Exploring place-attentive education and decoloniality in the English Home Language Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement

by

Matladi Rosina Tsoeu
(B.Soc.Sci.; PGCE; B.Ed. Honours)

Dissertation submitted to fulfil the requirements for the degree
MASTERS IN EDUCATION

in the

Department of Education Foundations
Faculty of Education

at the
University of the Free State
Bloemfontein

Supervisor: Dr E Barnett

Date of submission:
November 2023

DECLARATION

I, **Matladi Tsoeu,** declare that the thesis, **Exploring place-attentive education and decoloniality in the English Home Language Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement**, submitted for the qualification of **Masters in Education** at the University of the Free State, is my own independent work.

All the references that I have used have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

I further declare that this work has not previously been submitted by me at another university or faculty for the purpose of obtaining a qualification.

November 2023

SIGNED DATE

ABSTRACT

In my study I undertook to explore place-attentive education and decoloniality in the *English Home Language Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (2011)*, with the overarching aim of the study being to explore how place-based education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education. This was achieved by garnering a better understanding of concepts such as place and attention and place-based education. Moreover, a thorough understanding of Ingold's principles of attention, namely the principle of habit, volition and correspondence as well as coloniality and decoloniality and the intersection of place-attentive education and decoloniality also proved seminal to my study. In that understanding how Ingold's concept of attention intersects with decoloniality through the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality enabled my analysis to be informed by these critical concepts. I sought to address the aim of the study through conducting an analysis of policy and education related documents, namely, the *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa* (1996); the *White Paper 1 on Education and Training* and *English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12)* (2011). I found that the policy and documents achieve alignment, the White Paper 1 (1996) and the *English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12)* (2011) essentially echo the Constitution (1996) which is befitting since it is the supreme law of the land. Place-based education is premised as central throughout the documents as the importance of environmental education is emphasised, a factor which I contend is essential for the promotion of place-attentive education in order to promote decoloniality.

Keywords

Attention; decoloniality, education, place, policy, South Africa

DEDICATION

To my grandmother, Chabilele.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My family, the very essence and fiber of my being. My husband, for the unwavering support and words of encouragement, thank you. To my daughters, Reabilwe and Remoabetswe, this was as much for you as it was for me. Dr. Emma Barnett, I could not have reached this point without you, your optimism is infectious. Thank you for the guidance, support, and sleepless nights that we shared. Dr Frans Kruger, for planting the seed of the Philosophy of Education in me. To Ms Annamarie Du Preez for language editing my thesis.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1
ORIENTATION

1.1 INTRODUCTION

Education is more than the mere transmission of knowledge that involves the curriculum, educator, and learner. It is a far more complex process and has many more intricacies (Biesta, 2013 as cited in Ingold, 2018). Arguably, one such intricacy found within the South African education context, and which persists in the post-apartheid period, is that of coloniality. Quijano (2007:70) posits that once colonialism as a political mandate came to an end, the conditions, means of exploitation, and the domination against the indigenous people of the land continued, however. This in essence is coloniality: "the continuity of colonial forms of domination after the end of colonial administrations" (Zembylas, 2018:2). Within the South African education context, some students often feel isolated in their institutions of learning as the curriculum content and modes of delivery often are not sensitive toward all students (Fataar, 2017), For example, this sensitivity may include the language of instruction. Additionally, Fataar points out that modern colonial education, that forms the basis on which the South African education system is built, was concerned with the shaping of people as colonial subjects. The people under colonial rule are known as the colonial subjects and as Bulhan (2015) beyond the need and convenience of the colonizers, the colonized do not exist, the colonized thus are the colonial subjects. The impact of this is the depriving of human beings of their humanity and full potential, as well as the suppression of non-European, indigenous knowledge forms. Fataar (2017:3) elaborates on this by arguing that "the knowledges of the (colonial) university or school paid little or no attention to indigenous knowledges", instead it valued one view, namely that of Western knowledge.

The forms of domination that coloniality entails include coloniality of power, being, and knowledge. Seroto (2018:4) posits that "coloniality of power refers to the racial and epistemological hierarchies that are entangled within structural hierarchies such as global capitalism, which continues to be a factor after the period of colonisation". As such, it has to do with the structure or hierarchy of authority, and how the global political order has been designed to uphold this structure. Seroto (2018) postulates that coloniality of being refers to colonial relations of power having an impact on the general understanding of being – who you are and what you can become. The way in which vast populations of humanity were

portrayed during the period of colonisation, undoubtedly affected people's conception of themselves, not only racially or in terms of knowledge or authority, but also in terms of their essential being.

Of particular interest to this author is the notion of coloniality of knowledge. Quijano (2007) refers to the coloniality of knowledge as the expression of coloniality that entails the systematic repression of the knowledge, beliefs, and ideas of the dominated. Here, the dominated are not only reeling from the impact of political, economic, and social colonisation but they must also recover from what Quijano (2007:169) terms the colonisation of the imagination. That is the internalized sense of ethnic or cultural inferiority that people who were previously colonized had because they believed the colonizer's cultural norms were superior (Abrazaldo, 2023). One concept which refers to coloniality of knowledge is colonial domination. Colonial domination involves the deliberate destruction of other cultures and their knowledge forms, in what De Sousa Santos (2016:18) calls epistemicide. De Sousa Santos (2016:18) posits that epistemicide refers to the destruction of cultures, where the knowledge, legal and political forms are demolished and subordinated to the colonial occupation. One consequence of this in the post-colonial context is epistemological dominance. Epistemological dominance refers to what Marie Battiste termed "culturalism", which is the academic and pedagogical stance stemming from colonialism and coloniality. It is based on the notion that "Eurocentric culture and knowledges are the global and universal norm which indigenous knowledges deviate from" (Andreotti, Ahenakew & Cooper, 2011:42). From this perspective, indigenous knowledge is inadequate and lacking (Andreotti et al, 2011).

According to Mgqwashu (2019:71), South Africa is still undergoing a transition from an education system and policies which favour Eurocentric cultures, to one that favours a more inclusive and democratic perspective. He states that:

> A shift in focus from simply transmitting curriculum contents to prioritising the development of the literacy skills, needed to acquire such contents is long overdue. Scholars argue that resistance to this shift has ensured that teaching methods are not 'responsive to or consistent with the socio-cultural background and educational needs of African learners' (Mgqwashu 2019:71)

Also, Mgqwashu (2019) mentions the role of the hidden curriculum, which perpetuates coloniality. For example, the oral tradition, which is a time-honoured carrier of knowledge

that has traditionally been the main discourse in African perspectives, does not prominently feature in formal education. Since the school curriculum maintains the hierarchical order of a class-based society, the hidden curriculum teaches learners that inequality does not only exist, but that it is acceptable (Mgqwashu, 2019). Such coloniality is also argued to extend to teacher education. Waghid and Hibbert (2018:265) state that there remains "invisible, residual and resistant underpinnings of coloniality embedded within teacher education discourses in South Africa". Furthermore, they argue that a Eurocentric worldview still dominates South African higher education, where pre-service teachers have inadequate exposure to or knowledge of the numerous understandings of Africa and its intricate histories, including its education histories. This indicates the coloniality of knowledge, where there is an absence of or the suppression of other knowledge forms. As such, coloniality continues to pervade higher education institutions in South Africa, It can subsequently make its way into the basic education context, because pre-service teachers ultimately teach in this context (Waghid & Hibbert, 2018). Learning which acknowledges and incorporates diverse knowledge traditions and indigenous traditions, cultures, and ways of being, as well as western knowledge forms, needs to be incorporated in schooling as a means of addressing epistemicide (Mgqwashu, 2019) and the coloniality of knowledge. As such, to achieve social and cognitive justice by addressing epistemicide, there is an increasing need for the practice of decoloniality.

According to Zembylas, (2018:2), "[d]ecoloniality refers to the everyday and ongoing efforts to challenge persistent forms of coloniality". Decoloniality challenges social categories such as race, gender and sexuality as inventions of colonial capitalism that hold symbolic and material significance for how individuals and groups experience the world (Lugones, 2010). Approaches to decoloniality have been and continue to be varied. One such approach is grounded in epistemic disobedience. Thus, decoloniality, or what Mignolo (2009) calls the 'decolonial option', favours analyses, art forms, and actions that practice epistemic disobedience. Mignolo (2009) refers to practices that move away from the categories of Eurocentric thought to engage with ideas that have been marginalised and discredited as uncivilised and barbarian. Such disobedience may be practiced through, for example, embracing 'epistemologies of the South'[1] (De Sousa Santos, 2016). Zembylas (2018:2)

[1] "The South is a metaphor for the human suffering caused by capitalism and colonialism and for the resistance to overcoming or minimizing such suffering. It is, therefore, an anti-capitalist, anti-colonialist, anti-patriarchal, and anti-imperialist South. It is a South that also exists in the geographic North (Europe and North America), in the form of excluded, silenced and marginalized populations" (De Sousa Santos, 2016:18).

states that such epistemologies of the South speak to the distinctive epistemologies which emerge from the South and recognises the South as more than a political marker, but also as a source of rich and valuable knowledge. Thus, to begin to acknowledge and subsequently embrace knowledges which are not Eurocentric, is to engage actively in the process of decoloniality. In this study, I explore decoloniality concerning education and place. Johnson (2012:831) states that each individual is the result of what they learn from their cultures and environments, which includes "embodied experience of places". As such, we cannot ignore the importance of place in considering education within the post-colonial context. Decolonisation in South Africa calls for the development of a decolonised space (Waghid & Hibbert, 2018). In pursuing this call, I explore the possibilities of how being attentive to place could facilitate epistemic disobedience, and, by extension, decoloniality.

1.2 RESEARCH INTEREST AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Johnson (2012:830) states that "[o]ur cultural experiences including our ecological relationships are placed within the geography of our everyday lives". Here, Johnson speaks to the importance of place in our lives and in our interactions with our surroundings and with others. According to Creswell (2009), place is a way of knowing, seeing, and understanding the world. Naturally, people have different perceptions of place at any given time, and some places may be constructed to exclude certain people. Creswell (2009:6) further states that "this process of identifying how normative constructions of place exclude 'others' both physically and existentially has been identified across a whole range of identities including class, race, sexuality, gender, and physical (dis)ability". Historically, places such as schools and universities have been used as tools to discriminate and exclude people based on their race, traditions, cultures, and beliefs. As such, place can be used as a tool to encourage discrimination.

Place can furthermore be defined as a practice where the activities of people and institutions not only produce, but are also produced by, social structures that are inundated with power (Creswell, 2009). Such social production of place remains open to contestation, transgression, and resistance by the excluded, and these social structures of place are often challenged, transgressed, and resisted (Creswell 2009:6-7). Thus, institutions such as schools and universities can be understood as social structures and relations of power that exist in place and time. Therefore, it is essential to pay attention to the place within which teaching and learning occur, not just the physical structure of the specific education

institution, but what can be referred to as the sense of place as well. Creswell (2009:7) posits that “place, and particularly sense of place, differs from location (for instance) because of its insistence on the centrality of human consciousness and experience”. Such experience and consciousness of place speak to place-based education in considering the role that place plays with regards to education. Le Grange and Ontong (2015:7) define place-based education as reflecting “an educational philosophy that exceeds ‘learning to earn’, and [that] connects place with the self and the community”. According to Gruenewald (2003), place-based pedagogies are needed so that the education of citizens might have some direct influence on the wellbeing of the social and and physical environments of people. In South Africa, place-based education is critical, because it can act as an educational tool to transform and address the political and spatial inequalities that are remnants of the apartheid and colonial periods (Le Grange & Ontong, 2015). As such, “place is one part of what is needed to redress the consequences of colonialism” (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015:17).

Yet, one cannot be in a certain place, physically or mentally, and engage in the act of education within such a place, without paying attention. Ingold (2018) mentions the example of walking, and the level of attention that is required for this seemingly automatic act. Walking is by no means a passive action, and one’s level of attention during this act, is essentially what allows the walker to not only experience the world, but to give of themselves and to be exposed to the world as well. Walking offers us “a different relation to the present, one that calls not for explanation, understanding, or interpretation in context, but for our undivided, unmediated and unqualified attention” (Ingold, 2018:30). This attention that Ingold refers to is what we give to every undertaking, at school, work, or even while engaging in leisure activities. Ingold (2018:25) further posits that “attention interrupts or cuts across movement to establish a transverse relation between mind and world”. We often think of school and education as being separate from our surroundings, but here Ingold speaks to the fact that we need to realise that ‘mind and world’ are not separate, and neither are schools their surroundings. A potential role of attention, as conceptualised by Ingold, is therefore to disrupt our normal way of thinking about education. Furthermore, it draws our attention to the fact that the place within which teaching and learning takes place (the world/terrain/environment), as well as the curricular place, needs to be recognised for its importance. Therefore, education can be said to have a recursive relationship to the place within which it is practiced, and attention enables one to recognise this. As such, although attention must be given to the actual process of teaching and learning, what is of interest in this study is the importance of being attentive to the place (location, locale, and sense of

place) in which education occurs, and how place-attentive education could be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality.

The Department of Basic Education in South Africa makes use of the *Curriculum Assessment and Policy Statement* (CAPS) (2011a) for teaching and learning, and to guide educators in their assessment of learners. In its development, CAPS was aimed at equipping learners, regardless of their differences (socio-economic background, race, gender, physical ability or intellectual ability), with the necessary knowledge to achieve success (RSA DBE 2011:s.1.3). Additionally, indigenous knowledge systems and the rich history and heritage of this country are not only acknowledged in this policy statement, but their importance are also highlighted (RSA DBE 2011:s.1.3c). Furthermore, one of the principles on which CAPS is based is social transformation, which focuses on guaranteeing that the educational imbalances of the past are rectified, and that everyone has equal educational opportunities (RSA DoE 1995:s.4). From the abovementioned, one can deduce that addressing coloniality in education is considered to be of importance.

Based on my research interest, the research question in this study is: *What is the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality?*

To answer the main research question, the following subsidiary research questions will be addressed:

1.2.1. How can place-based approaches to education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention be read together to create a concept of place-attentive education?

1.2.2. How can place-attentive education be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality?

1.2.3. What is the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality?

1.2.4. What comments and suggestions can be made about the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality?

1.3 RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES

In alignment with my research question, the aim of this study is *to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.*

In order to achieve the aim of this study, the following objectives will be pursued:

1.3.1. Explore how place-based approaches to education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create a concept of place-attentive education.

1.3.2. Investigate how place-attentive education can be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality.

1.3.3. Determine the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education.

1.3.4. Comment on and make suggestion about the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

1.4 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

According to Jabareen (2009), a conceptual framework may be referred to as a network of interrelated concepts which offer an in-depth understanding of phenomena. Additionally, the concepts which a conceptual framework comprises of, not only support one another but they also articulate their respective phenomena and establish a philosophy which is framework-specific. Jabareen (2009:51) further posits that "a conceptual framework lays out the key factors, or concepts and presumes relationships among them and provide a better understanding of these concepts". Adom, Hussein and Agyem (2018), on the other hand, describe a conceptual framework as a structure that seeks to explain the natural evolution of a specific phenomenon that I will be studying. Additionally, a conceptual framework is my account of how the research problem would be explored, as it presents a cohesive way of looking at a problem under study (Adom et al, 2018). In this study, I developed a conceptual framework to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. As such, significant concepts that were considered in constructing the conceptual framework for this study include taskscape, place, attention, and decoloniality.

Johnson (2012:830) refers to Ingold's concept of taskscapes, through which he defines "place as locale or the setting and scale for everyday life". Not only does place or taskcapes affect us, but we similarly affect these taskscapes through our daily practices. The creation of knowledge emerges from the landscapes that surround us, and is a product of our combined and shared taskscapes (Johnson, 2012). For Johnson (2012:832), "this landscape which we carry within us alters how we see the world around us and how we engage in the production of knowledge". In this way, place and attention are intertwined, and fundamental to thinking about education. This implies that attending to the place within which we find ourselves becomes inevitable to the educational project. Through being attentive to practices of decoloniality, we can therefore actively engage in the educational spaces within which we find ourselves. In addition, Janz (2009), states that we cannot address place in isolation, as place addresses one's identity, history, memories, aspirations, family, and social connections. When one engages with a place, one simultaneously engages in meaning-making. Giving attention to place requires that meaning is rooted in human concerns, and as such paying attention to the place in education is important in practicing decoloniality. The need for decoloniality in education stems from the need of people to have their knowledge forms accurately and equally represented in formal knowledge spaces. Furthermore, the promotion and facilitation of decoloniality as epistemic disobedience is dependent on attending to the place from and in which education occurs.

The conceptual framework constructed for this study was employed to critically engage with coloniality of knowledge. This was done by using the conceptual framework to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

1.5 RESEARCH DESIGN

A research design is a combination of the method, methodology, and theory of a study. It can be referred to as the structure of the research, which essentially holds the elements in a research project together (Akhtar, 2016). According to Creswell (2014), there are different types of research designs namely, such as Narrative research, Phenomenology, Ethnographies, Grounded theory studies, and Case studies. However, for the purposes of this study, an exploratory study and more specifically a narrative literature review will be done. Cronin, Ryan, and Coughlan (2008) maintain that a narrative literature review formulates conclusions regarding the subject at hand by summarizing and critiquing a body of literature. The body of literature comprises pertinent studies and knowledge pertaining to

the subject matter. Its main goal is to give the reader a thorough foundation so they can comprehend what is known currently and to emphasize the importance of new research. By pointing out gaps or inconsistencies in a corpus of knowledge, it might provide ideas for new research projects by assisting the investigator in formulating research questions or hypotheses. Nieuwenhuis (2007:55) posits that the objective of an exploratory study is to identify the core issues and to gain a better understanding or formulate an entirely new understanding of a phenomenon or a specific social setting. Furthermore, Bhat (2019) states that exploratory research is used to investigate a problem that may not be clearly defined. Such research is conducted to have a better understanding of an existing problem, but may not produce conclusive results. Therefore, through an exploratory study, this researcher seeks to interrogate how the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement (Grades 10-12), together with place-attentive education, can foster decoloniality. The research design must inform the research methodology and methods.

1.5.1 Research methodology

This is a qualitative study. According to Nieuwenhuis (2007:51), research methodology functions as a flexible but strategic guide, and includes the procedures which researchers undertake in describing, analysing, and explaining phenomena. Research methods, on the other hand, refer to the specific techniques or tools that researchers use to collect data. These tools allow a researcher to gather information about the lived reality of individuals or groups as well texts in any medium, and may include observation, interviews, or the collection of textual or visual data (Nieuwenhuis, 2007:51). Furthermore, according to Crossman (2018), the qualitative methodology involves a more theoretical basis for research, with a direct interaction between a researcher and the source to interpret or draw meaning from the data. Qualitative research allows for investigating the meaning behind people's behaviour, and evaluates the meanings that people attach to their conduct and their interactions with others. Furthermore, Crossman (2018) states that this type of research produces descriptive data, which have to be interpreted by the researcher through rigorous and systematic analysis. Qualitative research is often informed by the researcher's personal and professional experiences, the literature they read, and their understanding of the world. The qualitative research is suitable for this study, which sets out to explore the possibility of decoloniality through place-attentive education within the South African basic education context. In particular, it will be explored how marginalised and silenced ways of knowing could potentially be promoted in the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy

Statements (Grades 10-12) through place-attentive education. Having identified the study's research methodology, the focus is next on the selected research methods.

1.5.2 Research methods

According to Reddy (2018), a researcher makes use of and implements research methods which are also referred to as the strategies, tools, and techniques required to conduct research. Additionally, Reddy (2018) posits that research methods need to be credible, valid, and reliable. All the methods used during a research study are referred to as the research methods. The research methods employed in this study are a literature review and policy analysis. In line with a policy analysis, no fieldwork will be done, and this is thus a conceptual paper. According to Singh (2023), a conceptual paper is a kind of research paper in which one or more theoretical or abstract concepts are discussed. It often comprises an explanation of the concept(s) being addressed as well as a review of the pertinent literature. Typically, conceptual papers seek to advance existing theories or frameworks, offer novel hypotheses, or recommend fresh lines of inquiry.

1.5.2.1 Literature review

Hart (2018) defines a literature search as a systematic search of credible sources and resources, which includes identifying both paper and electronic sources which are relevant to a study, while a literature review is "the analysis, critical evaluation, and synthesis of existing knowledge relevant to your research problem" (Hart, 2018:6). A literature review is paramount to a research study that has qualitative qualities, and according to Jharotia and Singh (2015:49), has several important functions. These functions include acknowledging those who have laid the groundwork for specific research, demonstrating the knowledge and understanding of the research problem and the theoretical and research issues related to the research question, demonstrating one's ability to evaluate relevant literature, and generating new theoretical insights. While conducting a literature review has several benefits, there are also some disadvantages. Levy and Ellis (2006) identifies that one disadvantage of a literature review is that numerous sources may exist on any given topic, and this may prove overwhelming for novice researchers. This study will make use of a comprehensive literature review to explore how place-based education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together, in order to create the concept of place-attentive education, as well to investigate how place-attentive education can be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality (cf. 1.3). Based on the literature review, I created a conceptual

framework to serve as an analytical lens for conducting the policy analysis of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12).

1.5.2.2 Policy analysis

Ball (1993) states that policies are textual interventions that turn into practice. This statement captures the essence of policy rules and regulations, which are formulated with the intention of them being implemented. All policies contain some elements that aim to legally regulate the actions of certain groups and individuals, and concern themselves with social values (Aravacik, 2018). According to Mansour (2011), policy analysis addresses practical problems, and as such is situational, flexible, and focuses on decision-making. Policy analysis also helps to foster critical thinking about the causes of social problems (Mansour, 2011).

Simons, Olssen, and Peters (2009) argue that policy analysis can be understood in terms of analysis *for* policy and analysis *of* policy. An analysis *for* policy can be subdivided into two strands, namely information for policy, and policy advocacy. Policy advocacy involves research that seeks to make specific policy recommendations by influencing the policy agenda, while information for policy relates to the analysis which seeks to provide data and information to support the formulation or revision of policies. Analysis *of* policy takes the form of the analysis of policy determination and its effects, and analysis of policy content. Analysis of policy determination has to do with how policy is made, why it is made, when and for whom. In contrast, Simons et al (2009:25) posit that “the analysis of policy content focuses on the development of a particular form of policy (in relation to earlier policies) or on the values, assumptions, and ideologies which are at stake in the policy process or content”. The approach to policy analysis also looks at the effects and impact that policy has on groups and a given problem in terms of social concerns (Simons et al, 2009). Furthermore, such analysis is done in relation to earlier policies, and it focuses on the development of a particular policy, the values, norms, or ideologies within the policy process, and content. This relates to what Taylor, Rizvi, Lingard & Henry (1997) refers to when they posit that policies are developed in relation to other related policies, so policies are intertextual. This researcher will undertake an analysis of policy content to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. The policy analysis in this study will begin by placing the CAPS (2011) within the broader legislative

framework, by analysing the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and by also referring to the White Paper 1 on Education and Training.

1.6 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Parveen and Showkat (2017) refer to research ethics as the standards of conduct that distinguish between right and wrong, and doing what is morally and legally correct in research. Ethics are crucial in the research process, and researchers are required to be mindful of and ensure that ethical considerations are met during the research process (Parveen & Showkat, 2017). Adhering to ethical norms in research is vital, because they promote research aims such as truth, avoidance of error, and knowledge (Resnik, 2019). There are a number of ethical principles that should form a part of every research process, some of which apply to this study, even though it entails a theoretical analysis and does not include any participants (University of the Free State, 2015). An ethical principle that was important to consider in terms of this study is deception, which involves purposefully misrepresenting information or concealing the nature of the research, which is generally frowned upon. Deception can therefore also relate to plagiarism. In order to avoid this, I ensured that all the information and sources used in this document-based study, were attributed to the relevant authors, and truthfully represented the arguments of these authors. As required by university regulations, I applied for and acquired ethical clearance from the UFS Faculty of Education ethics committee to conduct this study (Appendix B).

1.7 DEMARCATION OF THE STUDY

Siegal (2009:3) defines philosophy of education as the branch of philosophy which addresses philosophical questions about the nature, aims, and problems of education. Philosophy is concerned with a wide array of factors within education, including contemporary educational policies and practices. Additionally, philosophy is conceived as being closely aligned with other branches of educational inquiry (Clark, 2006). Clark (2006:23) further posits that “philosophy of education examines a wide range of issues which are central to the development of educational theory, the critique of policy and the enhancing of educational practice”. Furthermore, Fries (2012) defines philosophy of education as a discipline that identifies and clarifies the values, beliefs, and understandings of an individual or group in relation to education. As such, the philosophy of education is an organised body of knowledge on the practice and conceptualisation of education (Fries, 2012). Therefore, the overarching aim of the philosophy of education is to foster a better understanding of a

specific phenomenon, and, through this understanding, facilitate different ways of thinking about this phenomenon (Kruger, 2020). In this study, I consider how reading the concepts of place, attention and education as a collective may create opportunities for enacting practices of decoloniality within the context of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12).

1.8 OUTLINE OF THE STUDY

This study has a specific structure to address the aim and objectives. In chapters two and three, I conduct a comprehensive review of the literature to address the first two subsidiary research objectives (cf. 1.3.1 and 1.3.2). In the second chapter of the study, I explore how place-based education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education. Subsequent to this, I considered how the concept of place-attentive education can be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality. In chapter 4 I determine the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. This determination of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) will be achieved through a policy content analysis of the policy statements. In the concluding chapter, I provide comments and suggestions about the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

1.9 SUMMARY

In this chapter, I provided an exposition of the research interest, questions, and research objectives which this study will address, with the overarching aim of the study being to explore how place-based education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education. It was furthermore indicated how I developed and employed the conceptual framework of this study, and introduced the research design, methodology, and methods. This was followed by commenting on the ethical considerations of the study (i.e, a document analysis) and the potential value the study holds. The next chapter explores how place-based education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education.

