedy and affordable; crime investigation must be insulated from the vagaries of partisan politics and made accountable, and we must move towards better electoral systems with effective safeguards to ensure the democratic choice of candidates.

2.18 CONCLUSION

The chapter focused on understanding the concepts of NGOs, CBOs, and governance in depth. It further presented the role played by NGOs and CBOs in governance. The chapter also established that CBOs and NGOs serve either to offer development (social, economic, and political) or to assist the state in delivering certain services to citizens. The ability of NGOs and CBOs to do this task depends on the transparency and accountability of these organisations. It is important to note here that corruption hinders development from taking place in communities and there is a great need for countries to control corruption.

The chapter further focused on understanding good governance and its importance in the public service. It was also established that there is no single agreed-on definition of governance. Scholars define governance based on the theory they deem significant, such as the cultural, institutional, stewardship and agency theory. Moreover, the role of good governance in public administration was established, and its effect on service delivery.

This chapter can be seen as a foundation of the chapters to follow as it provides an understanding on how NGOs and CBOs function well where good governance prevails. Good governance enables these organisations to promote development and provide efficient service delivery.

CHAPTER THREE: CHALLENGES/CONSTRAINTS FACING NGOs AND CBOs IN PROVIDING SERVICE DELIVERY

3.1 Introduction

NGOs are seen worldwide performing a wide range of services aimed toward human well-being and social welfare. According to FundsForNGOs (2021), these organisations relentlessly work towards development and bringing positive change in society. NGOs, sometimes called civil society organisations, are established on community, national, and international levels to serve a social or political goal such as a humanitarian cause or the protection of the environment (Folger, 2022: 1). The term came into use in 1945 when the UN wanted to differentiate in its charter between participation rights for intergovernmental private organisations and other civil society organisations (Willetts, 2002).

Bromideh (2011: 197) states that NGOs can refer to any organisation, provided that they are independent of government control, not seeking to challenge governments either as a political party or by a narrow focus on human rights, non-profit making, and non-criminal. Bromideh (2011) further states that the non-profit-making qualifier is an important attribute of an NGO.

According to Rahman (2003: 55), the nature of NGOs reflects their five basic characteristics, namely, non-governmental, voluntary, non-commercial, accountable, and non-political. NGOs should be driven by the urge to do well without the motive of achieving profits or being politically influenced.

There are three types of NGOs, as explained by Rahman (2003), namely grassroots/CBOs, support organisations, and intermediating organisations. Bromideh (2011: 198) states that in broader terms, most NGOs can be classified into two groups, operational and advocacy NGOs. Operational NGOs must mobilise resources, in the form of financial donations, materials, or volunteer labour to sustain their projects and programmes, while advocacy NGOs will conduct many of the same functions, but with a different balance between them (Willetts 2002; Mostashari 2005).

Most NGOs in Africa, while continuously working towards their goals, they face many challenges. They find it difficult to obtain sufficient and continuous funding for their

work and there is rising pressure on NGOs to better allocate and manage their limited resources. The dynamics between NGOs and governments and within NGOs affect their ability to provide services, and the dynamics in implementation and decision-making pose great challenges.

Abidin *et al.* (2022: 9) state that funds are critical for NGOs to implement their projects, programmes, and activities that benefit their communities' development. The authors (2022) add that NGOs could have different structures, activities and policies, but all NGOs are committed to their cause and perform their functions to achieve their respective goals.

There has been growing interest in the contribution of NGOs to the services provided in communities. Gooding (2017) observes that to impact service delivery, NGOs need to provide effective service, which meets the needs of their recipients. However, according to experts, effective service delivery is situation-specific and requires tailored delivery arrangements that fuse the efforts of the state and non-state actors (Albanie 2016).

Muhammad Ali Nader (2015: 3) refers to NGOs as service providers (the delivery of basic services), advocates of the poor (advocating on behalf of the poor) and supporting the poor to be advocates for themselves (empowerment). The author (2015) documented the contribution made by NGOs in providing services to the poorest people in communities. FundsForNGOs (2021) states that NGOs perform these services for social well-being, either through implementing development projects or through policy advocacy.

NGOs refer to highly diverse groups of enterprises engaged in a wide spectrum of non-profit activities (Maximpact, 2017). The focus of NGOs can range from humanitarian and rural development to assisting local start-ups and businesses. These causes differ based on the focus areas NGOs have; generally, NGOs are determined to give aid and support for advanced development. However, NGOs currently face challenges in their pursuit of giving aid and support to communities, ranging from funding to strategy changes. Hence, this affects the provision of their core activities. All this has been ascribed to the global economic crisis. NGOs play an essential role in the social field in the fight against poverty and social exclusion; yet they operate under many constraints.

This chapter will elaborate on the problems and challenges faced by these organisations in their pursuit of delivering services to societies. It will also provide insight into the literature by other scholars and researchers on the challenges faced by NGOs in providing services in Lesotho.

3.2 Funding for NGOs and CBOs

The availability of funding is critical to the service delivery of NGOs, while the unavailability of funds plays a debilitating role in the effective running of these institutions (Agere, 2014). Agere (2014) adds that most, if not all NGOs, operate on a non-profit basis and depend wholly on donations; it, therefore, makes their survival unpredictable especially if market fluctuations occur and recessions descend upon global economies. An example of this is the 2008-2009 global economic crisis, which was linked to decreased donor spending for the HIV/AIDS epidemic in low and middle-income countries.

In 2020 when the world was hit by the Covid-19 pandemic, many NGOs experienced funding disruptions. Although there was an increase in the number of funding facilities accessible for NGOs in response to the global pandemic, it was insufficient. NGOs provide many essential services across the world, especially in the developing world, where they supplement or, in some instances, extend government services. With services from health and gender issues to humanitarian support, NGOs continue to grapple with insufficient core and programming funding and unstable staffing.

Lack of funds limits the quantity and/or quality of services provided to communities. Unlimited needs chasing limited resources is a fundamental fact of economic life in rich countries and poor countries (Viravaidya & Hayssen 2001: 1). The authors (2001) add that it affects large international organisations, such as the United Nations, down to the smallest local NGOs. From rural development agencies to museums, and from health care providers to education and training institutes, managers of NGOs must often pay as much (if not more) attention to finding funds as they do to using those funds (Viravaidya & Hayssen 2001: 1).

Many NGOs are not living up to the expectation of filling the gaps that governments cannot meet because they have been seriously affected by the recent global

economic recession. This is because most donors stop donating during times of economic malaise (Davis, 2013). NGOs are either finding it difficult to access funds from donors or, if there is aid, it comes with strict conditions. These funding issues are discussed below.

3.2.1 Accessing donors

Financial resources are important for NGOs to implement their plans (Baluku 2010: 26). However, many NGOs and CBOs are expressing difficulties in finding sufficient, appropriate, and continuous funding for their work. Moreover, NGOs must compete with other NGOs for limited grant funds and aid. The EU Roadmap for Engagement with Civil Society in Lesotho (2018-2020) observed that civil society groups do not have access to resources from a range of sustainable sources, including domestically, and this hinders their mandate to define their activities.

Geofunders (2015) confirms that financial struggles are a reality for many non-profits, even those with excellent programmes. Hapazari and Hapazari (2019: 65) observed that the main challenge faced by NGOs in Lesotho in their quest to assist the rural poor were constrained financial resources. All NGOs, whether national or international, depend on some source of external funding; however, the source might vary (Chakawarika 2011: 22). According to Muthupandian (2006), the sources of funds for NGOs come from three different areas: firstly, the government, secondly, the public, and lastly, foreign development agencies. However, for many NGOs in Third World countries like Lesotho foreign funding is mostly their source.

Lesotho Times (15 September 2021) reported that foreign funding predominately flowed to donor organisations headquartered in the Northern Hemisphere rather than going directly to the 90 percent of African Civil Society Organisations that remain dependent on it. To receive the much-needed support from donors, NGOs must invest in creating successful media campaigns to send a compelling message to donors. A lack of funds could mean a total standstill for projects and service delivery. According to the Global Policy Forum in Lesotho (2005), referring to bilateral agreements, all resources must be channeled through the government.

For example, Ireland changed the way it gave aid to Lesotho, seeking to support government programmes rather than fund stand-alone projects. Over the period

1999 to 2004, Development Cooperation Ireland supported a wide range of projects and activities in Lesotho (Lesotho Country Programme 2005: 1) Funds were provided to strengthen education, healthcare, and human rights. Support was also provided for building roads in rural areas and funding water supply systems, business development, and improving the way the government works (Lesotho Country Program Evaluation 2005). However, the situation changed as for most of the time under review, the Development Cooperation Ireland programme did not fully support Lesotho's priorities.

The EU Roadmap for Engagement with Civil Society in Lesotho (2018-2020) stated that, in Lesotho, the number of development partners had dwindled over the years; the last to close its doors was the Irish Embassy in 2014 leading to a struggle for funding in NGOs. Thus, some NGOs shut down operations due to a lack of funds. However, some have remained behind, such as the German Government through GIZ and the Millennium Challenge Corporation of the US government.

3.2.2 Funding conditions and limitations

The services provided by NGOs and CBOs are made possible by the contributions of individuals and institutions, referred to as donors. A donor is defined by the Codes of Good Practice of South African NGOs (1997: 3) as an individual or institution who agrees to voluntarily provide resources or money in response to various appeals presented by an NGO or CBO in support of their programme, project, or operation.

Each donor has specific requirements, like how and when to provide feedback on the donation previously given, the expenditure, or the outcome of the services. Many NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho and Africa at large are desperate for funding and will try their level best to comply with the requirements, even if it means diverting or redirecting their goals. The dilemma is that many grants and donations carry restrictions on the types of expenses that they may cover. The most common restriction is to cover only direct programme costs, but not the cost of support services or other overhead costs, like the salaries of staff members, incurred by the NGO.

Donors expect countries to behave in a certain manner and may also demand audited statements from previous grants. Geofunders (2015) states that NGOs and

CBOs are subjected to complex and redundant paperwork to apply for and report on grants. The changing funding environment is becoming problematic for many NGOs. One of the reasons that led to a decrease in resource distribution in Lesotho was due to declining aid support, which was brought about by the country's status as a lower-middle-income country (LMIC), its political instability (it nearly lost funding from the Millennium Challenge Corporation), its failure to meet the European Development Fund (EDF) conditions, and limited support from non-resident agencies, who had from the beginning of the Lesotho United Nations Development Assistant Plan (LUNDAP) promised to fund towards the programme (Khati 2018).

According to *Lesotho Times* (15 September 2020), the United States (US) had warned that Lesotho risked losing out on the multi-million dollar second compact under the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) due to concerns about human trafficking, police brutality against citizens, and the failure to implement the long-delayed multi-sector reforms. The Bertelsmann Transformation Index (BTI) (2018) stated that Lesotho was told by the US government, among others, that if it did not implement the SADC Commission Report it risked losing aid and preferential market access. This finally led to the firing of the Commander of the Lesotho Defence Force, Tlali Kamoli, and the government declaring intentions to introduce constitutional and institutional reforms. However, this was all halted by the motion of no-confidence against Prime Minister Pakalitha Mosisili and the calling of snap elections. Another example relates to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) in 2015. To have met the 2015 target on the MDGs, Lesotho needed to partner with other actors like the private sector, development partners, and civil society. The government was not allowed to execute on its own and it needed to be involved in talks with numerous partners around the globe and at a national level to come together towards the goals (Millennium Development Goals 2015).

Geofunders (2015) states that donor selection procedures vary according to the local context, the amount of funding involved, and the urgency of delivering aid, which may limit the possibility of conducting in-depth and costly financial reviews. However, it is good practice to exercise due diligence and conduct minimum background checks of new partners, including reviewing past performance on projects financed by other agencies and a set of internal governance and systems. Moreover, there are numerous international barriers to these organisations in Africa. These primarily

consist of the racialised and colonial nature of funding, donor preferences and choices, complex donor systems, requirements, and language and reporting mechanisms (Moyo and Imafidon 2021: 9).

Lesotho Times (9 October 2021) reported that too often, only a portion of philanthropic funding from international aid institutions reaches African CSOs, as they remain trapped within bureaucratic processes and systems. When this aid does reach the African continent, it is usually distributed among locally registered international NGO counterparts and then allocated to African Led Organisations for specific projects.

Mang'unyi (2011: 110) states that less funding leads to reduced activities, which have adverse effects, such as high illiteracy, reduced project implementation, and therefore, reduced impact on the communities served. Tasnim (2007: 160) asserts that the challenge of funding also leads to a politicised civil society. This is where a civil society finds itself influenced by government and political parties; and thus makes biased, politically motivated decisions.

The dynamics of funding for NGOs creates a real problem for NGOs' service delivery. Due to funding limitations, NGOs and CBOs are unable to sustain resources and build long-term strategies for lasting social impact through good service delivery. Dependence on grants and donations can also inhibit the autonomy of NGOs to choose which programme activities to undertake and to select the most effective intervention strategies to achieve programme goals along with administrative constraints and negative perceptions about African NGOs. This imbalance in approach to donor funding is preventing these organisations from being more effective and self-reliant, and from helping the communities and citizens they serve (*Lesotho Times* 9 October 2021).

There is no standard, proven method to meet the funding challenge. All NGOs are different in terms of their missions, philosophies, client bases, skills, and experience. But increasing financial security is an important part of planning for all NGOs (Viravaidya & Hayssen 2001: 2). Becoming completely independent of donors may be a realistic goal for NGOs, while trying to self-generate funds to cover overhead costs may be more suitable to others; still others may rightfully establish that relying on grants and donations, at least for now, is the best approach. There is no right

answer. It is up to each NGO and its managers to consider all the funding options available and to choose the most appropriate mix, just as they must determine which core activities and implementation strategies are most appropriate to their mission and goals (Viravaidya & Hayssen 2001: 2).

3.2.3 Corruption and embezzlement of funds

NGOs are no more immune to corruption than companies in other sectors, but for development organisations it can be especially harmful and have a knock-on effect on reputation, funding, and donations (Adetunji, 2013). Adetunji (2013) adds that corruption, which includes nepotism, bribery, fraud, kickbacks and double funding, can divert resources, feed conflict, and increase the basic costs of services for the poor – undermining the work of NGOs.

In many NGOs, including in Lesotho, corruption and its implications manifest themselves in the embezzlement of organisational funds, paying ghost workers, and the misuse of organisational infrastructure, such as buying vehicles for one's own gain. Transparency International (TI) defines corruption as 'the abuse of power or position for private gain'. Reports have indicated that those entrusted with funds for NGOs misuse them for personal benefit and, in some instances, corruptly access funding (*The Herald*, 2014; Agere, 2014).

Defining corruption is problematic because the concept does not have an exact definition. The IMF (2017: 9) defines corruption as the misuse of state resources for self-gain, while Farrales (2005: 16) defines it as the misuse of state funds, authority, and public office for personal gain. Corruption has spread so much in the society and its roots have sunken deeper into our communities and I fear that many governments will take years to uproot it. According to Kyambalesa (2006: 108), corruption may be caused by various factors such as poor governance, political instability, and fragile legislative and judicial structures in democratic governance. However I believe that the high rates of unemployment in our societies and poor service delivery do contribute to the rising corruption in societies

Embezzlement is defined by the Anti-Corruption Resource Centre (2008: 1) as the misappropriation of property or funds legally entrusted to someone in their formal position as an agent or guardian, while the embezzlement of funds is defined as a

situation when a person intentionally uses funds for a different purpose than they were intended to be used for. According to Hayes (2022), embezzlement refers to a form of white-collar crime in which a person or entity intentionally misappropriates the assets entrusted to them. In this type of fraud, the embezzler attains the assets lawfully and has the right to possess them, but the assets are then used for unintended purposes (Chen, 2020).

Although NGOs play an important role in changing people's lives, an increase in the number of fraud and corruption cases has left donors uneasy. It is important to note that fraud and corruption within NGOs are not new occurrences; it has been happening for years. In May 2022, an investigation was launched against two Women and Law in Southern Africa Research and Education Trust executives in Lesotho (WLSA) following official complaints from other employees that they had been siphoning off donor funds for their private use ("Anti-Corruption Investigates Women's Rights NGO" Billy Ntaote 2022), an editor at the Centre for Investigative Journalism stated that the European Union, as well as the Global Fund, are donors who confirmed that they received a detailed petition from WLSA employees about WLSA managing director, Advocate Libakiso Mathlo and programme manager, Advocate Mamosa Mohlabula. The Directorate on Corruption and Economic Offences (DCEO) is also investigating allegations that the pair siphoned off funds from multiple donor-funded projects, disguising the funds as payment for employees. Employees however said that the money never reached them and accused the pair of taking the money.

Kennedy (2022) explains how funds are embezzled in NGOs. For example, an NGO manager can work together with a company owned by a friend, by inflating the number of delivered goods to maximise stealing. Secondly, Kennedy (2022) states that most donors expect NGOs to employ staff full-time, and information like the names of employees; their qualifications; together with contracts are all submitted to the donor's head office. Does this mean that donors know who is being paid by an NGO? Unfortunately not, asserts Kennedy (2022).

Donor-funded projects in developing countries are vulnerable to employee fraud for several reasons. Firstly, the nature of project support and short implementation timetables often require large amounts of funds to be spent in a small amount of time

(Anti-Corruption Resource Centre 2008: 2). Under pressure to spend quickly, project managers often do not monitor project expenditures closely or set up appropriate financial checks and balances. Secondly, donors often need to establish bank accounts in both foreign (hard) and local currencies. While this arrangement may protect against currency risk from inflation, extra accounts add to the complexity of the financial system and make tracking expenditures and transparency more difficult (Anti-Corruption Resource Centre, 2008: 2).

Corruption and its ramifications manifest in the embezzlement of organisational funds, paying ghost workers, and the misuse of organisational infrastructure such as vehicles. This is a cankerworm that seriously continues to undermine the productivity of organisations – NGOs notwithstanding (Agere, 2014: Coetzer, 2013).

It is sad situation that all these unscrupulous actions are at the expense of targeted beneficiaries, who in most cases are needy and vulnerable (Manomano & Kang'ethe 2014: 149). This, therefore, affects the distribution of services by NGOs to communities.

3.3 Dynamics between government and NGOs and service delivery

A government is a political system by which a country or community is administered and regulated, whose core function is the provision of sufficient, affordable and quality basic services (Urban Governance, 2016). A government does a variety of works for the welfare of its citizens: It makes decisions and gets things done. It builds roads and schools. It takes decisions about how to reduce the price of essential goods when they become too expensive or ways to increase the supply of electricity.

NGOs are citizen-based associations that operate independently of government, usually to deliver services or to serve social or political purpose. NGOs are regarded as a force for good that almost all nations need for service delivery. They are components of the social movements within a civil society.

3.3.1 Service delivery

Governments around the world are mandated to provide basic services such as clean water, sanitation, housing, immigration documents (passports), security, and health services, among others, for their citizenry (AUDA NEPAD, 2022). It remains

crucial for governments to efficiently provide these services sufficiently and cost-effectively (AUDA NEPAD 2022). However, African countries' basic service delivery has remained constrained by various limitations, such as fractured and uncoordinated communication between government departments and countries (AUDA NEPAD 2022).

'Service delivery' is a common phrase used to describe the distribution of basic resources citizens depend on, such as water, electricity, sanitation infrastructure, land, and housing (Campbell 2014). These services have a direct and immediate effect on the quality of the lives of people in communities. Throughout Africa, Lesotho included, there has been a rise in protests, especially protests over poor service delivery.

The importance of service delivery falls on municipalities and local governments as they are responsible for maintaining healthy living conditions and improving the quality of life for members of communities (Development Bank of Southern Africa, 2022). Local government (municipalities) is the sphere of government closest to the people; citizens elect them to represent them and they are responsible for ensuring that services are delivered to the community (Municipal Service Delivery, 2020).

Local governments can provide the services themselves using their own resources – finance, equipment, and employees – or they may also outsource the provision of a service. In other words, they may choose to hire someone else or an organisation to deliver the service, but it remains the responsibility of the municipality/local government to choose the service provider and to ensure that they deliver the service timeously and properly.

However, many governments' delivery and upkeep of resources is unreliable – inconveniencing or endangering whole communities (Campbell 2014). Municipal Service Delivery (2020) explains that this might be because of a lack of finances or a lack of capacity to provide a good service at an affordable price.

Since the introduction of the Lesotho Local Government Act of 1997, the challenges of lack of funding and human resources, and the lack of the central government decentralising political power to the districts affected service delivery at local government level leading to ineffective service delivery throughout the country (Twala, Kompfi & Kabi 2017). According to *The Reporter* (21 February 2020),

effective service delivery requires good governance and performance management so that funds are directed quickly to the most urgent needs and incentives enable service providers to make effective use of available resources.

According to the World Meteorological Organisation (2012: 4), services should possess the following attributes to be effective:

- Available and timely: at a time and space scale that the user needs;
- Dependable: thus, delivered on time to the required user specifications;
- Usable: presented in user-specific formats so that the client can fully understand;
- Useful: to respond appropriately to user needs; and
- Credible: for the user to confidently apply to decision-making.

This has not been the case in Lesotho. The country's service delivery has been poor and is characterised by a lack of finances, a lack of capacity, and corruption.

3.3.2 Interaction of government and NGOs

This section investigates how governments and NGOs directly interact to deliver services, and how this interaction directly constrains NGOs in delivering services to the poor. NGOs' interaction and engagement with governments can pose a threat to NGOs' operations. In Lesotho, the dynamics of operating NGOs appear to compete with the government; hence, NGOs' engagement with the government has posed a threat to NGOs' work.

The relationship between NGOs and governments has been identified as complex lately. While, on the one hand, there has been more recognition and encouragement for NGOs' activism by governments; on the other hand, there has been severe criticism of government agencies by NGOs for their rigid bureaucratic and traditional outlook (Shah 2013).

Damlamian (2006: 6) asserts that there has been a decline in the nation state in an increasingly globalised international economy, and transnational corporation (TNCs) and multinational corporations (MNCs) have gained more power, leading to a shift of power that has taken place around the world from government to major corporations, especially in developing countries. Damlamian (2006: 11) adds that the public view

NGOs as more trustworthy than other corporations in respect of benefiting society. According to Hassan and Forhad (2013: 60), NGOs have been seen as playing a supportive role with governments because of governments' limited capacity to address societies' needs.

Because of the changing needs of communities, governments need more assistance from NGOs and CBOs to meet communities' needs. In Lesotho, government ministries are turning to NGOs to render some of their services, including the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Social Development, and the Ministry of Education. This has become a source of tension for NGOs. Receiving more demands from the government to assist with addressing social needs becomes a funding challenge, especially when there is little to no funding from the government itself.

Baluku (2010: 34) states that for many commentators, the marriage between NGOs and governments does not bode well because along the way NGOs no longer play their role of holding government accountable. It is further suggested that if NGOs fully engage in government contracting, who would talk on behalf of the poor. NGOs are supposed to hold the government accountable to the people and ensure the impartial functioning of state organs at grassroots level.

The dynamics of working with the government constrains the poor; thus, NGOs are at a crossroad in terms of working with the government (Care, 2005: 7). According to Kitua (2015: 11), it is evident that governments in developing countries are not keen on the idea of NGOs because they tend to look at them as a threat to the country, rather than as a means of development for the country.

Many NGOs in Lesotho have failed to establish their legitimacy to engage the government, largely because they have failed to effectively develop strong constituencies of citizens. Moreover, weak internal governance undermines their credibility and thus impedes their engagement with the government (EU Roadmap for Engagement with Civil Society in Lesotho, 2018-2020: 3).

According to a report by Innovations in Civic Participation, due to a number of economic and socio-political factors, civil society in Lesotho is uncoordinated and works in isolation from the government (Ramsey, 2013). A World Vision Report (2013: 19) further states that the lack of engagement between civil society organisations and the government means that important ideas from the constituents

that NGOs represent are not raised because of their inability to present the issues in a manner that is creative and appealing.

Studies relating to civil society show that many of these organisations and institutions, which depend on international funding, lack a real grassroots constituency due to discriminatory structures within the organisations. Civil society in Lesotho must strive to participate in the formulation of public policies. The African Development Fund (2006: ii) reported that civil society organisations, and the private sector in general in Lesotho, are weak and have inadequate capacity to engage the government on its programmes and intentions.

The current government of Lesotho hinders participation and shared views, based on the community they represent; they also threaten those civil society organisations that voice their concerns. Lesotho's civil society sector desires to contribute to policy making, but it encounters obstacles because consulting citizens is not a common practice in the country (Rakhare, 2019: 18). The author (2019) adds that citizens are consulted only before elections because politicians want to be elected. Hence, in Lesotho, civil society faces obstacles that hinders it from performing its duties.

3.4 Dynamics operating within NGOs and CBOs

NGOs were established to solve the problems of the world. But often NGOs fail due to challenges within themselves. Such challenges include poor accountability, lack of branding, and the late adoption of technology. In this section, we examine how NGOs' and CBOs' dynamics and operations has become a constraining factor in the delivery of services to the poor (Giving Circle, 2020).

Although most NGOs work hard for their beneficiaries and they are successful in reaching their goals, they can lose out on recurring or potential funding without a proper system of demonstrating the value they bring to the community.

3.4.1 Poor accountability

Accountability is described as making officials account for their activities (World Bank 1992: 13). According to the World Bank (1994: 12), accountability is crucial for governance; hence, it is at the centre of governance activities. The World Bank (1994: 12) further states that accountability is about holding governments

responsible for their roles in society; it is also about making political leaders answerable to their representatives. Considering the definitions above, accountability takes two forms: internal and external accountability. Khati (2018) explains that internal accountability (horizontal accountability) is from within institutions, mostly about finances, and is an internal control mechanism. On the other hand, external accountability (vertical accountability) is pressure from the public in relation to services (Khati 2018: 26).

According to Mehrotra (2006: 263), the inferior quality of public services in developing countries has attributed to the slow progress of development. Deininger and Mpuga (2005: 171) argue that it is now widely realised that in many developing countries, the low quality of public services and governance can limit the scope for poverty reduction and growth. Moreover, Ahmed, Devarajan, Khemani and Shah (2005: 18) observed that although accountability, through the decentralisation of service delivery is regarded as a solution to curb corruption and improve public services, the approach has limited evidence of success.

Hudson (2000: 2) states that the pressure for NGOs to be made accountable is often accompanied by some form of questioning their legitimacy and credibility. Tilt (2005: 3) says that the criticism has predominantly come from those affected by NGOs' actions, including multi-national corporations, governments and international organisations.

The government of Lesotho does however not make provision for NGO accountability in all the policies that govern NGOs (Khati 2018: 98), such as the Labour Code of 1992 and the Cooperative Societies Act of 2000, which work in conjunction with the Societies Act. The lack of provision results in NGOs adopting their own policies on accountability, which suit their own interests and those of their donors. However, this means that the government and the public cannot hold NGOs accountable for their actions or inactions. NGOs' reports and the integrity and reliability of the information they present are often questionable; this process requires consultation and public participation, which is limited in most cases.

Khati (2018: 98) points out that the inability of NGOs being held accountable implies that the policies they seek to implement are uninformed; hence, their interaction is

not necessarily needed by the public they serve, and this results in poor service delivery and policy failures.

3.4.2 Poor governance

Governance can be termed as the system by which entities are directed and controlled. All institution, needs governance to function. GOs also need good governance for effective functioning, growth, and sustainability. The principles of good governance hold true in the dynamic environment NGOs face today, including accountability, transparency, organisational relationships, responsibility, and disclosure practices among boards and stakeholders. According to Ricciuti and Calò (2017), the governance of NGOs includes the process of developing strategic leadership in a non-profit organisation. This means setting the direction, making strategic decisions, evaluating the performance, and ensuring accountability and transparency. The World Bank states that governance ensures that there is institutional competency in public institutions that deliver services to the citizens of the country and the providers of services in an effective and efficient, transparent, impartial, and accountable manner (Kerandi 2008: 3).

It is advisable that NGOs follow good governance practices to strengthen their own internal structure to avoid any crisis that might arise out of poor governance. However, most NGOs are characterised by poor governance. According to Maximpact Blog (2017), a lack of effective governance is all too common in NGOs.

3.4.3 Strategic planning

A goal without a plan is just a wish, stated Antoine de Saint-Exupery, a French writer. Most organisations agree that planning is an essential process for good governance and management. Be it a NGO or a government organisation or a corporate company, strategic planning is required by all entities towards achieving success (Khushi, 2017).

Khushi (2017) defines strategic planning as an organisational management activity that is used to set priorities, focus energy and resources, strengthen operations, ensure that employees and other stakeholders are working toward common goals, establish agreement around intended outcomes/results, and assess and adjust the

organisation's direction in response to a changing environment; it is also a consistent and efficient process where choices on foreseen future results, their accomplishments, estimations, and assessments are made. Morais (2011) explains that it incorporates objective setting and asset designation that motivates pro-activity, enactment development, prolonged rationality, communication and strategic matters. Khushi (2017) observed that most organisations devise their own strategic plan – a document that articulates an organisation's goals and objectives, the essential steps and actions that need to be taken to accomplish those goals, and other important elements that are developed amidst planning.

Khushi (2017) states that strategic planning in NGOs is important for the following reasons: firstly, an effective strategic plan helps in building up the main initiative behind a NGO. It clearly states the mission and vision of the organisation and gives an overall direction to its way forward. Secondly, NGOs will know what they need to do to accomplish their set targets. They can execute their duties and functions in accordance with their strategic planning. This will make their activities more organised and well planned. Khushi (2017) further explains that strategic planning leads to the efficient management of time, money and human resources, which becomes easier through strategic plans. NGOs can manage their investment and resources, define a budget for a specific period, and proficiently utilise their funds through strategic planning.

Some NGOs suffer from the lack of a cohesive, strategic plan that would facilitate success in their activities and mission. This renders them unable to effectively raise and capitalise on financial support (Maximpact 2017: 7).

Price (2005: 3) identified six reasons why most strategic plans fail. Firstly is a lack of energy/resources. Some NGOs run out of energy or resources before they can formulate a practical plan. Secondly, they lack focus. Often, they get lost in the semantics of defining their vision, mission, and values. They spend so much time and effort trying to understand what the terms mean and how they fit together that by the time they have it all figured out, they are mentally fatigued (Price, 2005: 5). Thirdly, there is the lack of accountability. Sometimes the strategic planning process becomes too political. There is too much turf protecting and it becomes the time when people must give reasons why their plan did not work in the past.

Khushi (2017) identifies PESTEL Analysis as a tool for strategic planning. The author (2017) states that PESTEL Analysis “is an important planning tool used for understanding the external macro-level external factors that impact the working of an organisation. It is a useful strategic tool for understanding market growth or decline, business position, potential and direction for operations.”

3.5 Constraints in monitoring and evaluation in NGOs

Monitoring and Evaluation is an approach that involves the periodic assessment of the success and performance of programmed activities and projects. Although the two terms are intricately linked, and are referred to as M&E, they entail two different activities (Humanitarian Global, 2001).

Monitoring involves tracking the progress of a project to see its performance in relation to its longer-term results and the impact desired (Admin 2020). It is normally done within the organisation or through a third-party contract, during the Project Implementation phase. On the other hand, evaluation requires an external evaluator to look at whether the allocated resources were used effectively and productively to achieve the desired results. It is done during the Project Implementation and Closure phase, and normally determines the need for other projects to be considered in the future to achieve the desired results.

Monitoring is a long-term, if not permanent, performance review process of organisations and it is an important part of every organisation. Monitoring is defined as a systematic process of collecting, analysing, and using information to track progress and guide decisions (Gage & Dunn, 2009: 2). Holloway (2004: 24) states that monitoring is one of the principal tools used by human rights, environmental, and other NGOs in pursuing their reform objectives. The author (2004) adds that it is a tool increasingly used in the fight against corruption. Monitoring diagnoses problems (particularly the difference between rhetoric and reality), assesses actual situations and the actual functioning of systems, and can highlight corrupt practices systematically over time (thus, providing a base for advocacy action). It is a tool that is valuable in itself but is made most effective when joined with public information and advocacy.

Evaluation is “an assessment, as systematic and objective as possible, of an ongoing or completed project, programme or policy, its design, implementation and results,” states the OECD (n.d.). An evaluation is periodic, retrospective and might be conducted internally or by external independent evaluators (Admin, 2020).

Admin (2021) explains that the evaluation of a project looks at whether the use of the inputs, as well as the outputs achieved, produced the desired outcome. Evaluation also considers whether the costs associated with the project were effectively used in achieving the desired outcomes, or whether other projects should be considered in the future as means for the desired outcomes.

According to the Government of Lesotho’s Draft Performance Management Policy (2013: 22), performance evaluation is the culmination of the process of performance contracting. This is normally conducted by independent experts drawn from outside the NGO to ensure objectivity and to enhance the integrity of the results, and because a government should not be seen to evaluate its own performance.

The Lesotho Zero Hunger Strategic Review (2018) stated that the United Nations (UN) made an international call for action towards a vision of a world without hunger. It was fully aligned to the 2030 Agenda and reflected the five elements from within the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The Lesotho Zero Hunger Strategic Review (2018: 44) further stated that during the stakeholders’ discussions it was found that there were places where M&E frameworks did not exist, and where they existed, they were not followed with earnest. Without strong monitoring and evaluation frameworks linked to the project and programme objectives, with solid qualitative and quantitative indicators, nutrition and food security would not be achieved (Lesotho Zero Hunger Strategic Review 2018: xii).

M&E assists NGOs in assessing their overall performance. With donors and taxpayers often directing significant amounts of funds to help vulnerable populations or solve some of the most pressing problems in the world, understanding how that money is being used, the results of those programmes, and their impacts on stakeholders is important. M&E effectively achieves this by ensuring greater transparency and accountability are achieved through analysis, tracking and reporting on relevant data and information throughout a project’s life cycle (Humanitarian Global 2001). M&E also provides stakeholders, community members,

and donors with key evidence for all decisions and actions throughout the project (Humanitarian Global 2001).

Good M&E could lead to the improved performance of projects. A well-planned M&E also promotes a better understanding of the population or target audience's needs (Humanitarian Global 2001). By assessing previous projects through the use of M&E, the performance of future projects is greatly enhanced.

Humanitarian Global (2001) further stated that good M&E leads to the effective allocation of resources since all project operations are interwoven around project budgets; resource allocation is dependent on the same. What dictates the choice of resources, the number of employees, and the duration and magnitude of interventions all depends on the funds available. M&E helps in effectively allocating those resources.

The EU (2014/2017: 5) states that civil society organisations in Lesotho do not conduct their own research but rely on consultants to perform this task for them. This is because the lobbying capacity and analytical skills of civil society organisations are extremely weak and they do not have the ability to hold the government accountable. The EU (2014/2017) further states that civil society in Lesotho lacks the capability of monitoring itself and the government's transparency and accountability; it also lacks the necessary skills to participate in policy dialogues with the government. A considerable number of NGOs in many societies around the globe monitor the work of public and private institutions in their countries to protect the public in a number of different areas they consider important, namely, elections, land appropriation and gender representation (Holloway 2004: 24).

For all the abovementioned reasons, M&E is an important activity for NGOs. As already stated, the purpose of NGOs is to hold the government and the business sector accountable to the citizens. Monitoring is an important part of this watchdog role, and NGOs are likely to be able to have a considerable amount of access to local knowledge, local experience, and local contacts.

To solve the issue of weak M&E, the African Development Fund (2013: 14) stated that, given the challenges experienced in past projects in Lesotho, the Bank would undertake supervision missions at least twice a year, which would be supported by relevant experts from its field offices in the region. The PFM Reform Secretariat,

which would include one staff member dedicated to M&E, would monitor progress on the project and submit quarterly progress reports on the physical and financial implementation of the project. This would reduce the level of corruption and the embezzlement of funds in NGOs; thus, leading to the effective and efficient usage of funds.

3.6 Political environment and service delivery

In this section, we present and analyse how the government's policy formulation processes could constrain NGOs' operations. The political environment in Lesotho created many challenges for NGOs, with some leaving the country or halting their operations, while some managed to sustain themselves through these challenges and they are still operating.

NGOs have played a key role in pushing for the protection of human rights at international level. Increasingly, the existence of NGOs is proving to be a necessity rather than a luxury in societies throughout the modern world (Chakawarika 2011: 5). Moreover, in many developing countries, the role of NGOs has evolved in response to the market gaps left by the government (Gaist 2009).

Lesotho is a constitutional monarchy. In the past few years, Lesotho has experienced numerous breakdowns in democratic governance and its political environment has been unstable because of political violence. The army's involvement in the country's already fragile politics has resulted in political instability and a security crisis (Freedom in the World 2021 Country Report). The introduction of a coalition government in 2012 brought nothing but instability. Unicef (2017: 7) states that the unstable coalition government structure and the lack of majority support for existing political parties has resulted in political instability in Lesotho.

The political unrest in Lesotho was the result of failed governments, which led to general re-elections twice within a period of four years, instead of having general elections once in five years. The first re-elections were in 2015 after the general elections were held in 2012, while the second was held in 2017 after the 2015 re-elections. These instabilities involved rivalry within political parties, which led to the parliament passing a motion of no confidence against the Prime Minister every two years; therefore, leading to elections before reaching a full term of five years. The

instability appears to have chased donors away as they are apprehensive about investing in an unstable country. This affected NGOs, particularly those that had agreements with donors and the government.

The Lesotho Council of Non-Governmental Organisations (LCN) (2005) stated that NGOs in Lesotho feared the closure of donor and embassy offices. NGOs feared that the closing of the embassies would not only affect their funding, but also their strategic management (ibid.). According to systems theory, NGOs are a system, which interacts with the external environment and is influenced by social and political factors.

A country that is clouded by political instability becomes corrupt, and corruption remains a pressing issue in Lesotho. Unicef (2017: 7) stated that within the civil service, high-level administrative appointments were made based on political patronage and nepotism. This resulted in bureaucrats using their influence to divert public resources to the politically connected elite or to garner support for their own political agenda.

According to Alesina (1996: 1), economic growth and political stability are deeply interconnected. Firstly, the uncertainty associated with an unstable political environment may reduce investment and the speed of economic development. Secondly, inadequate capacity in the executive and legislative branches means that substantial investments in key social sectors are not translated into better outcomes. This problem is exacerbated by the lack of accountability in the system along with the regular turnover of ministers in the education, health, and social protection sectors. The legislative branch faces a similar problem, where its limited capacity and skills restrict its ability to scrutinise and oversee government policies and budgets (Unicef, 2017: 7).

Continuing political uncertainty has had a negative impact on public administration, private investment, and economic development in Lesotho (African World Bank Report, 2002: 9). In addition, the Report stated that the government has signed a defence pact with SADC countries, allowing them to intervene at the government's invitation, and at short notice, should the need arise.

3.7 Constraints in implementing

Olsen (2019) defines implementation as the process that turns strategies and plans into actions to accomplish strategic objectives and goals. DeGroff and Cargo (2009: 48) and Grindle (1980: 6) state that implementation encompasses all actions that take place after the plans have been made, such as budgeting, the construction of infrastructure, and the undertaking of the necessary institutional changes for policy measures.

Many NGOs face challenges when implementing their documented strategic plans. In the implementation of NGO programmes, there are constraints that deter the beneficiaries from participating (Baluku, 2010: 30). In most NGOs and CBOs, the poor are normally the people who are constrained in participating in the implementation of NGOs' work.

According to LCN (2005), NGOs in Lesotho often lack the technical and organisational capacity to implement and fulfil their mission, and few are willing or able to invest in training for capacity building. The EU (2014/2017: 4) stated that civil society in Lesotho does not have the capability to monitor the implementation of domestic laws effectively and efficiently. NGOs and CBOs, which are not able to do proper implementation, face various challenges.

3.7.1 Lack of resources (human and financial)

The EU Country Roadmap for Engagement with Civil Society (2014 to 2017: 5) stated that the limited capacity of CSOs in Lesotho in terms of financial and human resources restricted them in effectively participating in the different national dialogues. Furthermore, many NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho face the challenge of not having adequate resources to meet their objectives of poverty alleviation and social welfare. Resources may be in the form of grants, human resources, and transport.

In relative terms, Lesotho has increasingly allocated resources to health, including to infrastructure, Human Resources for Health (HRH), and service purchasing (Public Expenditure Tracking Survey and Service Delivery in the Health Sector 2017: 4). Significant financial resources have been allocated to HRH to fill a critical gap, which resulted in halving the vacancy rate in recent years. However, more than half of the remaining vacant positions are concentrated in the categories for non-essential staff,

while healthcare workers, especially doctors are seriously understaffed in comparison to the WHO African Region (AFRO) regional average (ibid.).

3.7.1.1 Human Resources

In 2003, Lesotho launched a long-term development plan called National Vision 2020. The National Vision's overarching objective was that by 2020 Lesotho would be a stable democracy and a united, prosperous nation at peace with itself and its neighbours; that it should have healthy and well-developed human resources; and that its economy would be strong, its environment well-managed, and its technology well-established (International Labour Organisation, 2014: 21). Twenty years later, in 2023, most of the objectives have not been met, especially well-developed human resources; this despite the fact that Lesotho attaches immense importance to human resource development as human resources is one of the assets that should be capacitated for the development of every country (Lesotho News Agency 29/11/2018)

Returning to NGOs and human resources, the external environment is not the only factor that pose challenges in these organisations. The internal also contributes to challenges in the implementation of community development projects (Sekai, 2016: 17). NGOs face challenges relating to human resources and the activities of NGOs are mostly curtailed by human resource challenges (Tarisayi, 2013). These organisations face a shortage of well-trained and experienced personnel, as many of their staff are volunteers.

People are an important aspect in all social organisations; from the perspective of the organisation, people are resources, and organisations cannot exist without them. Batti (2014: 87) explains that the importance of people is immense for NGOs as they support the development of these organisations' objectives and the achievements for which NGOs are recognised.

The Government of Lesotho established the Ministry of Health Social Welfare (MOHSW) Human Resources Development and Strategic Plan 2005-2025 in 2004

as an output of the Lesotho Human Resources Consultancy, financed by the World Bank and undertaken as part of the Health Sector Reform Initiative (Lesotho Health Sector Human Resources Development and Strategic Plan, 2005-2025). The new District Health Package and Social Welfare Priorities had the following specific implications for the articulation of the future human resources development strategy for Lesotho: ensure that all health facilities (Government, CHAL and other NGO) are staffed with a minimum complement of necessary personnel, taking into account the designated service function of the various types of facilities and associate case management and referral guidelines/norms; train relevant personnel in supervision, performance evaluation and technical support based on well-specified quality assurance guidelines/norms/protocols/targets and use of related performance indicators; and ensuring adequate staffing of all designated mental health facilities (Lesotho Health Sector Human Resources Development and Strategic Plan 2005-2025: 2-4).

The main categories of human resources in NGOs are the founder(s), director, staff, and volunteers. The lack of attention to the management of human resources is one of the factors standing between success and failure in many local NGOs in developing countries.

In Lesotho, there are supply gaps of qualified and trained personnel in all sectors of the economy, especially in the civil service (African Development Bank 2006: 3). Moreover, those who are employed generally lack the necessary skills. Since the country is surrounded by the Republic of South Africa, which offers better-paid jobs than Lesotho, the country's educated, skilled, and experienced professionals have found it easier and more attractive to migrate to that country.