CHAPTER 2
CONCEPTUALISING PLACE-ATTENTIVE EDUCATION

2.1. INTRODUCTION

In chapter 1 I provided an overview of the research interest, questions, and the research objectives of this study, as well as the methodology and methods to be employed. The overarching aim of the study is to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality, as education has been informed by place in a variety of ways. In this chapter, I review the relevant literature on how place has been conceptualised, and how it has informed education. Place-based education refers to an educational approach which is concerned with connecting place, the self, and the community (Le Grange & Ontong, 2015). Place-responsive education involves teaching, which is concerned with the environment, and is also aimed at understanding and improving the relationships between people and the environment (Mannion, Fenwick & Lynch, 2013). In this chapter, I consider how place, as it has been taken up in education, and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention, can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education. In doing this, I address the research objective to explore how place-based approaches to education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education (cf. 1.3.1).

2.2. CONCEPTUALISING PLACE

When defining place, Cresswell (2015) indicates that the word has been used for as long as geography has been in existence. However, only from the 1970s onwards has place been conceptualised as a certain location that has acquired meanings and attachments. Cresswell (2015) posits that a meaningful location comprises of three aspects, namely location, locale, and a sense of place. Location is the physical setting, which can be classified in relation to its distance from another location, and that has specific coordinates (Cresswell 2015). For instance, the town of Welkom, which is located northeast of Bloemfontein in the Free State, is located at the coordinates (*27.9828° S, 26.7349° E)*. In contrast, locale is the setting where social relationships are practiced, and meaning is formed. This includes tangible markers of a specific place. For example, where people

conduct their daily lives such as in a building or on a street, is the locale. The third aspect of place that Cresswell (2015) identifies, is sense of place. A sense of place refers to the emotional attachment induced by a place, and the meanings which are attached to a particular place (Cresswell 2015). For example, the beach may hold a significant meaning for someone, as the beach may remind them of a time in their childhood. The meaning which is attributed to a place may be individual or shared, and a specific place may evoke certain emotions within an individual, or there may be shared feelings amongst a group of people. For example, as it pertains to the 2021 Table Mountain fire in Cape Town which lasted several days, certain people may share feelings of dismay for various reasons, such as the fact that the reading room of the African Studies Library at UCT was destroyed. Some may have experienced Cape Town as a holiday destination, and may therefore be concerned with how popular sites such as Table Mountain were affected. Still others, such as students or relatives of the students, may have been concerned about the well-being of the students. Thus, as is clear form these examples, the same place can evoke different or similar emotions, based on the meaning attached to it or the sense of place which people have of it.

Furthermore, Massey (2005) classifies the creation of a sense of place as a socially fashioned, interactive process that is contingent and constantly under construction. This Massey refers to as the 'event of place'. "Event of place refers to the movement that constructs place, the coming together of the previously unrelated and a constellation of processes rather than a thing" (Massey 2005, 141). In this way, place is not something which is uniform and can be classified as one thing within a specific time. Instead, a number of different social processes come together at any given time to form a whole. In addition, place cannot merely be without being acted and enacted on by external forces. Place therefore necessitates intervention (Massey, 2005). In a similar vein, Ingold (1993) posits that people do not only inhabit places, instead they move through, around and between them, which constitutes the essence of place. Also, the experiences gained in a particular place, lend character to the place, while these experiences are dependent on the activities which people engage in at a specific place. It is from this relational context of people's engagement with the world, that each place draws its unique significance (Ingold, 1993:155). Moreover, while one may move from one place to the next, places do not necessarily have boundaries. As Ingold (2011:69) states, places are joined by and engage in the process of wayfaring. For him, "wayfaring is less a path from point A to point B and more of meshwork of lines and

movement, a trail along which life is lived" (Ingold, 2011:69). This speaks to the link between various places, that while they may be separate, they are also in some ways, interwoven.

In order for particular spaces to be something more than mere space, people must attribute meaning to them. Without meaning, Cresswell (2015) contends, place cannot exist. While the concept of place is intricate and complex, at base level, place can be defined as spaces which people have attached meaning to, i.e., places that are perceived as a meaningful location (Cresswell, 2013). This conception of place means that a particular place can be experienced in multiple ways, and as such, triggers various emotions in people (Cresswell, 2015). Furthermore, one's sense of place does not remain fixed or static, but can be altered at any given time. We constantly struggle over, reconfigure and reimagine place in various practical ways (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015). That is, one place can mean different things to different people, but it can also mean different things to the same person. For example, school can be meaningful to a learner as the first place where they met friends and made connections. For the same learner, it can also be recognised as the space where they first realised their true academic potential. In addition, the learners' sense of place as it relates to school, may be altered from when they first started a certain grade, to the time they finished school. In this sense, place moves away from being a secure and static 'thing', to become an event. According to Tuck and McKenzie (2015), place is not only influenced by social practices and interactions, but it also affects these practices. As extrapolated by Van Eijck and Roth (2010), in place-based education, the place or surroundings within which teaching and learning take place, forms part of the education which is rendered to learners. Here, the ecological and environmental well-being of places form part of the teaching and learning process (Van Eijck & Roth, 2010). Grunewald (2008) states that critical place-based education is concerned with educational practices which acknowledge the role of places in mainstream education. On the other hand, land education places indigenous peoples, indigenous languages and indigenous critiques of settler colonialism at the centre through advancing indigenous agency and land rights (Tuck, McKenzie & Mccoy, 2014).

In the discussion that follows, place will not only be conceptualised as an event, but also in terms of place-based education, critical place-based education, and land education, where the focus will be on indigenous conceptualisations of place.

2.2.1 Place as an event

In relation to the conceptualisation of place as an event, Cresswell (2009:4) maintains that the contemporary understanding of place "attends to how we, as humans, are in the world – how we relate to our environment and make it into place". Additionally, according to Tuck and McKenzie (2015), when we understand the way that a place influences and shapes social practice and its prominent role in the making and remaking of place, it becomes both less stable and possibly more powerful. That is, places are not perceived as stable due to the dynamic nature of the social practices which occur within any place at any given time. In the same breath, this constitutes a sense of power, as place is not only influenced by the social practices which occur in it, but it also has an influence on these social practices. For example, both human and non-human actors come together in meaning-making in a particular place at a particular time, and the result can be classified as the event of that interaction (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015). This understanding speaks to Cresswell's conception of place as a dynamic event. In a similar vein, one can argue that place is not a single or a specific thing, instead, it is completely open and is something which is practiced (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015). For Tuck and McKenzie, places become and hold their meaning through the actions we perform inside them, and at any given time, several people can engage in different activities within one space. However, because various engagements can occur within a place, meaning is made through practice.

As indicated by Ingold (in Tuck & McKenzie, 2015), places do not exist as much as they occur. For example, Tuck and McKenzie (2015) posit that places can be understood and reshaped through movements and practices, such as protesting or institutionalisation. In establishing how movement constitutes place, Kruger (2020) posits that transformation and change can be facilitated through the act of walking and paying attention to the place in which this activity occurs. This implies, according to Kruger, when walking is undertaken as a political activity, opportunities arise for it to become a practise of decoloniality. As Sundberg (2014:39) states, social change is "enacted through a dialogic politics of walking and talking, doing and reflecting". In this manner, walking permits learning, as it is a means of listening, probing, and observing, as well as border crossing (Kruger, 2020). "Arguably such learning should be informed by participatory reciprocity" (Kruger, 2020:331), where learning is understood as a social activity which includes learning from and with others, as opposed to only learning about others. Optimistically, this understanding of place may create opportunities for "relearning to learn alongside, from and with knowledges and [different] ways of being" (Walsh, 2015:14). This includes knowledges which are presently

marginalised and silenced (Kruger, 2020), and also illustrates the dynamic aspects of place as an unfolding event.

Furthermore, it is important to note that place is experienced differently by different people based on factors such as gender, sexuality, culture, and life experiences. These aspects influence how place is experienced, understood and practiced (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015). McKittrick (2006) views categories of body, identity, and place as being integrated, and she prompts us to view practices which reinforce oppression (i.e., racism/sexism) as spatial acts. These acts are influenced by the spaces within which they take place. This is supported by Lipsitz (2011:3), who states that "largely because of racialized space, whiteness in this society is not so much a color as a condition", which allows for whiteness to prevail, and in effect disadvantaging black people[2]. In addition, this condition is a structured advantage which provides prejudicial and unmerited enhancements for white people, while placing unfair and unjust hindrances in the path of black people (Lipsitz, 2011). Moreover, whiteness as a condition, presents itself in several spheres and places, including the neighbourhoods and schools within which a middle-class family may find themselves, as "race is produced by space, and it takes places for racism to take place" (Lipsitz, 2011:5). Subsequently, the promotion of whiteness is facilitated through places by way of school segregation, where white children are placed in well-equipped classrooms with experienced teachers, while, in contrast, black children are subjected to overcrowded classrooms in ill-equipped buildings (Lipsitz, 2011). Further, Spaull (2013) indicates that after many years of a post-apartheid education system in South Africa, most black learners are still on the receiving end of an education which condemns them to the underclass of society, which is persistently plagued by poverty and unemployment.

Similarly, under-performance in schools which serve the poorest of communities is a broadly recognised problem, while learners from middle-class and affluent families that are primarily white, attend schools which perform well (Department of Basic Education, Republic of South Africa; 2011b). As Mgqwashu (2019) posits, the class-based society's hierarchical structure is maintained through the school curriculum (cf 1.1). The above reflects how schooling spaces can be utilised for the promotion of coloniality through the practise of whiteness. Additionally, within these schools, the spaces and the meanings assigned to them inadvertently result in racially charged and discriminatory practices, where whiteness

[2] Black people refer to the socially constructed race of an individual, including but not limited to Black, Black African, and African American people (Agyemang, Bhopal & Bruijnzeels, 2005).

operates as a spatialised and structured advantage. “Lipsitz examines residential and school segregation as well as spatial isolation” (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015:37), which further speaks to the role that places can play in advocating for or against oppression. As argued for by Tuck and McKenzie (2015), these place-specific differences ultimately contribute to the establishment of forms of oppression such as coloniality. In line with the notion that place can be greatly influenced by power relations, Malone (2016) maintains that any given place is riddled with power, symbolism and intricate relations of domination and subordination. The manner in which these complex webs of relations are negotiated reveals the power and politics of place (Malone, 2016). Tuck and McKenzie (2015:40) further posit that “[P]ower can operate through and in relation to place to work counter to oppressive understandings and practices of power”. Hence, place can be used to give expression to forms of oppression such as colonisation, and in the same token, it can be ‘re-narrated’ through engaging in the process of decolonisation.

In a similar vein, historically archives have been used to facilitate colonisation, and yet, through counter-archiving, they can also be used for the promotion of decolonisation. Springgay, Truman and MacLean (2019) contend that archives are concerned with power structures, and often serve the dominant political and ideological structures. Furthermore, as opposed to being neutral repositories of the past, archives in South African tend to uphold state narratives, and are influenced by values which centre whiteness and erase Black or Indigenous people. In contrast, “counter-archiving and anarchiving practices are political, resistant, and collective, they disrupt conventional narratives and histories and seek ways to engage with matter not typically found in official archives” (Springgay et al, 2019:898).

Ware (2017) defines counter-archiving as the process of interrupting the whiteness of archives. For Ware (2017), this is achieved by emphasising that Black lives have always been present, contrary to the narrative that Black subjects are new additions to the existing archives. The realisation that place has meanings and implications which extends to the non-human species, including the land itself, is important (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015). This is important because in any given space there are human and non-human species that play an equally important role in the community and the places within which we find ourselves.

2.2.2 Place-based education

“Places teach us about how the world works and about how our lives fit into the spaces we occupy” (Greunewald, 2003:621). Our identity and attributes are formed by the places within which we find ourselves, as such places ‘make us’. Places influence and shape our experiences and perceptions of the world. However, the type of teaching that occurs, and what we learn from places, are dependent on our level of attention and how we respond to these places (Greunewald, 2003). While critical place-based education and place-based education are similar in that both conceptions emphasise the situated context and social transformation as the overarching goal, several dissimilarities exist (Greunewald, 2003). The main differences between critical place-based education and place-based education will be expatiated on in the subsequent section 2.2.3.

According to Van Eijck and Roth (2010:871), “place-based education is an approach to schooling, where local settings become the integrating element in students’ education”. It is important to note that place is not a singular term, which refers to a specific geographical location. Instead, the ‘local settings’ which are referred to in the above definition, comprise a variety of places. “There are as many natural worlds (hence places) as there are people, who can account of, and therefore understand, the natural world only in and through inherently ideological discourse” (Van Eijck & Roth, 2010:871). Place-based education is essential because it ensures an education which has a direct impact on the well-being of the ecological and social places that are inhabited by people (cf 1.2). Additionally, place-based education may also be regarded as environmental education and can also be referred to as ecological place-based education. In this regard, place-based education seeks to demonstrate the natural environment and the problems which affect these environments (Van Eijck & Roth, 2010).

2.2.3 Critical place-based education

Grunewald (2008) defines a critical place-based pedagogy as a response against educational reform practices and policies that ignore places. Furthermore, critical pedagogies serve to challenge and probe the practices and outcomes which are taken for granted in orthodox education by the dominant culture (Grunewald, 2008). Grunewald (2008) also posits that critical place-based education is more concerned with social and urban contexts, and almost entirely ignores the ecological and rural context as well as the ecological systems which play a central role in place-based education. Tuck and McKenzie (2015) hold that critical place inquiry may encompass an array of research methodologies which engage conceptually with place as a means to explicitly address place. Also, essential to note, is that "decolonizing conceptualizations of land, place and indigenous methods are central to practices of critical place inquiry" (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015:1).

Critical place-based education differs from place-based education in that the former reflects an educational philosophy which exceeds learning, to learn and seeks to connect place with the self and the community. It is an educational approach that embraces a multi-disciplinary approach to place and aims to reconnect humans with land (Le Grange & Ontong, 2019).

The latter is more concerned with the place-based processes of colonisation and settler colonialism, and extends towards a deeper consideration of the land and its non-human inhabitants (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015). Furthermore, place-based pedagogies are essential to foster a link between the education of citizens and the well-being of the social and ecological places that people occupy (Le Grange & Ontong, 2019). The over-arching objective of place-based education is therefore its social purpose (Le Grange & Ontong, 2019).

According to Johnson (2012), the places which we have experienced and within which we have lived, impact our production of knowledge. The knowledge we create is unavoidably influenced by the landscape which surrounds us and is a result of our communal taskcapes. In addition, this landscape, which abides within us, plays a part in our education, and when we engage with each other and the world, we continually remember and share our landscape with others. Place therefore alters our perception and experience of the world, and how we participate in the social production of knowledge (Johnson, 2012).

2.2.4 Land education: Indigenous conceptualisations of place

According to Greenwood (2019), the acknowledgement of land and its indigenous inhabitants, as well as the persistent legacies of colonialism, are essential parts of place and place-based education. Within indigenous conceptions of place, in general where events took place is just as important as what happened there, and the consequences of those events (Tuck & McKenzie, 2015). According to Greenwood (2019), a need may exist to move towards a more 'land-based' education and away from 'place-based' education. This is the case, since land-based education would address the colonial pattern of disregarding indigenous peoples and stealing their land by centring the land and its people as primary (Greenwood, 2019). This approach to place focuses on colonisation from the indigenous cultures' perspective, and addresses place-based perspectives, which tend to avoid or sanitise such issues (Greenwood, 2019). Similarly, Tuck and McKenzie (2015:1) argue that "Indigenous concerns, decolonizing conceptualizations of land and place and Indigenous methods are central, not peripheral, to practices of critical place inquiry". Therefore, understanding the role that place and land play in decolonization form the main part of critical place inquiry.

An important aspect of conceptualising decolonisation, as it pertains to the discussion of place, is acknowledging the indigenous people and the theft of their land as the beginning of decolonisation. Decolonisation facilitates the return of indigenous land and life to its rightful owners (Tuck & Yang, 2012). To envision decolonisation within settler colonial contexts, it is important to develop an understanding of what settler colonialism entails. According to Tuck and Yang (2012:5), European settler colonialism refers to when "settlers come with the intention of making a new home on the land, a homemaking that insists on settler sovereignty over all things in their new domain". In this instance, the most valuable thing is the land, because it becomes the source of capital within settler colonialism. The disturbance of indigenous relationships to land signifies a profound epistemic and ontological violence (Tuck & Yang, 2012). This violence is reasserted every day, which further oppresses and marginalises indigenous people. For settlers to turn a particular place into their home, the indigenous people who occupy this place must essentially be erased, because for settlers, indigenous people are a stumbling block (Tuck & Yang, 2012). Therefore, in addition to indigenous people losing their community, they also lose their land,

as it is recommissioned by new laws to become a colonial resource. Indigenous persons are those who have creation stories about how they came to be in a particular place, and how they ultimately became one with that place and their relationship to the land, encompass their epistemologies and ontologies (Tuck & Yang, 2012). As such, the need to embrace land-based education becomes more prevalent to ensure that the land and its people are at the forefront.

It is important to note that in relation to land education, Tuck and Yang (2012) refer to two forms of colonialism, namely external colonialism, which may also be referred to as exploitation, and internal colonialism. External colonialism represents the expropriation of parts of indigenous worlds, including human beings, animals, and plants, for the purpose of transporting them to the colonisers (Tuck & Yang, 2012). This is executed with the aim of building the wealth, increasing the privilege, or satisfying the appetite of the colonisers. For the external form of colonialism, that which is indigenous is re-formed as 'natural' resources. On the other hand, internal colonialism comprises the "biopolitical and geopolitical management of people, land, flora, and fauna within the 'domestic' borders of the imperial nation" (Tuck & Yang, 2012:4). This includes specific means of control such as schooling, policing, and prisons to safeguard the superiority of a nation and its white elite (Tuck & Yang, 2012). These forms of colonialism speak to how the indigenous people have been and continue to be dispossessed of their being as well as their land, even within postcolonial contexts such as South Africa.

This notion is supported by Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2015:489), who asserts that at the moment "schools, colleges, churches, and universities in Africa are sites for reproduction of coloniality", as they instil knowledges of equilibrium which do not question methodologies or the present asymmetrical world order. Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2015) further posits, from a perspective of decoloniality, that research methodologies are understood to be gate-keepers and tools of surveillance aimed at blocking the development of another-thinking or a differing world view As such, decoloniality stems from the realisation that the modern world is sustained by colonial matrices of power and epistemologies, as well as pedagogies of equilibrium which continue to socialise Africans into hating Africa, while viewing Europe and America in a more favourable light (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2015). Additionally, a distinction is made between three concepts of analysis as it relates to decoloniality, namely coloniality of power, coloniality of knowledge and coloniality of being (cf 1.1). However, for the purposes of this section, this study will elaborate on Ndlovu-Gatsheni's (2015) conceptions of the

coloniality of knowledge, which is concerned with the politics of knowledge generation, that is who generates which knowledge and for what reason. Coloniality of knowledge, it is argued, helps us to understand how indigenous knowledges have been pushed and confined to the "barbarian margins of society" (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2015:490). Africa is burdened with immaterial knowledge, which seeks to disempower individuals and communities to ensure the continued acceptance of the knowledge of equilibrium, which benefits the present asymmetrical power-structured world.

Therefore, places such as institutions of learning play a pivotal role in decolonisation, through education approaches like place and land education. Place-based education and land education emphasise the importance of place and the environment, and the people which inhabit such places.

2.3 CONCEPTUALISING ATTENTION

Attention is conceptualised in different ways by different authors, and the concept of attention can take on multiple meanings. In this section, this researcher considers how attention has been conceptualised in education, mainly by Ingold, while also drawing on various other scholars.

According to Rytzler (2019), attention has become increasingly important in educational thinking and in the formation of educational practices. Thus, educational practices can be linked to attention, since they seek to point out specific phenomena, such as a certain topic, a particular idea, or new ways of living. In the pursuit of connections, such practices elicit self-active and transformative responses, where students develop into attentive subjects (Rytzler, 2019). Moreover, education is an intergenerational progression of attention formation. In this way, attention has come to represent an innate ability of an individual (De Preester, 2021). Within the sphere of education, the formation of attention is an ever-present phenomenon that is inherent to an individua (De Preester, 2021). Additionally, in the contemporary philosophy of education, attention is understood as a vital feature of educational practices in ways that frequently go beyond instrumentally biased educational research (Ergas, 2015). Several philosophical approaches to education rely on philosophy and etymology as opposed to psychological conceptions of attention (Rytzler, 2019). Likewise, these philosophical conceptions result in the formulation of attention as an

educational concept, as well as provide suggestions on the ways that education could lead to the development and promotion of attention. Rytzler (2019) further posits that these approaches place an increased focus on what represents an attentive activity, as opposed to the inner workings of an attentional process. The relationship between attention and education can be created by presenting the particularity of a teaching-learning relationship as a setting for attention formation (Stiegler, 2010 as cited in Rytzler, 2019).

On the other hand, Weil (2012) refers to attention as waiting. This form of attention is viewed as a suspension in space and time, and does not encompass an expected or known occurrence. Here, there is an absence of intention, because an attention where intentionality is present, essentially leads to a passive process of learning. To Weil (2012), attention is characterised by concentration, which makes itself visible through activities such as waiting, listening, and looking. This view of attention adopts an aesthetic sense that can be developed through practicing solitude. This sensibility is cultivated through being exposed to other sensible and aesthetic experiences such as art (Weil, 2012). Weil's views find their roots in this sense of attention as waiting. These views can only truly be manifested in the absence of external agents or ego. As Finch eloquently describes:

> Human beings, utterly fragile, at the mercy of every material accident and at any moment exposed to the possibility of affliction, have only two tiny points where they are linked to something else. One is the capacity for impersonal, impartial attention, the waiting that is an intense receptivity to that which comes from outside; the other is the ineradicable expectation in every human being that good will be done to us". (Andic, 1999:15).

Here, Weil's definition of attention as waiting can be conceived as an objective attention, or a strong openness to external impressions.

In addition, the relationship between education and attention has come to the fore in recent years. In defining attention as an educational construct, or to suggest a way that education can develop and promote attention as a practise, philosophers borrow from scholastics, etymology, and philosophy (Rytzler, 2017). To evaluate how various philosophical approaches include different conceptions of attention pertaining to educational practise and thinking, Rytzler classifies the approaches into two main groups. One group describes attention as an external phenomenon that should or could be incorporated into education, either through educators' personal attentional skills or by means of developing attention as

a tool for increasing morality or learning (Rytzler, 2017). In contrast, in the other category, attention is understood as a phenomenon which already encompasses educational dimensions, since it is more of a relational or shared concept (Rytzler, 2017). Similarly, however, both of these categories dispute the idea that attention is a characteristic which individuals possess, of which one can have less or more of. Instead, attention is viewed as something which can be developed and cultivated through educational practices (Rytzler, 2017). For example, Ingold contends that education as an act of showing or presenting is essentially an education of attention (Ingold, 2018). He further argues that educational practices should intentionally engage in facilitating relationships between a subject and the world within which they live. It is through these relations that attention can be constructed and developed (Rytzler, 2017).

On the other hand, Ingold maintains that attention can take on a myriad of meanings and conceptions, for example active listening and coming into presence or being present in a particular space and time can be referred to as the act of attending (Ingold, 2018). Accompanying others and caring for them in a practical and dutiful manner can also be understood as a form of attention. However, the understanding of attention that Ingold extrapolates is where attention is referred to as the stretch of life. Here, Ingold (2018:21) states that “life is not merely lived in the here and now but is stretched by a memory of the future that itself allows every present moment to be a new beginning”. He also refers to this stretching of life as ‘longing’, a term which will be extrapolated at a later stage (cf.2.3.3). Ingold argues that the act of paying attention must therefore be thought about differently, and away from a discursive lens that frames the object in a specific contextual manner. Furthermore, Ingold articulates attention not as a “stop-and-check” gesture, but as a “going along together”, an enduring attendance to things. Ingold (2017) points to the genealogy of the word “attention”, which comes from the Latin “ad tendere”, meaning stretching towards in the way the ears stretch out when listening. What this implies is that attending to something also demands thinking of the body not as an anatomical unity, as a “set of organs with a coherent structure”, but as a “bundle of affect” in which coherence is rather constituted as a node of affect. Citton (2017) describes paying attention as an activity preceding any form of subsequent action. It implies weaving together observations and features while respecting the correct level of tension for maintaining tenable relations with our milieu.

According to Dewey (cited in Ingold, 2018), life is viewed as a constant interchange between doing and undergoing, and these two elements are ever-present in our everyday lives

(Ingold, 2018). Furthermore, life is continuous rather than episodic, where our actions find meaning from and are influenced by our past experiences. What we currently undertake and do in the world, therefore finds meaning from what we have previously undergone or experienced (Ingold, 2018). Equally, our present actions result in and have an influence on our further doing or our future actions (Ingold, 2018). Moreover, the process of living comprises acting upon the environment, and being acted upon by the environment. This continuous exchange and interaction with the world may be understood as habit formation, and through the habits that are formed in our engagements with the world, we in-habit the world (Ingold, 2018). Thus, "habit is what undergoing brings to the task of doing", where we are continuously influenced, recreated, and re-formed by our actions and practices in the world" (Ingold, 2018:22). Therefore, different understandings of attention are also encapsulated in the principles of habit. These are how our current actions are influenced by past experiences and then affect our future experiences, the concept of correspondence, which refers to a process of individuals inhabiting experiences as a form of attention, and lastly the principle of volition.

2.1.1. Habit as a principle

Habit is commonly understood as referring to a consequence of individuals repeatedly acting or behaving in a specific way, and the things that make them do certain things or act in a particular way. However, here we understand habit as a process which we are in the midst of, as opposed to habit being a cause or consequence (Ingold, 2018). Dewey distinguishes habit as principle, and it differs from how we may normally define habit, as a fixed and settled way of acting and behaving (Ingold, 2018). According to Ingold (2018:21), the principle of habit is encompassed by the following statement: "The actions we undertake in the world draw some of their meaning from what we have undergone in the course of previous doings". That is, our previous experiences affect and shape our current actions, and our present experiences draw some of their meaning from these past experiences. Thus, our present actions and how we move through the world daily, draw meaning from our past experiences, as well as the consequences that we may have suffered from those specific experiences.

Similarly, in carrying out our present actions, we influence not only the environment but our future actions, referred to by Ingold (2018) as further doing. This speaks to the understanding that life is continuous, since how we have previously engaged with the world,

will inevitably impact our future engagements with the world (Ingold, 2018). As such, the process of living essentially encompasses continuity, because it is an ongoing process of continuously being acted upon by the environment, even as we act upon it. Ingold (2018) further posits that we cannot exist separate from the world in which we live, since our experiences in and with the world become a fundamental part of the self that not only acts but is also acted upon in every new experience. While our experiences come to an end, in their physical or tangible form, the value and meaning that we gain from our experiences remain and forms an integral part of the self (Ingold, 2018). We inhabit the world through the habits that are formed through our continuous engagement and exchange with the world. The world becomes home and the home forms part of our everyday experience. Additionally, all of our experiences modify us, and also modify the quality of our future experiences. Ingold (2018) further extrapolates that all our experiences change us, and therefore affects the quality of experiences to follow, because the person who enters new experiences is essentially a different person from the one who has already experienced something. As such, we are constantly influenced and recreated by our own actions (Dewey, 2015).

The principle of habit yields beginnings as opposed to stemming from ends, and finds its creativity in doing, undergoing agencement and attentionality (Ingold, 2018). As proponents of habit, agencement falls to us, and it forms a part of the life that we live as accountable and receptive beings. Ingold (2018:33) states that where “beings continually forge themselves and one another in the crucible of social life, their humanity is not a foregone conclusion but an ongoing relational achievement”. Hence, the attentional mind operates in an increasingly ecological manner, and the type of creativity that is referred to here, is what personality undergoes but cannot do. Thus, attentionality assumes an ontological role as the ultimate mode of existing and moving in the world. This form of creativity offers the potential for a new beginning, and such is the creativity of social life (Ingold, 2018). Biesta (2013 as cited in Ingold, 2018) draws the same comparison between strong conceptions of creation as a transition from ‘non-being to being’, and weaker conceptions of creation as ‘calling being to life’. Hence, if creation in the stronger sense reimagines the core of humanity, then in the weaker sense it persistently recreates human existence (Ingold, 2018). Moreover, attentionally, which is also framed by the principle of habit, demands constant responsiveness to one’s surroundings and environment. It requires one to become part of the environment and its elements by going along and participating with them in one’s own way (Ingold, 2018). Attentionally encompasses a continuous process of listening, feeling, and watching, where the world unfolds around and with the responsive being, as opposed

to the individual merely being an observer of this process. In this way, attention is understood as being longitudinal (Ingold, 2018). Therefore, Ingold (cf. 1.2) makes an analogy of walking as a conception of attention, where walking demands the walker be constantly responsive to the elements, the path, and the terrain. The walker attends to these things as she goes along, participating with and joining them in her own movements. This is what it essentially means to watch, listen, and feel, and this active participation yields an attention that is longitudinal. Furthermore, Ingold (2018) refers to two conceptions of attention. In the first account, attention disrupts movement as a way of establishing a transverse link between the mind and the world, and between the object and subject. “In the second sense of responsive accompaniment, attention follows the animate movements with which it is resonantly coupled: it is a go-along, not transverse but longitudinal” (Ingold, 2018:43). The attentive walker aligns his movement to the landscape as it unfolds beneath his feet and around him, as opposed to stopping to check on it periodically. Thus, in the first sense, attention cuts across and interrupts movement in order to form a transverse relation between world and mind, and in the second account, it joins with the movement as an accompaniment (Ingold, 2018). It is through the establishment of the relation between mind and world that the principle of volition comes to the fore.

Rytzler (2017) proposes mindfulness as a particular way of paying attention and controlling and directing one's attention to oneself or to the current moment of an experience (Varela, Thompson, & Rosch, 1991 as cited in Rytzler, 2017). According to O'Donnell (2015) as cited in Henriksen, Richardson, Shack (2020). It would not be far-fetched to say that mindfulness could provide a drug-free option to the control of attention (i.e., student behaviour). Some philosophers of education, however, draw attention to the potential of mindfulness practices for their contribution to the growth of "basic goodness," which they contend is absent in the neoliberal educational system (Eppert, Vokey, Nguyen & Bai, 2015). The notions of attention formation that are discussed in the next paragraphs relate to how the teacher and the student encounter a shared experience of the subject matter or the surrounding environment (Rytzler, 2017).

2.1.2. The principle of volition

Attention concerns itself with establishing a one-to-one link between each physical feature and its accompanying mental representation. This ensures that the contents of the mind

coincide with the objects in the world (Ingold, 2018). This view of attention is outlined by the principle of volition, where the way we move about the world is conceived as intentional. Additionally, it is an attention which takes stock or keeps record in the midst of experiencing and may even temporarily pause the act of experiencing. Ingold (2018) makes an example of going for a walk. The doer sets out clear intentions prior to embarking on the walk, such as improving their physical and mental fitness. In preparation for and during the walk, the doer must attend to various things, and this is the mind's way of being attentive. This form of attention cuts off or disrupts movement to initiate a transverse relationship between the mind and the world, and to check up on and take stock of the world (Ingold, 2018). For example, during the walk, the walker may encounter a large rock or boulder, and must therefore pause her walk-in order to avoid or remove the obstruction in her path. The principle of volition quite literally speaks to pausing or halting movement, after which an exchange pertaining to the mind and the world ensues (Ingold, 2018). Moreover, the principle of volition is based on the premise that every act begins with an intention, and in the act ultimately being executed, the intention is fulfilled (Ingold, 2018). Essentially, in fulfilling the intention by doing or executing a specific act, a process of undergoing takes place (Ingold, 2018). Once the intention is fulfilled, the doer will suffer the effects of the things that they had to undergo and may well be transformed by them.

In the principle of habit, "undergoing is what one does, and doing what one undergoes", while in the principle of volition, the doing is inside the undergoing, which makes it more passive. The "doing and undergoing are set apart on opposite sides of a division between the active and the passive" (Ingold, 2018:22). As we are given volition, agency belongs to us, and essentially, we possess volition, which enables us to act. As beings bequeathed with volition, we have agency, and this enables us to move and act in the world. Also, to be fully open to the world, we need to surrender a level of our agency, as this will enable us to become responsible and responsive human beings. To return to the example of the walk, with each step that the doer takes, there is a level of uncertainty. She must keep the elements in mind, and alter her footing according to the terrain, which may certainly require the doer to surrender some agency. Thus, the principle of volition finds its meaning in the intentions that are set out prior to an action being executed, and therefore lends itself to a form of attention that is founded in intentionality (Ingold, 2018). As Ingold posits, intentionality relates to an intention which is clearly set out prior to enacting a specific action. While in the principles mentioned above, there is a transformation which takes place

because of external forces, Ingold introduces the concept of correspondence, where everything takes place from within.

2.1.3. Correspondence

Correspondence is explained in terms of active undergoing, where there is a continuous absorption and release of energy (Ingold, 2018). This undergoing phase of experience involves the digestion or taking in and the extrusion or going out of energy. The extrusion of energy is a prerequisite to receiving energy, and this active exchange is what Ingold (2018) refers to as correspondence. Furthermore, when the ‘doing’ is inside the ‘undergoing’, it is identified as an enactment of experience (Ingold, 2018). Moreover, when one enacts an experience, one is already inside that experience, in other words inhabiting it. When we inhabit an experience, we are essentially engaged in a process of attention. Hence, by undergoing, we inhabit the world, and this habitation in its active responsiveness is a process of attention (Ingold, 2018).

Correspondence can be understood as a ‘transverse sense of attention’ when it is viewed in its longitudinal or ‘going along with’ sense. This transverse comprehension of attention is the way things and beings ‘co-respond’ or answer to each other over time. It involves how each being finds their individual voice through sharing and exchanging their unique experience with others. Ingold (2018) further posits that a being whose stance is framed within correspondence, abides in habit and adopts an attentional stance. It is through attending to each other and simultaneously going along together, that people correspond. In any social engagement at surface level, it may appear that two individuals are merely interacting, however those involved inhabit this exchange (Ingold, 2018). As in attending to a board game for instance, the participants are captivated and drawn to it. By playing the specific game, they become open to each other due to their mutual enjoyment of the game and the sense of community that enables them to play in a friendly manner. It is this enthrallment with the game that results in the agency of the participants being continuously in question and not pre-determined. Hence, through this practice, the players' agencement is aligned, and they are correspondents in the game, like companions on a walking trail.

Ingold (2018) then refers to two aspects which are like correspondence, namely care and longing. These two also contribute to our comprehension of what it means to lead life, and

consequently our understanding of education. Care presents a moral dimension to attention. We inherently care for things and people by paying close attention to them and attending to their needs. As co-responsive beings, it is our duty to take care of one another, and this duty of care falls to us (Ingold, 2018). The actions which we undertake in its fulfilment are therefore in the nature of tasks, and a task is an action which belongs to others. It is an action which we owe and don't own. "As much undergone as done, it is a 'doing undergoing' which comes to us because we are people of habit" (Ingold, 2018:27). This is not done of our own free will, instead it is done because in a society of people who have little in common, where people are essentially strangers to each other, their presence demands a response. On the other hand, longing marries the processes of imagining and remembering, both of which can be understood as 'presencing', a verb which Ingold (2018) refers to as imagining and envisioning the future and 'remembering presences the past'. In this sense, to remember is to reintroduce oneself to the correspondence, and to re-enter as a correspondent in the practices of one's own development as well as the development of others. Therefore, we must invite people into our presence for us to be present to them (Ingold, 2015). In this way, we attend to people and things to account for them.

Moreover, when attention is discussed in the philosophy of education as a crucial component of educational practice, it is frequently done as a way of complementing psychologically and instrumentally biased educational research. This often focuses on how to address the rising prevalence of attention deficits in the classroom, or on how to manage students' attention so that they meet the curriculum's learning objectives (Rytzler, 2017). The development of attention through educational relationality involves attention as a form of waiting and attention as caring (Stiegler, 2010 as cited in Rytzler, 2017). There are many angles from which to see and ways to comprehend the relationship between education and attention. It is conceivable to speak of an educational kind of attention that arises from and can also be produced in the activity of teaching, with a relational view on education and an adverbial and contextual idea of attention (Rytzler, 2017). Turning to the wisdom traditions, where the idea of mindfulness is tied to diverse practices that enhance attention, is one method to complement that kind of research. In recent years, most philosophers have defined attention by drawing on etymology, scholastics and philosophy, as opposed to a psychological perspective of attention. In this way, attention is understood as an educational concept, and the role of education in promoting and developing attention as a practice (of learning or being) is considered (Rytzler, 2017). These methods place a greater emphasis on what constitutes an attentive action, rather than to the operation of the attentional

process. They therefore closely resemble Mole's (2011) idea of an adverbial approach to attention, since they emphasise the significance of establishing an educational notion of attention due to their educationally focused and adverbially structured notions of attention (Rytzler, 2017).

Given the above philosophical perspectives, Rytzler (2017) examines how attention is understood differently, particularly in relation to educational theory and practice. He achieves this by classifying attention into two groups. In the first group, attention is discussed as an ’outside’ phenomenon that could or should be brought into education, whether through the educators' own attentional abilities or by using attention as a means of enhancing morality or learning. In the second group, attention is viewed as a phenomenon which already includes educational features, since it is more of a relational or shared phenomenon (Rytzler, 2017). However, both categories reject the idea that some learners have higher or lower levels of attention than others, and both groups view attention as a phenomenon which can be cultivated through educational activities. For instance, (Ingold, 2001 as cited in Rytzler, 2017) contends that educational practices should deliberately work to establish connections between a subject and the outside world, since these connections help to facilitate and develop attention. Therefore, it is through these connections that we begin to develop an education that gives attention to place, that is, place-attentive education.

2.4. TOWARDS PLACE-ATTENTIVE EDUCATION

Greenwood (2019) posits that the narrow view of place and its meaning is one of the enduring challenges of place-based education. He further makes a distinction between place-conscious education as a way of knowing and being, and place-based education as a methodology in teaching and learning. In addition to improving their teaching techniques within critical education, educators also need to engage in an in-depth reflection regarding their own ontological experience (Greenwood, 2019). One of the main objectives of developing a more place conscious stance in education is to spread philosophies of accountability and pedagogy outward toward places. Therefore, place-conscious education finds its purpose in working against practices and discourses which are isolated from the living world and are often practiced within placeless institutions of schooling (Grunewald, 2003).

2.4.1 Dimensions of place

Grunewald provides an exposition of place through the lens of five dimensions of a place-conscious and sociological education. As such, in the following section, I provide an overview of Gruenewald's exposition of place, and joins it with Ingold's concept of attention. This will enable me to conceptualise place-attentive education, allowing her to engage in the reconceptualisation of place and attention, according to Grunewald's five dimensions of place. Grunewald (2003) defines five dimensions through which an education which is place-conscious and socio-ecological may be explored and developed, namely the perceptual, sociological, ideological, ecological, and political.

The perceptual dimension of place finds its inspiration within Ingold's principle of habit, which involves our present actions and their impact on the environment (cf 2.3.1). Habit as a principle not only acknowledges the environment and the places that we engage with (our surroundings), but also emphasises our interconnectedness with the world in which we live (cf 2.3.1). According to Grunewald (2003), the perceptual dimension aids in building a philosophy of place which responds to the non-human world. Here, a phenomenology of perception is an essential step to caring for the ecological lives of places, and understanding the interconnectedness of different places and that which exists between people and places. In line with this, the principle of habit unveils its creativity in Ingold's concept of attentionality, where the attentional mind functions in a more ecologically conscious way (cf 2.3.1). Moreover, attentionality necessitates an ongoing awareness of one's surrounding environment, and requires one to form part of and assimilate into the environment and all of its elements (cf 2.3.1). The Perceptual dimension further suggests that schools must be enablers, through the development of strategies that allow teachers and students to perceive places that are alive in the more-than-human and the human world. In the formal education setting, the requirement for renewed attentiveness is essentially a challenge to the manner in which schools, through their rigidity and control, affect our ability to perceive. Because schools traditionally function based on institutional processes, structures and patterns which isolate students and teachers from places outside of the school premises, one may posit that schools limit perception and experience. Hence, schools inadvertently foster our lack of connection to, the lack of awareness of, and our lack of appreciation for places.

The sociological dimension of place finds its meaning in Ingold's principle of volition. The goal of attention within the principle of volition is to create a direct connection between every physical feature and its corresponding mental representation, thereby guaranteeing that thoughts align with physical features in the world (cf 2.3.2).

Similarly, the sociological dimension of place involves the relationship between physical locations and mental geography. Within this dimension of place, the world reveals itself to human beings. Place is therefore where 'being-in-the-world' takes place. As hubs of experience, places also hold our identity and culture. We live our lives in places, and our exchanges and engagement with places colour who we are. There is a clear connection between our identity, cultural experiences, and place. As such, there is a definite link between geographical places and the geography of the mind. Grunewald (2003) further posits that people are place-makers, and that places are the main product of human culture. Recognising that places are what people make of them suggests that schools have a more active and dynamic role in the creation, study, and care of places. In this way, the development of an education which is place-attentive will be fostered. Furthermore, if we as individuals are liable for place-making, then we must become conscious and fully aware of ourselves as participants in the sociopolitical process of place-making, and as place-makers. With regards to education which is place-attentive, this involves the development of connections with places, which enables us to invest them with specific meaning (Grunewald, 2003).

The variety of perceptual experiences of teachers and students should therefore be expanded to facilitate a reflection on how different places and our conceptions of them, become what they are. From this perspective, schools are tasked with providing opportunities for the meaningful participation of students in the place-making process, i.e., in the process of defining what our places will become (Grunewald, 2003). Most education systems do not recognise the importance of place. They reproduce and facilitate the unconscious assumption that places are inevitable parts of our geographical and social landscape (Grunewald, 2003). This assumption is dangerous, as it fails to acknowledge the links between place and education. It does not hold people accountable for their role as place-makers and it validates the ideologies that are entrenched in the places, which are taken for granted (Grunewald, 2003). This disregard of education limits the potential and impact of places and democracy, because it diverts the attention of educators and citizens away from the political, cultural, and social patterns which are seminal to place-making (Grunewald, 2003).

On the other hand, according to the Ideological dimension of place, places and spaces express relationships of power and ideologies. The shaping and moulding of space has been influenced by historical and environmental factors, but this has been a political process, so space is both ideological and political. In acknowledging that places and spaces

are filled with ideologies and politics, Grunewald (2003) argues that critical geographers should revive space from its historical status as fixed and passive territory awaiting colonisation and discovery and should draw the life of places into the fiber of history.

Here, place is alive and filled with the beliefs, actions and thoughts that shape who we are as people, where the geographical relations between places and people becomes the focus of critical social analysis (Grunewald, 2003). Furthermore, place is not a mere reflection of the society, but through society, spatial forms will be produced by human action. These spatial forms will perform and express the interests of the dominant class, based on a specific mode of production. Furthermore, power relationships will be expressed and implemented in a historically defined society. Grunewald (2003) states that, in the same manner that place and the engagement of people with places and the more-than-human are used to promote the dominant class ideals, place can also be used to discourage the practice of power dynamics. Place, as an ideology, must thus be weaved into society and education in order to facilitate decolonisation. In other words, one function of place is hegemonic, and as opposed to material force, domination is maintained through material forms. Here, we concern ourselves with how the geographical place is infused with ideologies and politics, as well as how place simultaneously reproduces and reflects the social relationships of domination and power (Grunewald, 2003).

In relation to education, this insight interrogates the role that education plays in the production and reproduction of place and power relationships. A fundamental goal of education is to equip students with the skills necessary to engage in a society that is fundamentally just and equitable, or one that is becoming increasingly equitable and just through democracy. However, the implicit or hidden agenda of education in its failure to be attentive to spatial forms, functions to uphold geographical relations of dominations (Grunewald, 2003). It is through this lack of attention to place that education conceals and obscures the role citizens in the place-making process. The colonisation and displacement of marginalised groups is the essence of how power has historically operated through the production of place, and how people and places are simultaneously affected and controlled by power. The overarching message here is that power is dependent on, accelerated by and reflected through the control and development of place. Furthermore, the control and privatisation of space by dominant groups signal a need for a place-conscious education and speak to the role that place-attentive education can play in terms of decolonization (Grunewald, 2003).

The Ecological dimension of place maintains that, despite the fact that the nonhuman world is frequently invisible to humans and is mostly regarded as a compilation of natural resources within the global economy, it has become increasingly obvious that modern economies damage and destroy the ecological systems that support human and nonhuman communities.

Additionally, contemporary school transformation has the clear mandate of preparing students so that they are able to compete and be successful in the world. “Therefore, despite the widespread institutionalization of environmental education, schooling and an ecological consciousness of places are fundamentally at odds” (Grunewald, 2003:633). Additionally, previous research about the indigenous experience and marginalised communities such as environmental justice, ecofeminism, and social and human ecology, have contributed to the literature that concerns itself with how places are the empirical center of patterns of both environmental and social domination. The discourse of ecofeminism is particularly valuable in understanding the person-place relationship in a diverse global society. Here, the historical patterns of control and domination over women and other marginalised groups are coupled with the patterns of domination over the land (Grunewald, 2003). While ecofeminism largely speaks to women as a marginalised group, it does not ignore other categories of historically ignored communities, and it recognises how land and place has been an enabler of colonisation through producing numerous sites of oppression.

Finally, Grunewald (2003) refers to the political dimension of place. Two related components with regards to thinking about place are prevalent within the political dimension of place, namely an analysis of the politics of identity, and an examination of the geographic distribution of power and capital. Within these two components, emphasis is placed on place and space. Due to their interest in the political geography of place in a global context of power, conflict, and resistance, the proponents of spatialised cultural study have a lot to offer in terms of an education that is place-conscious, and thus an education that is concerned with identity and diversity issues. By exploring the variety of ways in which politics and places are interlinked, educators and learners can be equipped with ideas concerning how places and people are shaped (Grunewald, 2003). Furthermore, entering a political environment suggests that educators should assume political roles to serve as intermediaries in the creation of culture, identity, and the places where they arise.

The above-mentioned dimensions of place do not fully encompass the ways in which place has encouraged thinking within academic disciplines and across cultures. Once one interrogates the power of place as a concept for analysis, one comes to the realisation that it may be and is increasingly practically applied to any scope of human inquiry or experience. In addition, these dimensions of place question some assumptions of educational research, theory, and practice by shifting our attention to the places where we live our lives, and by interrogating the role that schools play in distorting our view of places or diverting our attention from them all together (Grunewald, 2003). Conversely, Greenwood (2019) states that one of the fundamental objectives of place-conscious learning is the political objective of shaping places in a manner that emulates socio-ecological justice. Naturally, since places are especially complex and induce various intense human responses, place-learning inevitably assumes multiple forms, such as ecological, political, sensory, and psychological, amongst others.

2.5. EDUCATIONAL IMPLICATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF PLACE-ATTENTIVE EDUCATION

The remnants of the impact that colonisation and subsequently apartheid have had on education in South Africa can still be felt today. The schooling system was created to be compatible with a curriculum and institutional framework which found its origins within Eurocentric modernism. As such, this schooling system is unable to also fulfil its objective of righting previous wrongs (Christie, 2020) by encouraging decoloniality through the practise of teaching and learning. This researcher argues that this objective may be addressed through place-attentive education. Once the schooling system has been transformed and re-formulated to reflect democratic values, there will be certain implications. Place-attentive education will inevitably result in an education system which is essentially conscious of place. Place-consciousness within education therefore cannot exist in isolation. This researcher therefore highlights the important role that place-based pedagogies can play in place-conscious and place-attentive education.

2.5.1. Place-conscious education

Greenwood (2013:99) defines the aim of place-conscious education as follows: ”Place-conscious education aims to activate and integrate social and ecological awareness so that

learning, ethics and politics are well grounded in the enfleshed world of social and ecological experiences". While place-conscious thinking can assist in developing a conceptual framework that explicitly articulates educational purposes and possibilities, place-based education (PBE) can be seen as a pedagogy that can transform schooling for all involved by offering authentic experiences in local communities and environments. According to Knapp (2005), PBE has gained increasing prominence over the last ten years in educational literature and is aimed at (re)connecting humans with the land. Gruenewald and Smith (2008) agree that the purpose of place-based education is to increase student engagement and achievement, and to promote democratic participation in local community processes. In terms of place-attentive education, the following implications are identified in relation to Ingold's (2017) concept of attention in terms of the principles of habit, volition and correspondence.

Place-responsive pedagogies are concerned with garnering a better understanding of human-environmental relationships and cultivating positive relations between people and the environment. Thus, place-responsive pedagogies can practically address environmental issues such as climate change, since these pedagogies involve teaching and learning by involving the environment (Lynch & Mannion, 2021). Therefore, an education which is place-responsive, recognises the seminal role that place plays, where place is given center stage through the acknowledgement of the socio-ecological reality (Lynch & Mannion, 2020). Here, the interconnected relationship between society, the environment and its ecosystems are prevalent, place is acknowledged, and humans are tasked with preserving and embracing places for education. Additionally, Wattchow, Jeanes, Alfrey, Brown, Cutter-Mackenzie, and O'Connor (2016) draw on John Cameron's postcolonial position on education when defining the term 'place-responsive education'. They refer to specific indicators for educators who practice place-responsive education. These indicators include being present in and with a place, the representation of place experiences, the power of place-based narratives and stories, and apprenticing ourselves as students of outdoor places (Lynch & Mannion, 2021). Furthermore, John Cameron integrates the ecological conceptions of place when he proposes the term 'place-responsive' in order to make the argument that we should be more than 'sensitive' to place (Lynch & Mannion, 2021). Our responsivity toward places translates to the realisation that place is more than a geographical location. Place, instead, comprises of the more-than-human features which are co-ingredients in education, specifically in place-responsive pedagogies.

Ingold (2003) speaks to the dynamics which are at play regarding place-responsive when he contends that our ability to react to and engage with the world arises from our responses to the environment, as opposed to it being an innate ability which we possess. This essentially means that as it relates to knowledge and education, it is our ongoing responses to the world that enable us to gain a thorough understanding of it. In our engagement with the world, there is a continuous exchange taking place. It is through this exchange that we respond to the world and its spaces, and these spaces in turn react and respond to us. Ingold (2003) further contends that any knowledge that may be created undergoes continuous generation and regeneration within the context of people's practical participation with and contribution to significant components within the environment. As such, place-responsive pedagogies have a direct bearing on learners' exchanges with the world. Conversely, learners' engagement with the world also influences place-responsive pedagogies. In addition, place-responsive pedagogy involves the more-than-human, meaning that the more-than-human attributes of place may be understood as co-ingredients in education (cf 2.4). In essence, place-responsive pedagogy involves the intentional efforts by an educator to engage in an environment-centered teaching process, with the increased comprehension and improvement of human environment relations as the main objective (Mannion et al., 2013). Place-responsive practices are also concerned with place-relations, which involve learning to inhabit places differently while recognising our mutual immersion within the world (Mannion et al., 2013).