According to Global Fund Grants in the Kingdom of Lesotho (2020: 18), key positions at the national level in NGOs remained vacant. Seventy-seven percent (10/13) and 64% (18/28) of the required positions at the National TB Program and HIV/STI Program respectively were vacant in 2020. In addition, three key managerial positions in the supply chain department were vacant, apart from operational staff vacancies representing 94% of the department (ibid.). This indicates that human resources remain a challenge in NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho; therefore, the implementation of projects will suffer. The situation of inadequate human resources

reflects weak HR planning and management, deriving from an inefficient establishment list, as well as the inadequate strategic deployment and geographic distribution of human resources.

3.7.1.2 Financial resources

The University of York (2022:1) defines financial resources as the funds and assets that finance an organisation's activities and investments. In simple terms, financial resources are the monies that keep a business operating, and there are several ways a business will raise and use its financial resources. The University of York (2022) further states that every organisation will have a framework or process in place for planning, organising, directing, controlling, and monitoring its financial resources and activities to deliver on the goals of the business. This is known as financial resource management (FRM) or financial management.

Funds are critical for NGOs to implement their projects, programmes, and activities, which benefit their communities' development (Abiddin, *et al.*, 2013:9) The Government of Lesotho depends heavily on donors for funding the vacant positions in NGOs and CBOs: the Global Fund and the World Bank are temporarily funding 50% (5/10) of the positions at the National TB Program; Global Fund and PEPFAR are temporarily funding 33% (6/18) of the positions at the HIV/STI Program; and 68% of staff at health facilities are funded by donors (Global Fund Grants in the Kingdom of Lesotho, 2020: 18).

According to Mukasa (2002: 17), not all people working for NGOs are volunteers and paid staff members typically receive lower pay than in the commercial private sector; they have little organisational and professional skills; and the quality of training they receive is poor. According to Villain (2002), pressing issues affecting implementation in NGOs relate to staffing issues and covers recruitment, assignment and layoff, as well as human resources development and administration, and the everyday management of staff.

3.7.2 Dynamics in leadership in NGOs and CBOs

Leadership is defined as the ability of an individual or a group of individuals to influence and guide followers or other members of an organisation (Pratt 2017). Leaders are required in most aspects of society, from business to politics, to regional and community-based organisations. However, NGO leaders often face extraordinary challenges – both at a personal and organisational level (Hailey 2006: 1). They work long hours with limited resources in uncertain and volatile political and economic circumstances to help the most marginalised and disadvantaged members of their communities (Deans, F., Oakley, L., James, R. and Wrigley, R. (2006: 2).

According to Afaq (2013: 104), leadership plays a key role in fostering connections and guiding change. He (2013) adds that leaders can play a key role in the governance, effectiveness, accountability, and capacity development of NGO. Leadership involves making clear but tough decisions, creating and articulating a clear vision, establishing achievable goals, and providing followers with the knowledge and tools necessary to achieve goals. All organisations need an effective leader to thrive and meet goals, especially in delivering services.

An effective NGO leader can transform an organisation by providing direction, motivating staff, generating untapped resources, upholding a clear and distinct organisational identity, and supporting values. Such leaders require a knack for balancing competing demands and challenges with their own values and ambitions (Hailey, 2006: 11). Pratt (2017) states that an effective leader possesses the following characteristics: self-confidence, strong communication and management skills, creative and innovative thinking, perseverance in the face of failure, willingness to take risks, openness to change, and levelheadedness and reactivity in times of crisis.

De Vita and Fleming (2001: 18) argue that leadership is closely related to vision and mission. Leaders who have vision can translate those ideals into an NGO's mission. More than that, they are committed to the mission of their NGO and have the passion to work for its fulfilment. Afaq (2013: 164) noted that De Vita and Fleming (2001: 18) further contend that leadership can play a key role in the success and failure of NGOs and can set exacting standards for the organisations. According to Bernstein (1997), good leaders insist on excellence in NGOs' performance and they reject complacency and rigid performance.

However, as Daud (2020: 274) states, the world is changing and the sweeping changes in society, nations and organisations, rumbling shifts in globalisation, technology, and changing demographics has given rise to new ways of leading organisations. This has led to many NGOs having poor leadership and inferior performance. Such mediocre performance or unethical behaviour can threaten the viability, credibility, and sustainability of an organisation. In the context of the non-profit sector, these concerns highlight the importance of identifying appropriate leadership competencies that reflect the values of the sector and the needs of individual staff and volunteers (Apostu, 2013: 149).

Daud (2020: 274) asserts that competent leadership is paramount in leading today's organisations due to the unpredictable, volatile, uncertain, complex, and ambiguous operating environment. Leaders influence their organisations' operational and strategic thinking and direction, adds Daud (2020: 274). They are expected to work with their boards and internal and external stakeholders; plus, they should have adequate qualified staff, expertise and budgets to conduct mandated tasks, while ensuring their vision, personal behaviour, conduct, actions and decision lead to the success of the team and organisation. Moreover, the evolving development and humanitarian landscape poses profound challenges in terms of the increasing complexity of major crises and their impact on affected people, leadership gaps, and the changes within sectors (Daud, 2020: 274).

Bromideh (2011: 200) states that a lack of managerial and leadership skills deprives NGOs from strategic planning and implementation. NGOs' managers face complex management issues, both at a personal and organisational level (Bromideh, 2011: 198). Mehta (2010) observes that leadership has become a matter of concern in the NGO sector, where the leadership has become highly personalised.

LCN, as the representative of the Lesotho Civil Society, submitted a project proposal to the ACBF Foundation aimed at strengthening NGOs to enable them to engage the government, the private sector and international partners for alternative long-term development strategies for the country, and to contribute meaningfully and constructively to sustainable long-term socio-economic development (LCN 2016). The project was geared towards ensuring improved leadership and better

governance of NGOs through emphasising the institutional and organisational strengthening of LCN and its members.

According to Khati (2018: 75), Lesotho, regardless of its slow progress, is heading towards attaining its development goals if there is a change in leadership and good ethics in the workplace. Destructive leadership can come in a variety of forms, such as toxic, abusive, and/or narcissistic leadership and bullying.

NGO leaders are often isolated and lack the support of society. At times, they also do not include the community in their policy formulations. Moreover, even though civil society organisations in Lesotho do not always participate in government, there are various occasions when they have been involved in policy formulation processes. Examples were their participation in the formulation of the National Vision, the Poverty Reduction Strategy, the National Strategic Development Plan 2012/2013/-2016-2017, and the Lesotho African Peer Review Mechanism (EU 2014/2017: 5; Rakhare 2010). However, there is talk of a leadership deficit because of the shortage of talented leaders in the non-profitmaking sector in Lesotho; as a result there is an urgency to develop a new generation of leaders, and to provide relevant support to existing and future leaders (Apostu 2013: 145).

3.8 Poor networking and communication

Poor networking and communication are other challenges face NGOs in the implementation of community development projects (Teguru 2016: 20).

3.8.1 Networking

Holmen (2002) states that networking is commonly seen as a cost-effective means to share information and spread knowledge about grassroots' needs, solutions, and best practices. NGOs, in various forms and definitions, have been filling the gaps in the delivery of public services by governments, particularly in developing countries (BGT Partners Network 2022). The gaps include information, knowledge, finances, services, and capacities (Hari 2016: 1). However, many NGOs have poor networking and communication skills in the implementation of community development projects. Networking is believed to strengthen NGOs' ability to speak with one voice and to

significantly increase their impact as policy negotiators and advocating agencies (Holmen 2002).

Recognising these dilemmas, and the importance of NGOs themselves, donor agencies and governments have begun to set up networking and support centres to assist NGOs overcome their shortcomings and provide better services to the communities they work in. Such centres are being set up in both OECD and developing countries to assist NGOs working in the respective countries (Hari 2016: 2).

An example of such centres would be the LCN that was established in 1990 with the objective of providing supportive services to the NGO community. The Council implements this through networking and leadership training and development, information dissemination, capacity building, coordination, advocacy, and representation when dealing with the government and the international community.

Networking is considered as particularly suitable for NGOs to improve their performance and enhance their impact (Hans 2002). With the improvement in communications, more locally based groups (referred to as grassroots organisations or community-based organisations) have become active at the national or the global level. Increasingly this occurs through the formation of coalitions with other NGOs for specific goals (Mostashari, 2005).

Hari (2016: 2) states that networking activities support an NGO's own activities and facilitate linkages with other organisations in other sectors, including government agencies. Networking also assists NGOs in the administrative, financial, and legal problems they might experience (ibid.). Ultimately, networking enables NGOs to develop more effective and innovative programmes and projects.

Many NGOs lack networking skills and instead are seen competing for resources, other than working together towards common interests. Many donors look to fund organisations that are in networks or work together (Korten, 1990: 6). Donors prefer NGOs and CBOs who work in line with other organisations to attain efficiency and effectiveness. Moreover, NGOs that work together to reach their goals more efficiently is one perspective of successful and good delivery.

There are steps that NGOs could follow to achieve good networking. Salto Youth (2021) provides the following tips for NGOs: firstly, start with giving information about your own activities and your own organisation by building a mailing list and mailing regularly, using e-mail and news groups or a website, and sending out invitations for your activities. Secondly, show interest: phone around regularly, visit the activities of other people and organisations, send them a postcard when you feel like it, and try to remember personal interests. Thirdly, organise meeting points: to build a good network you need to meet people personally; do not wait until you meet them accidentally but invite them to a conference, or organise a seminar or a social gathering. And, lastly, common actions/activities: the best way to get to know people is to collaborate with them; the network links are strengthened and you are stronger as a result. You should also involve people in all stages of your project, from the planning stage to the evaluation (Salto Youth 2021).

However, while NGO networking has the potential to improve the undertakings of NGOs and grassroots' organisations in Least Developed Countries (LDCs), much of this potential is not realised. NGOs have been found not to share information voluntarily as they are often fierce competitors for funds, market shares and clients and – particularly – for the right to represent other smaller NGOs.

Poor or disorganised networking and communication can cause duplicated efforts, time inefficiencies, conflicting strategies, and an inability to learn from experience (Maximpact, Blog 2017: 8). Abiddin *et al.* (2022: 9) state that ineffective communication and networking is associated with the duplication of efforts, contradictory policies at the community level, a lack of experience-based learning, and the inability of NGOs to address the structural causes of underdevelopment at the local level. The more NGOs communicate with one another, with International Non-Governmental Organisations (INGOs) and with the community at large, the more effective all of them could be (*ibid.*).

3.8.2 Communication

There are many things to keep in mind when running an NGO, and internal communication is a crucial element that is often overlooked (Grossman 2022). A simple definition of communication, as Monchari (2019) states, is the process of imparting or exchanging information or news. There are different types of

communication: Verbal Communication, Non-verbal/Interpersonal Communication, Written Communication, Formal and Informal Communication, and Visual Communication. With excellent communication between employees and employers comes increased morale, productivity, and commitment, especially with employers who spend the time and energy to create open communication lines.

NGOs, whose mandate is to do welfare and humanitarian work, need to ensure that they are proactive in communication. The role of communication in NGOs is to share information, tell stories, protect the brand's reputation, and engage in conversations that inspire people to join their organisation (Monchari 2019). Since NGOs' focus is on the humanitarian sector, they need to inform people on how to obtain help; this is through providing information on what kind of services they provide as organisations.

According to Maiers, Reynolds and Haselkorn (2004: 1), an effective information and communication system (ICS) is a central component of successful humanitarian relief efforts, which involves not only IT but also people, practices, policies and organisational environments. The EU (2014/2017) states that communication identifies the following priorities: to enhance efforts to promote a conducive environment for CSOs in partner countries; to promote a meaningful and structured participation of CSOs in the domestic policies of partner countries, in the EU programming cycle and in international processes; and lastly, to increase local CSOs' capacity to perform their roles as independent development actors more effectively

Khan (2021) states that communication provides purpose, it fosters a transparent company culture, it creates accountability, and it builds productivity and growth. It has been observed that through lobbying and advocacy campaigns, civil society can strive to participate in governance where laws are made, in policy making, and in implementation by government ministries and departments.

Many NGOs in Lesotho and in Africa face challenges related to poor communication. Khan (2021) states that poor workplace communication occurs when there is a discrepancy between what is said and what is heard, whether it be between colleagues or between an employee and a manager. More specifically, the understanding between two people is not mutual when the person being communicated with misunderstands what you are communicating to them.

There are a number of reasons why NGOs may be the victims of poor communication. Firstly, would be unclear objectives. Goals and objectives are powerful in organisations, as they focus attention on achieving desirable outcomes. Good outcomes in organisations require attentive employees who know what management expects them to accomplish, and transparent objectives provide that direction. Secondly, is poor leadership. Employees look to their managers for direction in the workplace. Good communication that starts from the top down motivates staff members to be more productive and innovative.

3.9 Dynamics of limited capacity

Capacity is defined as the “stock of resources available to an organisation as well as the actions that transform these resources into performance” (NGO Tips 2011: 1). Typically, NGOs seek to develop capacity across several dimensions, namely organisational, technical, financial, management and contextual (NGO Tips 2011: 2). However, many NGOs lack the technical and organisational capacity to implement and fulfil their mission and few are willing or able to invest in training for capacity building (Holland 2017). According to LCN (2015-2019), Lesotho NGOs do not have the capacity to accept the challenge to engage communities in the implementation of progress reports and to hold the government accountable to the nation for delivering on national priorities. In addition, their limited capacity in terms of financial and human resources restricts them from effectively participating in the different national fora and dialogues (EU 2014/2017: 5).

Organisational capacity is defined by NGO Tips (2011 :2) as the ability of an NGO to mobilise its resources (human, financial, material) to maximise the quality and timeliness of service delivery at the lowest possible cost. Murphy (2007: 16), in turn, defines it as the level of an organisation’s capacity to deliver services and products that not only satisfy present customer expectations but continually anticipates future marketplace opportunities. The key components of capacity are those associated with the human side of performance, like the traditional classification of knowledge, skills, and abilities; all these elements contribute to an organisation’s capacity and serve as a primary focus of its capabilities, adds Murphy (2007).

Technical capacity involves developing state-of-the-art skills, improving knowledge, and applying best practices, while financial management capacity encompasses the

extent to which the systems, procedures and internal controls within an organisation offer confidence that funds are judiciously used and properly accounted for. Lastly, context refers to the complex, dynamic, unpredictable, difficult-to-control, external forces in developing countries. These might include socio-political and economic instability, cultural and environmental variables, and the climate for donor funding (NGO Tips, 2011: 2).

According to Lesotho Council of NGOs (2015-2019), limited capacity can be seen in an inadequate coverage of the country outside the main urban centres by the existing NGOs, thereby leaving the rural areas behind in the national dialogue and action around PRS. It was however acknowledged by the government that during the formulation of the PRS, it was the NGOs that made the difference in engaging grassroots communities in contributing to the formulation of the PRS.

LCN (2015-2019) states that another capacity challenge in Lesotho NGOs is the weak coordination gap of the country's civil society. While LCN is recognised as the legitimate coordinating body for Lesotho's NGOs, it is felt by many stakeholders that it does not have adequate capacity in terms of human resources, structures, and systems to coordinate the sector. (R M Goodman¹, M A Speers, K McLeroy, S Fawcett, M Kegler, E Parker, S R Smith, T D Sterling, N Wallerstein 1998: 260) however state that given time, capacity can improve or decline. It often develops in stages that indicate improved readiness to influence performance. Therefore, to improve the capacity of NGOs, capacity building ought to be adopted by NGOs themselves.

A report by USAID (2006: 4) entitled 'AIDS-free Lesotho: Capacity strengthening of Civil Society Organisations' reviewed the capacity of CSOs. The report observed that civil society has grown, but that it needs improvement. It was further observed that the lack of a comprehensive legal and policy framework adversely affected the efficiency of the sector. The EU Road Map for Engagement with Civil Society in Lesotho (2018-2020) noted that rural and local CSOs have limited capacity and international CSOs find the environment in Lesotho unrewarding. Moreover, CSOs are characterised by weak institutional capacity, weak linkages to reliable and credible sources of information to inform programming, poorly qualified staff, and weak financial management system (Eu Road Map, 2018-2020: 3). Furthermore,

there are CSOs that lack expertise and skills in project management and implementation. Civil society needs to increase its effectiveness; in particular, the capacity for evidence-based advocacy and the ability to work with traditional and local authorities if it is to contribute to improvements in service delivery and fulfil its watchdog mandate and foster accountability.

Another constraint to the capacity of Lesotho's NGOs is their dependence on foreign aid. Almost all local CSOs have a weak financial base, as they are not able to generate resources locally and they rely on donor funding or (very low) membership fees. The EU (2014/2017) stated that international funding can only partly compensate for this; also because the management of external funding is often complex and demanding in terms of scarce human resources. Additionally, CSOs do not receive tax favours under the Income Tax Act 1993 and the government has not put mechanisms in place to deliberately support and sustain their operations. This means all organisations must seek donor funds to survive.

Due to the waning donor support most CSOs have scaled down their operations and others have closed down their operations. An emerging challenge for local organisations is that they compete for the same resources as international organisations. A typical scenario in Lesotho is that most CSOs survive by using volunteers as they cannot afford staff on a fulltime basis; in addition, they experience a high staff turnover (EU Roadmap, 2018-2020: 4). Moreover, Lesotho is characterised by partly rugged terrain; thus, most CSOs are based in the lowlands, and only a few are based in the mountainous regions. Due to a lack of funds not all CSOs can place field officers in the outlying districts; thus, it becomes a challenge for services to reach the mountainous areas. Hence, capacity can be seen as a moving target.

Furthermore, the EU (2014/2017: 3) stated that access to information on matters of public interest is legally provided for, but NGOs find it challenging to obtain such information. This concerns information related to bills, information on the budget, and audits. This limits CSOs' efficient participation in national decision making and dialogues and this leads to poor service delivery to the citizens of Lesotho.

3.9.1 Capacity building

LaFond and Brown (2003: 7) define capacity building (or capacity development) as a process that improves the ability of a person, group, organisation, or system to meet objectives or to perform better. NGO Tips (2011: 1), in turn, defines capacity building as “a process that improves the ability of an organisation to meet objectives and perform better”. Capacity building, therefore, is an ongoing process (the development of abilities), whose stages can be measured as “development outcomes” through monitoring and evaluation (Lafond & Brown 2003: 8).

Capacity building considers the quality of the NGO’s performance, the achievement of concrete results over time, and the responsible use of scarce resources. While there is a general agreement among international development practitioner that capacity building is necessary to foster the growth and maturity of NGOs, exactly what it entails is subject to many interpretations.

Capacity building interventions require focus, direction, and linkages to an overall strategy for improving performance. Initial questions include asking: Where are we now? What is our current capacity? How does it affect performance? Where do we want to go from here? What improvements in existing capacity or new capacities are required? Is there consensus on these? Are proposed interventions relevant to identified problems and designed to address the right elements? (NGOs Tips 2011: 2).

The LCN Strategic Plan 2014-2019 states that building the capacity of Lesotho’s civil society will contribute towards achieving sustainable development, and the knowledge gained through capacity building will further strengthen the sector and demonstrate that it is a reliable sector that adds value in efforts geared towards governance and development discourse. It further stated that in the next five years, it will continue to deliver capacity building programmes and projects aimed at empowering Lesotho’s civil society, as it is considered a key enabler in achieving public policy coherence and development goals (LCN Strategic Plan, 2014-2019).

In conclusion, building the capacity of an NGO involves more than improving technical skills, developing new strategies, or revising a mission statement. While these are important, building capacity means changing behaviour. This requires paying attention to other factors, such as attitude, motivation, values, relationships and commitment, all of which underlie an organisation’s ability to truly affect

meaningful and sustainable change. In Lesotho, NGO capacity building would entail small enterprise development, adult literacy, workplace learning, and non-formal education programmes in such areas as environmental education, AIDS, maternal child health care and family life education, and refugee education and resettlement (USAID 1993 E-6).

3.10 Summary

Although the objectives, aims and missions of all NGOs are basically the same, their management systems and approach to work may be different, but challenges are always present in NGOs. This chapter has provided an overview of the challenges and their impact on the service delivery of NGOs.

The prevalence of NGOs in most developing countries is attached to the presence and availability of foreign aid and the agenda for developed countries to invest in the development of countries in the Global South.

Firstly, the chapter observed that financial constraints are a major challenge among many NGOs in Lesotho. A lack of funds limits the quantity and quality of the important work they do. In both rich and poor countries, unlimited needs chasing limited resources are a fundamental fact of economic life. Without good funding, NGOs are unable to provide services. This further affects the communication and networking of NGOs, as to function effectively they need good funding. The capacity of NGOs is also affected by a lack of funds. One can conclude that funding is a challenge that impacts both the sustainability of an NGO and sustainable development within a community. This not only affects the daily running of NGOs but forces them to shut down eventually, no matter how good their cause might be.

Secondly, NGOs continue to face the complex issue of accountability; when NGOs rather than the state provide basic social services such as health care, education and many other services, to whom are they accountable? Some NGOs are membership organisations that seek to benefit their members but they are also directly accountable to them. The vast majority of services delivered through NGOs are provided by professional development organisations with self-appointed boards.

In many countries, NGOs operate with minimal accountability to government. As the role of NGOs in providing services has increased, with international donors switching

funding from the state to NGO providers, the lack of accountability to the state has become a growing problem.

Lastly, it is important for NGOs to have a backup plan to fall back on. NGOs should not rely solely on government funding. NGOs can run separate fund donations and keep their eyes open for new grants to obtain adequate funding.

CHAPTER FOUR: THE IMPACT OF NGOs AND CBOs ON LESOTHO'S GOVERNANCE

4.1 INTRODUCTION

In recent years, there has been a growing interest in the role of civil society in public governance, defined as the process of steering society and the economy through collective action and following common objectives (Torfin, 2020: ii). These organisations hold valuable experiences, resources, and ideas that may be mobilised in support of public governance processes. Moreover, NGOs and CBOs continue to play a crucial role in the development of communities and societies. These organisations have actively lobbied with concerned government entities for the passage of legislation and policy to promote the people's development agenda (Masinga, 2013: 59).

NGOs are private, voluntary, non-profit-making organisations constituted outside the realm of government to contribute to human development and alleviate human suffering through providing emergency relief, education and publicity on matters of development, supporting projects, and other social services (Streeten & Burki 1987: 415). Actors within the NGO sector in Lesotho include national and international organisations, religious-based organisations, and self-help associations and groups, while CBOs are non-profit, charitable organisations that represent community needs. They operate at a sub-county level and below, and their objective is to promote and advance the well-being of the members of the community.

Tshiyoyo (2022) states that it is becoming difficult for governments to provide citizens with public services that meet the required standards, particularly in the context of developing countries. Therefore, NGOs play and will continue to play roles that are of significance to the attainment of the social contract (Tshiyoyo, 2022). Moreover, the era of governance has made NGOs major role players alongside governments. Tshiyoyo (2022) adds that NGOs are filling the vacuum created by governments' inability to honour the social contract, particularly in the context of developing countries.

In May 1990, an umbrella organisation for NGOs in Lesotho was established to provide supportive services to the NGO community, with its strategic focus on

strengthening civil society, environment protection, stewardship, governance and accountability, and empowering the vulnerable and marginalised. LCN strives to be a leading and innovative organisation where its members, government, development partners, and the public have trust and confidence in its efficient and effective management of NGOs, as well as its ability to coordinate and lead Lesotho's civil society, and to improve its ability to fulfill this role (Lesotho Council of NGOs 2014-2019: 15).

The Lesotho government is supportive of NGOs and Private Voluntary Organisations programmes. Considering the degree to which NGOs are involved in the provision of education, the management of health care, and the delivery of social services in Lesotho, it is no wonder that the government and NGOs have found a way to work together (Fox & Fisher, 1993: 2).

NGOs have been pushed to the centre stage of Africa's development discourse in the face of the waning legitimacy of the state and, more specifically, its reduced capability to initiate development and provide needed social services. They have been viewed as effective in filling development gaps left by the centralised government approaches because they engage in micro-level development activities that involve people at grassroots level.

NGOs have played a prominent role in poverty reduction, economic advancement, social alteration, and democratisation programmes in Lesotho. The growing reputation of NGOs has resulted in the global call for improved accountability, transparency, effectiveness and efficiency.

The White Paper (2001: 8-9) stipulated that the importance of civil society in maintaining and promoting good governance and poverty reduction locally, nationally and globally, is being increasingly recognised. Edwards (2009: 125) argued convincingly that “against the background of weak democracies, strong bureaucracies, corporate power, legalism and nationalism resurgent, civil society is essential to the prospects for a peaceful and prosperous world order in the twenty-first century” because it “leads us to a renewed awareness of the fusion of the moral, the social and the political in the constitution of all human communities” (Hann & Dunn, 1996: 3).

Matlosa (2003: 37) states that the civil society community plays three major roles in the governance process. First, it provides a counterweight to government use or abuse of power; in other words, it is a critical watchdog for government action and behaviour (Kabemba, 2003: 37). Second, it is also a reservoir of critical human, technological, and material resources for governance; hence, a key partner for government. Third, given its proximity to the people who are voters of any sitting government, civil society has the requisite muscle to influence immensely the composition and longevity of governments; although as interest groups, NGOs do not harbour political ambitions of controlling state power on their behalf (Mohiddin, 2002: 37).

As discussed above, active citizens and a lively civil society have always been included as important aspects of the principles, indicators, or criteria of good governance (Yui Kei LEUNG* , Yan Wing LEUNG, Timothy Wai Wa YUEN 2016: 491). We will recall that the primary role of an NGO is to monitor and analyse the work of local or international institutions. Because NGOs act as watchdogs, this so-called watchdog model suggests that the members of civil society should evaluate governance in all its stages: from policy-making to implementation (Loise, 2017). If NGOs notice any kind of suspicious behaviour, they warn the authorities or the public. Since the establishment of the watchdog model, governments and state institutions are becoming more accountable.

4.2 Governance and Good Governance

The concept of good governance surfaced in 1989 in the World Bank report on Sub-Saharan Africa, which characterized the crisis in the region as a "crisis of governance" (World Bank, 1989). The World Bank coined the term 'good governance' during a period in which corruption was soaring, aid was not effective, and there was a lack of commitment to implement reforms by countries that received donations (World Bank, 1989).

The UNDESA (2012: 3) states that 'governance' refers to the exercise of political and administrative authority at all levels to manage a country's affairs. It comprises the mechanisms, processes and institutions through which citizens and groups articulate their interests, exercise their legal rights, meet their obligations, and mediate their differences (UN system Task Team, 2015: 3). Governance has however long been

suspected to be a major impediment to African economic development. This suspicion came to the fore in the late 1970s when African economies suffered major setbacks after independence (Fosu, 2018: 2).

From a human rights perspective, good governance refers primarily to the process whereby public institutions conduct public affairs, manage public resources, and guarantee the realisation of human rights (OHCHR 2019). Mitra (2020: 40) defines good governance as how power is exercised in the management of a country's economic and social resources for development.

According to the OHCHR (2019), while there is no internationally agreed definition of 'good governance', it may span the following topics: full respect for human rights, the rule of law, effective participation, multi-actor partnerships, political pluralism, transparent and accountable processes and institutions, an efficient and effective public sector, legitimacy, access to knowledge, information and education, the political empowerment of people, equity, sustainability, and attitudes and values that foster responsibility, solidarity and tolerance.

Poor governance offers greater incentives and more opportunities for corruption, which is referred to as the abuse of public office for private gain. Corruption undermines the public's trust in its government (IMF, 2022). It also threatens market integrity, distorts competition, and endangers economic development because poor governance is detrimental to economic activity and welfare (IMF, 2022).

Manyuon (2018) is of the view that for generations Africa has faced numerous social, political, and economic challenges. These endemic problems range from abject poverty, violence, underutilised agriculture, infrastructure, lack of access to credit facilities, social fractionalisation, poor health facilities and poor education to catastrophic civil unrest, which are linked to illiteracy, lack of proper institutions and exploitation by corrupt and brutal leaders (Manyuon, 2018).

According to United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific(2009: 1), good governance has eight major characteristics. They are participatory, consensus oriented, accountable, transparent, responsive, effective and efficient, equitable and inclusive, and follows the rule of law. It ensures that corruption is minimised, the views of minorities are considered, and that the voices of the most vulnerable in society are heard in decision-making (UNESCAP 2009: 1).

The elements of good governance highlight the complex nature of the concept. Good governance covers two distinct but closely related dimensions: one is political and relates to the degree of genuine commitment to the achievement of good governance; the other is technical and relates to issues of efficiency and public management. Both must be addressed to create a truly enabling environment where private operations can flourish, and poverty can be reduced (African Development Bank, 1999: 3).

The World Bank together with the IMF and other donor countries influenced global economic policy by ensuring that good governance was central to any policy framework. They made it a precondition for receiving any form of financial assistance, and governance continues to drive international development policy to date (Lehobo, 2017: 1).

The importance of governance was highlighted in a study by the African Economic Research Consortium entitled 'Explaining African Economic Growth' (the Growth Project) (Fosu 2018: 2). Good governance and functional partnerships are regarded as important goals of development, but they are also considered to be necessary for building a favourable environment and productive overall framework for development (Koski 2004: 1).

4.3 ACCOUNTABILITY

The current era of globalisation demands that governments around the world undertake public sector reform and the implementation of good governance, which is legitimised by the existence of public accountability (Samboteng *et al.*, 2021: 238). These authors (2021) further note that accountability is an important concept in implementing public services, and governments in developing countries also face the problem of poverty and community empowerment toward economic prosperity, which is the main agenda in government reforms.

The African Development Bank (2006: 4) defines accountability as the obligation to render an account for a conferred responsibility, while the World Bank (1992: 13) defines it as making officials account for their activities, holding governments responsible for their roles in society and making political leaders answerable to their

representatives (World Bank 1994: 12). Moreover, accountability is crucial for governance; hence, it is at the center of its activities (ibid.).

According to Khati (2018: 26), accountability can take two forms: namely internal and external accountability. Internal accountability is also referred to as horizontal accountability. This form of accountability happens within institutions, mostly of finances and as a means of internal control mechanisms, while external accountability can be referred to as a vertical and it is described as the pressure from the public concerning services.

The African Development Bank (2006: 4) refers to three forms of accountability: political, financial, and administrative accountability. Political accountability relates to holding those elected to government, including Parliament, responsible for their actions. Financial (budgetary) accountability involves holding designated officials responsible for the use and control of government funds, assets and properties, while administrative accountability involves holding public officials responsible for tasks and assignments bestowed on them.

In the period between 2019 and 2021, Lesotho was dominated by national reforms. The government established the multi-stakeholder National Reforms Authority (NRA) to implement reforms of the security services, parliament, the judiciary, the media, the civil service, the constitution, and the economy (BTI 2022: 3). The reforms were meant to strengthen institutions, ensure the separation of powers, promote meritocracy in the appointment of public officials, and promote transparency and accountability within the public service (BTI 2022 Country Report 2022: 3).

4.3.1 Non-Governmental Organisations

In Lesotho, CSOs are usually the ones playing an important role in ensuring the interests of citizens are put first, as they are the most dominant special interest group service (BTI 2022 Country Report 2022: 17). Many NGOs are experienced in mass mobilisation to build in people an awareness of unjust policies, to show governments or businesses the strength of their numbers, and to put pressure on governments and businesses to implement reforms.

For example, one of the easiest ways, and maybe the most effective one that UNICEF uses to ensure direct accountability of governments is through partnerships

with states. UNICEF works alongside the Committee on the Rights of the Child to review submitted state reports (UNICEF 2020g). Moreover, the organisation uses national and internal fora to hold governments accountable. The role of advocacy is a central direct accountability mechanism for UNICEF, as seen in its strategic plan for 2018-2021. Through campaigns and partnerships, the organisation can hold states accountable and influence their policies (UNICEF 2017: 27). Moreover, Cohen and Stewart (2010: 53) state that petitions, the statements of leaders, and periodic briefings with decision-makers are key aspects of accountability and advocacy for UNICEF.

According to the European Union (2017: 12), civil society in Lesotho performs an essential role in monitoring the governance sector's performance, and it aims to support organisations' capacity to ensure the accountability of public institutions and in particular their capacity to provide outreach, advocacy, and other support. According to Paffenholz and Spurks (2010: 68), a civil society that can monitor and hold a government accountable for its actions and conducts is fundamental in a democratic society.

4.3.2 Community-Based Organisations

CBOs are important actors in empowering communities other than the state and NGOs (Samboteng et al. 2021: 239). CBOs are considered capable of solving collective problems involving formal institutions. Public service providers often put aside the wishes of the community; while the government dictates what they should do, rather than being asked what they need to make it easier for them to receive public services and get public services without discrimination. The involvement of CBOs is a way of "empowering" poor communities in the economic, social and civic fields in developing countries to get out of poverty (Samboteng *et al.*, 2021: 238).

Samboteng et al. (2021: 240) elaborate that CBOs provide services and build relationships of trust and collaboration in a local environment. CBOs are often also focused on improving and empowering the poor. They further focus on the activities of the economic and political community, including activities to influence decisions about how public resources are allocated and where the government encourages the private sector to invest (Samboteng *et al.*, 2021: 240).

In 2016, two CBOs in Lesotho, namely the Lesotho Network of AIDS Service Organisations (LENASO) and the Lesotho Network of People Living with HIV/AIDS (LENEPHWA), were nominated for an AIDS-free Generation Project. These CBOs focused on community engagement and mobilisation. Each CSO identified and trained individuals within the community to serve as volunteer mobilisers. These CBOs worked with the government of Lesotho through the Ministry of Health (USAID 2016-2018: 4).

4.4 Transparency

Transparency is recognised as a critical component of good governance that can enhance governance capacity and effectiveness to solve complex environmental problems (Gupta & Mason 2016). Transparency is also generally understood as greater openness and less secrecy, through an increasing availability and flow of information. Availing out information and imbalances between the authorities and affected actors, transparency is believed to empower the weak and hold the powerful accountable.

When there is transparency in organisations, it allows detection (and reduces the likelihood of corrupt behaviour) because it lowers the information barrier, allowing for scrutiny and monitoring. Transparency also deters corruption by increasing the chances of getting caught. According to the Asia Development Bank (ADB) and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) (2014), transparency is vital to cultivate public trust in government and to deter, prevent and detect corruption effectively (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, n.d.).

Transparency is a requisite in government service delivery; this is because the beneficiaries of the services should be able to hold the government accountable. Government institutions must ensure that reliable and truthful information is available to the public and stakeholders regarding performance, plans and objectives, as well as resource utilisation reports (CIPFA and IFAC 2013: 17).

The successful implementation of government policies relies wholly on transparency and truthful information. The World Bank (1992: 40) adopted this approach as a way of ensuring the participation of the public in the decision-making process by making

information available to them. It also emphasises the importance of improving transparency and information in financial markets (World Bank 1992).

In 2020, Lesotho's score for transparency, accountability and corruption on the Corruption Perception Index for Africa was 3.0. (this is roughly at the midpoint of the scale, where it reflects the highest standards and 6 the worst). It however fails periodically to account to international organisations such as the UN for human rights abuses committed by the government (South African Institute of International Affairs 2022: 53).

One area in which transparency is key is in the budgeting process. A budget is a tool for implementing national policies that affect every citizen of a country's life, including every Mosotho's life in Lesotho. Thus, knowledge of the functions of the budget, its impact on the overall economy, and the role every Mosotho could play in the process are important. Moreover, they would appreciate the budgeting process more by having a general knowledge of the trade-offs and choices the government must make in allocating resources to the different sectors of the economy (African Development Bank 2006: 19-20).

The 2023-2024 Budget was delivered by the Honourable Finance Minister, Retselisitsoe Matlanyane, and it was made available for every Mosotho on the internet and on social media platforms. However, there is still a need for Lesotho to improve the mechanisms for information dissemination. The United Nations in Lesotho has shown continuous support to the Bureau of Statistics (BOS) to collect, analyse and disseminate data; but the use of evidence in decision-making across government bodies must be strengthened. Data on important issues such as migration, environment, labour, and disaggregated data by age, rural/urban location, and disability remain scarce or obsolete and hinder progress in evidence-based policy-making (United Nations Lesotho n.d.). However, concerning transparency and access to information, although it is a fundamental human right for all Basotho, loopholes in the country's legal framework on financial management, the poor transmission of information, and poor coordination of institutions involved in financial management constrain access (African Development Bank 2006: ii).

4.4.1 NGOs

CSOs could play an important role in enhancing transparency and good governance in developing countries. Such organisations could contribute to an increased public debate on issues surrounding the formulation and implementation of government budgets, as well as in supporting greater transparency (Iweala and Kwaako 2007: 10). Civil society actors, such as non-NGOs, are described as important political actors for transparency. They are seen as drivers of transparency, calling on international organisations (IOs), states, and companies to publicly disclose information and allow public scrutiny of their activities.

NGOs perform a supporting role in formulating and implementing state policies. They often acquire the status of observer in the main government and interstate agencies. In these situations, they must inspect decision-making procedures and the choice of policies, as well as monitor the accountable investment of funds and the progress and outcome of their implementation. Action by a third party, with different interests from those who occupy public offices would, in these cases, confer greater transparency and legitimacy on these initiatives (Buchana & Keohane, 2006: 432).

According to the EU (2017: 15), the LCN's leadership and civil society contributed to an increased public debate on the formulation and implementation of the government's budgets, as well as in supporting greater transparency of public revenue. This is evidenced by the government's attendance at the civil society fora to dialogue with CSOs on matters related to national resource allocation (European Union 2017: 15). LCN and its members contribute to, analyse, and track the National Budget and ensure that the gender sensitiveness of the Budget is respected.

4.4.2 CBOs

Local governments are more likely to be responsive, accountable, and transparent in relationships with their constituents if there are mechanisms through which CBOs can express their priorities and concerns and monitor local government processes. These mechanisms include centrally mandated or supported local elections (including open list elections) and municipal oversight.

The issue of good governance and transparency is more than just about wasted money, it is about the erosion of a social contract and the corrosion of the government's ability to grow the economy in a way that benefits all citizens. The actual influence of civil society on national policy and development needs to be further strengthened. Institutional deficiencies within the government continue to hold back a more inclusive and transparent development process in which CSOs can play a formally recognised role in shaping and monitoring national development processes (European Union, 2017: 6).

4.5 RULE OF LAW

The rule of law has a long history in the aspirations of oppressed people everywhere. Developing societies seek to establish the rule of law, well-regulated societies seek to regulate it, and most governments claim to maintain it (Sellers and Tomaszewski 2010: 1). Sellers and Tomaszewski (2010: 1) further define the rule of law as the fulfillment of justice and the negation of government by and for the benefit of those in charge. For the United Nations system, the rule of law is a principle of governance in which all persons, institutions and entities, public and private, including the state itself, are accountable to laws that are publicly promulgated, equally enforced and independently adjudicated, and which are consistent with international human rights norms and standards (United Nations, 2022).

Good governance requires fair legal frameworks that are enforced impartially. It also requires full protection of human rights, particularly those of minorities. The impartial enforcement of laws requires an independent judiciary and an impartial and incorruptible police force (UNESCAP, 2009: 3). Schlemmer-Schulte (2001: 697) states that the connection between good governance and the rule of law is that the rule of law serves as a legal aspect of good governance.

Rijpekema (2013: 795) explained that, as a principle of governance, the rule of law describes the fundamental principles or regulations that should guide behaviour and power relations within society. As a principle of law, the rule of law describes the fundamental principles that should regulate a legal system. Laws are set to stabilise and guard society, which could improve its chances of development and poverty alleviation (World Bank, 1994: 23).

4.5.1 NGOs

NGOs often play a critical role in advocating for changes in law, policy, procedure, and administrative rules. NGOs also bring the stories of the individuals they serve to the process.

Lehobo (2017: 1) explains that, in 1998, the World Bank began to promote the establishment of the rule of law through legal and judicial reforms as fundamental to economic development. International organisations, donor governments, and private foundations embraced the idea that building the rule of law might itself be a strategy for development (Kennedy, 2003: 2).

There are several arguments around the concept of the rule of law. Aristotle argued that the rule of law could be used for evil purposes in some political situations (Chesterman, 2008: 337). According to Cheesman (2009/10: 599), a non-democratic legal system based on the denial of human rights, abject poverty, racial divide, sexual inequalities, and religious prosecution might observe the requirements of the rule of law in comparison to democratic ones. The rule of law was however perceived to promote good governance and economic development through its role in the control of corruption.

Lesotho has faced persistent political instability since the country gained independence in 1966. This has left the country with a weak state, and state institutions that are highly party-politicised. There has been frequent government changes, which reflects challenges in governance.

Some CSOs have at the individual level actively monitored the protection of human rights and the maintenance of the rule of law. The EU to the Kingdom of Lesotho has awarded three CSOs grants, funded under the European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR), which is the EU's key financial mechanism for supporting organisations active in promoting human rights and fundamental freedoms. LCN was among the organisations selected by the EU. It has implemented a project entitled 'Civil Society Organisations Engagement towards Fostering the Rule of Law and Accountability in Lesotho', with support from the EU. The project aimed to foster greater accountability of public institutions and leaders to citizens, in line with the Constitution of Lesotho.

The United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2019-2023 provides joint United Nations support to Lesotho's national development priorities, as United Nations agencies joined forces to help Lesotho progress towards the achievement of the SDGs by 2030 (UNDAF 2019-2023: 11). These organisations endeavour for government and non-governmental institutions to deliver their mandates and uphold good governance, the rule of law, and human rights, with all people having improved access to justice and to participate in social and political decision-making processes in a peaceful environment (United Nations Lesotho 2019-2023: 19).

According to United Nations Lesotho (2022: 2) the justice sector and the rule of law in Lesotho are critical to the attainment of the country's development goals. However, many issues still need to be addressed. These include inequalities in access to justice; a backlog of court cases; inadequate prosecutorial skills; and insufficient capacity of law enforcement officials. Poor coordination between various ministerial departments adds to the challenges.

In 2020 an NGO called the Crime Prevention, Rehabilitation, and Reintegration of the Prisoners Association stated that Lesotho Correctional Services (LCS) officers refused to grant the Association permission to provide Mozambican foreign inmates with food and other assistance from relatives or friends, which was permitted for Lesotho national prisoners (Lesotho Human Rights Report 2021: 5). Between January and September, the Police Complaints Authority (PCA) received ten reports of torture/assault by the police. These included allegations that police assaulted Ha Tsae villagers, unlawfully arrested and assaulted a suspect, tortured a suspect, received a bribe, unlawfully confiscated and then damaged two vehicles, delivered services poorly at Morija, and damaged property (Human Rights Report 2010: 2).

Good governance, the rule of law, and credible leadership are critical elements in ensuring the successful delivery of services and the attainment of development in a country. These elements provide a conducive environment for private investment and inclusive growth. Investors prefer locations with clearly defined property rights, a low risk of property loss, and the availability of public goods and services that efficiently and effectively support the private sector (National Strategic Development

Plan II 2018/19-2022/23: 8). Hence, there is a need for Lesotho to strengthen the rule of law, as this could attract investors.

4.6 PARTICIPATION

Addink (2019) states that participation is the active involvement of a group of individuals in a collective process on the actual or intended actions of administrative authorities. Participation can also refer to taking part in preliminary arrangements, influencing decision-makers, or taking part in actual decision-making processes.

According to Brynard (1996: 39), the concept of citizen participation arises from the classical theory of democracy, where it is defined as a form of government organised following the principles of popular sovereignty, political equality, popular equality, popular consultation, and majority rule (Ranney 1971: 76).

Citizen participation is a key element of a good governance system. It provides private individuals and groups the opportunity to inform, influence, monitor, and evaluate public decisions, processes, and actions. UNESCAP (2009: 2) stated that participation could either be direct or through legitimate intermediate institutions or representatives.