Further, place-responsive pedagogy might begin by adopting a co-extensive perspective of culture and nature in a process of ontology, which encompasses an understanding that places, people, and activities are all interconnected (Bennet, 2010). People and places are deeply enmeshed in a mutually beneficial and co-emergent relationship. As one influences the other, both undergo a process of being influenced. By extension, a pedagogy that characterised as place-responsive, suggests that through being attentive with and to the places within which we find ourselves, we are in a position to be more active in ensuring the protection of these places for the future (Nicol, 2014). A place-responsive approach acknowledges and involves non-human factors, and equally recognises the importance of place and the relationship which emanates from this constant interchange between individuals and place, which can take place at any given time (Boyd, 2020). Knowledge does not reside in the environment, nor does it dwell within individual human participants, or the non-human. Instead, it is a persistent and continuous becoming-with, which is distributed through this enmeshment. While place-responsive education generally focuses on outdoor

education, Boyd (2020) postulates that it is more than merely engaging in a specific activity in a set location (place-based learning). Rather, place-responsive education comprises the conscious recognition of the role that place plays in the learning experience, and takes it a step further to a deepened recognition of the intertwined nature of living learning.

2.6. SUMMARY

In this chapter, place was conceptualised, and I considered how it has been taken up in education in terms of place-based and critical place-based education. I extrapolated on the indigenous concepts of place, and the role played by colonialism regarding land and indigenous people. Also considered were place-responsive pedagogies as educational implications for place-attentive education, as well as what such pedagogies encompass. This was followed by a conceptualisation of attention, where attention was defined as being multifaceted. The formation of attention can be understood as an intergenerational progression. A discussion on attention as waiting and the notion that attention can be an external phenomenon, or an inherent feature of education followed. The discussion was premised on Ingold's 2017 concept of attention, through the lenses of the principle of habit, the principle of volition, and the principle of correspondence. Finally, I considered how Ingold's concept of attention can be read together with place to create place-attentive education by referring to Grunewalds five dimensions of a place-conscious and socio-ecological education.

CHAPTER 3

THE CONCEPT OF PLACE-ATTENTIVE EDUCATION AS A PRACTICE OF DECOLONIALITY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

In the preceding chapter, I considered how place-based approaches to education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education. This was achieved through conceptualising place and attention, by looking at place as an event, discussions of place-based education, and indigenous conceptions of place through land education. Additionally, the conceptualisation of attention was compounded by the principles of habit, volition, and correspondence. Furthermore, I discussed place-based education and the role that land education plays regarding place and education. Focus was also placed on the concept of attention, and how place-responsiveness informs education. It is through different place-based approaches and a firm grasp on what it means to be conscious of and responsive to place that education can be reconfigured to be more attentive to place. As such, in this chapter, I explore how place-attentive education can be understood as an enactment of decoloniality. In doing this, she will address the research objective to investigate how place-attentive education can be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality (cf. 1.3.2).

The section will begin by referring to decoloniality and education, where I will conceptualise decoloniality. In conceptualising decoloniality, she will refer to the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality. This will be followed by a discussion of coloniality, and how its distinguished from colonisation, and the historical impacts thereof. I will then proceed to extrapolate concepts such as coloniality of knowledge and epistemicide, and examine how place-attentive education and decoloniality intersect, followed by a discussion of epistemic disobedience as a practice of decoloniality. In the next section, I will focus on decoloniality within education.

3.2 DECOLONIALITY AND EDUCATION

3.2.1 Conceptualisation of decoloniality

Decoloniality confronts social classes like gender, sexuality, and race as products of colonial capitalism, with material and symbolic value for how people and groups experience the world (Lugones, 2010). Fataar (2018) indicates that decoloniality can best be understood as a call for a type of cognitive justice, based on an overhaul and expansion of Western knowledge. The call is also for knowledge pluralisation, and the incorporation of the complex ways of knowing of subaltern and all previously excluded groups. Fataar furthermore states that all knowledge forms must be brought into play that promote a type of epistemic openness to the knowledges of all human beings. It is essential to highlight decoloniality's generosity, which is reflected in its pluri-versal ways of being, doing and knowing. Winkler (2023) posits that pluriversality represents a world that acknowledges and respects various knowledge systems and claims, as opposed to re-establishing one privileged position, which is frequently the approach used when it comes to the Western knowledge system. Through promoting multiple worldviews and knowledge systems, pluriversality involves a horizontal coexistence of knowledge forms that are non-dominant and are grounded in relational ontology (Ortiz, 2022; Vasudevan and Novoa, 2022). Furthermore, pluri-versal conceptions are mandatory for decoloniality, as they do not promote or favour one knowledge system over another (Winkler, 2023). Instead, pluri-versal thinking disagrees with the perception that there is a universally acceptable way to engage in knowledge production. This is achieved by practising a type of epistemic disobedience (De Sousa Santos, 2014).

Next, I will focus on Winkler's (2023) reference to decoloniality, by referring to the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality. Cusicanqui (2012, as cited in Winkler, 2023) refers to grounded normativity and grounded relationality, both concepts which are encompassed in decoloniality and are derived from the intentional grounding of indigenous thinking systems, which disrupt Western approaches to thinking.

First, grounded normativity "teaches us how to live our lives in relation to other people and nonhuman life forms in a profoundly nonauthoritarian, non-dominating, non-exploitive manner" by promoting an ethical way of knowing, doing, and being that negates vertical ontologies (Coulthard & Simpson, 2016:254).

Grounded normativity considers how coloniality continues to inform taken-for-granted understandings of nature, memory, and history through" the production of archives and certain kinds of knowledges that favour hegemonic white possession" (Byrd, Goldstein, Melamed and Reddy, 2018:13). Grounded normativity allows us to engage with meta-ethical questions. Meta-ethical questions include, for example, what is the nature and meaning that informs our understanding of the object under study? The importance of the role that the human and non-human play within places is prevalent in the concept of grounded normativity. According to Coulthard (2014 cited in Winkler 2023), grounded normativity refers to an ethical praxis, where he calls for the restoration of pre-colonial laws pertaining to land. Such laws should support reciprocal relationships and interactions between the human and non-human. Moreover, grounded normativity demonstrates to us how-to live-in relation to others, both the human and non-human, in an ethical manner that does not exploit or dominate them (Winkler, 2023). The overall principle of grounded normativity is that all beings exist equally in the world. In addition, this principle acknowledges the presence of coloniality and how it continues to have an influence on ideologies, history, and nature through the production of knowledge systems which favour Western ideologies (Winkler, 2023). In addition, grounded normativity enables us to engage with meta-ethical enquiries, which center around the nature and meaning of objects or entities. For example, when the object under study is land, the meta-ethical question will be: what is the meaning and nature of the land? (Winkler, 2023).

Winkler (2023) acknowledges relationality grounded as a concept linked to decoloniality. Grounded relationality is premised on the importance of understanding the value and meaning of place and places. Grounded relationality purposefully engages with the nature, meaning and value of relationalities to and with land, but without" precluding movement, multiplicity, multi-directionality, transversals, and other elementary or material currents that have agential significance in ways that exceed liberal conceptions of the human" (Byrd et al., 2018:5). Arguably, grounded relationality alludes to meta-ethical concerns that are relevant to praxis, since grounded relationality spotlights how we might begin to de-link from coloniality (cf 3.2.2). The relational aspect of existence holds each of us accountable to and dependent upon other people and the environments in which we live (Veletsianos & Houleden, 2020). Thus, developing a relational model of knowing that is located within indigenous knowledges will contribute to the realisation of epistemic decolonisation (Botha, Griffiths & Prozesky, 2021). In addition, indigenous knowledge is essentially relational, since it gives priority to the relationships between spaces, people, and artifacts or non-living

beings in constructing knowledge (Botha et al., 2021). This relational knowledge builds and maintains connections and relationships amongst communities and individuals as well as the non-human. It is thus important to consider the relationships between what is now often referred to as Western knowledge and indigenous knowledge as a meeting of different ways of producing, reproducing, and portraying ideas, considering the decolonising potential of indigenous knowledge. Thus, relational processes of knowledge occur within a specific relationship context at a specific moment in time (Kovach, 2009) Therefore, the argument is that, through considering the relational outlook of existence, place-attentive education may be realised as a practice of decoloniality. Considering the relationships which exist between people and the environment, and how this affects and contributes to the construction of knowledge, we are able to realise the decolonising potential of place and indigenous knowledges (Kovach, 2009).

Furthermore, relationality reinforces complexity and the multiple ways in which people are both shaped by and shape other people's responses, situations, experiences, and contexts (Doane & Varcoe, 2015). Congruent with this epistemology, decolonising methodologies place participants' feelings, perspectives, experiences, resistance, and the immediate and broader contexts of their lives at the center of analysis in order to understand and advance social change (Chilisa, 2012).

One cannot engage with decoloniality without referring to decolonisation. Decolonisation can be understood as a broad term for the varied efforts towards the resistance of the distinct but interlinked processes of racialisation and colonisation. It is a way of enacting redress and transformation pertaining to the historical and present-day effects of racialisation and colonisation, as well as to ensure the survival of being, relating and knowing, that these processes aim to destroy (Stein & Andreotti, 2017 in Zembylas, 2018). Within this umbrella term, there are several tensions, paradoxes, and complexities, which manifest in varying decolonisation efforts (Andreotti, Ahenakew & Hunt, 2015). For instance, one such paradox which is prevalent in decolonisation efforts in South Africa, is how institutions of higher learning continue to perpetuate an epistemological hierarchy which privileges Western pedagogies over non-Western ideologies, bodies of knowledge, the production of knowledge and traditions (Higgs, 2016; Mamdani, 2016; Mangcu, 2016; Mbembe, 2016; Morreira, 2017 in Zembylas, 2018). Decolonisation is very much an ongoing process, as indigenous colonised people have resisted colonialism since the very beginning, starting more than 500 years ago (Zembylas, 2018). While the term decoloniality denotes the

everyday and ongoing efforts of contesting persistent forms of coloniality, decolonisation is mainly linked to the historical post-World War II period, where different movements by indigenous people began to challenge external colonialism (Mignolo, 2011b). Here, Greenwood (2019) further states that the aim is that the subject can read the world for what it is and not according to what the subject perceives it to be. The colonisation of the mind, which has been realised through the traditional training of education, affected everyone in the critical process of unlearning the damage caused (Greenwood, 2019). Similarly, it mapped directly onto the related need to remedy and understand the very real contemporary trajectories and material histories of colonialism. Reinhabitation may also be understood as the process of learning to inhabit place, in an area that has been disrupted and scarred by means of exploitation in the past. In addition, Greenwood (2019) states that colonisation has always involved both land and people, territories, bodies, and minds and while it proves impossible to undo colonialism and its history in all its facets, we can learn to acknowledge it and possibly learn to reinhabit our common spaces in more ecologically sensible and socially just ways. Therefore, the primary task of the educator becomes to decolonise the mind, her own as well as that of the learners.

As mentioned above, decolonisation takes on a variety of meanings within different contexts and is centred on two main ideas (Mackinlay & Barney, 2014 as referenced in Zembylas 2018). It firstly elicits a historic account that is against Eurocentrism and recognises the contributions of the colonised minorities across the world. Secondly, it highlights a moral and ethical necessity for righting the wrongs inflicted by the colonial authority and an ethical position pertaining to social justice for those wronged and disempowered by pervasive kinds of coloniality. As such, decoloniality favours artistic expressions and actions which practice epistemic disobedience, and by so doing, deviates from Eurocentric thought to engage with concepts that have been discredited and marginalised (Zembylas, 2018).
We cannot engage in a discussion about decoloniality without touching on the concept of coloniality. Next will follow an exposition of coloniality.

3.2.2 Coloniality and education

Ndlovu (2018) argues that the world which we live in is laden with coloniality as opposed to colonialism. He distinguishes the two, stating the beginning and ending of colonialism is clearly defined, while coloniality persists. Ndlovu (2018) thus refers to coloniality as comprising of a structure of colonialisms, and this structure is both prescriptive and

performative. Prescriptive coloniality rejects the prospects of change and the subsequent move to a decolonial option. Thus, the prescriptive manifestation of coloniality involves the outright denial of change, and openly maintains coloniality (Ndlovu, 2018). Coloniality, in its performative form, is vulnerable to transformation and reconstruction, but not complete collapse. It is thus through the process of reconstruction and transformation that the colonial power structure can elude those essential changes that are desired by the supporters of decolonial thinking (Ndlovu, 2018). This is how coloniality was able to survive even after colonialism came to an end - through undergoing a process of slight re-arranging, which creates the illusion that the practise of coloniality has been disempowered, while in fact it has not undergone transformation to the point of collapse. “A prescriptive structure is that which assimilates contingent circumstances to itself, thereby resisting change, and a performative structure is that which assimilates itself to contingent circumstances, thereby becoming susceptible to change and re-arrangement” (Sahlins, 2013 as cited in Ndlovu, 2018). Moreover, Ndlovu (2018) posits that, historically, coloniality has proven to be unwilling to completely change, while being receptive to undergoing reconstruction, when necessary, in order to elude anti-systemic decolonisation movements. Therefore, coloniality is very much still alive, and almost demands the development and cultivation of an education which is place-attentive, and in turn promotes the practise of decoloniality.

Grosfoguel (2007) reiterates Ndlovu’s position when he argues that coloniality successfully survived the fall of judicial-administrative colonialism through the prevalence of long-standing European versus non-European colonial hierarchies, which continue to exist today. Additionally, these colonial hierarchies are intertwined with the accrual of capital at a global scale and the international division of labour (Grosfoguel, 2007). This is a clear demonstration that whilst colonialism in the classic or traditional sense has collapsed, colonial power relations and conditions remain. While the presence of governments led by settlers in non-Western cultures have essentially been eradicated, coloniality persists (Grosfoguel, 2007). In line with this, Maldonado-Torres (2007) refers to coloniality as long-standing power structures which are a direct result of colonialism, but that define and influence culture, knowledge production and intersubjectivity relations far beyond the colonial administrations and its rigid boundaries. Therefore, colonialism endures as coloniality. It persists in literature, in cultural patterns and in the standards for academic achievement, and it is prevalent in various other facets of the modern experience (Maldonado-Torres, 2007).

In essence, we live and breathe coloniality, and it forms a tangible part of our lived experience as modern subjects. As Maldonado-Torres so aptly describes, while coloniality is an inescapable and invisible power structure, its effects are ever-present, and so it outlives classic colonialism (2007) and manifests itself through coloniality of knowledge. Since coloniality impacts on many spheres of the colonised subjects' lives, including their ways of seeing and interpreting, imaging, and knowing the world, it manifests itself in several ways. In the scope of knowledge production, coloniality reveals itself in terms of the colonisation of the mind, the colonisation of the imagination, and the colonisation of knowledge and power (Ndlovu, 2018). Similarly, Seroto (cf 1.1) refers to coloniality through the lenses of knowledge, power and being, and he posits that coloniality of knowledge involves the systemic suppression of the knowledge, beliefs, and ideas of those that are dominated. In addition to recovering from political, economic, and social colonisation, they must also recover from 'mental' colonisation (cf 1.1), a concept that Quijano terms 'colonization of the imagination'. Additionally, coloniality of knowledge includes conceptions such as colonial domination, which is characterised by epistemicide or the purposeful destruction of cultures and their knowledge forms (cf 1.1). On the other hand, coloniality of power denotes racial and epistemological hierarchies that are entwinned with organisational hierarchies like global capitalism, which persist after the end of colonisation (cf.1.1). Thus, it speaks to the way that the global-political order has been designed to maintain this structure, that is "a racially hierarchised, Euro-American-centric, Christian-centric, patriarchal, capitalist, hetero-normative, hegemonic, asymmetrical, and modern power structure" (cf.1.1). While coloniality of being relates to colonial relations of power, which have a bearing on the overall understanding of being, because colonisation undeniably affected the way that people perceived themselves in terms of their being (cf.1.1). These manifestations of coloniality are essentially invisible forms of coloniality, and the fact that they are unseen is problematic, as the victims of this said power structure may contribute to sustain it without even realising it (Ndlovu, 2018).

Pillay (2021) refers to 'the problem of colonialism' that exists in societies and in institutions of higher learning. Colonialism was identified as a persistent problem, demanding 'anti-colonial, political intervention to decolonise knowledge in the university' (Pillay, 2021:389). If universities could respond to earlier ideologies such as African anti-colonial thought, post-colonial thought, and Marxist thought, then this has allowed for the introduction of decolonial theory into South African debates. Decolonial theory is a specific school of intellectual criticism that found its origins from Latin American scholars. The African and Latin American

movements that are referred to here, expressed a common concern regarding the problem of colonialism, which entails the desire to reverse the legacy of colonial education. ‘The problem of colonialism’ is focused on drawing attention to the way that the decolonisation of knowledge decodes it, which is also the target for these political interventions, and is influenced by political and historical discourses of criticism arising from Arica, and finds its meaning from Latin American conceptions of colonialism (Pillay, 2021). “The Latin American decolonial theorists which are also taken up by some scholars in Africa, put an emphasis on assimilation as the essential feature of colonial epistemic violence” (Pillay, 2021:390). Colonial assimilation aimed to reinvent those who were colonised according to the vision of the European man in terms of conduct, consciousness, aesthetics, and demeanour. However, for a large portion of the African continent, the issue with colonialism is imposed cultural differences, rather than forced cultural assimilation (Pillay, 2021). If we seek to achieve the decolonisation of knowledge, we must first recognise the assimilationist features of that legacy, like the modern legacy of colonial perceptions of difference (Pillay, 2021). If the challenge of colonialism is recognised as assimilation, then the response will likely overlook how colonial rule relies on difference. If both difference and assimilation are recognised as indicators of the issue of colonialism, then decolonisation must also address the problem of how to decolonise differences without compromising the significance of diversity itself in shaping new political possibilities. We should consider the connection between colonialism as a problem, our modern challenge, and the problem that is faced by colonialism (Pillay, 2021). If we examine colonialism from the standpoint of the problems that arise from it, we reach a fuller historical analysis of its legacy as a multiple inheritance. Pillay (2021) further posits that the problem of colonialism refers to difficulties that colonial rulers and administrators had to contend with. These issues gave rise to institutionally unique perceptions of the colonial subject. To further explain this argument, we draw on the early conceptions of the teaching of Native subjects under apartheid educational policy. These issues led to institutionally unique perceptions of the colonial subject. If an anticolonial endeavour in education aims to reverse the effects of colonial education, are those effects identical across various geohistorical experiences? And if those legacies differ, what does that entail for anticolonial projects that are focused on the colonial legacies of difference and assimilation that are currently seen in education? These concerns are addressed by examining how one branch of decolonial philosophy enters and influences South African discourse (Pillay, 2021).

One recurring question is whether present-day education systems within Africa serve the interests of the African continent, or that of former Western colonial masters (Ndlovu, 2018). On this premise, once may argue that education within Africa is desperate for an overall paradigm change, which involves an increased focus into confronting with the intention of rectifying the wrongs and moving away from systems of knowledge that reinforce coloniality (Ndlovu, 2018). Furthermore, many African universities are defined by and still embrace Eurocentric conceptions of knowledge. In many cases African universities can be said to merely be African by virtue of their geographical location, meaning that they are Westernised institutions on the African continent. Ndlovu (2018) refers to the protests which took place not so long ago at some South African universities, where there was an overarching call for decolonisation, as alluding to the fact that many African universities prescribe to the power structure of coloniality. The fact that these protests targeted institutions which are located in former homeland areas, in other words those that are usually classified as 'black universities', is an indication that the main issue which is prevalent in contemporary universities in South Africa and Africa at large, is not so much the social location but the epistemic location of the institutions (Ndlovu, 2018). The same can be said for schools in South Africa.

While the schooling curriculum has undergone an overhaul after colonial rule, the remnants of colonisation can still be seen and felt in schools. According to Christie (2020), consensus can be reached regarding the dismal performance of the South African education system. South Africa is ranked as one of the lowest performers across all international comparison scales, and the performance trends within in the educational system are recognised as bimodal (Christie, 2020; Mlachila & Moeletsi, 2019). The performance trends are bimodal in the sense that there are distinctively varied results for students who attend different schools, and the distinguishing factor is related to economic and poverty levels. In this bimodal orientation, the majority of the students are subjected to an inefficient education system, while the minority (8%) attend schools that are primarily desegregated, produce good results and are fee-paying (Christie, 2020).

Moreover, nearly all the underperforming schools are black schools in townships and rural areas, and this disparity indicates an unequal basis. Unfortunately, despite the implementation of post-apartheid policies, these performance patterns, which seek to achieve improved quality and equity in education, have persisted (De Clercq, 2020; McKeever, 2017). As a way of addressing the poorly functioning schools and improving

performance, several interventions and suggestions for change have been made. The efficiency and effectiveness of the education systems and policies are seldom investigated, however, and are therefore not identified as the perpetrator in these patterns (Christie, 2020). Most initiatives to modify the occurrences in classrooms have failed due to the fact that over the last hundred years, the fundamental organisational structures have barely changed, and there has been minimal engagement with educational theories of Western education (De Clercq, 2020). Each school has a principal, teachers who oversee individual classrooms, and learners who are categorised according to their grade and age, this structure persists and has prevailed throughout the years, including during the colonial period (Cuban, 1988). To further explain how schools endure despite attempts at reform, we distinguish between first-order and second-order changes. First-order changes are quality-control adjustments meant to enhance what already exists, while maintaining the fundamental structure of the organisation (Christie, 2020). They may address any aspect of the educational system, including the variety of problems listed above, and may be helpful in addressing challenges. Second-order modifications, in contrast, aim to alter the fundamental organisational structure of the educational system (Christie, 2020). Second-order changes are far less likely than first order changes to succeed, because outside of schools, societal and political reforms are necessary for their success (Christie, 2020). It may be argued that the significant social and political developments of the 1990s created favourable conditions for modifications which were made to South African education's second-order structure (Christie, 2020).

To replace the apartheid curriculum with outcomes-based instruction, Curriculum 2005 may also be seen as a second-order redesign. This redesign, followed by a series of quality control revisions before the design was discarded (Taylor, 2012). One may therefore pose questions pertaining to the competence of the redesign of the system, regarding its claimed objectives of redressing past injustices in educational provision and providing an education progressively high quality for all(South African Schools Act, 1996). According to (Ngobeni et al, 2023) indicate that the curriculum reforms included the Curriculum 2005 (C2005) which was initiated around 1998 and was underpinned by the Outcomes-Based Educational (OBE) philosophies. Furthermore, the OBE later underpinned the subsequent reforms such as the New Curriculum Statement (NCS or RNC) and the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) (Ngobeni et al, 2023). In 2012, the CAPS was introduced to enlighten teachers about what they should teach in class and how they should assess learners predominated by disciplinary knowledge (Hoadley 2017). Davies (2016) posits that access

to formal education is a pre-requisite for accessing powerful knowledge and exclusion in education on any basis lacks justification. Christie (2020) further posits that there are limits to the abilities of the current system. It has a limited ability to address the injustices of apartheid, eliminate the severe disparities between schools, or guarantee equal quality in terms of educational outcomes and experiences for everyone. The significant political shifts which occurred in 1994 provided an opportunity for a fundamental transformation, a decolonising moment. However, more extensive negotiations led to the 1990s education policy agreement. The apartheid National Party participated in these negotiations. It was devoted to ensuring the survival of Afrikaans-language schools, and successfully created a privileged status for all former white schools. Furthermore, the population's linguistic diversity and the highly varied learning environments in legacy apartheid schools were not adequately considered when changing the curriculum, nor was there enough thought given to how to address the historical injustices and negative impacts of apartheid. While the South African Constitution regards education as a fundamental right, and forbids racial discrimination, equal access to schools did not follow.

Coloniality of knowledge therefore concerns itself with the generation of knowledge, and deliberates on who the authors of such knowledge are, as well as what the objective of this knowledge generation is (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2015). Coloniality of knowledge involves the superior authority and the inferior or dominated communities (cf 1.1) Within schooling, the learners are essentially the inferior beings and knowledge recipients, who are taught knowledge which resides in Eurocentric worldviews (cf 1.1, 3.3.2). Furthermore, the learners exist in an education system which does not promote learning which will in turn promote decoloniality. There is, for instance, a lack of place-centred approaches in teaching and learning activities (cf 1.1, 3.3.2). Moreover, coloniality of knowledge seeks to understand how indigenous knowledges came to be overlooked and marginalised, which resulted in the rise and prevalence of Eurocentric or Western knowledge, and where indigenous knowledge forms were seen as deficient and lacking (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2015). As a result, the epistemologies and worldview of indigenous people do not form part of these knowledge systems. There are increasing calls for schools and universities, as institutions which train educators, to undergo decolonisation. Hall and Tandon (2017) further posit that in their origin, medieval universities were established as a means of exerting control of knowledge and its distribution by limiting access to knowledge. This was essentially an act of enclosing knowledge, and only making it accessible to a small elite, where those outside of this enclosure were non-knowers, and those within the enclosure were knowers. Institutions of

higher learning are sites for knowledge production, and educators are trained at these institutions. Thus, if the knowledge that is produced and shared at universities still prescribes to Eurocentrism and colonial perceptions, the schools and learners are ripe for the taking. This is almost a direct way to perpetuate coloniality through institutions of learning. The land and the connections between those who shared it were stripped of knowledge, which is referred to by Boaventura de Sousa Santos (2016) as epistemicide, which means the killing of knowledge systems. Epistemicide is defined as the destruction of cultures, memories, ancestral links, knowledge of these populations, and the way that members of these populations relate to one another (De Sousa Santos, 2016).