Citizen participation has assumed profound importance in contemporary democratic regimes. According to Bekker (1996:29), "The phenomenon of participation in the public affairs of democratic governments is a well-established concept". The role and significance of citizen participation are not only encouraged in national elections but also enshrined in many constitutions, thereby making it a constitutional right of every citizen, even beyond elections.

Considering this, citizen participation can be regarded as an important component of democratic government. In democratic governments, people or citizens have a strong say in terms of policies and plans, as well as the running of government (Mothepe 2013: 25). The literature shows that an active and engaged citizenry can contribute to better development policy outcomes, a renewed faith in the public sector, and a stronger sense of community. Liphapang (2021: x) states that communities with higher levels of social capital and citizen participation have higher-performing governments and governments that are more responsive to the public that they serve.

Participation encompasses a wide range of formal and informal activities, such as voting, volunteering, participating in group activities, or just community gardening. Civil society is also considered to play a key role in the consolidation of democracy, in checking abuses of state power, preventing the resumption of power by authoritarian governments, and encouraging wider citizen participation and public scrutiny of the state (Mercer 2002: 8).

The concept of public participation was also mentioned in official documents, like the Lesotho National Vision 2020. Lesotho Vision 2020 is a policy document that supports the notion of public participation in governance affairs. According to Lesotho Vision 2020 (2004: 11), by the year 2020, Lesotho should be a stable democracy with a well-established system of local government with full ownership and popular participation of all citizens in decision-making and local development (Government of Lesotho 2004: 11).

4.6.1 NGOs

In many countries NGOs have been used as vehicles for driving good governance, especially in countries where democracy is limited (Shava and Thakathi 2016: 220). In addition, a vast majority of NGOs operate in smaller communities, developing local assets and infrastructure. This way, NGOs boost participation and allow people to become involved in activities that are directly related to their everyday lives (Loise 2017). Mercer (2002: 8) explains that NGOs work with grassroots organisations that are often comprised of poor and marginalised groups. In this respect, they both widen (in social and geographical terms) and deepen (in terms of personal and organisational capacity) possibilities for citizen participation. NGOs continue to shine in these developing societies as they assist citizens to participate in local affairs, as well as influence public policies and the governance mechanisms of various governments (Shava & Thakathi, 2016: 220).

The primary role of NGOs would be to mobilise people and their resources at local, national, and community levels to support self-sustained development (African Union 2013: 6). In addition, the African Union (2013) states that NGOs can plan and implement development programmes on a limited scale, mobilise local resources and initiatives, act as catalysts, enablers or innovators, mediate in relations between governments and the people, support and partner with governments in providing

local and rural development programmes, act as agents of information, and facilitate development, education, training and professionalisation (African Union 2013: 6). It is crucial to highlight that NGOs increasingly influence policymaking in national governments, multilateral institutions, and corporations; thereby, conferring legitimacy and enhancing good governance.

UNDP Lesotho continues to urge CSOs to take a gender focus in their interventions, especially with rising femicides, homicides, and gender-based violence. This was reiterated by the UNDP Lesotho Resident Representative, Betty Wabunoha, during her closing remarks at NGO week (Wabunoha, 2022).

Lesotho has taken some steps regarding the empowerment of women, but the gender-based measures implemented by the government have mostly been flawed and need rectification if they are to genuinely empower women; otherwise, they will remain good intentions. Sekatle (2010) states that in 2004 the Lesotho Parliament passed legislation reserving at least 30 percent of its seats for women.

NGOs in Lesotho like the Ex-miners Association, Caritas Lesotho, United Textile Employees, Lesotho Homemakers Association, Send-a-Cow, and the Rural Self-Help Development Association employ a myriad of strategies in their efforts to economically empower Lesotho's unemployed people and the rural poor. The strategies employed by the respective NGOs largely depend on factors such as the genesis, nature, and agenda of the particular organisation (Hapazari & Hapazari 2019: 77).

For example, Caritas Lesotho, an NGO founded in 1970, and a member of Caritas International and Caritas Africa, is a prominent NGO operating in Lesotho. The organisation receives most of its support from global national Caritas members, such as Catholic Relief Services USA. Its economic empowerment activities focus on imparting technical skills by offering and sponsoring the training of vulnerable groups, especially orphans.

NGOs aim to increase capacity and enrich and empower citizens so that they can improve their quality of life themselves. They contribute towards restoring self-worth and a sense of dignity by involving the citizens in the development process, which gives them the confidence to actively participate in society, to accomplish more, and to serve their families better (Jivani 2010: 9).

However, citizen participation in Lesotho is still a challenge. Between 2012 and 2017, Lesotho experienced both the advent of a coalition government and a series of snap elections because of short-lived governments, which were unable to complete their constitutional five-year terms (Liphapang 2021: x). This phenomenon prompted the interest to investigate the citizens' participation in development decision-making as one of the pillars of good governance in Lesotho during this period. As United Nations Lesotho (n.d.) stated, the Government of Lesotho's commitment to far-reaching reforms presents a chance to increase vulnerable groups' participation in politics, society, and the economy, but more effort is needed to ensure that voices are heard and considered in policy development.

4.6.2 CBOs

CBOs play an important and relevant role in providing services at the local level. They work in a variety of different fields, such as education, health, the rights of the disabled, and gender issues (Geyer and Salles 2006: 1). CBOs are a key component of a participatory process that helps to raise the status of vulnerable groups, build confidence, and enhance the ability of people to participate in development (African Development Bank 2006: 25). The participatory concept is an entry point for CBOs as they are important actors in empowering communities other than the state and NGOs. Real participation can be realised because these institutions are locally based and managed by the community itself (Samboteng et al. 2021: 239).

These organisations do not have a formal structure, so the participation is more intensive and more authentic. Moreover, as many CBOs have a limited number of members, the learning process becomes easier. Samboteng et al. (2021: 240) state that CBOs focus on the activities of the economic and political community, including activities to influence decisions about how public resources are allocated in communities and where the government encourages the private sector to invest.

The failure of governments' top-down approach and lack of involvement of the people at grassroots level in the bottom-up strategy has reduced the confidence of the public in central authorities. Therefore, communities seek solace in indigenous institutions such as CBOs, which undertake development programmes and projects that they observe as immediate needs in their communities. CBOs have a good

understanding of their communities' dynamics and are therefore often best placed to identify what they need to offer to their communities.

By engaging in political strategy, CBOs can influence the political strategies of public resources allocated for social interests. They do more political government deals for service availability contracts, which can contribute to their neighbourhood communities. The result of this approach is that CBOs build political machines in urban poor environments and can apply the methods of assisting in the distribution of public service provision for poor communities. Hence, CBOs are viewed as generating, aggregating, and disseminating new ideas critical to development, as well as mobilising the resources for their enactment (Dill 2010: 31).

In Lesotho, a significant portion of AIDS Free's technical support for LENASO and LENEHWA focused on community engagement and mobilisation (USAID 2018-2019). Each CSO identified and trained individuals within the community to serve as volunteer mobilisers.

The global community recognises public participation as a fundamental human right, and several international agreements aim to promote public participation in Lesotho. Lesotho is a signatory to international, continental and regional legislation promoting public participation; hence, it can be said that the country recognises the importance of public participation.

An active civil society that encourages greater participation across all sectors of society will aid decentralisation, particularly in those countries with "marked ethnic divisions and deeply rooted local identities" (World Bank 2000). It also calls attention to the need for policies to address "social dislocations" (Mercer 2002: 9).

4.7 Effectiveness and Efficiency

Effective and efficient governance is integral to any government's well-being. It is common to see the words 'effective' and 'efficient' together, even though they hold different meanings (Eisenstein 2019). In addition, while the two words have different definitions, they often go together.

(Eisenstein 2019) defines effectiveness as the process of producing a desired intent or result, and it requires doing the right thing to make it happen. On the other hand,

efficiency refers to preventing or minimising wasting materials, energy, effort, money, or time. Efficiency and effectiveness in the public sector mean considering an assembly of conditions concerning competence, organisation, assuming responsibilities, governmental transparency, citizen participation in decision-making on certain common issues, public interest, efficient allocation of public resources, and democratic governance (Florina 2017: 315). Kefela (2011: 399) explains that the concept of efficiency in the context of good governance also covers the sustainable use of natural resources and the protection of the environment.

Tommasoli (2013) asserts that the effectiveness of institutions and the soundness of democratic politics are acknowledged as the catalysts for development. Moreover, effective and efficient governance is integral to any institution's well-being. Additionally, an integrated approach to public service delivery demands that local governments, together with relevant stakeholders, integrate processes and services to ensure effective and efficient service delivery.

Civil society is recognised as important role players in the community because they are responsible for development. They strengthen democracy because of their support at the grassroots level where they empower poor citizens to participate in government decisions (Irvin and Stansbury 2004: 55). Azi (n.d.) states that civil society's perception of the need to control government actions, along with its demand to play an effective part in the political decision-making process, is remarkable. This movement is revealed in Agenda 21, a non-binding action plan of the United Nations with regard to sustainable development, where it is stated that governments must take "any legislative measures necessary to enable non-governmental organisations to establish consultative groups and to ensure the right of non-governmental organisations to protect the public interest through legal action" (Lage and Brant 2008).

The principles of efficiency and effectiveness normally apply in the procurement sectors of the government. Procurement of goods and services constitutes a major expenditure item for the Government of Lesotho (African Development Bank 2006: 12). As such, the public procurement system needs to be efficient and transparent to ensure that the government not only receives the right goods and services but also value for its money (Public Procurement Procedures Handbook 2013: 6). The

system's organisation and effectiveness are, therefore, critical in public financial management and the development of the country.

According to the African Development Bank (2006: 13), for effectiveness and efficiency, the procurement system in Lesotho requires institutional improvements in the following specific ways: (i) reviewing the legal and regulatory framework for public procurement to make it more accountable and transparent; (ii) strengthening the capacity of the Central Tender Board (CTB) and its secretariat to enable it to discharge its functions more effectively (training of procurement officials is important in this regard); (iii) raising the awareness of government ministries/departments and other stakeholders on the importance of an accountable, transparent and efficient procurement system; and (iv) considering the possibility of decentralisation of procurement to allow ministries and departments to carry out purchases up to a specified threshold.

4.7.1 NGOs

NGOs worldwide perform a wide range of services aimed at human well-being and social welfare. These organisations relentlessly work towards development and bringing positive change in society. NGOs in Lesotho facilitate government policies to reach remote areas and enhance the overall effectiveness of social welfare schemes. They do this through implementing development projects or through policy advocacy. Khati (2018: iii) states that NGOs have played prominent roles in poverty reduction, economic advancement, social alteration, and democratisation programmes in Lesotho. Allard and Martinez (2008: 3) assert that NGOs are held liable by donors, the public and the hosting government for their actions and activities and therefore have no option but to be effective and efficient.

The Lesotho government is committed to ensure the effective and efficient management and development of its resources to maximise socio-economic benefits (Ministry of Natural Resources 2017: v). To attain such, Lesotho has made several public sector reforms, aimed at improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the public administration.

To address governance and other challenges in Lesotho, the government has embarked on an ambitious Public Sector Improvement Reform Programme (PSIRP),

which is being supported by development partners, including Development Cooperation Ireland (DCI), United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DfID), the European Union (EU), and German Technical Assistance/Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau (GTZ/KfW) (African Development Bank 2006: iii). The Programme is a multi-dimensional reform package and its objectives are to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of public service delivery and enhance public financial management to facilitate economic growth and reduce poverty (African Development Bank 2006: iii).

4.8 Responsiveness

Recently, we have seen a growing demand for responsive governance in African countries. We are seeing many people taking to the streets to demand that their governments be more responsive to their needs. Responsiveness has thus emerged as an important principle of good governance. A responsive administration is sensitive to the needs and views of citizens, with personnel who represent their interests and serve their needs.

Friedman (2009) refers to responsiveness as the practice of ensuring that clients are served helpfully and responsibly by government agencies and officials. The first step in acting according to responsiveness is to commit to interacting cooperatively and respectfully with clients (Friedman 2009). In short, it is the effort that is made by a government agency to provide helpful, expeditious service to the public.

According to the United Nations (2015: 27), responsive public governance requires responding efficiently and effectively to people's real needs. This entails a resolve to anchor policies, strategies, programmes, activities, and resources, considering people's expectations, with particular attention paid to local variations and ambitions (United Nations 2015: 27). Another aspect of responsiveness involves an effort that ensures that every citizen has access to government services that he/she wants and to which he/she is entitled. That means that government managers and employees must be dedicated to the principle of non-discrimination and the related policies of equal employment opportunity and affirmative action.

Responsiveness is one of the positive benefits of decentralisation. Decentralised organisational systems may bring the government into closer contact with citizens or

client groups. Government is improved because local representatives are best placed to know the exact nature of local needs and how they can be met in a cost-effective way. Through the creation of social territories, the government's response to client needs and problems can be better and more effective. To respond more efficiently and effectively to the multiple development challenges and identify people's real needs and aspirations, governments in many parts of the world have been collaborating with private businesses and civil societies. Successfully undertaken, this collaboration enhances clarity and depth of understanding among parties and ultimately fosters more efficient and effective, and thus responsive, public policies (United Nations 2015: 28).

A key aspect of responsive governance is for governments to recognise that one source of growing public demand is a rights-based approach to development (World Public Sector Report 2015: 30). Among the key messages emerging from the consultation undertaken on governance, under the aegis of the United Nations Development Group (UNDG), are the notions that international human rights standards and principles must underpin development, that gender-responsive and rights-based governance systems are central for implementing equality goals, and that access to justice and effective justice administration are enablers for development and human rights (World Public Sector Report 2015: 30).

CBOs are best known to enhance the information flow from citizens to local governments and from local governments to citizens; thus, forcing governments to be responsive to their citizens' needs. Because citizens are more likely to hold strong views on local matters that may affect their daily lives than on national issues, it may be easier for them to participate in decision-making at the local government level (United Nations 2015: 31). Informal institutions, particularly those arising from culture and tradition or those used as social control mechanisms, will also be felt more keenly by individuals, particularly when stepping outside the accepted social norms could have repercussions for them personally or for their families (World Public Sector Report 2015). Because of this heightened relevance, the issue of context and consistency between the national and local, and formal and informal institutions becomes more important.

Slaymaker and Christiansen (2005: 4) assert that there is broad agreement that community-based approaches have the potential to be more responsive to the needs and priorities of beneficiaries (allocative efficiency). There is also some evidence that community-based projects are comparatively cost-effective (productive efficiency) because of lower levels of bureaucracy and better knowledge of local costs (McLeod 2003).

Slaymaker and Christiansen (2005: 4) further observe that when CBOs work alongside constitutionally established and procedurally delimited local governments (LGs), the utility of both entities can be enhanced. LGs can be well grounded and organically connected with the citizens they serve, and CBOs can help citizens to connect more constructively with larger processes of markets and state. Additionally, experience shows that the success of community-based approaches ultimately depends on establishing a responsive framework of support institutions (Slaymaker and Christiansen 2005: 4); hence, if the government is responsive, then the CBO automatically becomes successful.

NGOs

An example can be drawn from Lesotho's response to the Covid-19 pandemic. Firstly, the government created the National Covid-19 Secretariat (NACOSEC) to fight the Coronavirus, although its legal standing was disputed (Kali 2022:60). Secondly, this establishment's reputation was tainted with accusations of corruption and lack of accountability. Citizens were worried that NACOSEC may not be accountable because it had no bank account and legal standing. To make matters worse, isolation centres lacked the facilities necessary to prevent Covid-19, and health workers lacked PPEs; hence, they resorted to a stayaway to force the government to be responsive (Kali 2022: 60).

Another example comes from 2015 when Lesotho experienced severe drought caused by irregular rainfall. Lesotho's drought response efforts received a boost following the approval of \$20 million in additional financing by the World Bank Group Board of Executive Directors. The added funds would help the Government of Lesotho improve the shock-responsive function of its ongoing social assistance programmes as part of its emergency response to the El Nino drought (The World Bank 2016). NGOs like the Lesotho Red Cross Society, World Vision, Caritas, and

UN agencies, WHO, WFP, UNICEF and UNFPA were hands-on with the government to assist it to respond to the needs of citizens during the drought (Disaster Management Authority 2015: 17).

The concept of responsive governance is not entirely new; it has been a foundation stone of democracy since the time of Ancient Greece. The need for responsive governance in today's world is more urgent than ever. With the rise of global challenges like climate change, economic inequality and pandemics, we need governments to be more responsive than ever before. We need them to listen, understand our needs, and act accordingly. Only then we can address the challenges of our time.

4.9 Conclusion

Civil society in Lesotho plays an important part in addressing governance issues. It is an important role player in the community because they are responsible for development. They strengthen democracy because of their support at grassroots level where they empower poor citizens to participate in government decisions (Irvin and Stansbury 2004: 55). NGOs and CBOs also help the public by keeping an eye on whether politicians are misusing public money or breaking the law. They also assist the public to become organised and make their opinions known to their representatives.

Lesotho has made good progress in creating institutions and programmes necessary for good governance in general, but the success of such institutions and programmes remains a challenge. An example of this relates to the Government of Lesotho and the European Union initiated Public Service Improvement and Reform Programme (PSIRP), which planned to improve the delivery capacity, effectiveness, accountability, and transparency of public services (2001/2002). PSIRP had a three-pronged strategy that included: (i) Improving Public Financial Management and Accountability focusing on strengthening macroeconomic analysis and forecasting linked to fiscal policy, budget performance and monitoring, integrated planning and budgeting processes, modern procurement systems, integrated accounting, revenue, and expenditure management systems, strong independent oversight bodies and mechanisms, capacity building to support and sustain reform initiatives; (ii) Improving

service delivery through decentralisation, and (iii) Improving Public Service management (Ministry of Finance Action Plan 2012-2017/18: 4).

However, the public service of Lesotho still has a long way to go to meet the expectations of the public and earn the latter's trust. If it is not berated for shoddy delivery of service, it is rebuked for turning a blind eye to corruption, conflict of interest, and other ethical indiscretions. Instead of working proactively to proffer solutions to daunting challenges (like the Aids pandemic, youth unemployment, climate change, and food shortages), the public service wrings its hands as the challenges fester sufficiently to become intractable (Final Report 2019: 16).

In as much as development policies, like Vision 2020, state the importance of civil societies, civil society in Lesotho is highly constrained to fulfill its roles in the country. The actual influence of civil society on national policy and development needs to be further strengthened as institutional deficiencies within the government continue to curtail a more inclusive and transparent development process in which NGOs and CBOs could play a formally recognised role in shaping and monitoring national development processes.

CHAPTER FIVE: FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1 Introduction

This is the final chapter of this study. It summarises the findings, recommendations and conclusion emanating from the study. The study was undertaken with the general objective of determining the impact of the intervention of NGOs and CBOs on the governance of Lesotho. It also aimed to analyse the roles and functions of NGOs and CBOs in the Lesotho government; to determine how NGOs and CBOs assisted the Government of Lesotho in service delivery; to identify and analyse the challenges faced by these organisations in the pursuit to fulfill their roles; and lastly, to determine if NGOs and CBOs had a positive or negative impact on the governance of Lesotho. Specifically, the study sought to answer these questions: What are the roles and functions of the NGOs and CBOs in the Lesotho government; how do NGOs and CBOs assist the Lesotho government in service delivery; what actions should be taken in dealing with the challenges faced by NGOs; and, do NGOs and CBOs have a positive or negative impact on Lesotho's governance?

Considering the research findings, it can be said that NGOs and CBOs have an impact on Lesotho's governance. Their intervention was seen to enhance and motivate a positive perception of their intervention in Lesotho's governance. Existing research similarly suggests that they facilitate development, community participation and good service delivery. Their functions and roles in governance also enhance good governance. This study further took an intentional direction to find out the intricacies behind the intervention of NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho.

The primary objective of the study was to examine the intervention of NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho's governance. To address this research objectives, it was imperative for the research to break down the key objective into a set of achievable sub-objectives. These sub-objectives were critical in guiding the researcher throughout the study.

The first objective was to analyse the roles and functions of NGOs and CBOs in governance. The study confirmed that these civil organisations play a vital role in governance. They play the roles of service providers, development initiators, and

participation influencers. One should keep in mind that the main purpose of these organisations is to serve. They relentlessly work towards development and to bring a positive change in society. They perform a wide range of services aimed at human wellbeing and social welfare. These organisations have been observed to improve transparency and accountability, and monitoring in governments. Also, through these organisations, poverty is declining, economic advancement is attained, and communities are becoming well developed as many citizens now have access to health, education and water, among other human needs **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.7.1)**.

Secondly, the research outlined how these organisations facilitate service delivery. These organisations are motivated to engage as enablers by their organisational mission. Many governments attain efficiency and effectiveness through working with NGOs and CBOs to deliver services, which normally are carried out effectively **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.8)**. It is rare to see communities protesting against NGOs for poor service delivery. According to Adaro (2012: 37), in many places in the developing world, a large share of service activity comes from the private sector. The research confirmed how and why these organisations assist governments in service delivery.

Thirdly, the research aimed to identify and analyse the challenges faced by these organisations in pursuit of fulfilling their roles. This objective was reached as the challenges were identified in the study. Corruption and lack of funding were identified as major challenges affecting the efficiency of these organisations. Without funds, these organisations fail to provide services to communities. The same goes for corruption. When funds are redirected from their initial course, the effectiveness of these organisations is compromised in providing services and achieving development and successful projects **(See Chapter 2.9.2)**.

Lastly, the study aimed to establish whether these organisations have a positive or negative impact on Lesotho's governance. This objective was reached as the study indicated that NGOs and CBOs have a positive impact on the governance of Lesotho. NGOs and CBOs enhanced the government's responsiveness, the rule of law, and participation, among other governance principles. Through this they enhance democracy in Lesotho as the government is able to provide services

through the assistance of these organisations. They achieve this because of their support at grassroots level where they empower poor citizens to participate in government decisions **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.7)**.

The study firstly provided background on Lesotho as a country, and the roles played by NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho. It further provided the reader with the conceptual frameworks of terms. The study also identified the challenges faced by CSOs in service delivery and assessed the impact of these organisations.

This chapter will interpret the research findings. Moreover, the secondary data that was captured from the previous chapters will be assessed and evaluated. The researcher made use of the qualitative method, which was exploratory and sought to explain how and why a certain phenomenon operated the way it did in a particular context (Fox and Bayat 2013: 7).

5.2 Chapter overview

Chapter 1 of this study introduced the topic, examined the background of the study, and provided the intention of the study. It further discussed the research problem, the objectives of the study and the research questions, and it offered an overview of the research methodology. It also introduced the core concepts of the research being governance, NGOS and CBOs. Lastly, it provided a broader understanding of the governance of Lesotho.

Chapter 2 provided detailed theory related to governance, and NGOs and CBOs were properly defined, and their roles were outlined. Moreover, the concept 'governance' was defined in this chapter. It was also said that it could be termed 'good governance' when it effectively facilitated the generation and utilisation of public resources in a manner that secured the human development imperatives of society. The value of this chapter was to provide the reader with a deeper understanding on the roles, advantages, and disadvantages of having these organisations in our communities.

Chapter 3 focused on the challenges and constraints facing NGOs and CBOs in providing services, the dynamics that operated within these organisations, and the dynamics between these organisations and the government. This chapter is valuable

as it provides the reader with an understanding of what may constrain these organisations from performing optimally.

Chapter 4 analysed the impact of NGOs and CBOs in governance by considering the eight principles of governance. The chapter further allowed the reader to grasp what governments needed to be successful, and what governments could do to maximise their effectiveness.

5.3 Findings

This chapter presents the principal findings of the study, which are pertinent to the research questions. The main aim of this study was to assess the impact of CBOs and NGOs on the governance of Lesotho. The impact could be negative or positive.

The findings of the study will be based on the research questions to determine whether the researcher addressed the problems and the answers to the questions. The findings are as follows:

5.3.1 Good governance is the hallmark of governments

According to the UNDESA (2012: 3), governance refers to the exercise of political and administrative authority at all levels to manage a country's affairs. Good governance is central to any policy framework in a country.

The issue of good governance is more than just about wasted money; it is about the erosion of a social contract and the corrosion of the government's ability to grow the economy in ways that benefit all citizens. However, the actual influence of civil society on national policy and development needs to be strengthened **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.4.2)**.

Good governance requires fair legal frameworks that are enforced impartially. It further requires full protection of human rights, particularly those of minorities (UNDESA 2009: 3) **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.5)**. Good governance is also a critical element in ensuring the successful delivery of services and the attainment of development in a country. This indicates that the welfare of people can be achieved through good governance.

Furthermore, good governance strengthens the legitimacy of government by making public administration more transparent. It is the mandate of any government to guarantee that free and fair democracy exists so that the rule of law can be applied, and effective and efficient services can be provided to citizens **(See Chapter 2 Section 2.12.1)**.

5.3.2 Effectiveness in the provision of services through NGOs and CBOs

NGOs and CBOs were found to enhance service delivery in Lesotho. African governments faced a daunting task in their attempts to provide effective and equitable public services. Hence, over the past few decades, there has been a major trend toward the private sector (NGOs and CBOs) taking responsibility for the delivery of public services that were traditionally provided by governments.

These organisations are regarded as a force for good service delivery by virtually all nations. Due to changing needs of society or communities, governments need more assistance from NGOs and CBOs to meet community needs.

NGOs

In Lesotho, many government ministries are turning to NGOs to render some of their services, such as the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Social Development, and the Ministry of Education. NGOs are viewed as more trustworthy than other corporations in respect of benefiting society. Hassan and Forhad (2013: 60) assert that NGOs play a supportive role with governments because of their limited capacity to address society's needs **(See Chapter 3 Section 3.3.2)**.

NGOs in Lesotho facilitate government policies by reaching remote areas and enhancing the overall effectiveness of social welfare schemes. They do this through implementing development projects or through policy advocacy **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.7.1)**. As Allard and Martinez (2008: 3) state, NGOs are held liable by donors, the public, and the hosting government for their actions and activities; therefore, they have no choice but to be effective and efficient. They need to account for every penny used. This reduces the chances of corruption within the NGOs.

CBOs

Governments delegate responsibilities to CBOs and rely on them to gather local concerns and to develop, plan, and help deliver solutions to communities. CBOs' members often live within the community, which places them at an advantage over international organisations. These members are familiar with the community they are part of and their services; therefore, CBOs are better equipped at communicating appropriately through their existing networks. This allows them to be more efficient and effective in their work **(See Chapter 2 Section 2.2.5)**.

5.3.3 Funding of NGOs a serious challenge

The availability of funding is critical to the service delivery of NGOs and CBOs. The unavailability of funds plays a debilitating role in the effective running of these institutions (Agere 2014) **(See Chapter 3 Section 3.2)**. These organisations operate on a non-profit basis and depend wholly on aid from donors to provide services.

NGOs

This research has established that funding is becoming a serious issue for many NGOs in Africa. A lack of funds limits the quantity and/or quality of the services provided to communities. Many factors have been affecting funding, such as the global recession and the Covid-19 pandemic. NGOs are finding it challenging to find sufficient, appropriate, and continuous funding for their work. They must compete for limited grants, funds, and aid. **Chapter 3 Section 3.2.2** indicates that many grants and donations carry restrictions on the types of expenses they may cover. The most common restriction is to cover only direct programme costs, but not the cost of support services or other overhead costs, like the salaries of staff members incurred by the NGO. Donors also expect countries to behave in a certain manner; they may also demand complex and redundant paperwork like audited statements from previous grants in order to apply for new grants.

CBOs

The services provided by CBOs are made possible by the contributions of individuals and institutions referred to as donors. **Chapter 3 Section 3.2.2** states that the dynamics of funding for CBOs are a real problem for service delivery. Due to funding limitations, CBOs are unable to sustain resources and build long-term strategies for lasting social impact through good service delivery.

5.3.4 Citizen participation in governance issues enhanced through NGOs and CBOs

Citizen participation has been a challenge in Lesotho in recent years. Citizen participation is one of the key elements of good governance. It provides private individuals or groups with the opportunity to inform, influence, monitor, and evaluate public decisions, processes, and actions. However, there have been some improvements since the involvement of NGOs and CBOs in citizen participation **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.6)**.

NGOs

NGOs have been used as vehicles for driving good governance, especially in countries where democracy is very limited. Shava and Thakathi (2016: 220) note that most NGOs operate in smaller communities, developing local assets and infrastructure. IN this way, NGOs boost participation and allow people to become involved in activities that are directly related to their everyday lives **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.6.2)**.

NGOs empower and enrich citizens so that they can improve their quality of life themselves. They contribute towards restoring self-worth and a sense of dignity by involving the citizens in the development process, which gives them the confidence to actively participate in society, to accomplish more, and to serve their families better. Caritas Lesotho, for example, empowers orphans so that they can be afforded the platform to participate in governance issues **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.6.2)**.

CBOs

The findings further show that CBOs can enhance participation as they can influence the political strategies of public resources allocated for social interests. They do more political government deals for service availability contracts, which could potentially contribute to their neighborhood communities. Real participation can be seen in CBOs because they are locally based and they are managed by the community **(See Chapter 4 Section 4.6.2)**.

5.3.5 Corruption in NGOs and CBOs

NGOs and CBOs are no more immune to corruption than companies/organisations in other sectors. However, for development organisations, corruption can be especially harmful and has a knock-on effect on their reputation, funding, and donations.

NGOs

Lesotho has been under the public's visor about corruption, which is believed to have ravaged the country's public service and other sectors. In many NGOs, corruption and its implications manifest themselves in the embezzlement of organisational funds, paying ghost workers, and the misuse of organisational infrastructure, such as vehicles, for one's own gain (**See Chapter 3 Section 3.2.3**).

Corruption can take the form of nepotism, bribery, fraud, kickbacks, and double funding. **Chapter 3 Section 3.2.3** indicates that corruption could be caused by various factors, such as poor governance, political instability, and fragile legislative and judicial structures in democratic governance. In May 2022, an investigation was launched against two Women and Law in Southern Africa Research and Education Trust executives in Lesotho (WLSA) following official complaints from other employees that they have been siphoning donor funds for their private use (news@lescij.org 2022). According to Billy Ntaote (2022), an editor at the Centre for Investigative Journalism, the EU and the Global Fund, as donors, confirmed that they received a detailed petition from WLSA employees about WLSA managing director, Advocate Libakiso Mathlo, and the programme manager, Advocate Mamosa Mohlabula. The Directorate on Corruption and Economic Offences (DCEO) investigated allegations that the pair siphoned funds from multiple donor-funded projects, disguising the funds as payment for employees. The employees however explained that the money never reached them and accused the pair of taking the money.

Corruption has also led to poor service delivery as resources that are meant to assist the public are diverted to people's pockets. However, many scholars believe that accountability through the decentralisation of service delivery is regarded as a solution to curb corruption and improve public services; the approach however has

limited evidence of success (**See Chapter 3 Section 3.4.1**). Other scholars assert that monitoring is one of the principal tools used by human rights, environmental, and other NGOs in pursuing their reform objectives and curbing corruption. Monitoring diagnoses problems, assesses actual situations and the real functioning of systems, and can highlight corrupt practices systematically over time. It is a tool that is valuable in itself but is made more effective when joined with public information and advocacy.

It has also been observed that corruption in Africa is hindering economic, political, and social development. It has become a major barrier to economic growth, good governance, and basic freedoms, such as freedom of speech, or citizens' right to hold governments to account, as discussed in **Chapter 2 Section 2.9.2**. Corruption births ugly consequences for citizens and a country. This can be seen in **Chapter 2 Section 2.9.2**, which discusses this point in detail. It states that corruption could trigger political instability and brain drain. Unrest could occur, driven by individuals who have had enough of corruption activities, as these activities could limit the speed of service delivery and divert resources intended for economic development to corrupt public officials.

5.3.6 NGOs and CBOs improve transparency

In 2020 Lesotho's score for transparency, accountability, and corruption on the Corruption Perception Index for Africa was 3.0 (This is roughly at the midpoint of the scale, where it reflects the highest standards and 6 reflects the worst). Lesotho has been failing to account for and be transparent to international organisations providing aid to the country over many years.

Transparency is generally understood as greater openness and less secrecy, through the increasing availability and flow of information. Lesotho has failed periodically to account to international organisations, such as the UN, for human rights abuses committed by the government (South African Institute of International Affairs 2022: 53).

Chapter 4 Section 4.4 states that data on important issues such as migration, the environment and labour, and disaggregated data by age, rural/urban location, and disability remain scarce or obsolete, and this hinders progress in evidence-based

policy-making (United Nations Lesotho n.d.). Lesotho, like many other African countries, also showed a lack of transparency and accountability around Covid-19 funds. This was found to be a factor for political distrust which, in turn, undermined the government's response to the pandemic.

NGOs

The findings indicate that NGOs play an important role in enhancing transparency and good governance in developing countries. Iweala and Kwaako (2007: 10) state that such organisations can contribute to an increased public debate on issues surrounding the formulation and implementation of government budgets, as well as to support greater transparency. NGOs also perform a supporting role in formulating and implementing state policies.

According to the EU (2017: 15), under the LCN's leadership, civil society contributed to increased public debate on the formulation and implementation of government budgets, as well as in supporting greater transparency of public revenue. Lastly, LCN and its members contribute to, analyse, and track the National Budget and ensure that gender sensitiveness of the Budget is respected (**See Chapter 4 Section 4.4.1**). This indicates that NGOs are working on enhancing transparency in governance.

5.3.7 The rule of law needs more attention

Lesotho has faced persistent political instability since 1996, when the country gained independence. This has left the country in a weakened state, state institutions that are highly party-politicised, and frequent government changes. United Nations Lesotho (2022: 2) observed that the justice sector and the rule of law in Lesotho were critical to the attainment of the country's development goals.

NGOs and CBOs often play a critical role in advocating for changes in law, policy, procedure, and administrative rules (**See Chapter 4 Section 4.5.1**). Many issues still need to be tackled in Lesotho's governance. These include inequalities in access to justice; a backlog of court cases; inadequate prosecutorial skills; and the insufficient capacity of law enforcement officials.

The Human Rights Report (2010: 2) observed that between January and September 2010, the Police Complaints Authority (PCA) received ten reports of torture/assault by the police. These included allegations that the police assaulted Ha Tsae villagers, unlawfully arrested and assaulted a suspect, tortured a suspect, received a bribe, unlawfully confiscated and then damaged two vehicles, delivered inferior services at Morija, and damaged property (Human Rights Report 2010: 2).

5.4 Interpretation of the research

This section will assess whether the aims and objectives of the research were met. The section will also deal with the interpretation of the data collected to understand the impact of the intervention of NGOs and CBOs on Lesotho's governance.

5.4.1 The roles and functions of NGOs and CBOs in government

The study's principal aim was to establish the impact of the intervention of NGOs and CBOs on Lesotho's governance, and whether they had a positive or a negative impact on governance. NGOs and CBOs were defined in the previous chapters but for the purpose of understanding, brief definitions will be provided. NGOs can be defined as organisations that function free from the control of the government or they are non-profit organisations that work for the welfare of society, whereas CBOs are charitable organisations or local nonprofit groups that are driven by communities, and they represent the community's needs and work to generate improvements within communities.

NGOs

NGOs play miscellaneous roles within the societies they operate from; their key objective and underpinning principle is the betterment of the lives of people within their target communities. These organisations implement economic development projects; some monitor the social impact of resource development initiatives, while others monitor their environmental impact.

The first role of NGOs is social development. NGOs play an essential role in the welfare of society. Social development is about improving the well-being of every individual in society so that they can reach their full potential. These organisations solve many social issues like education, health, and poverty.

The second role is sustainable development. NGOs have played an important role in promoting sustainable development. They pay attention to the social and environmental impacts of business activity, helped in part by advances in information and communications technology. According to Yap (1990: 75), sustainable development is frequently discussed in association with the report of the Brundtland Commission entitled *Our Common Future*, which was released in 1987. NGOs deal with development that minimises environmental problems and meets the needs of the existing generations without compromising the quality of the environment for future generations.

The third role is promoting community participation. Community participation can be loosely defined as the involvement of society in projects to help solve their own problems. NGOs and CBOs have endeavoured to fill the gaps left by governments in promoting the participation of the identified stakeholders.

It is undeniable that NGOs, beside their positive role in contributing to countries' socio-economic development, face various challenges worth discussing in the hope of improving their effectiveness and efficiency. The reason why some NGOs in the developing part of the world do not appear to execute their roles significantly could be associated with the way they handle their finances. In Lesotho, corruption and its implications manifest in the embezzlement of organisational funds and paying ghost workers. The researcher is of the view that the NGOs must strengthen their monitoring, transparency, and accountability mechanisms so that they are able to trace their funds.

CBOs

CBOs' goals include to ensure the development of citizens, as the central idea in achieving and harnessing their potential, through empowerment, community participation, and enlightenment on their rights and responsibilities at the grassroots and national levels. Like NGOs, the purpose of CBOs is to plan, implement, and monitor social and economic development programmes and provide technical and financial aid to communities. The difference between CBOs and NGOs is that CBOs are close to the people, as they operate in communities. They positively affect the process of rural change by improving the health, nutrition, and literacy status of the population.

Although the Lesotho government welcomes the operations of NGOs to fill many development gaps, it is still suspicious of them and their agendas. Moreover, most CBOs' staff members are not educated; thus, specialisation and the attainment of some results might be difficult to achieve.

5.4.2 How NGOs and CBOs assist the Lesotho Government in service delivery

Service delivery remains a pressing issue throughout many African countries. Service delivery is considered a core function of urban governments, meaning governments have the mandate to ensure that all citizens are provided with services to satisfy their basic needs. These services range from health care and water, to education and sanitation licences.

However, there is a gap that must be filled in Lesotho and other African countries. Foster and Briceno (2010) observe that service delivery in Africa lags significantly behind that of other developing countries. Services are also considerably more expensive than anywhere else. Hence, the trend of NGOs taking over service provision in many countries, with Lesotho no exception, as governments were failing dismally in this regard.

NGOs

NGOs perform a wide range of services aimed at human well-being and social welfare in Lesotho, including conducting research and undertaking service delivery and advocacy. NGOs must mobilise resources in the form of financial donations, materials, or volunteer labour to sustain their projects and programmes to provide services. NGOs are driven by the urge to do well without the motive of attaining profits or being politically influenced, and the researcher believes that this is enough motivation for them to fulfill their task effectively without receiving anything in return.

Although NGOs aim to deliver services effectively and efficiently to the communities they serve, it does not mean that they do not face challenges. Sometimes it is difficult for them to obtain sufficient and continuous funding. Funds are essential for NGOs to implement their projects, programmes, and activities that benefit their communities.

5.3.3 What actions should be taken in dealing with the challenges faced by NGOs?

There are numerous international barriers to NGOs and CBOs performing their tasks – from a lack of funds to corruption within these organisations. Several factors can lead to corruption in humanitarian operations. These include a lack of planning; the number of humanitarian actors present; and the financial resources at stake. However, NGOs and CBOs are reluctant to talk about corruption for fear that it will lead to bad publicity and, consequently, a loss of funding.

NGOs and CBOs must widen their scope of risk assessment to consider whether their programmes are vulnerable to corruption, such as theft or the misappropriation of funds or in-kind goods by warring parties, real inequities in the distribution of aid, and the sexual abuse and exploitation of beneficiaries by agency or partner staff. They need to be transparent with their stakeholders about these challenges, and how they may affect decisions about whether to continue their work. Also, NGOs need to ensure that they are well informed about the nature and level of corruption in the countries in which they operate.

NGOs and CBOs need grants to function and achieve the success of their projects. In cases where NGOs struggle with funding, host governments need to step in and assist them to complete their projects as it is for the benefit of the countries.

5.4.4 Determining if NGOs and CBOs have a positive or negative impact on the governance of Lesotho

NGOs and CBOs are believed to have a positive impact on the governance of Lesotho. These organisations enhance governance by influencing the effectiveness and efficiency of governments and by enforcing accountability, transparency, participation, responsiveness, openness, and the rule of law.

NGOs and CBOs are seen to work on identical grounds and share a common motive – the welfare of society and the people. They are seen to strengthen democracy because of their support at grassroots level where they empower poor citizens to participate in government decisions (Irvin and Stansbury 2004: 55). Secondly, their perception of the need to control government actions, along with the demand to play an effective part in the political decision-making process, is remarkable.

NGOs are private, voluntary, non-profit-making organisations constituted outside the realm of government to contribute to human development and alleviate human suffering through providing emergency relief, education and publicity on matters of development, and supporting production projects and other social services. NGOs can educate the public and put pressure on public policy, meaning they act as important pressure groups in a democracy. They also facilitate government policies to reach remote areas and enhance the overall effectiveness of social welfare schemes. The successful implementation of government policies however relies wholly on transparency and truthful information. The World Bank (1992: 40) adopted this approach as a way of keeping the public involved in the decision-making process by making information available to them.

NGOs also mobilise and organise the poor in demanding quality service and they impose a community system of accountability on the performance of grassroots government functionaries. In addition, NGOs influence governments to be transparent in their service delivery to citizens. Transparency is a requisite in government service delivery; this is due to the obligation of the beneficiaries of the services to hold governments accountable.

NGOs often play a critical role in advocating for changes in law, policy, procedure, and administrative rules; thus, impacting governance positively. NGOs also bring the stories of the individuals they serve to the process. It is no secret that Lesotho has faced persistent political instability since the country gained independence in 1966, but NGOs have actively monitored the protection of human rights and the maintenance of the rule of law.

In addition, NGOs enhance the participation of citizens in government issues; thus, impacting governance positively as citizen participation is a key element of a good governance system. It provides individuals and groups in communities with the opportunity to inform, influence, monitor and evaluate public decisions, processes and actions.

Moreover, NGOs encourage participation and allow people to become involved in activities that are directly related to their everyday lives. NGOs continue to shine in these developing societies as they assist citizens to participate in local affairs, as

well as to influence public policies and the proper management and governance mechanisms of governments (Shava and Thakathi 2016: 220).

5.5 RECOMMENDATIONS

This research has highlighted several topics on which further research would be beneficial to fill the existing gaps. The study attempted to determine the impact of the intervention of NGOs and CBOs on the governance of Lesotho. The researcher has the following recommendations:

5.5.1 Good governance must be encouraged

Good governance is a priority in Africa for international development assistance; therefore, practicing and enhancing good governance is a top priority on the continent. Good governance is considered as guidance for the execution of human rights. Through the principles of good governance, human rights can be made concrete. It can also act as a preventative mechanism for the violation of human rights. If principles of good governance are met, violations of human rights occur less easily. This means that enhancing good governance should be a priority in African countries.

Effective and efficient governance is integral to any government's well-being. The effectiveness of governments depends on their accountability and transparency. NGOs in Lesotho facilitate government policies to reach remote areas and enhance the overall effectiveness of social welfare schemes. They do this through implementing development projects or through policy advocacy. According to Khati (2018: iii), NGOs have played a prominent role in poverty reduction, economic advancement, social alteration, and democratisation programmes in Lesotho. However, these organisations need considerable amounts of money to fulfill their roles and functions.

5.5.2 Increased funding of NGOs and CBOs

The funding of NGOs cannot be emphasised enough. It is clear from the research findings that inconsistent funding is a major challenge for these organisations to do their work effectively. Because of NGOs' growing dependency on foreign funding, a

question has arisen: Can NGOs work without funding? NGOs may lose their voluntarism if they struggle to acquire funding. It is recommended that the Government of Lesotho should include these organisation in their annual budget to assist NGOs and CBOs that struggle with funding. Recently, Population Services International, an NGO, was forced to cut its staff component because of a lack of funding. Also, it would be helpful if international donors could lower the requirements for funding applications for NGOs in less developed countries, especially those participating in poverty alleviation programmes.