Every facet of these populations is therefore destroyed and subjected to colonial occupation, including their political and legal forms (Cf 1.1). In addition, epistemicide is colonial domination in practise, as the destruction of indigenous knowledge forms reinforces the Eurocentric knowledge as the only valid knowledge form and undermines non-Eurocentric knowledges (cf 1.1). When epistemicide is active, the vast majority of knowledges that are based on ideologies that are fundamentally different from the dominant one, will be completely silenced (Bennet, 2007). The beginnings of decoloniality inevitably involve the end of epistemicide, and subsequently colonial domination, which will make way for decoloniality, which this researcher maintains can be practiced through an education which acknowledges the fundamental role of place and being attentive. Also, colonial domination, oppression, and the relationship between the coloniser and the colonised, are essential to our comprehension of the various types of dominance, because domination is active in a series of oppressions (De Sousa Santos, 2016).

In line with the concept of epistemicide, De Sousa Santos also refers to epistemologies of the South, which reinforce the need for epistemological transformation to reimagine social emancipation on a universal scale (De Sousa Santos, 2016). The South becomes a metaphor for people's suffering, which is a direct result of colonialism and capitalism on the global or universal level, and for the resistance to minimising or overcoming such suffering (De Sousa Santos, 2016). Hence, De Sousa Santos (2016) posits that 'epistemologies of the South' offer fresh conceptual foundations for understanding the transformations which occur in society. Although they do not address the notion of what is considered as knowledge, epistemologies of the South address methods of knowing, which frequently do not qualify as knowledge (De Sousa Santos, 2016). Instead, they are often minimised and disregarded as opinions, superstitions, common sense, and subjectiveness. Consequently,

“the epistemologies of the South must occupy the term ‘epistemology’ in order to re-signify it” (De Sousa Santos, 2016:20). When these discounted knowledges are re-classified as epistemologies, epistemicide will inevitably cease, as the knowledge forms which are being eliminated and silenced will be viewed as what they in fact are - rich and valuable epistemologies (De Sousa Santos, 2016). The end of epistemicide makes way for cognitive justice. According to Muchenje (2017), cognitive justice acknowledges the different knowledge forms which coexist, and recognises that this plurality needs to transcend mere tolerance, to become an active recognition and understanding of the importance of diversity. Cognitive justice therefore makes way for education which promotes and encourages decoloniality.

3.2.3 The intersection of place-attentive education and decoloniality

The aim of this chapter is to explore how place-attentive education may be understood as a practice of decoloniality. This is done by framing the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality (cf 3.2.1) within Ingold’s principles of habit (cf 2.3.1), volition (cf 2.3.2), and correspondence (cf 2.3.3).

First, according to Ingold (2018), the principle of habit posits that “our actions are influenced and shaped by our past experiences”, and that these experiences also give our present experiences some of their significance (cf 2.3.1, cf 3.2.1). As a result, the things we do now and the way we live our everyday lives are shaped by our prior experiences, as well as any negative effects that those experiences may have had on us (cf 2.3.1). As Ingold puts it, "further doing" refers to the impact that our current acts have on our future actions, as well as on the environment (cf 2.3.1). This illustrates the idea that life is a continuous process, since our past interactions with the world will always influence our interactions within the world in the future. Thus, the principle of habit acknowledges the role of non-human phenomena when it comes to us being affected by and through different experiences. This may refer to experiences with human beings or non-human artefacts (cf 2.3.1). A person may be affected by nature and the environment, and also have the power to affect the environment. Ingold further argues that the progression of life largely encompasses continuity, since it is an ongoing process of continuously being acted upon by the environment, as we simultaneously acting upon it (cf 2.3.1). Moreover, while the tangible experiences that we have may come to an end, the meaning and value that we derive from the experiences remain, and form an integral part of the self (cf 2.3.1). In terms of

decoloniality, the concept of grounded normativity (cf 3.2.1) also recognises the role of the environment and the relationship which exists between human and non-human elements. Grounded normativity acknowledges the role of both human and non-human elements, as well as how the two relate to one another (cf 3.2.1). Additionally, grounded normativity avers that the relationship between the human and non-human should be of a reciprocal nature and should be premised on the assumption of equality. In this way, grounded normativity makes a case for decoloniality, that is, the human and non-human elements should co-exist in a non-dominating, non-exploitative manner (cf 3.2.1). This alludes to the notion of pluriversality (cf 3.2.1), which involves knowledge forms that co-exist in a non-dominant manner. Once all knowledge forms are acknowledged as equal, the premise that Euro-centric or Western knowledge forms are superior to indigenous knowledges (3.2.2) will not hold. Therefore, this researcher argues that through grounded normativity as a tool for decoloniality, the recognition of indigenous knowledge forms will facilitate decoloniality. Furthermore, place finds its premise within the principle of habit and Grunewald's dimensions of place. Habit as a principle highlights our interconnectedness with the world in which we live, while also acknowledging the environment and the places we interact with (our surroundings), and in this way it relates to the perceptual dimension of place (cf 2.3.1; 2.4.1). Grunewald (2003) asserts that the perceptual dimension of place contributes to the development of a place philosophy, which takes into account the nonhuman environment.

Ingold (2001) contends that, as teaching is a demonstration or presentation activity, intentional efforts should be made in educational practice to establish connections between a subject and the outside world. Such connections will help to build and develop attention. The implications from an educational standpoint are that when a subject is asked to do something, it is primarily a call to present itself in a world populated by other people. Arguably here, there is no domination, and the educational practice is undertaken in a non-exploitive manner. Therefore, decoloniality and attention can be regarded as an event of intellectual emancipation. It can therefore be seen as self-activity that does not constrain the integrity of the subject, but invites the subject, as an attentive subject, to self-attentively emerge in a world of plurality and difference (Rytzler, 2017).

Moreover, Ingold's principle of habit intersects with grounded relationality (cf 3.2.1), where reference is made to the value of people and non-living artefacts, and the significance of the relationship between the two is highlighted (cf 2.3.1). The principle of habit maintains that people are unable to exist outside of the environment in which they live, so people engage

in a relationship with the environment, where both the environment and humans are influenced by one another (cf 2.3.1). Similarly, grounded relationality emphasises the significance of place, the meaning and value of the relationships that human beings have with place, and the relationalities which exist between people and the environment (cf 3.2.1). Therefore, the places where teaching and learning occur, such as schools, affect the people, including educators and learners, who wish to create meaning, and are searching for meaning. It is through this continuous exchange and engagement with place that attention is formed (cf 2.3.1). As such, when educators engage with the meaning and value of the school within which they teach, their surroundings inevitably have an impact on them, and affects them in a particular manner. It is through this reciprocal relationship that humans inhabit their surroundings, and by so doing engage in a process of attention (cf 2.3.1). This researcher therefore argues that, through a relational approach that gives attention to place, an education that is place-attentive can be developed, and result in decoloniality as a practise.

In the principle of volition, the goal of attention is to ensure that every physical characteristic has a corresponding mental representation, allowing the mind's contents to align with the world's objects (cf 2.3.2). Ingold (2018) refers to this way of moving around the world as being intentional. It is a type of attention that continuously makes connections between what is in the world, and its value and meaning (cf 2.3.2). The principle of volition is therefore premised on intentionality, and connecting what exists within places to a particular symbol or mental representation (cf 2.3.2). This refers to creating meaning from the place and even searching for and deriving meaning from the place as we move through the world. In terms of their acknowledgement of meaning, the principles of habit and volition converge when they both make mention of meaning and meaning-making in the strive towards decoloniality. As mentioned above, the principle of habit (cf 2.3.1) is focused on the experiences that we have daily, and maintains that even while our physical or tangible experiences may come to an end, the meaning and value that we receive from them endure and form an essential part of who we are (cf 3.2.3.2). In relation to decoloniality, in particular grounded normativity, it references meta-ethical enquiries focused on the meaning and nature of non-human entities or objects (cf 3.2.1). In referencing meaning, grounded normativity alludes to Ingold’s position, which is derived from our everyday experiences. Also, as mentioned above, grounded normativity encompasses meta-ethical enquiries, which includes probing to establish the sense of meaning and value of non-human features such as place (cf 3.2.1).

The concept of grounded relationality is premised on the belief that developing a relational model of knowing, that is founded in indigenous knowledge systems, will help make epistemic decolonisation a reality (cf 3.2.1). Arguably, grounded relationality, in practise, would encompass learners being exposed to learning material inspired by and aimed at the promotion of indigenous knowledges. Furthermore, grounded relationality maintains that relationships between individuals, communities, and non-human entities are established and sustained by relational knowledge (cf 3.2.1). This position mirrors Ingold's principle of volition (cf 3.2.1), in that as we attend to and move through the world, we assign meaning to each thing or artefact that we come across. In doing this, we engage in a form of attention-making, by assigning value to our daily engagements with people and places (cf 3.2.1). The concept of grounded relationality is based on the premise that it is necessary to have a strong understanding of the significance and value of the relationships that we have with and to land and place (cf 3.2.1). Thus, understanding the value and meaning of our relationship with place, will lead to the realisation of decoloniality. In this way Ingold's principle of volition finds a voice in the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality. Essentially, both the principle of volition and the concept of grounded relationality acknowledge the role of meaning-making, and how we engage in exchanges with the world, including the environment and the human and non-human (cf 3.2.1). The connection between actual locations and mental geography characterises the sociological dimension of place (cf 2.4.1). Place is where "being-in-the-world" takes place. As hubs of experiences, places also carry our identity and culture. It is within this dimension of place that the world presents itself to human beings. There is a direct correlation between our place, cultural experiences, and identity, as we are products of the places in which we live and interact. Thus, the geography of the mind and physical locations are inextricably linked. In this way, the perceptual dimension of place finds itself within the principle of volition (cf 2.3.2), which involves matching up the contents of the world with its accompanying mental representation.

Ingold refers to correspondence as a practice of attention (cf 2.3.3). It can be understood as the exchange of energy where energy is being taken in and then extruded. Energy must first be extruded to be received, and this dynamic exchange is what Ingold refers to as correspondence (cf 2.3.3). Furthermore, it is seen as an enactment of experience when the "doing" is part of the "undergoing." When we experience something, we are undergoing the experience, enacting the experience, and when we enact an experience, we are engaged in a process of attention (cf 2.3.3). Arguably this means that the dynamic exchange which

takes place during the process of teaching and learning is a process of attention. According to Ingold's principle of correspondence, when the experience of teaching is encountered, it is simultaneously enacted through the learning process. That is, we are undergoing the experience of teaching, while enacting teaching, thus when we enact this experience through learning we are involved in a process of attention (cf 2.3.3).

When correspondence is considered in its longitudinal or 'going along with' sense, it might be interpreted as a 'transverse sense of attention'. This transverse comprehension of attention describes how the non-human and people 'co-respond', or provide answers, to one another over time (cf 2.3.3). It has to do with how every human being discovers their unique voice through communicating and exchanging their unique experiences with other people (cf 2.3.3).

In the dynamic exchange which takes place in the receiving and giving of energy, an exchange between people and non-human phenomena occurs (cf 2.3.3). This exchange is described as a co-responding, that is, how people and the non-human engage with and affect one another. This notion alludes to the concept of grounded normativity and grounded relationality. Here, grounded normativity is focused on the nature of the relationship between the human and non-human, and concerns itself with the significance and meaning of things and beings (cf 3.2.1). Grounded relationality, on the other hand, refers to the meaning which may be inferred from the non-human and the places within which they exist (cf 3.2.1). The mention of place here may infer the perceptual dimension of place, which aids in building a philosophy of place which responds to the nonhuman world. Here, a phenomenology of perception is an essential step to caring for the ecological lives of place (cf 2.4.1). In line with the perceptual dimension of place, Ingold calls for care through his principle of correspondence (cf 2.3.3). Ingold (2018) posits that care is fundamental to our concept of education and, by extension, what it means to live a life. Care adds a moral component to attention, as we are naturally drawn to objects and people who require attention, and it is our responsibility to look out for and care for one another as co-responsive beings (cf 2.3.3). By the promotion of care, correspondence echoes the concept of grounded normativity (cf 3.2.1), which presents evidence in favour of decoloniality through the idea that human and non-human components should coexist in a non-dominating, non-exploitative manner (cf 3.2.1). In the classroom, care finds its premise by means of an educator and an education system which can accommodate non-western knowledge forms. When the place within which teaching and learning takes place makes a case for non-dominant knowledge forms

and ways of being (cf 2.3.3), care is present, and the principle of correspondence which can be understood as a process of attention, can thrive.

In consideration of Ingold's views of attention as a form of decoloniality, it therefore becomes imperative to highlight the role of epistemic disobedience. Mignolo (2011a) posits that epistemic disobedience is characterised by the divergence, or a process of delinking, from Euro-centred epistemologies and the subsequent emergence of decolonial methodologies. Epistemic disobedience brings to the fore decolonial options as a set of projects which find commonality in their coloniality. This refers to the effects experienced by communities which were the targets of global projects to colonise the economy, through the appropriation of land and natural resources, military and police enforcement, reinforcing the coloniality of power, in order to colonise knowledges such as thoughts and languages. Therefore, delinking, which implies epistemic disobedience, is required, as there is no way of escaping the coloniality of power while within Western categories of thought. In responding to the colonisation and conquest of America and the slave trade, epistemic disobedience leads us to a different location, a different 'beginning', to spatial sites of struggles and building as opposed to a new temporalty within the same area. Mignolo (2011a) argues that coloniality comprises of modernity, given that modernity assumes a condemnatory and oppressive logic of coloniality, which subsequently facilitates a sense of distrust and discontent. This energy is converted into decolonial projects which also constitute modernity, because biographical and geohistorical sites of enunciation have been discovered during and because of the transformation and the making of the colonial power structure.

Epistemic disobedience will aid us in not only de-linking knowledge forms from coloniality, but in also making knowledge forms more socially just, transformative, and inclusive (cf 1.1; 1.4; 3.2.1). The South African schooling system remains a challenge, and continues to engage in marginalising non-European knowledge forms (Hlatshwayo, 2019). This is visible in how Western thought maintains its dominance and centrality at the expense of non-Western knowledge forms, and those from the Global South. The 1994 democratic post-apartheid government anticipated an epistemic revolution that would require redirection away from the apartheid and colonial knowledge systems, where the curriculum was an instrument of exclusion, to a democratic curriculum that would embrace all schools of thought (Hlatshwayo, 2019). To comprehend epistemic disobedience, understanding it and placing it within the larger decolonial school of thought, is crucial. Such a school of thought should be focused on challenging Western modernity and Euro-American thought in a

counter-hegemonic way (Hlatshwayo, 2019). Furthermore, Mignolo's concept of the colonial matrix of power aptly describes a knowledge system that only benefits a small segment of humanity when it comes to epistemology (Mignolo, 2013). Additionally, epistemic disobedience leads us to different types of projects that all share the common experience of being colonised in different facets, whether through the economy, authority, coloniality of power or colonising knowledges through categories of thought, languages, or belief systems (Quijano, 2007). Therefore, the process of de-linking entails deviating from Western thought and re-centering other ways and perspectives of looking at the world that avoid elevating Euro-American perspectives to the forefront as primary signifiers (Quijano, 2007). In this study, I explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

3.3. SUMMARY

In this chapter I conceptualised decoloniality, which is defined as a demand for a certain kind of cognitive justice based on an overhaul of Western knowledges. While decolonisation is primarily associated with the historical post-World War II period, when various initiatives by indigenous people started to oppose external colonialism, the term decoloniality refers to the daily and continuous attempts to contest enduring forms of coloniality. This was followed by an exposition of the historical impacts of colonialism and coloniality on education, which distinguishes prescriptive and performative coloniality. Furthermore, in addition a discussion on the history of the South African education system and its formative years, and the problem of colonialism as described by Pillay (2021) were also discussed. After the historical impacts of coloniality on education, the study explored the intersection of place-attentive education and decoloniality. This was achieved by considering the link between Ingold's principles of habit, volition, and correspondence, through which he defines attention, and the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality.

CHAPTER 4

THE POTENTIAL OF THE ENGLISH HOME LANGUAGE CURRICULUM ASSESSMENT POLICY STATEMENTS (GRADES 10-12) TO PROMOTE PLACE-ATTENTIVE EDUCATION AS A PRACTICE OF DECOLONIALITY

4.1. INTRODUCTION

In the preceding chapter, I conducted a literature review to deliberate and conceptualise place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality in South Africa. I examined place-attentive education, and how it can be understood as a practise of decoloniality. In this chapter, I explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality (cf 1.3.3). My analysis consists of a document and policy analysis to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (hereafter, CAPS, 2011) (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. This is achieved by drawing on the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (hereafter, the Constitution 1996) and an education-related document namely the White Paper 1 on Education and Training of 1995 (hereafter, White Paper 1995) as well as a policy analysis of the CAPS (2011). I will position CAPS (2011) within the broader legislative context and thereafter discuss the findings of both the document and policy analyses separately, as presented in the mentioned documents. Therefore, I consider how the policies I analyse converge and are interlinked with additional related documents and policy. Moreover, I employ a qualitative methodology for my study, since it offers a theoretical basis for research, and elicits meaning from data, and can assist us in the interpretation of meaning (cf 1.5.1) in the Constitution (1996), the selected education-related document (the White Paper 1, 1995), and the CAPS (2011). Furthermore, I will undertake a content and context analysis. According to Talyor et al (1997), policy content analysis is focused on establishing the purpose of the policy, its overarching objectives and aims, and its core values, to establish the potential of the document or policy to promote place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality. On the other hand, the context analysis will involve examining the factors that contributed to the formulation of the policy. As Taylor et al (1997:45) posit, a context analysis of policy concerns itself with the “antecedents and pressures leading to the gestation of a specific policy”. I will therefore undertake a context

analysis of policy, with particular mention of the historical socio-economic factors that took place in the South African education context, which subsequently led to the CAPS (2011). Additionally, qualitative research produces data that requires systematic and rigorous analysis to be interpreted (cf 1.5.1). I will then develop a framework for analysis (Appendix A), which is guided by the Chapters 2 and 3 (cf 4.5) respectively which aligns with a conceptual paper. The next section will report on the qualitative analysis.

4.2. QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

The research methods used to collect data in this study were document and policy analysis (cf 1.5.2). Moreover, I employed a qualitative methodology for my study, since it offers a theoretical basis for research, elicits meaning from data, and assists us in the interpretation of meaning (cf 1.5.1). Qualitative analysis refers to the analysis of data by means of assessing, evaluating, and interpreting textual data for the purpose of obtaining information (Bowen, 2009). Additionally, qualitative research produces data that requires systematic and rigorous analysis in order to be interpreted (cf 4.2). This will assist this researcher in addressing the research question, namely "*What is the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality*?". Furthermore, I conducted a literature review as a research method, which is fundamental to a qualitative study and involves the critical evaluation and analysis of relevant existing knowledges (cf 1.5.2.1)

4.2.1 DOCUMENT ANALYSIS

Document analysis is a methodical and systemic procedure for evaluating and reviewing documents (Bowen, 2009). Similar to other analytical techniques in qualitative research, it necessitates the examination and interpretation of data to extract meaning, gain comprehension, and produce empirical knowledge (Bowen, 2009). With this approach, a variety of documents can be analysed, such as books, academic journal articles and institutional reports. Any text-based document can serve as a source for qualitative analysis (Morgan, 2022). Document analysis gives researchers access to reliable data sources and it can also be beneficial due to the stability of the data, which remains unchanged. Document analysis also allows researchers to access data that would otherwise require a great deal of time and effort to collect (Morgan, 2022). The three stages of document analysis involve

reading (a thorough examination), skimming (a superficial examination), and interpretation, and both content analysis and thematic analysis are used in this iterative process. Sorting material into groups based on topics connected to the main research questions is called content analysis (Bowen, 2009). I will undertake an analysis of the following documents: the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), and the White Paper 1 on Education and Training (1995).

For the purpose of this study, I will refer to Samuel's (2017) exposition to analyse documents. Samuel maintains that a document and policy analysis can follow a specific pattern. Firstly, the focus of the policy should be established, followed by the textual proposition. It should also be established what type of policy it is, and the intentions of the policy. Furthermore, it is necessary to determine from where the policy draws its inspiration, what the policy is responding to, the contributors in the policy-making process, and the intended beneficiaries of the policy. Samuel (2017) provided the guide on which this policy analysis is based, which enabled me to gain increased comprehension of the contextual basis against which the said documents were developed. I, however, only made use of the applicable elements of his proposed framework. It is important to note is that not all of Samuel's elements will be addressed in the analyses, as they are not applicable. Taylor et al's (1997) views (cf 1.5.2) will be used to augment Samuel's framework (2017).

The analysis will commence by referring to the Constitution (1996), and how it relates to the White Paper 1. Subsequently, the CAPS (2011) is examined from the lens of these two policy documents, which inextricably influenced the formulation of the CAPS (2011). To achieve this aim, an analysis of the Constitution (1996) will provide a broad legislative backdrop against which the White Paper on Education and Training (1995) can be examined, and conversely the CAPS (2011). These two documents form the basis from which the CAPS (2011) were developed, and while it is a policy in and of itself, it draws its inspiration from the Constitution (1996) and the White Paper 1 (1995). As such, the analysis will include an evaluation of the above-mentioned policies, what they have in common, and how they relate to each other.

Through examining the CAPS, I seek to determine how coloniality and decoloniality display themselves within education and training. To achieve this aim, I engage in what Taylor et al (1997) refer to as intertextuality within a policy. Intertextuality denotes the relationship that

a policy shares with other policies and official documents that could have played a significant role in shaping the development of the policy.

4.2.1.1 The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996)

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa is the supreme law by which the country is governed, and any actions contrary to the obligations which are outlined in the constitution (1996) must be halted and eliminated. (RSA 1996: Chapter 1, s. 2). The Constitution is clear on its position regarding education, stating that:

- "Everyone has the right to basic education, including adult basic education and to further education which the state, through reasonable measures, must make progressively available and accessible".
- "Everyone has the right to receive education in the official language or languages of their choice in public educational institutions where that education is reasonably practicable. In order to ensure the effective access to, and implementation of, this right, the state must consider all reasonable educational alternatives, including single medium institutions, taking into account— equity; practicability; and the need to redress the results of past racially discriminatory laws and practices. (RSA 1996: Chapter 2, s. 29(1))".

The right to education is fundamental, and while it is stated in the Constitution (1996), unfortunately equal access to education was not realised (cf 3.2.2). The Constitution (1996) maintains that "everyone is equal before the law and has the right to equal protection and benefit of the law" (RSA 1996: Chapter 2, s. 9(1)). As indicated in the Preamble, the overarching objective of the Constitution (1996) is to: ***"***Heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights; Lay the foundations for a democratic and open society in which government is based on the will of the people and every citizen is equally protected by law; Improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person; and build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations" (RSA 1996: Preamble). By implication, the Constitution (1996) was developed due to the need for laws and legislation which would be for the benefit of all people, regardless of any differences which may exist.

In terms of languages, the Constitution (1996) refers to the 11 official languages of South Africa and goes on to specify them, including English (RSA 1996: Chapter 1, s. 6(1)). The Constitution (1996) also refers to “recognising the historically diminished use and status of the indigenous languages of our people, the state must take practical and positive measures to elevate the status and advance the use of these languages” (RSA 1996: Chapter 1, s. 6(2)).

The Constitution (1996) further states the following as it pertains to language:

- The national government and provincial governments may use any particular official languages for the purposes of government, taking into account usage, practicality, expense, regional circumstances and the balance of the needs and preferences of the population as a whole or in the province concerned; but the national government and each provincial government must use at least two official languages (RSA 1996: Chapter 1, s. 6(3a)).
- The national government and provincial governments, by legislative and other measures, must regulate and monitor their use of official languages. Without detracting from the provisions of subsection (2), all official languages must enjoy parity of esteem and must be treated equitably (RSA 1996: Chapter 1, s. 6(4)).
- A Pan South African Language Board established by national legislation must—promote, and create conditions for, the development and use of—all official languages; the Khoi, Nama and San languages; and sign language; and promote and ensure respect for—all languages commonly used by communities in South Africa Chapter 1, s. 6(5)).

Thus, the Constitution (1996) emphasises the importance of all languages being utilised equitably and fairly, especially indigenous languages, which have been neglected (cf 3.2.3). In addition, the democratic ideals and values that are outlined in the Constitution (1996), are directly proportional to decoloniality, and this is relevant to this study, as it seeks to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. Furthermore, the Constitution (1996) governs the Republic of South Africa as a democratic and sovereign state, which is built on the following values: human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights, non-racialism and non-sexism, the

supremacy of the constitution, the right to vote to ensure responsiveness, accountability, and openness (RSA 1996: Chapter 1, s. 1).

The Constitution (1996) also outlines the importance of environmental preservation, and states that “everyone has the right to have the environment protected through legislative measures that prevent pollution and ecological degradation and that promote conservation” (RSA 1996: Chapter 1, s. 24). Additionally, the Constitution (1996) also advocates for equitable access to South Africa’s natural resources, including land and property for all citizens (Chapter 1, s. 25 (4)). This democratic value, which speaks to the preservation of the environment, is prevalent in this researcher’s conceptualisation of place, and alludes to place-based pedagogies. Place-based and place-responsive education highlights the fundamental role that the environment plays in education, as well as acknowledging the relationship that people share with the environment (cf 2.1; 2.2.4). This human-environment interaction alludes to Ingold’s concept of attention as habit, when he contends that the process of living includes interacting with and simultaneously being impacted by one's surroundings (cf 2.3). Ingold also draws our attention to the fact that the environment in which teaching and learning occurs, needs to be recognised for its importance (cf 1.2). Therefore, one may contend that education is linked to the places where learning takes place, and it is through attention that we are able to recognise this link (cf 1.2).

Furthermore, the environment may be understood as a non-human feature, while being place-responsive means acknowledging the non-human, and the meanings and relationships which stem from the ongoing interchange between individuals and place (cf 2.5.1). It also refers to acknowledging that place has implications and meaning, so the non-human element, including the land itself, is important because there are always human and non-human factors at play at any given time (cf 2.2.1). Arguably, this alludes to place-based and place-responsive pedagogies, which emphasise the relationship between people and the environment, or the non-human factors, and the fact that education should have a direct influence on the wellbeing of people and the places that they inhabit (cf 1.2). Therefore, it is aptly befitting that the Constitution (1996) and accompanying policy documents acknowledge the environment and its overall importance.

From the above exposition of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), it could be argued that the Constitution (1996) acknowledges the fundamental role of place and places in education (cf 4.2.1). The Constitution (1996) also recognises the relationship which

exists between place and people, that is between the human and the non-human. Furthermore, Ingold (2017) shares the sentiments of the Constitution when he refers to the principle of habit, which comprises the process of influencing and simultaneously being influenced by the environment (cf 4.2.1.1). In this way education and attention are linked, where teaching and learning takes place within a particular environment (place) during which we affect and are also affected by place (cf 4.2.1.1).

An analysis of the White Paper 1 on Education and Training (1995) follows in the next section. A discussion which will be foregrounded by the need to develop place-attentive education and the need for equality to achieve decoloniality. This will then be related to education and the education system.

4.2.1.2 White Paper 1 on Education and Training (1995)

The White Paper 1 on Education and Training (1995), (White Paper 1, 1995), was a natural progression in reconstructing and developing an education system which would encompass true democratic values. The White Paper 1 is focused on the progression of transformation in education and training, so that the education system would be geared to serve all people, and not just some. This transformation and redirection of the education system were aimed at aligning with the Constitution, as the Constitution is the primary law of the country and all accompanying legislation must adhere to the laws and regulations as outlined therein (cf 4.2.1). The fundamental rights and guiding principles that are set out in the Constitution (1996) articulate a moral view of people which seeks to influence and guide policy and law-making in education (Chapter 3, s. 3). Therefore, any undertakings in teaching and learning must draw inspiration, not only from the Constitution (1996), but any accompanying documents and policies as well. The White Paper 1 (1995) is aimed at schools, colleges, technikons, and universities where education and training take place, as these institutions bear the direct responsibility for the process of teaching and learning (White Paper 1, 1995).

White Paper 1 (1995) outlines the Ministry of Education's initial steps in the formulation of policies, it defines the new priorities, values and principles for the education and training system, and focuses on how the new Constitution will affect the educational system (Chapter 1, s. 1). Some of these values, which are fundamental, include the following:

- basic human rights: the state has an obligation to protect and advance these rights, so that all citizens, irrespective of race, class, gender, creed or age, have the

opportunity to develop their capacities and potential, and to make their full contribution to society (Chapter 1, s. 2).

- the parents' right to choose the language and the cultural or religious basis of a child's education (Chapter 1, s.3).
- the state has an obligation to provide advice and counselling on education services by all practicable means, and render or support appropriate care and educational services for parents, especially mothers and young children within the community (Chapter 1, s.4).
- to enable all individuals to value, have access to, and succeed in lifelong education and training of good quality. In achieving this goal, there must be special emphasis on the redress of educational inequalities among those sections of our people who have suffered particular disadvantages, (Chapter 1, s.5; 6).

The above values essentially speak to what education and the education system should achieve. For example, a classroom which practices decoloniality (cf 3.1, 3.2.3) provides quality education for all learners regardless of their race or class. Thus, the teaching and learning is not presented in a way that suppresses anyone's culture, language, or religion. Additionally, the reference to the state being under the obligation to provide care (Chapter 1, s.4) alludes to Ingold's principle of correspondence, which maintains that care presents a moral dimension to attention (cf 2.3.3). Furthermore, the over-arching goal of the policy refers to addressing and correcting the educational inequalities of the past. The comprehensive restructuring of the national educational system and the demolition of the previous educational system were occurring concurrently with the development of the policy (Chapter 1, s. 4). The fact that there was a need for a complete overhaul of the education system reiterates the pervasive need for decoloniality within the education system.

The White Paper 1 (1995) is closely linked to the Constitution, which provides the historical link between a society that was deeply divided and characterised by conflict, strife and injustice, and a future built on the respect for human rights, democracy, and opportunity for development for all South Africans, regardless of colour, ethnicity, class, and beliefs (Chapter 3, s. 4). Additionally, the adoption of the Constitution created a solid platform for South Africa's people to move past the conflicts and divides of the past (Chapter 3, s. 4). Furthermore, the White Paper 1 refers to how appropriate education and training can enable people to be active participants in all facets of a democratic society, including economic activity and cultural expression (Chapter 3, s. 2). In addressing the educational legacy of the

past, the White Paper highlights the strides that South Africa has made in terms of education and schooling post 1994, particularly on the African continent. (Chapter 3, s. 7).

Moreover, the White Paper 1 (1996) is also concerned with language, since language is mentioned a number of times in this education-related document. The right to education is expressed as follows: "Every person shall have the right (a) to basic education and to equal access to educational institutions (b) to instruction in the language of his or her choice where this is reasonably practicable (c) to establish, where practicable, educational institutions based on a common culture, language or religion, provided that there shall be no discrimination on the ground of race" (Chapter 7, s. 9). The White Paper 1 (1996) specifies the following rights in relation to language:

- The right to instruction in the language of choice.
- The right to establish educational institutions based on a common culture, language or religion.
- The diversity of language and culture is acknowledged and protected, and conditions for their promotion shall be encouraged.

These provisions do not in themselves define a policy on language in education, but they provide entrenched language and cultural rights, and state explicit language policy principles which bind the national and provincial governments. Furthermore, the language stipulation in this policy mentions that learners have the right to be instructed in the language of their choice, where this is reasonably practicable (Chapter 7, s 27; 29; 36; 37; 39).

The White Paper 1 (1996) therefore acknowledges language and its role in education, or what the envisioned role of language should be in education.

The development and implementation of policy documents seek to address the inequalities which still exist within the education system. Hence, this researcher argues for the development of place-attentive education, which is conceptualised and examined in terms of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (CAPS, 2011) (Grades 10-12). The White Paper highlights the need for good quality education for all members of society (Chapter 4, s. 6). This need alludes to the necessity of redressing education inequalities which only affected specific classes and categories of people, who had been disadvantaged (Chapter 4, s. 7). Additionally, redress cannot be achieved without the active encouragement of mutual respect for the diverse cultural, religious and other

differences that exist between people (Chapter 4, s. 14). The White Paper also reiterates the fundamental role that equality, justice, liberty, and democracy plays in education and lifelong learning (Chapter 4, s. 13). The values that underpin democracy and the charter of fundamental rights must be promoted by the educational system to combat the legacy of violence (Chapter 4, s. 16). In addition to equality, liberty and equity, environmental preservation is outlined as a pertinent value. Environmental education, which involves an active and integrated approach to learning, must be incorporated in all programs and at all levels of the education and training system (Chapter 4, s. 20).

From the above exposition, the Constitution (1996) and White Paper 1 (1995) refer to language although they are not explicit in terms of the teaching of English as a subject within the school curriculum. The Constitution (1996) refers to the preservation and promotion of indigenous languages, which indicates a recognition of how language has historically been utilised to promote coloniality (cf 3.2.2).

4.3 POLICY ANALYSIS

To respond to the main research question of the study, namely "*What is the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality?*", it was essential to engage in a context and content analysis (Taylor et al 1997, Samuels, 2017) of the CAPS (2011). The CAPS (2011) is an official policy document which outlines the policy relating to the content and assessment of the curriculum that is taught in all school-based subjects across each grade within the South African education system (RSA DBE, 2011). Every school subject has a dedicated CAPS (2011) policy document, which is specific to that subject and details how teaching and learning should take place (RSA DBE 2011).

Policy analysis can be understood in terms of two strands, namely analysis *for* policy and analysis *of* policy (cf 1.5). For the purpose of this study, I engage in an analysis of policy content, which is concerned with the development of a specific policy, often in relation to other policies which were established earlier. It further focuses on the values and ideologies which are at stake in the policy content (Simons et al, 2009). This approach to policy analysis also considers the impact that policy has on specific groups and on a specified problem with regard to social concerns. Additionally, I also undertake a context and content analysis of the policy (cf 4.1). A context analysis aims to determine the potential causes and influences behind the creation of a particular policy, while a content analysis involves outlining the policy's core goals, objectives, and purpose (cf 4.1).

The study will also focus on the intertextuality of the policy documents in relation to the CAPS (2011) by referring to the Constitution (1996) and White Paper1 (1995) as discussed in the documents analysis section (cf 4.2.1). Intertextuality refers to the connections that a policy shares with other policies and official documents, that may have had a substantial influence on the creation of the policy (4.2.1). I will undertake an analysis of policy content to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

4.3.1 Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (2011)

4.3.1.1 Context analysis

Taylor et al (1997) state that context analysis of policy seeks to determine what factors and pressures may have led to the development of a specific policy. This study therefore undertakes a context analysis of the CAPS (2011), by referring to socio-economic and historical factors that contributed to the development of CAPS (2011). The CAPS (2011) recognises the historical impact of coloniality and/or apartheid on the education system, which inevitably triggered the need for the development and implementation of new and improved legislation and policies (cf 2.2.1; 3.2.2; 3.2.4). I contend that the historical and socio-economic factors of the country are interconnected.

The socio-economic and political circumstances which led to the formulation of the CAPS (2011) and other education-related documents such as the White Paper 1 on education and training (1995) (cf 4.2.1.2), include the colonial or pre-apartheid era and the apartheid era in South Africa. Consequently, the CAPS (2011) recognises the fact that the education system, previously only designed for the benefit of the dominant class and power structures, was in dire need of an overhaul (cf 3.2.2). The CAPS (2011) was developed with the intent of achieving a curriculum built on values and principles (Chapter 1, s. 1.3), which could align with the Constitution (1996). As stated in the CAPS (2011), “our national curriculum is the culmination of our efforts over a period of seventeen years to transform the curriculum bequeathed to us by apartheid. From the start of democracy, we have built our curriculum on the values that inspired our Constitution” (1996) (RSA DBE, 2011: Foreword by The Minister).

The focus of the following section is content analyses.

4.3.1.2 Content analysis

The study refers to Taylor et al (1997) and Samuel (2017) in analysing texts which focus on the policy aims and objectives, underlying values, and directives for its implementation. The discussion on the CAPS commences by describing the general aims of the South African curriculum. This is appropriate, as the specific subject-related content can only find its relevance within the South African curriculum as a whole. Since the focus of this study is

the English Home Language CAPS (2011), the specific aims of learning languages are also considered. The study will also establish some background as it pertains to learning languages from the perspective of the CAPS (2011).

Language is an instrument for communication and thought, and it is also a cultural and aesthetic tool that is widely used by people to improve their understanding of the world they inhabit (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.1). Language expresses and constructs cultural diversity and social ties, and it also allows for the modification, expansion, and improvement of such structures. Furthermore, language learning in Grades 10-12 is inclusive of all the official languages in South Africa, and there are various language levels at which these languages can be taught (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.1). Therefore, the labels Home Language (HL) and First Additional Language (FAL) refer to the proficiency levels at which the language is offered. Any reference any reference to "home language" in this policy should be interpreted as referring to the level of teaching and learning, rather than the language itself (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.1). Furthermore, languages may enable access to and the management of information within different contexts. Language is also used as a means of creative and critical thinking, and for the expression of opinions on ethical issues and values, and for the engagement with a variety of texts for different purposes including critique, enjoyment, and research (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.2).

Below are the general aims and objectives outlined in the CAPS (2011):

- “The *National Curriculum Statement Grades R-12* gives expression to the knowledge, skills and values worth learning in South African schools. This curriculum aims to ensure that children acquire and apply knowledge and skills in ways that are meaningful to their own lives. In this regard, the curriculum promotes knowledge in local contexts, while being sensitive to global imperatives”.
- “The National Curriculum Statement Grades R-12 serves the purposes of equipping learners, irrespective of their socio-economic background, race, gender, physical ability or intellectual ability, with the knowledge, skills and values” (RSA DBE, 2011: s, 1.3).

The CAPS (2011) aim for the promotion of knowledge in a way that is cognisant of the specific context within which it exists, as well as being non-discriminatory in terms of who has access to the said knowledge (RSA DBE, 2011: s, 1.3). The context that is referred to here, highlights the fundamental role of place in not only policy formulation but the

implementation of policy as well (cf 2.2.3; 2.2.4). Thus, place plays an essential role in teaching and learning, and specifically in the teaching of English HL level (cf 2.2.2; 2.2.3). In line with this, place-based pedagogies form an essential part of teaching and learning (cf 2.2.2; 2.2.3).

Additionally, the CAPS (2011) outline the principles which inform the policy, and these are outlined below (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 1.3).:

- Social transformation: ensuring that the educational imbalances of the past are redressed, and that equal educational opportunities are provided for all sections of the population.
- Active and critical learning: encouraging an active and critical approach to learning.
- Human rights, inclusivity, environmental and social justice: infusing the principles and practices of social and environmental justice and human rights as designated in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa ensured.
- The National Curriculum Statement Grades R-12 is sensitive to issues of diversity such as poverty, inequality, race, gender, language, age, disability, and other factors.
- Valuing indigenous knowledge systems: acknowledging the rich history and heritage of this country as important contributors to nurturing the values contained ensured (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 1.3).

Social transformation as outlined above, is an aim that is outlined in the CAPS, an aim through which the redress of the educational imbalances of the past and the provision of equal educational opportunities for all members of the population can be ensured (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 1.3). Social transformation is infused with the principles of social and environmental justice, human rights, and ensured equality (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 1.3). Additionally, showing responsibility towards the environment is one of the critical objectives of this policy document (RSA DBE, 2011: s, 1.3). The CAPS (2011) also aim to acknowledge the rich heritage of South Africa and its citizens, and by doing so shows value for indigenous knowledge systems (cf 2.2.4, 3.2.1, 3.2.2, 3.2.3) (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 1.3). Therefore, the CAPS (2011) recognise previously marginalised knowledge forms and aims to counter this. In this way, the CAPS (2011) therefore make a case for decoloniality (cf 3.2.1).

In the following section, I will address the policy directives, which according to Taylor et al. (1997) and Samuels (2017), involve the stakeholders in the teaching and learning process,

and their respective roles. Regarding policy and education-related documents, educators are essentially responsible for promoting the aims and objectives of the respective documents (Taylor et al, 1997; Samuels, 2017). This manifests itself in different ways based on the specific teaching and learning process, and the respective policy directive will be articulated accordingly under the relevant language skills.

The English HL CAPS (2011) indicates that the Home Language level provides for language proficiency that reflects the mastery of basic interpersonal communication skills required in social situations, and the cognitive academic skills essential for learning across the curriculum. Arguably, the interpersonal skills, which are referred to here, infer the ability to have and maintain relationships with others. This relationship with others may thus be understood as the relationship that people share with their surroundings (cf 4.2.1.1). Therefore, the relationship between people and non-human elements, including place, forms part of the CAPS (2011), in terms of the provisions made for language proficiency. Below, I refer to the specific language aims which are outlined in the CAPS (2011) (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.2).

Learning a language should enable learners to:
• use language appropriately, considering audience, purpose. and context
• express and justify, orally and in writing, their own ideas, views and emotions confidently, in order to become independent and analytical thinkers
• use language and their imagination to find out more about themselves and the world around them. This will enable them to express their experiences and findings about the world, both orally and in writing.
• use language to access and manage information for learning across the curriculum and in a wide range of other contexts.
• use language as a means for critical and creative thinking; for expressing their opinions on ethical issues and values; for interacting critically with a wide range of texts; for challenging the perspectives, values and power relations embedded in texts; and for reading texts for various purposes, such as enjoyment, research, and critique (RSA DBE. 2011: s. 2.2).

The HL level provides learners with a literary, aesthetic, and imaginative ability that will afford them the ability to recreate, imagine, and empower their understanding of the world in which they live. Arguably therefore, the world that learners live in may be understood as their experiences, and experiences find their bearing within Ingold's principle of habit (cf 2.3.1.).

This principle posits that our current experiences are influenced by past experiences, and our current experiences simultaneously affect any future experiences (cf 2.3.1). Moreover, when we engage with places and people within these places, we utilise language which encompasses culture. In this way, places are understood as hubs of experiences which hold our language and culture (cf 2.4.1). Furthermore, language teaching is achieved through three main skills: listening and speaking; reading and viewing and writing and presenting. This will be expanded on in the section below. The intended beneficiaries of each language skill are the learners.

4.3.1.3 Listening and speaking

Through the efficient use of listening and speaking strategies, learners are able to construct knowledge, collect and synthesise information, express ideas and opinions, and solve problems (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.4). With the use of critical listening techniques, students can identify the attitudes and values that are ingrained in texts, and confront prejudiced and manipulative language (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.4). Arguably, critical listening techniques could help facilitate decoloniality, since knowledge and knowledge forms can be used to perpetuate colonisation (cf 2.2.4; 3.2.1). For instance, the coloniality of knowledge considers the politics of knowledge generation, and also how other knowledge forms have been marginalised (cf 2.2.4).

The CAPS (2011) refer to a listening process which comprises of several elements, including pre-listening and post-listening (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Pre-listening involves making mental connections, finding meaning, and analysing the speaker's reasoning and emotional appeals. Post-listening involves analysing and critically evaluating what learners have heard (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Similarly, Ingold's principle of volition refers to making mental associations as a form of attention and meaning-making (cf 2.3.2; 2.4.1). In this way, listening for critical information, as a skill within the CAPS (2011), can be understood as a form of attention.

Moreover, the CAPS (2011) refer to different kinds of listening, including listening for specific information, listening for critical analysis and evaluation, and listening for appreciation and interaction. Here, the specific context must be considered, and information is processed through filing in gaps, interpreting meaning, and transferring information (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Equally, place-based pedagogies highlight the significance of the context in education (cf 2.2.2). The importance of context is further reiterated in the concept of

grounded relationality (cf 3.2.1). Grounded relationality posits that relational processes of knowledge take place at a particular time and place, in a particular relational context. Making mental connections (cf 3.2.1) and finding meaning allude to Cresswell's contention that places cannot exist without meaning, since at its very basic level, place can be defined as spaces that people have attached meaning to (cf 2.2). Likewise, Ingold's principle of habit (cf 2.3.1; 3.2.3.1) and the concept of grounded normativity (cf 3.2.1; 3.2.3) refer to how we derive meaning from past and present experiences (cf 3.2.3.1), and how we move in the world being framed through the search for meaning (i.e, through meta-ethical enquiries) (cf 3.2.1; 3.2.3.1). Ingold's principle of volition is also premised by finding value in everyday experiences and meaning-making (cf 2.3.2; 3.2.3.2). Listening for critical analysis and evaluation comprises identifying and interpreting emotive, persuasive, and manipulative language, stereotyping, bias, and prejudice, while listening for appreciation and interaction highlights the relationship between language and culture by displaying a sense of respect for cultural conventions (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Thus, in the same way that language can be used as a display of respect for culture, it can also be used to reinforce colonisation, specifically the colonisation of knowledge (cf 1.1; 1.4; 2.2.4; 3.2.2) through categories of thought and languages. By implication, listening can therefore be understood as a characteristic of attention, because as Weil (2012) posits, attention is characterised by concentration which makes itself visible through activities such as listening (cf 2.3).

Furthermore, the process of listening is outlined in the CAPS (2011) as a three-phased exercise, which stimulates autonomous listening techniques for comprehending and decoding speech as well as other audio formats (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). For instance, before listening to a recorded explanation, learners must complete a pre-listening exercise that highlights the importance of focused listening and supports the formation of connections with their own experiences (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Once more, the forming of connections in relation to one's own experiences, may be understood as referring to Ingold's principle of volition (cf 4.3.1.2). Engaging in listening exercises aids in learners' memory retention and message analysis. In post-listening, students may be asked to respond in a discussion to what they have heard.

The opportunity to teach students how to listen is provided by listening comprehension exercises and assessments (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). The CAPS (2011) outlines three categories of listening and specifies what each category entails. Pre-listening is focused on setting the context, eliciting interest, anticipating content, utilizing past knowledge, building

prior knowledge, examining listening standards, and goal determination. During the listening, learners are expected to examine the speaker's argument, supporting details, and emotive appeals in order to evaluate their message. Listeners should create connections in their minds, look for meaning, pose questions, draw conclusions, and validate hypotheses (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1).

Post-listening involves learners asking questions and engaging about the contents of the speaker's presentation; orally summarising the presentation and reviewing notes; critically analysing and evaluating what they have heard, which involves reflecting on the presentation, and participating in activities that develop and refine the newly acquired concepts. What stands out in listening is context, meaning making and reflection.

Listening for specific information requires the following (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1):

- Give complete attention to listening task and demonstrate interest,
- Search for meaning, and
- Check understanding of message by making connections, making and confirming predictions, making inferences, evaluating, and reflecting.

Any thoughtful reaction to the environment we live in still depends on our ability to listen, not just hear. In a world where technology has produced an infinite number of voices, sounds, music, and talking, it is essential to learn to listen only to potentially significant or helpful information (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Students in grades 10-12 will be familiar with most of the activities listed below, which occur in the various stages of the listening process mentioned above. Teachers are therefore tasked with only working with those processes that they believe their class still needs (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). This is therefore a directive of the teaching of speaking as specified by (Samules, 2017; Taylor et al, 1997), this refers to the role that the educator plays or will play in the task of teaching. The role of the educator in this regard is identifying learners' needs and identifying where learners may still be lacking. Prior to listening, background knowledge must be activated, and this this involves gaining an understanding of the context (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). In achieving the latter, CAPS (2011) indicates that it is important to consider the context, recognising, interpreting and evaluating messages, verifying the message by drawing connections, forming and verifying predictions, drawing conclusions, evaluating, and reflecting, and take meaningful notes that include summarising, mapping, organising, retelling, paraphrasing, and explaining (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1).

Listening for critical analysis and evaluation involves recognising and interpreting manipulative, persuasive, and emotive language as well as bias, prejudice, and stereotyping (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). As outlined in the CAPS, this can be achieved by:

- Making judgments and providing evidence.
- Making assumptions and predicting consequences.
- Responding to language use, word choice, format, and pronunciation.
- Distinguishing between facts and opinions.
- Showing awareness of and interpreting tone, pace, and language use.

The procedures outlined above could be beneficial when analysing political documents, advertisements, and literary texts (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Thus, listening for critical analysis (cf 1.5.1; 2.2.3; 4.3.1.3) can be a tool for decoloniality, where learners are encouraged to interrogate the teaching material which they are exposed to (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Teachers typically give students the chance to discuss what they have heard during a listening exercise, but it can also be beneficial to convert these activities into writing assignments (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). For example, a teacher can start a narrative composition with a brief clip from a movie soundtrack by asking, "What do you hear? Explain it". A piece of writing can benefit from the appropriate use of several "emotive" words taken from a speech or from the reading of a poem (RSA DBE. 2011: s. 3.1). Learners can be encouraged to use the words to make a statement that contradicts what was said in the speech or use them in poetry to demonstrate how they understood the words (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). When emotive language is used it may elicit a sense of place (cf 2.2; 4.4), which is the meaning that people attach to a specific place, in other words the emotional bond that people attach to place (cf 2.2, 4.5). Therefore, when learners are engaged in activities which require listening for critical analysis, they are simultaneously engaged in the process of meaning-making and, by implication, are engaging in the process of attention through enacting the principle of volition (cf 2.3.2; 2.4.1; 3.2.3).

The best time to practice these listening exercises are during debates, discussions in small groups, and other organised conversations. The following traits can be aided by for example watching movie trailers (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1):

- respond in communication situations,

- show that you understand the relationship between language and culture by respecting cultural customs, and
- respond to the aesthetic aspects of oral text, such as gestures, eye contact, and body language, e.g. the text is accompanied by rhythm, pace, sound effects, imagery, and gestures (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1).

The CAPS (2011) also refer to speaking (cf 4.3.1.2) as a language skill. The following procedures and communication techniques should be included in the teaching of speaking: planning, researching and organising, where learners must display competencies in research skills, organising skills, and planning for oral presentations (RSA DBE 2011: s. 3.1) by doing the following:

- utilising appropriate language, and
- expressing and revealing their values and attitudes, biases, stereotypes, emotive, persuasive, and manipulative language.