5.5.3 Improving service delivery

Service delivery in Africa lags behind that of other developing countries and services are considerably more expensive than elsewhere. The call for delivering services in Lesotho calls for the inclusion of other partners to fight poverty and unemployment in communities. This study recommends that NGOs and CBOs collaborate with interest groups such as churches, clinics, schools, and businesses in the community to deliver services effectively.

Lesotho needs to improve its human resources management to enhance the performance of the civil service for better service delivery, as well as improving its statistical capacity to produce timely and reliable economic, social, and poverty data. The improvement in public resources management will allow for the more effective use of financial and human resources for the poor and vulnerable people who need the most assistance.

5.5.4 Promoting and strengthening the rule of law, accountability and transparency

Lesotho's turbulent recent history has been marked by crises of accountability and transparency, including a collapse of the rule of law. Strengthening domestic accountability and the rule of law is an urgent need in Lesotho as accountability is increasingly seen as the touchstone of successful development. Citizens need to hold their political leaders accountable; but citizens need information. Transparency is thus a prerequisite for accountability.

It is recommended that information held by public authorities should be shared with the public and then the public should be allowed to raise their voices without fear of

oppression. Access to information is the foundation of good governance and ultimately creates fertile ground for democracy to thrive. The free flow of information ensures that the media, which acts as a watchdog in society, can hold those in public office accountable for their actions.

The rule of law must be enhanced in Lesotho. The Directorate on Corruption and Economic Offences (DCEO), the military, and the mounted police must be provided with adequate resources for them to effectively discharge their mandate. In addition, proactive measures for fighting corruption should be implemented by engendering a culture of ethical conduct among those in public service and by advancing integrity within the leadership of the country.

5.5.5 Monitoring and Evaluation in NGOs must be enhanced

Weak monitoring and evaluation capacity still exists in many NGOs and CBOs in Lesotho, which could hinder the effective work of these organisations in the future. M&E is an approach that involves the periodic assessment of the success and performance of programmed activities and projects.

Lesotho can learn from South Africa, which has regulations for non-profit organisations. The Codes of Good Practice and the Non-Profit Organisations Act of 1997 are such regulations, which encourage accountability, good governance, transparency, participation, and healthy donor relations in their daily activities. These can be used as a guideline by the Government of Lesotho to improve the Societies Act 2001; there is also a need to merge all the regulations in Lesotho (the Societies Act, the Cooperative Societies Act 2000, the Labour Code 1992, and the Friendly Societies Act), which inform CSOs, into one regulation.

CBOs in Lesotho do not receive enough recognition. Many of them have been in a fight for survival as they do not receive sufficient resources to do their work. They could be given more roles, such as mobilising local resources, and human capital and other resources. For this to happen, further exploration is needed to determine the capability and sustainability of CBOs.

There should be strengthened collaboration between the government and NGOs because, as revealed by the research, NGO-government dynamics affect the development of the nation at large.

5.5.6 Public participation must be encouraged

The Local Government Act of 1997 should be improved to cater directly for citizen participation in matters of local government. The Local Government Act of 1997 and the 1998 Amendment make little mention of citizen participation in local government in Lesotho. Public participation needs to be improved in Lesotho, as it could contribute to government legitimacy if it has a genuine impact on political decisions.

Empowering participation should have the community at its core as participation is crucial to the functioning of any government. When the community participates at a level that is above merely attending meetings or receiving information, it not only strengthens the community but also the government. NGOs and CBOs need to encourage the community to participate more and they should be able to hold the government accountable for failing to deliver. It is also recommended that a comprehensive policy on citizen participation in Lesotho be enacted. This policy will work as a guiding tool to assist the government's stakeholders to provide a common understanding of what citizen participation is in terms of its conceptual understanding and underlying principles.

5.5.7 Value of the research

The intervention of NGOs and CBOs in the governance of Lesotho has been observed as a positive phenomenon in the country's democracy and governance. Previously the roles of NGOs and CBOs in governance were not taken seriously, or maybe they were not fully understood. This research could help the reader to gain a deeper understanding on how CSOs affect governance and how best they could enhance it. In addition, the findings of this study could directly benefit the Lesotho government, other institutions/organisations, and communities in dealing with CSOs. It could also bring about a deeper understanding of how NGOs and CBOs operate and of the benefits they bring. Moreover, the governance principles discussed in the study could be beneficial if effectively put into practice by the Government of Lesotho.

5.6 Conclusion

Many NGOs and CBOs operate in Lesotho, with each designed for a specific task. Over the years they have been seen to be very beneficial to Lesotho's governance – from improving service delivery in the country to improving community developments and livelihoods through sustainable development projects. However, the Government of Lesotho needs to recognise the importance of these organisations and work closely with them to improve governance.

Moreover, these organisations are considered by the community as institutions which voice and address their needs. Therefore, governments have come to accept NGOs and CBOs as their support in many of their development projects. Therefore, it can be stated that the presence of NGOs is felt to be irreplaceable in Lesotho.

Additionally, many scholars see the future role of NGOs as becoming facilitators of the global community's development movement because they are well-suited as instruments that facilitate the process of development. We can therefore conclude that NGOs contribute immensely towards enhancing the lives of the poor and protecting their basic rights.

Although NGOs and CBOs do not necessarily perform the role of formal governance, it must be said that NGOs play an important role in articulating and responding to the development needs of poor communities. Hence, the existence of these organisations cannot be ignored in the world of tomorrow. Lesotho's NGOs, as well as international NGOs, are certain to play a positive role in the transformation of the country's socio-economic development. In conclusion, it is accepted that NGOs and CBOs have become vitally important institutions in Lesotho's governance and development.

REFERENCES

Abdullahi, A. (2018). Governance and Community Participation: Evidence from most Successful Innovation. Department of Local Government and Development Studies Faculty of Administration

Abiddin, N.Z., Ibrahim, I. and Aziz, A. (2022). SA Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) and Their Part towards Sustainable Community Development. *Sustainability* 2022, 14, 4386. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14084386> Academic Editors: Rosab.

Abegunde, A.A. (2009). The role of community-based organisations in economic development in Nigeria: The case of Oshogbo, Osun state, Nigeria. *International NGO Journal*, 4(5), pp. 236-252.

Adetunji, J. (2013). "Dealing with Corruption in Your NGO." *The Guardian*. Available at: www.theguardian.com/global-development-professionalsnetwork/2013/jan/28/corruption-ngo-development-aid.

Admin. (2021). "Good Governance: Definition and Characteristics." Available at: UCLG ASPAC, uclg.aspac.org/good-governance-definition-and-characteristics/.

Adongo, J. and Swarray, M. (2006). Poverty Alleviation in Rural Namibia through Improved Access to Financial Services, No. 109.

Africa Development Fund. (2013). Project: Institutional Support for the Enhancement of Public Financial Management Project (ISEP). Country: Kingdom of Lesotho Project Appraisal Report.

African Development Bank. (2006). Country Governance Profile, Kingdom of Lesotho. Available at: <https://www.afdb.org/fileadmin/uploads/afdb/Documents/Project-and-Operations/ADB-BD-IF-2006-20-en-lesotho-country-governanceprofile.pdf>.

African Union. (2013). *The Role of Non-Governmental Organisations in Development Support: The African Perspective*, Ethiopia.

African Union Development Agency (AUDA-NEPAD). (2022). "Improving Africa's Service Delivery through E Governance|AUDA-NEPAD." Available at: [www.nepad.org/blog/improving Africa's service-delivery-through-e-governance](http://www.nepad.org/blog/improving-Africa's-service-delivery-through-e-governance).

Agere, L.M. (2014). *An Evaluation of the role of Child and Youth Care Centres in the Implementation of South African's Children's Act*. An unpublished Master's of Social Work Degree. University of Fort Hare; South Africa.

Anti-Corruption Resource Centre. (2008). U4 Anti-Corruption Resource Centre. Available at: www.u4.no/.

AGGN. (2010). A Discussion Paper. Available at: https://anyl4psd.org/article-aggn_adressinggoodgovernance/

Aideyan, O.A. (2018). Community-Based Organisations. In: Farazmand, A. (eds) *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-20928-9_144

Aktar, A. and Massud, M. (2020). 'Beneficiary Accountability of NGOs: A Case Study on a Women Empowerment Based Advocacy NGO:' *The Cost and Management*, Vol 48(2).

Ali, K. (2008). *NGO Governance: Accountability and Transparency Issues*. Available at <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/310134593>

Alonzi, A. (2018). "What Is Transparency?" Proposal for NGOs, 15 May 2018.. Available at: <https://proposalsforngos.com/what-is-transparency/#:~:text=In%20the%20context%20of%20international>. Accessed 19 July 2022.

Amagoh, F. (2015). "Improving the credibility and effectiveness of non-governmental Organisations," *Progress in Development Studies*, Vol. 15(3), pp. 221-239, July.

Angielczyk, K. (2017). "What Do We Mean by Theory in Science?" Field Museum, 10, Available at: www.fieldmuseum.org/blog/what-do-we-mean-theory-science

Ansell, C., & Torfing, J. (2016). Introduction: Theories of governance. In C. Ansell & J. Torfing (Eds.), *Handbook on theories of governance* (pp. 1–17). Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

Apostu, D. (2013). Non-Governmental Organisation Leadership and Development. A Review of The Literature. *Manager. Change and Leadership*, pp. 145-161.

BGT Partners Network. (2022). "NGO Networking - BGT Partners Network." Available at: www.bgtpn.com, www.bgtpn.com/join-network/ngo-networking. Accessed 19 October 2022.

Archive.globalpolicy.org. (n.d.). Do Donors and NGOs. Available at: <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/ngos/fund/2005/05ngospeak.htm> Accessed 15 April 2022.

Armstrong, G. (2007). The global footballer and the local war-zone: George Weah and transnational networks in Liberia, West Africa. *Global Networks*, Vol. 7.

Article on NGOs for UNESCO Encyclopaedia. (2016). Available at: www.staff.city.ac.uk/willetts/CS-NTWKS/NGO-ART.HTM.

Asadullah, M., Savoia, A. and Kunal, S. (2019). "Will South Asia achieve the Sustainable Development Goals by 2030? Learning from the MDGs experience," Global Development Institute Working Paper Series esid-126-19, GDI: The University of Manchester.

Avis, W.R. (2016). Urban Governance (Topic Guide). Birmingham, UK: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.

Azeez, A. (2018). Democratic Consolidation and Good Governance in Africa: Assessing the Incidences of Poverty and Corruption in four African States. *Bangladesh e-journal of Sociology*, Vol. 15(1), pp. 42-58.

Baluku, J. (2010) NGO-led Service Delivery to the Poor: The Case of Agricultural Support Programme (SATNET) in Kasese District, Uganda. *Poverty Studies and Policy Analysis (POV)*. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/2105/8600>

Banks, N. and Hulme, D. (2012). 'The role of NGOs and civil society in development and poverty reduction'. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, page 3. doi: 10.2139/ssrn.2072157

Batti, R.C. (2014). Challenges facing local NGOs in resource mobilization. *Humanities and Social Sciences*, 2(3), pp. 57-64. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.hss.2014.0203.12>.

Biswas, A. (2020). Good Governance: Definitions, Characteristics, and Importance. Available at: [School of Political Science, school of political science.com/what-is-goodgovernance/](http://www.schoolofpoliticalscience.com/what-is-goodgovernance/).

Boskov, T. and Spire, L. (2011). "Globalization, Trade and Business." Tirana, Albania. Accessed 8 September 2022.

Botes, L. and Van Rensburg, D. (2000). Community Participation in Development: Nine Plagues and Twelve Commandments. *Community Development Journal*, Vol. 35, pp. 41-58.

Bromideh, A. (2011). The widespread challenges of NGOs in developing countries: Case studies from Iran. *International NGO Journal*. Vol. 6(9), pp. 197-202, September 2011. Available at: [http:// www.academicjournals.org/INGOJ](http://www.academicjournals.org/INGOJ).

Brown, D (2009), The Effectiveness of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) within Civil Society. *International Studies Masters*. Paper 75. Available at: https://fisherpub.sjf.edu/intlstudies_masters/75

BTI Country Report Lesotho. (2018). Available at: https://bti-project.org/fileadmin/api/content/en/downloads/reports/country_report_2018_LSO.pdf

BTI Lesotho Country Report. (2022). Available at: <http://www.bti-projects.org>.

Campbell, J. (2014). "South Africa: What Does "Service Delivery" Really Mean?" Council on Foreign Relations. Available at: www.cfr.org/blog/south-africa-what-does-servicedelivery-really-mean.

Caritas Lesotho. (2020). 'The Borgen project', Available at: borgenproject.org/tag/caritas-Lesotho. Accessed 27 April 2022.

Center for Social Justice. (2022). Staff Complete USAID Certificate Course on Resource Mobilisation - Centre for Social Justice. Available at: [Csjng.org/csjstaffs-complete-usaid-certificate-course-on-resource mobilisation/](http://Csjng.org/csjstaffs-complete-usaid-certificate-course-on-resource-mobilisation/). Accessed 18 October 2022.

Chakawarika, B. (2011). Challenges faced by NGOs in the political harsh climate of Zimbabwe: Analysing the effects on sustainability and promotion of human rights. SOA 3902. A dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree Master's in Human Rights Practice.

Chen, J. (2020). "What Is Embezzlement?" Investopedia, Available at: www.investopedia.com/terms/e/embezzlement.asp.

Chene, M. (2013). Key features of NGO accountability systems, Transparency International, No 350.

Chowdhury, N. and Skarstedt, C.E. (2005). The Principle of Good Governance. Centre for International Sustainable Development Law CISDL, Oxford, UK.

Codes of Good Practice for South African Non-profit Organisations (NPOs). (1997). Department of Social Development.

Coetzer, P. (2013). Bribery and corruption on the rise in South Africa and globally. Available at: www.leadershiponline.co.za. Accessed 1 October 2014.

Collinschimuti. (2015). "Community Participation." Slideshare.net. Available at: www.slideshare.net/collinschimuti/community-participation-49990976

Coppola, D.P. (2020). "Chapter 10 - Participants: Multilateral Organisations and International Financial Institutions." Science Direct: Butterworth-Heinemann, Available at: www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/B9780128173688000105#abs0010. Accessed 29 August 2022.

Creswell, J.W. (2003). Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, pp. 9-11.

Creswell J.W. (2006). Role of Governments and Nongovernmental Organisations. Research Designs. Sage: London. Available at: https://www.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/upm-binaries/52625_ch_9.pdf.

Damlamian, C. (2006). Corporate-NGO partnerships for sustainable development. University of Pennsylvania. (Honours mini-dissertation).

Deans, F., Oakley, L., James, R. and Wrigley, R. (2006). Coaching and Mentoring for Leadership Development in Civil Society, Available at: <https://books.google.co.th/books?isbn=3954894904>

Department of Economic and Social Affairs of United Nations (UN/DESA)-Population Division. (2015). *Global Sustainable Development Report, 2015 edition*. [online] Available at: <https://www.un.org/en/development/desa/publications/global-sustainable-development-report-2015-edition.html>.

Desai, V. (2002). "Informal politics, grassroots NGOs and women's empowerment in the slums of Bombay", in Jane Parpart, Shirin Rai and Kathleen Staudt (eds.) *Rethinking Empowerment: Gender and development in a global/local world*. London: Routledge, pp. 218-235.

Development Bank of Southern Africa. (2022). www.dbsa.org/about-us.

Devon, M. (2019). "Organisational Effectiveness: The X Factor for Company Success." Available at: slack.com/blog/transformation/organisational-effectiveness-company-success.

Domegan, C. and Fleming, D. (2007). *Marketing research in Ireland: Theory and practice*. Gill & Macmillan: UK

Economic Recovery and Innovation. (2020). "What Is Economic Development? – Province of British Columbia." Available at: www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/employment-business/economic-development/plan-and-measure/economic-development-basics.

Edwards, M. and Hulme, D. (1996). *Too Close For Comfort? The Impact of Official Aid on Nongovernmental Organisations*, Available at: https://www.tc.columbia.edu/cice/pdf/25629_1_1_Edwards_Hulme.pdf

Elisa, R. and Francesca, C. (2017). "NGOs and Governance." *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*, pp. 1-5, Available at: link.springer.com/referenceworkentry/10.1007%2F978-3-319-31816-5_3213-1, 10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5_3213-1. Accessed 18 October 2020.

Eswarappa, K. (2020). "Community-Based Organisations (CBOs) and Their Role in The Development of Women: A Case from Andhra Pradesh." *Contemporary Voice of Dalit*, p. 24 55328X2092243, 10.1177/2455328x20922437. Accessed 20 May 2020.

EU Roadmap for engagement with civil society in Lesotho 2018-2020. "Governance: What Is It and Why Is It Important?" Available at:

Governancetoday.com,governancetoday.com/GT/GT/Material/Governance__what_is_it_and_why_is_it_important_.aspx.

European Union. (2005). Community Participation. Available at:
at:https://ec.europa.eu/echo/files/evaluation/watsan2005/annex_files/WEDC/es/ES2D.pdf. EU country roadmap for engagement with civil society (2014-2017).

Fareed, M.A. and Hassan, O. (2002). Lesotho Development in a Challenging Environment. A joint World Bank-African Development Bank Evaluation: Abidjan and Washington, D.C.

Farrales, M.J. (2005). What is Corruption? A History of Corruption Studies and the Great Definition Debate. University of California: San Diego.

Ferguson, C. (2011). Enhancing the role of NGOs and civil society in poverty alleviation: Challenges and Opportunities. Geneva, Switzerland.

Ferrington, J., Bebbinton, A., Wellard, K. and Lewis, J.D. (1993). Reluctant Partners? Non-Governmental Organisations. The State and Substantial Agricultural Development. New York and London: Routledge.

Firefighter Foundation. (n.d.). Upholding the rights of vulnerable children. Available at: www.firefightfoundation.org/child-rights.

Finkelstein, D. (2020). "What Are the Principles of Accountability?" Tick Those Boxes, 3tickthoseboxes.com.au/what-are-the-principles-of-accountability/. Available at:
<https://tickthoseboxes.com.au/what-are-the-principles-of-accountability/>

Folger, J. (2018). "What Is an NGO (Non-Governmental Organisation)?" Investopedia, 2018, www.investopedia.com/ask/answers/13/what-is-non-government-organisation.asp.

Foster, V. and C. Briceno-Garmendia (2010), Africa's Infrastructure: A Time for Transformation, Africa Development Forum, World Bank, Washington DC

Francis, A. (2015). "History and Development of Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs)." MBA Knowledge Base. Available at: www.mbaknol.com/general-business-articles/history-and-development-of-non-governmental-organisations-ngos/. Accessed 5 September 2022.

FundsForNGOs. (2013). "Why Is Monitoring & Evaluation Important for NGOs?" Grants and Resources for Sustainability. Available at: <https://www.fundsforngos.org/featured-articles/monitoring-evaluation-important>

FundsForNGOs. (2020). During COVID-19 times, what type of projects can NGOs propose to donors for helping the poor? Available at: <https://www2.fundsforngos.org/featured/during-covid-19-times-what-type-of-projects-can-ngos-propose-to-donors-for-helping-the-poor/> .

FundsForNGOs. (2021). "Functions of an NGO." Available at: www2.fundsforngos.org/cat/functions-of-an-ngo.text=NGOs%20worldwide%20perform%20a%20wide. Accessed 19 October 2022.

Fung, A. (2013). Infotopia: Unleashing the Democratic Power of Transparency, Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0032329213483107>. Accessed 8 May 2022.

Geofunders. (2015). "What Financial Challenges Do Nonprofits Face?" Grantmakers for Effective Organisations. Available at: www.geofunders.org/resources/what-financial-challenges-do-nonprofits-face-661.

Global Policy Forum. (2005). "Do Donors and NGOs." Available at: Archive.globalpolicy.org/ngos/fund/2005/05ngospeak.htm.

Gooding, K. (2017). The role of NGOs' service delivery experience in developing relevant research agendas: experience and challenges among NGOs in Malawi. *Health Res Policy Sys*, Vol. 15(38). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12961-017-0199-3>.

Government of New Brunswick Canada. (2009). "What Is Social Development? Economic and Social Inclusion Corporation." Available at: https://www2.gnb.ca/content/gnb/en/departments/esic/overview/content/what_is_social_development.html.

Green Reporter. (2021). "What Are the Three Pillars of Sustainability?" Available at: [Greenreporter.com/what-Are-the-three-pillars-of-sustainability/](https://www.greenreporter.com/what-are-the-three-pillars-of-sustainability/). Accessed 17 August 2022.

Grobman, G.M. (2008). "The Nonprofit Handbook: Everything You Need to Know to Start and run Your Nonprofit Organisation." White Hat Communications.

Grossmann, C. (2022). "3 Key Challenges of Internal Communication NGOs." Available at: [Beekeeper, www.beekeeper.io/blog/3-key-internal-communication-challenges-ngosexperience/](https://www.beekeeper.io/blog/3-key-internal-communication-challenges-ngosexperience/). Accessed 17 November 2022.

Gurbax, S. (2020). "Economic Development Basics." Available at: CALED, 2020, caled.org/economic-development-basics/.

Hapazari, I. and Hapazari, J. (2019). A look at Lesotho government and NGOs' economic empowerment programs with respect to rural poverty reduction. *Corvinus Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, Vol. 10(10).14267/CJSSP.

Harriss, J (1992) Does the 'depressor' still work? Agrarian structure and development in India: A review of evidence and argument, *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 19:2, 189-227, DOI: 10.1080/03066159208438478

Harju, A. (2020). "The Essential Characteristics of Civil Society." Available at: kansalaisyhteiskunta.fi/tietopankki/the-essential-characteristics-of-civil-society/.