A further communication technique that the teaching of speaking encompasses, is practicing and presenting, where learners must be able to demonstrate and practice oral presentation skills (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1), such as:

- using organisational structures such as chronological, topical, cause-effect, compare-contrast, and problem solution to inform and to persuade,
- presenting and advancing a clear argument and choosing appropriate types of proof, and
- using verbal and non-verbal techniques (e.g. tone, voice projection/modulation, volume, pace/tempo, phrasing, eye contact, facial expressions, gestures, and body language) for presentations (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1).

Some of the features and conventions of oral communication texts include prepared speech, unprepared speech, interviews, introducing a speaker, offering a vote of thanks, panel discussions, informal discussions/conversations, and debating. By the time learners reach the point where they are able to engage in the speaking process in their education, they would have successfully acquired one of the most important skills for their personal and professional lives, which is the ability to speak clearly, fluently and easily. Learners must be guaranteed of the teachers' unwavering support and encouragement at all times. Prior to this stage, learners were taught the majority of the fundamental strategies for delivering an

effective speech. Educators are therefore only required to impart the necessary knowledge to a class (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). The manner in which this language skill can be tested in a way that incorporates place-based pedagogies (cf 2.2.2) and/or the promotion of decoloniality (cf 3.2.1) is through the topics which the educator introduces into the classroom. One example could be introducing a debate on or panel discussions about the impact of the apartheid era on teaching and learning versus after apartheid came to an end. Other examples could include why some learners are fluent in a specific language such as English, for example, while others are not. And is fluency in English necessarily even a sign of intelligence? There are endless topics which the educator could introduce to assess the learners' speaking as a language skill.

4.3.1.4 Reading and viewing

"Learners acknowledge how genre and register reflect the purpose, audience, and context of texts. The understanding and interpretation of written and visual material are determined by the learners' knowledge of language structures, conventions, and their own life experiences" (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.4). Similar to the above-mentioned listening process, the reading process also involves pre-reading and post-reading (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Pre-reading helps learners to establish associations with their own experience, while post-reading enables learners to respond to texts. This assists them in developing critical language awareness through providing the socio-political and cultural background of authors and texts, the effect of the text on meaning-making, and the relationships between language and power, emotive and manipulative language, bias, prejudice and discrimination and stereotyping (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Places are hubs of experiences which hold our identity and culture (cf 2.4.1). Thus, by establishing associations with their own experiences, pre-reading enables learners to incorporate their cultures into the act of reading, and consequently the process of learning. Moreover, learners inadvertently engage with place, since the principles of habit and volition converge when they both make mention of meaning and meaning-making in the strive towards decoloniality (cf 2.2.1, 3.2.3). Furthermore, pre-reading exposes students to the material, which may trigger associations and prior knowledge. (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Pre-reading may include scanning and skimming text features such as headings, subheadings, titles, captions, visual elements, and graphic information; making predictions based on information gleaned from skimming and scanning; and addressing any essential vocabulary that students might not be familiar with (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Reading entails understanding the text and analysing its linguistic elements

carefully by applying word attack techniques and contextual cues to deduce the meaning of unknown words and images (RSA DBE 2011: s. 3.2). Making connections, monitoring comprehension, modifying reading speed to text difficulty, going back and reviewing where needed, scanning the text ahead of time for potentially helpful information, and asking and responding to questions are some strategies for improving comprehension (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2).

Arguably, by implication, reading may enable decoloniality through the critical aspect of acknowledging learner's own experiences, acknowledging the political and socio-economic influence of texts, and the acknowledgment of the relationship between language and power. Once education policies were developed after the apartheid era, the linguistic diversity of the population was not adequately considered (cf 3.2.2). Moreover, the manner in which language was used to facilitate a certain power dynamic cannot be ignored as, historically, language was used to reinforce coloniality (cf 3.2.2; 3.2.3). Similarly, language can be used to promote decoloniality, through acknowledging the political and socio-economic influences on the material which is taught in class.

Post-reading enables learners to view and respond to the text as a whole by responding to questions ranging from basic to advance in the text; contrasting; synthesising; assessing, deriving conclusions, and voicing one's own opinion (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). This allows learners to copy the style in their own work when appropriate, and developing critical language awareness by considering the direct and implied meaning, and the socio-political and cultural background of texts and authors (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Learners will know to be aware of omissions and selections, and their impact on meaning, relationships between language and power and emotive and manipulative language, bias, prejudice, discrimination, stereotyping, language varieties, inferences, assumptions, arguments, and purpose of including or excluding information (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Therefore, post-reading proves to be essential for place-attentive education and decoloniality as a whole. Through engaging in the process of deciphering the meaning assigned within a specific text or teaching process, the teacher and/or learner is engaged in the process of attention, visible through Ingold's principles of habit and volition (cf 2.3.1; 2.3.2). This places the focus on one's own experiences and the relationship which exists between the human and the non-human (cf 2.3.1; 2.3.2), These principles also refer to meaning-making, and are linked to the concepts of grounded normativity (cf 3.2.1) and grounded relationality (cf 3.2.1). Grounded normativity prompts us to look at the meaning behind objects or non-living

features of the world (cf 3.2.1), while grounded relationality is based on the idea that it is critical to comprehend the meaning and value of places (cf 3.21). Thus, through Ingold's principles of attention (cf 2.3) and the decolonial concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality (cf 3.2.1), the language skills of reading and viewing may be tools for the promotion of decoloniality.

4.3.1.4 Writing and presenting

Writing and presenting enable learners to formulate and express their ideas and concepts in a coherent manner. The regular practicing of writing in a range of settings, assignments, and topic areas helps students to communicate both creatively and functionally (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 2.4). While the majority of literary texts serve as sources of enjoyment, entertainment, or revelation, serious writers create plays, novels, and poems because they have ideas and ideologies, principles, and beliefs that they want to reveal to and share with their prospective readers (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Their imaginative language use is an additional means by which they highlight, reveal, and reinforce their ideas (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.2). Therefore, the texts may be utilised in a manner that enables learners to formulate ideas about issues which relate to decoloniality. Since coloniality is premised on the suppression of ideas and beliefs (cf 3.2.2), this researcher contends that it is when learners utilise the skills of writing and presenting that they may be enabled to verbalise their ideas and perceptions, which will in turn promote decoloniality.

The following three components are combined in writing and presenting: using the writing process; studying and applying the features and structure of various text types; and studying and applying the punctuation and paragraph and sentence structures (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3).

Working through the writing process is typically a part of the act of teaching writing, although not every stage of the procedure will be applied every time (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3). For instance, learners won't need to analyse the structure and linguistic elements of a text in as much detail if they are producing a text type with which they are familiar (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3). Additionally, there might be times when students compose texts without drafting them in order to prepare for an exam, or when teachers need to concentrate on sentence structure or paragraph composition (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3). The writing process involves planning or pre-writing, drafting, revising, editing, proofreading, and presenting. It is in the

writing process that educators have the autonomy to facilitate decoloniality through the structure and type of texts. For example, for essays, educators are tasked with choosing topics for the writing process. Educators can thus choose topics which advocate for decoloniality (cf 3.2.1), or topics that speak against the marginalisation of indigenous knowledge (cf 2.2.4, 3.2.1). The language conventions and structures during the writing process involve register, style and voice, word choice, sentence construction, paragraph writing, and punctuation and spelling (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3). Furthermore, text types and their formats and features must also be considered. The main type of writing is essays, which can be further subdivided into narrative essays, descriptive essays, argumentative or reflective essays, and literary essays (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3). Reflective essays present the writer's personal views, ideas, thoughts, and feelings on a particular topic, usually something they feel strongly about (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3). As such, learners may be tasked to write a reflective essay on a topic that facilitates critical thinking around issues of coloniality and schooling in post-apartheid South Africa, for example. Other types of writing include transactional texts such as letters and, meeting agendas and minutes, texts which are prepared for the purpose of speech, dialogue and interviews, formal or informal reports, reviews, and newspaper articles (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.3).

From the above, it could be argued that CAPS (2011), through the abovementioned language skills including listening and speaking (cf 4.3.1.3), reading, and viewing (cf 4.3.1.4), and writing and presenting (cf 4.3.1.4), can facilitate place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

4.4 FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS

To assist with the analysis of this study, I considered place, place-based education, attention and decoloniality through a conceptualisation with specific reference to education. This framework for analysis seeks to address the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. In addition to the framework for analysis, I employed a policy analysis of the CAPS and a document analysis of the White Paper 1 (1995) and the South African Constitution (1996). I considered place, and evaluated how places can be tools for decoloniality (cf 2.2.1; 3.2.2). Through this, I sought to clarify how CAPS and other places and spaces could be sites for decoloniality, particularly through an education system that emphasises place-attentiveness. Thus, the role of place-based education was also

considered at length, as it serves as a roadmap to place-attentive education. It is through the acknowledgement of the importance of the environment and ecological conceptions of place, that we can begin to foster attention, and place-based education or environmental education within schools is an appropriate place to start (cf 2.2.2).

Additionally, I attempted to relay sense of place with meaning-making and conceptualised critical place-based education (cf 2.2.3) as a proponent for decoloniality. This concept is essential, as it speaks out against an education which ignores the role of place within education (cf 2.2.3). In conceptualising attention, I referred to Ingold's principles of habit, volition, and correspondence (cf 2.3.1; 2.3.2; 2.3.3). I further referred to the notion that the value that we get from places is dependent on how attentive we are within said places (cf 2.2.2). In essence, individuals and communities are active participants in the formulation of place-attentive education. In establishing place within the framework for analysis, sense of place and the meaning attached to place is paramount (cf 2.2; 3.2.3.2). Upon developing the conceptual framework, I identified key concepts from the literature review in Chapters 2 and 3, and identified central themes. Thereafter I sought similar themes within the policy and document analysis, followed by an exposition of the relationship between the specified themes within the different contexts. This was vital as it ensured a thorough and uniform approach to the analysis. The conceptual framework allowed me to foreground an analysis of policy and documents, which maintained the central themes within the study. In addition to conceptualising the key concepts as mentioned above, I also engaged with Taylor et al.'s (1997) and Samuel's (2017) exposition on how to analyse a policy. I also engaged in a context analysis, which is briefly referred to above, of the documents and policy, which looks at policies and documents in relation to others, as no policy or document exists in isolation (cf 4.3.1). All of this was read together with the aim of exploring the potential of the CAPS to promote place-attentive education in general, and particularly as a practice of decoloniality.

The discussion that follows comprises a brief exposition of the two themes in relation to the specified documents and policy which was analysed, namely *place-based approaches in education* and *place-attentive education as practices of decoloniality*. This will aid in better comprehension and documentation of the findings in a concise manner, and particularly in addressing the potential of the CAPS to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

Theme 1: Place-based approaches in education

This theme aligns with the first research objective of the study, namely, to explore how place-based approaches to education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention can be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education. This theme relates to issues such as place-based education and critical place-based education (cf 2.2.2; 2.2.3). Place-based education can be understood as a method of teaching in which learners' education is integrated into their surrounding environments (cf 2.2.2). Place-based education guarantees education which directly affects the well-being of the social and ecological spaces in which people live (cf 2.2.2). Critical place-based education can be understood as a reaction to policies and procedures for educational reform that disregard places (cf 2.2.3) and encompasses an education that goes beyond mere knowledge acquisition. It aims to establish connections between the individual and the community (cf 2.2.3).

Theme 2: Place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality

This theme aligns with the second research objective of the study, which is to investigate how place-attentive education can be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality. The aspects related to this theme include place-attentive education, in other words place and attention and decoloniality. In part the concept place-attentive education is concerned with the connections that people form with places, which subsequently enables us to develop and assign meaning to these specific places (cf 2.4.1). Decoloniality addresses the products of colonial capitalism, such as social class and race (cf 3.2.1). Moreover, decoloniality may be understood as a demand for a certain kind of cognitive justice, predicated on the overhaul and expansion of Western knowledge systems (cf 3.2.1).

4.5 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION: DOCUMENT ANALYSIS

In this section I discuss the findings of the analysis of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, and the White Paper 1 on Education and Training. The findings and discussion are presented according to the identified themes for each of the analysed documents (cf 4.2.1). The analysis begins by referring to the Constitution (4.2.1.1) and the intentions set out therein.

4.5.1 Findings and discussion of the South African constitution (1996)

4.5.1.1 Theme 1: Place-based approaches in education

The South African Constitution (1996) states that “everyone has the right to a basic, adult and further education, which the state must make available and accessible within reason” (cf. 4.2.1). Based on these intentions, one can deduce that the Constitution set out to address the lack of democratic values, the social injustices of the past, and the resulting consequences of these injustices on all facets of life, including education. Therefore, to achieve the ideals which are set out in the Constitution (1996), I contend that place-based education may be utilised. Place-based education is essential because it may be used as a teaching tool to address and change the political and spatial inequalities left over from the colonial and apartheid eras (cf 1.2). The Constitution further states that “to ensure the effective access to, and implementation of this right, the state must take equity and the need to redress the consequences of racially discriminatory laws and practices into account” (RSA, 1996: Chapter 2, s. 29(2)). In line with the development of the Constitution, there was and still exists a clear recognition of a need to transform the curriculum. However, even though education is clearly mandated as a fundamental right in the Constitution, it has not been implemented or rolled out in an equitable manner within the post-apartheid education system (cf 3.2.2).

Additionally, the Constitution aimed to transform and essentially overhaul the laws of the land and the situation at the time. The Constitution acknowledges the historically diminished status and use of indigenous languages and undertakes to advance and elevate the use and status of these languages (RSA, 1996: Chapter 1, s. 6(2)), an issue which is also taken up by the CAPS (2011, cf 4.3.1.2). Thus, through the teaching of English as a subject, and through assigning specific tasks and topics to learners, indigenous people be acknowledged and recognised as equal contributors to the world through non-European knowledge forms (cf 4.3.1). The recognition of the diminished status of indigenous languages inevitably alludes to the marginalised position of indigenous people in the post-colonial and post-apartheid era. Land education addresses the need for the advancement of indigenous people through their languages, amongst others (cf 2.2), as one of the strands of decoloniality (cf 2.2.3). The Constitution (1996) acknowledges place in terms of the

ecological preservation which is referenced to in the Bill of Rights (cf 4.2.1.1). Here, the Constitution (1996) states that everyone has the right to have their environment protected, and that pollution and ecological degradation must be prevented (cf 4.2.1.1). Since place-based education is concerned with the well-being of people and places, acknowledging that places need to be taken care of is seminal within place-based education (cf 2.2.2).

The Bill of Rights forms the foundation of democracy in South Africa and thus protects the rights of individuals in the country, and upholds democratic values such as freedom, equality, and human dignity (RSA, 1996: Chapter 2, s. 7(1)). Similarly, these democratic values can be viewed as characteristics of decoloniality. An education system which encourages freedom, strives for equality, and maintains human dignity, inevitably advocates for decoloniality, and can even be said to be decoloniality in practise (cf 2.2.1). The values as set out here are seminal to decoloniality, since decoloniality clearly denotes a need for equality. The entire premise of colonisation is that one group is superior and thus holds all the power, while other groups are inferior, and were subjected to marginalisation in a number of spheres (cf 3.2.2). One of the main tenets linked to decoloniality is that the Constitution is concerned equality, as it states that "everyone is equal before the law and has the right to equal protection and benefit of the law". It further mentions that "Equality includes the full and equal enjoyment of all rights and freedoms. To promote the achievement of equality, legislative measures designed to protect or advance persons, or categories of persons, disadvantaged by unfair discrimination may be taken" (RSA, 1996: Chapter 2, s. 9(1, 2)). The right to equality is a basic human right, and this right should be upheld, not only by treating individuals in a morally correct way, but also in different spheres of life, including education (cf 4.2.1.1). Thus, the Constitution (1996) outlines the right to equality. Legislation which supports the right to equality is imperative, as many organisations and institutions rely on policy documents to define their main objectives and purpose, and to guide daily operations (RSA, 1996: Chapter 2, s. 9(2 & 3)).

4.5.1.2 Theme 2: Place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality

This theme is addressed in terms of the Constitution (1996), by conceptualising place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality. Some of the fundamental values of the Constitution (1996) are such that it aims for the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights, as well as non-racialism (cf 4.2.1.1). The Constitution (1996)

therefore argues for decoloniality, since decoloniality goes hand in hand with equality and non-racial ideals (cf 3.2.1; 4.2.1.2).

Furthermore, the finding here is that the Constitution (1996) recognises the need for the preservation of the environment, and acknowledges the role that individuals play in the environment (cf 4.2.1.1). The Constitution (1996) therefore makes a case for the conservation of the environment, and also addresses the need to prevent ecological degradation (cf 4.2.1.1). I proceed by drawing a parallel between land education and the right to property, as stipulated in the Constitution. As indicated above (cf 2.2.4), the first step to addressing the legacy of colonialism is the acknowledgement of land and its indigenous inhabitants. Moreover, through land-based education, the colonial pattern of disregarding indigenous people and forcefully seizing their land will be addressed (cf 2.2.4). The Constitution states: “(2) Property may be expropriated only in terms of law of general application; for a public purpose or in the public interest” (RSA, 1996: Chapter 2, s. 25 (2)). For the purpose of this section, the public interest includes the nation’s commitment to land reform, and to reforms to bring about equitable access to land and the natural resources of the country for all (cf 4.2.1.1). The state must take reasonable legislative and other measures, within its available resources, to foster conditions which will enable citizens to gain access to land on an equitable basis (RSA, 1996: Chapter 2, s. 25 (4 & 5)). The Constitution further states: “A person or community whose tenure of land is legally insecure as a result of past racially discriminatory laws or practices is entitled, to the extent provided by an Act of Parliament, either to tenure which is legally secure or to comparable redress” (RSA, 1996: Chapter 2, s. 25 (6)). Through this section of the Constitution, it is clear to see that it recognises the role that land plays, or has played, in perpetuating a lack of equity based on different factors such race, and a lower social class. There is a need for land reform and the recognition that past discriminatory laws influenced the distribution of land and property. In this way, the Constitution reaffirms the importance of land-based and place-based education. Furthermore, the Constitution (1996) acknowledges that indigenous people's indigenous languages have historically held a diminished status (cf 4.2.1.1). In line with this, indigenous languages find their being within indigenous knowledge systems, and indigenous knowledge is fundamentally relational (cf 3.2.1). This alludes to the concept of grounded relationality, which is foregrounded within decoloniality (cf 3.2.1). In creating knowledge, indigenous knowledges prioritise the relationships between people, places, and artifacts or non-living things (cf 3.2.1). Thus, developing a relational model of knowing that

is located within indigenous knowledges will contribute to the realisation of epistemic decolonisation.

In line with one of the main rights which are outlined in the Constitution (1996), is the right to equality. Everyone is equal before the law (cf 4.2.1.1). Likewise, grounded normativity shows us how to live in a way that respects and does not exploit or dominate other people and non-human elements (cf 3.2.1). According to the general principle of grounded normativity, all beings exist equally in the world (cf 3.2.1). Additionally, the principle of grounded normativity recognises the existence of colonialism, and the ways in which it continues to shape history, nature, and ideology through the creation of knowledge systems that support Western ideals (cf 3.2.1).

The findings of the analysis of the White Paper 1 follows next, a discussion which is couched by the conceptualisation of terms such as place and attention, as well as the broader legislative framework of the Constitution.

4.5.2 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION OF THE WHITE PAPER 1 (1995)

4.5.2.1 The place-based approaches in education

The White Paper 1 aligns itself with the Constitution by stating: “Environmental education, involving an inter-disciplinary, integrated, and active approach to learning, must be a vital element of all levels and programmes of the education and training system, to create environmentally literate citizens” (Chapter 4, s. 20). An understanding of the environment and the role that it plays as a non-human factor in education, is one critical aspect for transformation. Although not explicitly referring to place, this researcher contends that the White Paper 1 (1995) does in fact refer to place, and places value on places. Since place-based pedagogies are also inferred here, the White Paper 1 (1995) thus acknowledges places and place-based pedagogies. This is a sentiment which is shared in place-based education, and relates to the environmental and ecological wellbeing of places which forms part of the process of teaching and learning (cf 2.2). Furthermore, the White Paper 1 (1995) makes a call for environmental education (cf 4.2.2). Since environmental education encourages an active and integrated approach to learning, it very clearly alludes to place-based education. Similarly, land education addresses colonisation from the indigenous

cultures' perspective, and also focuses on place-based perspectives which do not adequately address pertinent issues like the ones mentioned above (cf 2.2.4). Additionally, the White Paper 1 (1995), address language when reference is made to parents' right to choose in terms of language within schools (cf 4.2.1.2). Furthermore, attention does not directly feature in the White Paper 1 (1995), however, as the document outlines the new values and priorities, the obligation to care is mentioned (cf 4.2.1.2). This infers to Ingold's principle of correspondence, which posits that care presents a moral dimension to attention (cf 4.2.1.2). The moral dimension of attention should be prevalent in education, particularly in an education system which seeks to promote decoloniality. Thus, the White Paper 1 (1995) can be understood as reflecting attention, albeit indirectly.

4.5.2.2 Place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality

As previously mentioned, the White Paper 1 (1995) highlights the role of place, and by implication place-based pedagogies, within education (cf 4.5.2.1). Thus, in this way, the White Paper 1 (1995) acknowledges non-human factors when reference is made to the environment (cf 4.2.1.2; 4.5.2.1). It further emphasises the importance of cultural expression (cf 4.2.2), which has historically been neglected and discouraged due to the deliberate destruction of other cultures (cf 3.2.2). This is one of the defining characteristics of coloniality, a reality which perpetuated the suppression of those social classes that were deemed as inferior (cf 3.2.1; 3.2.2; 4.2.1.2). Consequently, without the active encouragement of mutual respect (cf 4.2.1.2) for diverse cultures, redress cannot be achieved (cf 4.2.2). Similarly, the Constitution maintains that 'everyone is equal before the law and has the right to equal protection and benefit of the law (cf 4.5.1). Through this right to equality, one may posit that everyone should enjoy equal expression of their cultures and languages. In this way, the Constitution and the White Paper 1 achieve alignment. The White Paper 1 (1995) further articulates that education should be accessible to everyone (cf 4.2.1.2).

4.6 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION: POLICY ANALYSIS

The focus of this section is to discuss the findings from the data obtained from the analysis of the CAPS (2011) document. The findings and discussions are presented according to the themes identified from the literature review in Chapters 2 and 3, to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to

promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. The aims are *place-based approaches in education* and *place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.*

4.6.1 Findings and discussions of the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements English Home Language (Grades 10-12) (2011)

4.6.1.1 Place-based approaches in education

The CAPS (2011) achieves alignment (cf 4.3.2.1) with the Constitution (1996), as the overall aim of the CAPS (2011) is to "heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights; improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person; lay the foundations for a democratic and open society in which government is based on the will of the people and every citizen is equally protected by law; and build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations" (RSA, DBE 2011: Foreword by The Minister).

The CAPS (2011) is for the promotion of knowledge in a way that considers the context within which the said knowledge exists. Emphasis is also placed on non-discrimination in terms of who is able to access this knowledge (cf 4.3.1). The context is paramount, and its mention within the CAPS (2011) may be inferred as alluding to the importance of place and environmental preservation, that is where teaching and learning take place, i.e, schools.

The CAPS (2011) echo the Constitution (1996) when reference is made to environmental justice, where displaying responsibility towards the environment through teaching and learning is encouraged (cf 4.3.1). An example of how place finds its relevance in language teaching is through one of the skills identified in the CAPS (2011), namely listening and speaking (cf 4.3.1), specifically within the *Features and conventions of oral communication texts,* where special mention is made of the physical environment and place (RSA DBE, 2011: s. 3.1). Since the places where the distribution and sharing of knowledge takes place are schools and institutions of learning, these places can enable decoloniality through place-attentive education. Additionally, one of the three categories of listening, namely pre-listening (cf 4.3.1.1), mentions the role of context in listening.

As stated in the CAPS (2011), this category is focused on setting the context. Pre-listening is focused on setting the context (cf 4.3.1.1) and what stands out in listening is the context, meaning-making and reflection. Listening for specific information (cf 4.3.1.1) also requires the context to be considered. This infers the important role that place plays in the activity of listening within teaching and learning in the classroom. Places shape and influence our perceptions and experiences of the world and the type of teaching that happens, and what we learn from places depends on how we respond to the said places and our level of attention (cf 2.2.2). The perceptual dimension of place, which finds its insights within Ingold's principle of habit (cf 2.4.1), considers our experience of the world and how our actions affect the environment (cf 2.3.1). The perceptual dimension aids in building a philosophy of place which responds to the non-human world (cf 2.4.1; 2.3.1). Here, a phenomenology of perception is an essential step to caring for the ecological lives of places, and understanding the interconnectedness of different places and that which exists between people and places. In line with this, the principle of habit unveils its creativity in Ingold's concept of attentionality, where the attentional mind functions in a more ecologically conscious way (cf 2.3.1). Moreover, attentionality necessitates ongoing awareness of one's surrounding environment, and requires one to form part of and assimilate into the environment and all of its elements (cf 2.3.1),

In addition to context, language also plays a fundamental role in redressing the imbalances of the past (cf 3.2.2; 4.2.1.2). The failure to adequately consider populations' linguistic diversity in legacy apartheid schools had a negative impact on the ability of schools to address the injustices and inequalities of apartheid (cf 3.2.1.2). This led to a lack of equal access to education and schooling, even though the Constitution and accompanying legislation such as the White Paper 1 and the CAPS clearly called for equity in access to education (cf 4.2.1). This is an essential aspect which is outlined in the Constitution (1996), which states that everyone has the right to education regardless of race, language of origin, or social class (cf 4.2.1.1; 4.5.1.1) Thus, the CAPS is premised on this right, and it details how schools should approach the implementation of this right in an equal and just manner, in order to redress and transform the education system (cf 4.3.1). Consequently, the CAPS (2011) is focused on ensuring the promotion of knowledge, and, importantly, not discriminating with regards to who has access to said knowledge. Consequently, I provide a proposition on the knowledge forms that should be promoted in schools, and makes a case for place-based pedagogies such as critical place-based education and land education, pedagogies which can be read together to develop place-attentive education.