Hassan, A. and Forhad, A. (2013), "The role of NGO in the sustainable development in Bangladesh". *Present environment and sustainable development*, Vol. 7(2).

Hayes, A. (2022). "Embezzlement Definition." Investopedia. Available at: www.investopedia.com/terms/e/embezzlement.asp#:~:text=Embezzlement%20r%20fers%20to%20%20form. Accessed 18 October 2022.

Hearn, J. (2007). "African NGOs: The New Compradors?". *Development and Change*, Vol. 38(6), pp. 1095-1110. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-7660.2007.00447.x

Himanshu, J. (2020). "Difference & Similarities between an NGO and CBO?" LegalRaasta Knowledge Portal. Available at: www.legalraasta.com/blog/difference-similarities-between-an-ngo-and-cbo/. Accessed 5 July 2022.

Holland, T. (2017). What challenges do NGOs face and what are the solutions? Retrieved from LinkedIn: <https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/what-challenges-do-ngos-face-solutions-tomholland/>.

Hope, K. (1999). Corruption in Africa: A Crisis in Ethical Leadership. *Public Integrity*, Vol. 1, pp. 289-308.

Hudson, A. (2000). "Making the Connection: Legitimacy Claims, Legitimacy Chains and Northern NGOs' International Advocacy", In Lewis, D. and Wallace, T. (Eds.), *After 15 the 'New Policy Agenda'? Non-Governmental Organisations and the Search for Development Alternatives*. Kumarian Press.

Human Development Report. (2016). *Human Development for Everyone*. New York.

Humanitarian Global. (2022). Why Monitoring & Evaluation Is Important to NGO's Available at: humanitarianglobal.com/why-monitoring-evaluation-is-important-to-ngos/. Accessed 21 July 2022.

Hussain, A. *et al.* (2008). "The role of community based organisations in rural development: a case study of selected CBOs in District Swat." *Sarhad J. Agric*, Vol. 24(4). Available at:

www.aup.edu.pk/sj_pdf/THE%20ROLE%20OF%20COMMUNITY%20BASED%20ORGANISATIONS.pdf.

IFAC. (2013). Good Governance in the Public Sector - Consultation Draft for an International Framework: Consultation Draft. New York: IFAC.

Impact of Community-Based Organisations. (2019). "Impact of Community-Based Organisations." UniversalClass.com. Available at: www.universalclass.com/articles/business/impact-of-community-based-organisations.htm.

Ingram, G. (2020). "Civil Society: An Essential Ingredient of Development.", Available at: www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2020/04/06/civil-society-an-essential-ingredient-of-development/. Brookings.

International Labour Organisation. (2014). Enabling Environment for Sustainable Enterprises in Lesotho. Open Journal of Business and Management, Vol.2 No.4

Irvin, R.A. and Stansbury, J. (2004). "Citizen Participation in Decision Making: Is It Worth the Effort?" *Public Administration Review*, Vol. 64(1), pp. 55-65. Available at: www.jstor.org/stable/3542626.

Isbell, T. and Malephane, L. (2018). Basotho support limits on executive power and transparency in use of public information. Available at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/328094842>

Jones, C. (2021). "Africa: Corruption Is Crippling Africa, "More like Sand than Oil in The Economic Engine" AllAfrica.com. Available at: allafrica.com/stories/202107070228.html. Accessed 3 September 2022.

Jain, K.A. (2001). Corruption: A review. *Journal of Economic Surveys*, Vol. 15(1). Blackwell Publishers: Oxford UK.

Kabi, T., Kompfi, B. and Twala, C. (2014). Challenges of Local Government in the Community Councils of the Maseru District in the Kingdom of Lesotho: An Historical Overview. *Journal of Social Sciences*, Vol. 39:1, pp. 51-57. doi: 10.1080/09718923.2014.11893268.

Kaldor, M., Moore, H.L. and Salchow, S. (2012). *Global Civil Society 2012: Ten Years of Critical Reflection*, pp. 19. Basingstoke New York: Palgrave MacMillian.

Kalonda, J. K. and Govender, K. (2021). Factors Affecting Municipal Service Delivery. A Case Study of Katima Mulilo Town Council, Namibia. *African Journal of Public Affairs*, Vol. 12(2). Available at: https://hdl.handle.net/10520/ejc-ajpa_v12_n2_a2

Kang'ethe, S.M. (2014). Social capital from informal networks can be a fertile niche to mitigate HIV/AIDS and poverty effects: Examples from South Africa and Botswana. *Journal of Human Ecology*, Vol. 47(2),185-192.

Keast, R. and K. Brown. (2002). The Government Service Delivery Project: A Case Study of the Push and Pull of Central Government Coordination *Public Management Review*, Vol. 4(4), pp. 439-459. Doi: 10.1080/14616670210163015.

Keck, M.A. and Sikkink, K. (1996). *Activists beyond borders: Advocacy networks in international politics*. Ithaka: Cornell University Press.

Kennedy, J. (2022). How NGO Managers Steal Funds – and How You Can Prevent It. Available at: www.procurementexpress.com/nonprofit-organisations/ngo-managers-steal-funds/. Accessed 12 October 2022.

Kenosi, L. (2011). Good governance, service delivery and records: the African tragedy. *Journal of the South African Society of Archivists*, Vol. 44. University of Botswana (Department of Library and Information Studies), Gaborone, Botswana.

Keup, M. (2019). "What Is Stakeholder Theory? – Project Manager.com." Available at: www.projectmanager.com/blog/what-is-stakeholder-theory.

Khati, K. (2001). NGO accountability in Lesotho: a governance perspective of the Societies (Amendment) Act 2001. Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Master's in Public Policy in the School of Social Sciences, College of Humanities at the University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Khan,H (2021). "The Causes & Effects of Poor Communication in the Workplace." Available at: www.simpplr.com/blog/2021/causes-effects-poor-communication-workplace/.

Kirby, M. (2005). "Promoting human rights – good governance, the rule of law and democracy Australian Human Rights Commission." Available at: [humanrights.gov.au, humanrights.gov.au/about/news/speeches/promoting-human-rights-good-governance-rulelaw-and-democracy](http://humanrights.gov.au/about/news/speeches/promoting-human-rights-good-governance-rulelaw-and-democracy).

Knowledge. (2022). "Transparency International Knowledge Hub." Available at: Knowledge Hub, knowledgehub.transparency.org/helpdesk/overview-of-corruption-and-anti-corruption-in-sub-saharan-africa. Accessed 8 September 2022.

Kreitner, R. (2005). Management, 10th edition. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Kushi, S. (2017). "Strategic Planning for NGOs: A Guide to Understand the Basics of Strategic Planning." Available at: www.linkedin.com/pulse/strategic-planning-ngos-guide-understand-basics-samina-khushi/.

Iweala, N.O and Kwaako, O (2007). *Nigeria's Economic Reforms: Progress and Challenges*. [online] Brookings. Available at: <https://www.brookings.edu/research/nigerias-economic-reforms-progress-and-challenges/>.

Kyambalesa, H. (2006). Corruption: Causes, Effects, and Deterrents. *Africa Insight*, Vol. 36(2), pp. 102-122.

Lawal, G. (2007). Corruption and Development in Africa: Challenges for Political and

Economic Change. *Humanity and Social Sciences Journal*, Vol. 2(1), pp. 1-7.

Lehobo, M.L. (2020). Good governance in Lesotho: An analysis of the relationship between the rule of law and control of corruption. Master's thesis, University of the Free State. Retrieved from: <http://scholar.ufs.ac.za/rest> of thesis URL on Kovsie Scholar.

Lemmons, R. (2022). "Criticisms of NGOs - Global Climate." *Climate Policy Watcher*, 9 December 2021. Available at: www.climate-policy-watcher.org/global-climate-2/criticisms-of-ngos.html.

Lesotho: Freedom in the World. (2021). Country Report. Freedom House. Available at: freedomhouse.org/country/lesotho/freedom-world/2021.

Lesotho Council of NGOs. (2014-2019). Strategic plan for the period 2014-2019, Available at: <http://www.lcn.org.ls/about/LCN%20Strategic%20plan%20new.pdf>. Accessed 8 May 2022.

Lesotho Country Programme Evaluation. (2005). Development Cooperation Ireland. Lesotho Zero Hunger Strategic Review. 2018. All food systems are sustainable from production to consumption Available at: lescij.org/2022/05/27/anti-corruption-investigates-womens-rights-ngo/.

Lesotho Council of NGOs (LCN). (2014-2019). Annual Report for the period 2012/2013. Available at: www.lcn.org.ls, www.lcn.org.ls/projects/acbf.php.

Lewis, D. and Kanji, N. (2009). Non-Governmental Organisations and Development. Routledge: London.

Local Economic Development. (2016). Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs. Available at: www.cogta.gov.za/index.php/local-economic-development-led/

Lovelock, C. and Wright, L. (2002). "Principles of Service Marketing and Management". 2nd ed. Prentice Hall: UK.

Luvai, T.K. (2012) Factors influencing the effectiveness of community-based organisations in Kibwezi district, Kenya (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nairobi, Kenya).

Manganyi, E. (2011). "Ownership Structure and Corporate Governance and Its Effects on Performance: A Case of Selected Banks in Kenya." *International Journal of Business Administration*, Vol. 2(3), pp. 2-18.

Manji, F and O'Coill, C. (2002). The Missionary Position: NGOs and development in Africa. *International affairs*, Vol. 78(3), p. 568.

Matthews, S. and Nqaba, P. (2017). "Rethinking the Role of NGOs in Struggles for Social Justice. NGOs and Social Justice in South Africa and Beyond", pp. 1-14.

Maximpact Blog. (2017). "Challenges NGOs Face and the Solutions" Available at: Maximpact, maximpactblog.com/what-challenges-do-ngos-face-and-what-are-the-solutions/.

MBA Knowledge Base. (2015). "Non-Governmental Organisation (NGO) - Definition, Types and Roles." MBA Knowledge Base." Available at: www.mbaknol.com/general-business-articles/non-governmental-organisation-ngo/.

McAbee, J. (2022). "What Is Stakeholder Theory? | Wrike." Available at: www.wrike.com/blog/understanding-stakeholder-theory/

McLennan, A. (2009). The promise, the practice and the politics: Improving service delivery in South Africa. Pp. 21.

Mehrotra, S. (2006). Governance and basic social services: Ensuring accountability in service delivery through deep democratic decentralization. *Journal of International Development*, Vol. 18(2), pp. 263-283.

Merriam, S.B. (2002). Introduction to qualitative research. *Qualitative research in practice: Examples for discussion and analysis*, Vol. 1(1), pp. 1-17.

Mgawanyemba, G.D. (2008). Community-based Organisations in Socio-economic Development: The Experience of Kasungu District in Malawi (Doctoral dissertation, University of South Africa).

Mhaka, T. (2022). "Corruption: Africa's Undeclared Pandemic." Available at: www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2022/7/2/corruption-africas-undeclared-pandemic. Accessed 1 September 2022.

Millennium Development Goals. (2016). "What Is Development - a Definitive Guide | MDG Monitor." Millennium Development Goals, Available at: www.mdgmonitor.org/what-is-development-guide/.

Miriti, G. (2009). The Role of Community Based Organisations (CBOs) In Transforming People's Lives: A Case Study of Omega Child Shelter in Mwingi Central District. University of Nairobi, Faculty of Arts Department of Sociology and Social Work.

Ministry of Health and Social Welfare Human Resources Development and Strategic Plan (2005-2025), Kingdom of Lesotho 2004, Lesotho Health Sector Human Resources Development and Strategic Plan 2005-2025.

Moletsane, M. (2020). Corruption and the seeds of its destruction in Lesotho, Democracy in Africa. Available at: [democracy in africa.org/corruption-destruction-Lesotho/](http://democracyin africa.org/corruption-destruction-Lesotho/).

Monchari, E. (2019). "Role of Communication in Humanitarian Work." Available at: [atlas corps.org, atlas corps.org/role-of-communication-in-humanitarian-work/](http://atlas corps.org/atlas corps.org/role-of-communication-in-humanitarian-work/).

Mouton, J. and Babbie, E. (2001). The practice of social research, Cape Town: Oxford University Press Southern Africa.

Mlambo, V. and Masuku, M. (2020). Governance, Corruption and COVID-19: The Final Nail in the Coffin for South Africa's Dwindling Public Finances. *Journal of Public Administration*, Vol. 55, No 3.1 pp. 549-566.

Mlambo, D., Mubecua, M., Mpanza, S. and Mlambo, V. (2019). Corruption and Its Implications for Development and Good Governance: A Perspective from Post

Colonial Africa. *Journal of Economics and Behavioral Studies*, Vol. 11, p. 39.

Moyo, B. and Imafidon, K. (2021). Barriers to African civil society: building the sector's capacity and potential to scale up. Retrieved from: <https://www.raceandphilanthropy.com/research>

Mostashari, A. (2005). "An Introduction to Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) Management." Iranian Studies Group: MIT.

Mule, H. (2001). Challenges to African governance and civil society. *Public Administration and Development*, 21(2), pp. 71-76.

Municipal Service Delivery. (2020). *Etu.org.za*, 2020. Available at: www.etu.org.za/toolbox/docs/localgov/munservice.html.

Muthupandian. K.S. (2006). Foreign Contribution to NGOs. *Journal of the Institute of Chartered Accountants of India*, Vol. 55(12), p. 1725.

Mutahaba, G. (2012). Achieving good governance and development in Tanzania: Is leadership the missing link? *ESRF Policy Brief*, Vol. 8(2), pp. 21-42.

News@lescij.org. (2022). "Anti-Corruption Investigates Women's Rights NGO." MNNCIJ.

Nelson, T., Singh, K., Elenkov, D., Ma, R., Krug, J., Davis, B. and Wright, P (2013) Theoretical contributions to governance of smaller firms. *Journal of Business Entrepreneurship*, (September):21-41.

Porumbescu, A.G. (2015). Using Transparency to Enhance Responsiveness and Trust in Local Government: Can It Work? Available at:

<https://doi.org/10.1177/0160323X15599427>

Price, R. (2009). "Why Strategic Plans Don't Work ... And What to Do about It."

Reliableplant.com, Noria Corporation. Available at:

www.reliableplant.com/Read/15167/why-strategic-plans-don%27t-work-what-to-do

about-it. Accessed 15 October 2022.

Public Expenditure Tracking Survey and Service Delivery in the Health Sector.

(2017). Available at:

https://www.undp.org/sites/g/files/zskgke326/files/migration/ua/undp_med_ENG-web-optimized.pdf

Rahman, M. (2003). "Management of NGOs: A Study in SAARC Countries," PhD dissertation, University of Karachi, Karachi. Available at:

<http://eprints.hec.gov.pk/1377/1/1080.html.htm>).

Richard, H. (2004). NGO Corruption Fighters' Resource Book – How NGOs can use monitoring and advocacy to fight corruption.

Rakhare, M. (2019). The impact of civil society in governance in Lesotho. Unpublished Master's thesis mini-dissertation. University of the Free State, South Africa.

Ricciuti, E. and Calò, F. (2017). "NGOs and Governance." *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*, 6 October 2017, pp. 1-5, Available at: link.springer.com/referenceworkentry/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5_3213-1, 10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5_3213-1. Accessed 18 October 2020.

Republic of South Africa. (1997). White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery. Government Gazette No. 18340. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Salto Youth. (2021). "Communication and networking for NGOs." Available at: www.saltoYouth.net, www.salto-youth.net/downloads/toolbox_tool_download-file
SAIIA – the South African Institute of International Affairs. SAIIA. 2013.

Shah, S. (2013). "Relationship between NGOs and Government – Explained!" Sociology Discussion – Discuss Anything about Sociology, Available at: www.sociologydiscussion.com/society/relationship-between-ngos-and-government-explained/877#:~:text=The%20government%20has%20also%20been. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Shava, E. and Thakathi, R.D. (2016). Challenges in the implementation of community development project in the Eastern Cape Province, South Africa.56 pp 363-373

Silverman, D. (2006). Interpreting Qualitative Data: Methods for Analysing Talk, Text and Interaction, 3rd ed., Vol. 9(1). London: Sage. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.17169/fqs-9.1.358>

Snowden, P.N. (1991). World development report 1989: Financial systems and development. Oxford University Press: New York for The World Bank.

Somekh, B. and Lewin, C. (eds.). (2005). Research methods in the social sciences, pp. 345-346. Sage: UK.

Srinivas, H. (2016). "An NGO for NGOs: Networking and Support Centers for NGOs." Available at: www.gdrc.org, www.gdrc.org/ngo/ngo-for-ngos.html. Accessed 3 October 2022.

Strategic Plans. (2022). "Strategic Plans | Maplewood, MN." Available at: Maplewoodmn.gov, maplewoodmn.gov/1916/Strategic-Plans. Accessed 20 October 2022.

Tasnim, F. (2012). How Vigilant is the Vibrant Civil Society in Bangladesh? A Survey Based Analysis. *Journal of Civil Society*, Vol. 8(2), pp. 155-183.

Tilt, C (2005)"NGOs: Issues of Accountability." Flinders Business School Research Paper Series, vol. 05, no. 7, pp. 1–18, researchnow.flinders.edu.au/en/publications/ngos-issues-of-accountability. Accessed 26 June 2023.

Teguru, S.C. (2016). An analysis of the challenges faced by the non-governmental Organisation in the implementation of community development project in Zvichavane, The case of Adventist Development and Relief Agency (ADRA). Honors Degree thesis, Midlands State University. Zimbabwe, pp. iii.

United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP). (2009). 'What is Good Governance? Available at:

<http://www.unescap.org/pdd/prs/projectactivities/ongoing/gg/governance.asp>.

UNICEF. (2020). Lesotho Budget Briefs 2020/2021. Available at: <https://www.unicef.org/esa/documents/lesotho-budget-briefs-2020-2021>

U. S. Embassy Lesotho. (2020). LePHIA 2020 Survey Results Reduced New Infections Successful Treatment Program in the Kingdom of Lesotho. Available at:

<https://ls.usembassy.gov/lephia-2020-survey-results-show-reduced-new-infections-successful-treatment-program-in-the-kingdom-of-lesotho/>

V.

United States Department. (2010). Human Rights Report. Available at:

<https://www.ilo.org/dyn/travail/docs/2087/US%20Dept%20of%20State%20Human%20Rights%20Report%202010%20-%20Lesotho%20-%20www.state.gov.pdf>.

Urban Governance. (2016). "Service Delivery." Available at: GSDRC, gsdrc.org/topic-guides/urban-governance/elements-of-effective-urban-governance/municipal-capacity/service-delivery/.

Urstore. (2016). "Challenges NGOs Face." Available at: UrSTORE [urstore.ca/blog/challengesngos face/](http://urstore.ca/blog/challengesngos%20face/).

USAID. (1993). Lesotho PVO/NGO assessment: the potential for an increased role in USAID/Lesotho's transition strategy. Prepared for USAID/Lesotho. Prepared by Leslie Fox, MSI Weston Fisher, MSI.

University of York. (2022) "Financial Resources: What Are They and How Are They Managed?" Available at: online.york.ac.uk/financial-resources-what-are-they-and-how-are-they-managed/#:~:text=Financial%20resources%20are%20the%20funds.

Vakil, A.C. (1997). Confronting the classification problem: Toward a taxonomy of NGOs. *World development*, Vol. 25(12), pp. 2057-2070.

Viravaidya, M. and Hayssen, M. (2001). Strategies to strengthen NGO capacity in resource mobilization through business activities. Available at: <http://data.unaids.org/publications/ircpub06/j>. Accessed 5 February 2013.

Walker, P. (2002). Understanding Accountability: Theoretical Models and their Implications for Social Service Organisations. Vol. 36(1), pp. 62-75.

Walsh, E. and Lenihan, H. (2006). Accountability and Effectiveness of NGOs: Adapting Business Tools Successfully. *Development in Practice*, Vol. 16(5), pp. 412-424.

Available at: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4030037>.

Wanjohi, A. (2013). History of Community Based Organisations in Kenya – Writers Bureau Centre. Available at: writersbureau.net/wbc-publications/history-of-community-basedorganisations-in-kenya/#:~:text=The%20history%20of%20Community%20Based. Accessed 11 July 2022.

Wehmeier, S. and Raaz, O. (2012). Transparency matters: The concept of organisational transparency in the academic discourse. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1177/2046147X12448580>

Weisbrod, B.A. (1988). *The non-profit economy*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Wigmore, I. (2014). "What Is Accountability? - Definition from WhatIs.com."

Available at: WhatIs.com, www.techtarget.com/whatis/definition/accountabilityngos.

Willetts, P. (2001). What is a Non-Governmental Organisation? UNESCO Encyclopedia of Life Support Systems. City University, London.

Willetts, P. (2002). "What is a non-Governmental Organisation?" Research Project on Civil Society Networks in Global Governance, City University, London. Available at: <http://www.staff.city.ac.uk/p.willetts/CSNTWKS/NGO-ART.HTM#Part10>.

World Bank. (1992). Governance and Development. Washington: USA.

World Bank. (1994). Governance: The World Bank's Experience. Washington: USA.

World Mayor. (2021). "Definitions of Poverty." Available at: www.worldmayor.com/contest-2021/poverty-world-mayor-2021.html.

World Bank (2023). "Lesotho Overview." *World Bank*, 2023, Available at:

www.worldbank.org/en/country/lesotho/overview.

Yap, N (1990) "NGOs and Sustainable Development." *International Journal*, vol. 45, no. 1, pp. 75–105, Available at:

www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/40202652.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3Aa334cad21f566814bfe46fff520c40f1, <https://doi.org/10.2307/40202652>. Accessed 30 Nov. 2019.

Youmatter. (2020). "Sustainable Development Definition - History, Importance and Examples." Available at: youmatter.world/en/definition/definitions-sustainable-development-sustainability.