Language can be used to perpetuate prejudice and discrimination (cf 4.3.1), where, in addition to enforcing colonial domination through the colonisation of knowledge, the colonisation of categories of thoughts and languages is a factor (cf 3.2.4). This is further emphasised when reference is made to the role that language plays in granting people access to certain information. Language can essentially be used to restrict access to valuable knowledge forms (4.3.1). However, the focus of this researcher in terms of language relates to English as a subject of teaching and learning and its accompanying legislative framework namely, the Constitution (1996) (cf 4.2.1.1), the White Paper 1 (1995) (cf 4.2.1.2), and the CAPS (2011) (cf 4.3.1), as opposed to the English language. Thus, we cannot ignore the role that language plays in the practise of decoloniality. That is why this researcher undertook an analysis of the English Home Language CAPS (2011) document, as it enabled an informed basis from which to conceptualise place-attentive education in relation to the present-day teaching and learning processes in South African schools.

4.6.1.2 Place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality

The CAPS (2011) was partially developed in response to the inequality which existed in the education systems of the colonial and/or apartheid eras (cf 4.3.1.1). This researcher therefore contends that the CAPS (2011) can be a facilitator of decoloniality, and further contends that decoloniality can be practiced through place-attentive education.

Furthermore, one of the guiding principles of the CAPS (2011), which relate directly to the need for decoloniality in education, is the principle of social transformation (cf 4.3.1.2). This involves equal access to educational opportunities in order to ensure that the imbalances of the past are addressed (cf 4.3.1.2). The CAPS (2011) also acknowledge the marginalised status of indigenous knowledges, and therefore emphasises that these indigenous knowledge forms should be valued (cf 4.3.1.2). Moreover, writing and presenting can act as promoters of decoloniality through the specific writing activities and topics which are assigned (cf 4.3.1.4). For instance, learners may be instructed to write about their cultures, and by engaging with their cultural conventions, and subsequently writing about and presenting on them, a case is made for decoloniality. This is achieved through the suppression of the marginalisation of indigenous knowledges. So in writing about non-European knowledge forms, they cease to be marginalized, which promotes decoloniality.

In addition, the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality are premised in the concept of decoloniality (cf 3.2.1). We are prompted by grounded normativity to consider the significance and meaning of non-living beings and aspects of the environment (cf 3.2.1; 4.3.1.4). Grounded normativity encourages us to be deeply non-authoritarian, nondominant, and nonexploitive in our interactions with other people and non-human living forms (cf 3.2.1). Therefore, the manner of engaging with people and the non-human that is encouraged in grounded normativity, mirrors the tenets of decoloniality (cf 3.2.2; 3.2.3). Since coloniality is premised on dominant, authoritarian and exploitative power structures (2.2.4), the concept of grounded normativity makes a case for decoloniality in practice. Similarly, the concept of grounded relationality is based on the idea that it is critical to comprehend the significance and value of places (cf 3.2.1). Grounded relationality seeks to intentionally address the nature and value of relationships to and with land, in order to de-link from coloniality (cf 3.2.1). Creating a relational model of knowing rooted in indigenous knowledges will help to bring about epistemic decolonisation (cf 3.2.1).

4.7 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

In this chapter, I explored the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. To achieve this, I undertook a document and policy analysis of the documents and policy from which the South African education system draws its inspiration (cf 4.2.1; 4.2.2; 4.3.1).

The Constitution of South Africa and The White Paper 1 on Education and Training provide a lens through which the CAPS policy is framed. I therefore conducted an analysis of the Constitution and The White Paper 1, as well as a policy analysis of the CAPS. The CAPS was analysed in line with Samuel's approach to policy analysis, as well as an analysis of policy content. My analysis of the policy content was framed by a framework for analysis, which was developed and guided by themes and concepts which were identified through a study of the literature and the policy analysis (cf 4.3). Moreover, the themes served as tools which enabled the analysis of the policy and documents. These themes include attention, place-based pedagogies, place-attentive education, coloniality, and decoloniality.

The findings from the analysis of the Constitution (1996) are such that it provides a legislative framework on which the analysis was formulated, and these legislative underpinnings enabled an analysis of the White Paper 1 (1996) and the CAPS (2011) policy, both of which

are in line with the Constitution as the supreme law of the land (cf 4.2). The right to education is the basis of the documents and policy, which inspired a reform of the education system (cf 4.5.1).

The findings from the Constitution (1996) include a clear recognition that there is a need for curriculum transformation in the post-apartheid education system (4.5.1.1). The need for transformation alludes to a need for decoloniality (cf 3.2.1). In line with this, the Constitution (1996), also clearly articulates that all individuals are equal before the law. In this way, the Constitution (1996) aligns with the aim of this study, which seeks to explore the promotion of decoloniality through place-attentive education. If there was no recognition for the need for decoloniality, it would prove challenging to make a case for decoloniality. The Constitution (1996) also advocates for environmental preservation, which aligns with this study, as this researcher proposes place-attentive education for the promotion of decoloniality, which finds its relevance in place-based education. Therefore, the importance of place-based education is articulated in the Constitution (4.5.1.1).

The findings highlighted from the White paper (1995) refer to environmental education as a vital aspect of all education levels (cf 4.5.2). It states that "environmental education which involves an integrated and active approach to learning is a vital component in teaching and learning" (cf 4.5.2.1). This essentially describes place-based education, which is associated with and can even be described as environmental education (cf 4.5.2.1). Moreover, the White Paper 1 refers to Ingold's principle of correspondence (cf 2.3.3) through the concept of care, which argues for care as a moral dimension of attention (cf 4.5.2.1). Therefore, place and attention find their bearings within place-attentive education, and in this way align with the main aim of this study, which is to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. The White Paper 1 (1996) also advocates for cultural expression (cf 4.5.2.2), meaning that is everyone should enjoy the right to engage in the expression of their cultures and languages (cf 4.5.2.2). This inadvertently contributes to the promotion of decoloniality, since the deliberate destruction of other cultures is one of the defining characteristics of coloniality (cf 4.5.2.2).

The CAPS (2011) highlight the importance of the context, and by implication the place, in which teaching and learning happens (cf 4.6.1). The places where knowledge is generated and exists, have an important role to play, as does the promotion or dissemination of these knowledge forms (cf 4.6.1). Everyone must be exposed to these knowledge forms,

regardless of their differences in class and race. Equally, therefore, the CAPS (2011) emphasises non-discrimination in terms of who has access to this knowledge (cf 4.6.1). Teaching which does not discriminate will therefore lead to the promotion of decoloniality.One way for this to be realised, is through critical place-based education (cf 2.2.3), which encompasses decolonising conceptualiations of land, and decolonising conceptualisations of place (cf 2.2.3)

Next follows Chapter 5, which comprises comments and suggestions about the potential of English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

CHAPTER 5

COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS ABOUT THE POTENTIAL OF ENGLISH HOME LANGUAGE CURRICULUM ASSESSMENT POLICY STATEMENTS (GRADES 10-12) TO PROMOTE PLACE-ATTENTIVE EDUCATION AS A PRACTICE OF DECOLONIALITY

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The aim of this study was to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy (CAPS, 2011) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. In addition to the analysis of the CAPS, I analysed the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (RSA, 1996) (cf 4.4.1) and an education-related document, the White Paper 1 on Education and Training (RSA, 1995) (cf 4.4.2). Since the CAPS (2011) finds its inspiration from the Constitution (1996) and the White Paper 1 (1995), their analysis was imperative to inform the subsequent analysis of the CAPS (2011). The policy and documents allowed me to gain an understanding of what informs and foregrounds the South African education system. In this chapter, I synthesise the earlier chapters with the goal of providing commentary on the research findings and offering recommendations regarding the potential of the CAPS (2011) to promote place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality. At the end of the chapter, the value of the study will be summarised, followed by an explanation of how it has contributed to both academic and individual development. Attention will also be given to its drawbacks, which present opportunities for further research.

5.2 PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

The research has achieved its purpose. The study has provided me with increased insight and perspective on how we are affected by places and how we impact places, as well as how place and attention can be read together to facilitate place-attentive education. This led to immense personal growth for me.

First, I provided a literature review which focused on place-based pedagogies and critical place-based education and their contribution to the development of place-attentive education and decoloniality. Secondly, I considered Ingold's conceptualisation of attention,

which contributed significantly to the conceptualisation of place-attentive education. Through this, I acquired fresh insights, which the reader will too. Third, through the literature review, I formulated a conceptual framework which framed the lens through which to analyse the CAPS (2011), the Constitution (1996) and the White Paper 1 (1995). I made use of Taylor et al.'s (1997) and Samuel's (2017) guidelines for the analysis and reading of policy while conducting the policy and document analysis. Furthermore, I developed a framework for analysis, which comprised various themes and found its bearings from the conceptual framework which was presented in the first chapter, as well as in the stipulated education policies and documents. Moreover, to help address the main research question of the study, I developed different objectives for the study. In addition, to illustrate how the study has fulfilled its purpose, a summary of Chapters 2 and 3 were provided, which enabled me to develop the conceptual framework that was used to evaluate the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), the White Paper 1 (1995) and the CAPS (2011) respectively. In Chapter 5 of the study, the focus is on the discussion and findings of the policy and document analysis in order to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

5.3 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

I constructed a conceptual framework from Ingold's exposition of the concept of 'taskscapes' (cf 1.4), which demonstrates the link between place and attention, and the role of education in this, from which the concept of place-attentive education emerged. As a result, the conceptual framework was developed to explore the potential of English Home Language Curriculum assessment policy statement to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. The conceptual framework comprised of Chapters 2 and 3, of which an overview follows.

Chapter 2

The aim of the chapter was to explore how place-based approaches to education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention could be read together to create a concept of place-attentive education (cf 1.3.2). The chapter focused on the conceptualisation of place and attention, with specific reference to place-based education, critical place-based education, Grunewald's dimensions of place and Ingold's concept of attention, all of which enabled me to gain a better understanding of place in relation to education. It is through this conceptualisation that I was able to construct the conceptual framework that guided the

research. Furthermore, to enable me to address the objective of the study I consulted the writings of several scholars. Place was conceptualised through the lens of different scholars such as Cresswell (2015), who argues that place refers to a particular location which has acquired meaning and value to people (cf 2.2), and can be understood in terms of location, locale and sense of place. Location refers to the physical setting, that can be defined in terms of its distance from another location and has specific coordinates. Locale is the context in which social interactions and the formation of meaning occur (cf 2.2), while sense of place refers to the emotional bond that a location creates, and the connotations associated with a certain location (cf 2.2). Massey (2005) refers to place as an event. Place as an event is a dynamic process where a variety of distinct social processes combine to form a whole. Furthermore, place becomes less stable and maybe more powerful when we recognise how it changes social practice and plays a significant part in the creation of and remaking of place. This means that places are not perceived as stable, due to the dynamic nature of the social practices which occur within any place at any given time (cf 2.2.1). In the same vein, this diversity creates a sense of power because while place influences the social practices that take place, place itself is influenced by these practices (cf 2.2.1). When, for instance, human and non-human actors collaborate to create meaning in a specific location at a specific moment, the outcome is categorised as the event of the interaction. Furthermore, McKittrick defines place as being understood differently by different people, which means that factors such as culture and one's own experiences influence how place is understood, experienced, and practiced (cf 2.2.1). This description of place prompted me to view practices which reinforce oppression as spatial acts, including practices such as racism/sexism. McKittrick posits that these acts are influenced by the spaces within which they take place (cf 2.2.1).

After the conceptualisation of place according to different scholars and definitions, I conducted an exposition of critical place-based education, which can be described as a response against educational policies and practices which disregard and ignore places (cf 2.2.3). Place-based education differs from critical place-based education as it seeks to establish a connection between the place and the individual as well as the community, going beyond the concept of merely engaging in passive learning (cf 2.2.3). Place-based pedagogies are thus an educational approach that seeks to reconnect people with the earth and adopts a multidisciplinary approach to place (cf 2.2.3). Critical place-based education extends towards a better understanding of the land and its non-human inhabitants, and is primarily focused on the place-based processes of colonisation and settler colonialism.

Furthermore, place-based pedagogies are crucial in order to promote a connection between the education of citizens and the well-being of the social and ecological spaces that people occupy.

Chapter 3

The aim of this chapter was to investigate how place-attentive education can be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality (cf 3.1) This was accomplished by considering the connection between the ideas of grounded normativity (cf 3.2.1), which teaches us how to live in relation to other humans and non-human living forms, grounded relationality (cf 3.2.1), which is based on the idea that it is critical to comprehend the significance and value of places, together with Ingold's definition of attention (cf 2.3), which is based on the principles of habit (cf 2.3.1), volition (cf 2.3.2), and correspondence (cf 2.3.3). Furthermore, I conceptualised decoloniality, which is focused on ongoing efforts to challenge persistent forms of coloniality. I also referred to decolonisation, which is connected to the historical period following World War II, when indigenous people started to resist external colonialism through a variety of initiatives (cf 3.2.1). The problem of colonialism was also discussed, with reference to the origins and development of the South African educational system (cf 3.2.3). The intersection (cf 3.2.3) between grounded normativity and grounded relationality within Ingold's principles of attention (habit, volition and correspondence) was also explored.

Chapter 4

In Chapter 4, the aim was to determine the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education. I conducted a document and policy analysis of the Constitution (1996) (cf 4.2.1.1), the White Paper 1 (1995) (cf 4.2.1.2), and the CAPS (2011) (cf 4.3.1). For the analysis of the documents and policy documents, I provided a context-based background which referred to the reasons behind the origin of the document and polices. The analysis was conducted with the main research question in mind: "*What is the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality?".* It was also conducted according to Samuel's (2017) and Taylor et al.'s *(*1997) approaches to analysing or reading policy (cf 4.1; 4.2.1). This chapter included the findings from the document analysis (cf 4.4.1; 4.4.2) and policy analysis (cf 4.5). The analysis of the Constitution (1996), White paper 1 (1995) and the CAPS (2011) (cf 4.2.1; 4.3) was done in relation to the themes which were developed from the conceptual framework, which in turn drew its inspiration from the

literature review in Chapters 2 and 3. The aim of the study was to explore whether the CAPS (2011) promotes an education which is place-attentive, and which can therefore lead to the practice of decoloniality. In this chapter, I present an overview of the findings from the policy and document analysis.

5.4 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

Next, a summary of the findings of the study will be provided, informed by the research questions of the study.

5.4.1 How can place-based approaches to education and Ingold's (2017) concept of attention be read together to create the concept of place-attentive education?

For this question to be addressed, I considered the theme of place-based approaches in education, against which the document and policy analysis was conducted (cf 4.2.1; 4.3). The role of place-based education and critical place-based education was emphasised from the conceptual framework in Chapter 2 (cf 2.2; 2.3; 2.4.1). Furthermore, there is a defined relationship between attention and place, and this link was established through the exposition of Grunewald's dimensions of place and Ingold's (2017) principles of habit, volition and correspondence (cf 3.2.3).

The findings revealed that the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) is the supreme law of the land, and all documents and policies must be developed in line with the Constitution (1996). The Constitution acknowledges that in post-apartheid South Africa, education is not equally accessible to all. For those who do have access to the education system, some inequality still exists in terms of the quality of the education that is being rendered to certain social classes (cf 4.4.1). The Constitution (1996) promotes environmental preservation, and highlights that the environment should be protected, and ecological degradation prevented (cf 4.4.2). Here, the onus falls on the schooling system to incorporate environmental education into activities within the curriculum, an aspect which alludes to place-based education and land education (cf 2.2.4). Land education is focused on confronting place-based approaches which sanitise and undermine indigenous people, and the significance of the places which they occupied (cf 2.2.4). This approach, therefore, concentrates on colonisation from the viewpoint of indigenous cultures. Therefore, critical place-based education (2.2.3) is essential in order to address environmental protection and preservation, as stipulated in the Constitution (1996). Furthermore, the Constitution (1996)

refers to the right to property, and in doing this, almost explicitly states that in the pre-democratic era, there was unequal distribution of land and related resources on the basis of racialisation and colonisation (cf 4.4.2). This is a factor which further highlights the need for an education that is attentive to place and places, and this researcher argues that place-attentive education can be a practice of decoloniality. Moreover, when the Constitution (1996) mentions the essential role of the environment in society, it refers to the non-human features of place and how their protection contributes to achieving the values and objectives outlined in the Constitution (cf 4.4.1).

The Constitution (1996) is therefore based on the following values: non-racialism, non-sexism, and the right to vote to ensure responsiveness (cf 4.2.1.1; 4.4.1). Although it is not explicitly stated, the statement of being responsive in a non-sexist and non-racial manner as part of the values of the Constitution (1996), alludes to both the achievement of equity and fairness and to the importance of being responsive to place (cf 2.5.1 ;4.4.1). Therefore, I found that the Constitution (1996) does make provision for critical place-based education. Moreover, the key objective of the Constitution (1996) is focused on healing the divisions of the past, and in the prcess achieving social justice (4.4.1). Here, the Constitution is explicit in mentioning that the country, and by implication the education system, is in need of social justice, a component which is critical to the achievement of decoloniality. Decoloniality, emphasises the moral and ethical need to make up for the wrongs committed by colonial authorities and the moral stance on social justice for people harmed and disempowered by widespread forms of colonialism (cf 3.2.2).

The analysis of the White Paper 1 (1996) revealed explicit reference to the importance of place-based education (cf 4.4.2). The White Paper refers to the need for the education system to help people to become environmentally literate. Every program and level of the education system must move towards fostering an active and integrated approach to learning (cf 4.4.2).

As the official policy document for the content and assessment of the curriculum taught in schools, the CAPS (2011) makes the case for education which is context sensitive, when it states that the promotion of knowledge should be in a manner that acknowledges the context within which teaching and learning takes place (cf 4.3). Furthermore, the specific skills and competencies, namely listening and speaking (4.3.1.3) and reading and viewing (cf 4.3.1.4), which are assessed in the CAPS (2011), make specific reference to the context. For

example, in relation to listening as a skill, the context from which the speaker is speaking is important, and so is the context where the listener is situated (cf 4.3.1.1). When the teaching and learning of listening as a skill takes place, emphasis is placed on the context or place that informs the activity. For example, in order derive meaning from what a certain speaker may be saying, learners are encouraged to consider the speaker's background and context, which alludes to the fact that people cannot exist separately from the places within which they find themselves (cf 2.2) Thus, arguably, place-based education (cf 2.2.2) is foregrounded within the CAPS (2011), and I contend that in line with the aim of this study, place-based education may aid in achieving place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality.

5.4.2 How can place-attentive education be conceptualised as a practice of decoloniality?

For this question to be addressed, the theme of place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality informed the document and policy analysis.

After analysing the Constitution (1996), it was clear that the need for decoloniality is acknowledged, as the Constitution (1996) clearly articulates its intentions when it sets out to address the absence of democratic values and the social injustices of the past, as well as the consequences of these injustices (cf 4.4.1). Arguably through this recognition, the Constitution (1996) can be a facilitator of decoloniality. Furthermore, the Constitution (1996) acknowledges the diminished status of indigenous languages, which means that the recognition of the marginalisation of indigenous peoples and their cultures are clearly articulated (cf 4.4.1). This is imperative for the achievement of decoloniality within education, because achieving redress in terms of the imbalances of the past is premised on acknowledging that a problem exists.

The White Paper 1 (1995) calls for the transformation of the education system (cf 4.2.1.2). In order to achieve all the objectives outlined in the White Paper 1 (1995), increased focused must be toward the redress of past inequalities (cf 4.3.1.2). This overarching call for transformation clearly indicates that there is a recognition within the White Paper 1 (1995) of colonial conceptions, and therefore a need for decoloniality. Additionally, the White Paper 1 clearly articulates the role and importance of non-human factors and, by implication, environmental education (cf 4.5.2). This can be inferred to allude to place-based education,

which is equally acknowledged and recognised in the Constitution (1996). Place-based pedagogies are therefore essential to enable place-attentive education to be envisioned as a practise of decoloniality. Previously, the expression and celebration of all cultures were not encouraged, instead it was supressed with the intention of the destruction of the specific culture (cf 4.5.2.1). Additionally, the White Paper 1 (1995) refers to parents' right to choose their children's cultural beliefs and language (cf 4.3.1.2). This demonstrates a recognition of different cultures which exist amongst learners within the education system. This recognition of the myriad of cultures (cf 4.3.1.2) and dispositions which may exist, speaks to the existence of more than one culture or knowledge system.

The role of place in terms of taking responsibility for and care of the environment is highlighted within the CAPS (2011) when it refers to environmental preservation. Additionally, the policy and documents achieve alignment here (cf 4.6.1), since the recognition of place within any given construct ,and particularly education, is prevalent within the CAPS (2011). Moreover, in line with this, the context within which activities takes place is highlighted in the CAPS (2011) (cf 4.6.1). For example, in listening and speaking (cf 4.3.1.3; 4.6.1), which is highlighted as one of the languages skills within the CAPS (2011), paying attention to the context is required when learners engage in the act of pre-listening (cf 4.3.1.2).

5.4.3 What is the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10-12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality?

Ingold's (2017) principle of habit is based on attentionally, which is founded on the premise that the attentional mind is increasingly aware of its surroundings, as attentionally necessitates that individuals become one with their surroundings and assimilate with the environment and its accompanying elements (cf 4.5). This therefore reiterates the role of place in achieving attention, and the principle of habit finds its being within the perceptual dimension of place (cf 4.3.1.2; 4.6.1), which reiterates the importance of the non-human world. Additionally, one of the critical objectives within the CAPS (2011) refers to showing responsibility towards the environment as well environmental preservation. In this way a case is made for environmental education, and by implication, place-based pedagogies (cf 4.5.1; 4.5.2; 4.6.1). Moreover, Ingold's concept of correspondence refers to the fact that people should care for one another as co-responsive beings in the world, and by extension,

this care should relate to non-human elements as well (cf 4.2.1.2; 4.5.2.1). Based on the concept of grounded normativity (cf 4.3.1.3; 5.3) through which decoloniality finds its being, the relationship between the individual and other people and their environment should exist in a non-exploitative, non-dominating way (cf 4.2.1.2; 4.5.2.1). In addition, Ingold's principle of volition refers to assigning mental representations to each symbolic representation as a form of attention and meaning-making (cf 4.3.1.3). In this way Ingold's principles of habit, volition and correspondence find their bearing within education, and here attention becomes active in place. Place-attentive education therefore becomes a promoter of decoloniality through the concepts of grounded normativity and grounded relationality (cf 4.3.1.3). Grounded relationality is focused on the relationship between the living and the non-living, and how they relate to their surroundings, in other words how the human and the non-human engage with each other and with their surroundings in order to establish meaning (cf 4.3.1.3). Therefore, language skills essentially come to life through the concept of grounded relationality, as the skill of listening in terms of pre-listening entails finding meaning and establishing mental connections (cf 4.3.1.3). Similarly, the skill of pre-reading involves understanding the text and engaging in an analysis of the linguistic elements by actively applying contextual cues to try and make meaning from unrecognised words and images (cf 4.3.1.4). Grounded normativity is focused on the nature of the relationship which exists between people as well as their surroundings. Through these two concepts, place and places as well as the non-human are interconnected and engage in exchanges with each other in ways that are encompassed of attention through Ingold's principles of attention (cf 2.3) in order to promote decoloniality. Therefore, we are drawn to the idea of creating and formulating meaning within the language skills of reading and listening, which finds connection in the concept of grounded relationality (cf 3.2.1).

Moreover, the two principles of attention (the principles of habit and volition) converge, in that the principle of habit (cf, 2.3.1; 3.2.3.1) and the principle of volition (cf 2.3.2; 3.2.3.2) find their voice within the CAPS (2011) (cf 4.3.1.3; 4.3.1.4). Therefore, attention is referenced in the CAPS and through the link that I established, where the principles of volition and habit find their meaning within grounded normativity and grounded relationality. As such, by teaching CAPS (2011), through the skills of listening and speaking (cf 4.3.1.3), reading and viewing (cf 4.3.1.4), attention is practiced.

5.5 SUGGESTIONS

I draw from the conceptual understanding of place-attentive education which stemmed from the conceptualisations in Chapters 2 and 3 respectively. This allowed me to explore the potential of place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality, through the analysis of policy and policy-related documents in Chapter 4. From the findings which stem from the analysis of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), the White Paper 1 on Education and Training (1995) and the CAPS (2011), I propose two suggestions that would enable the education system to be a facilitator of place-attentive education for the promotion and achievement of decoloniality in practise. These are making use of place-based and critical place-based pedagogies within education, as well as place-attentiveness, for the achievement of decoloniality.

5.5.1 Place-based pedagogies within education

Based on the analysis of the policy documents, the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (2011), the White Paper 1 on education and training (1995) and the Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (1996), the specified documents and policy foreground place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality (cf 5.4). Through the values and principles which are outlined in the Constitution (1996), the White Paper 1 (1995) and the CAPS (2011), a platform for place is created, and this is proposed through place-based education. Moreover, within the above-mentioned education related documents and policy, attention foregrounds itself through Ingold's principles of habit, volition, and correspondence. Therefore, one could contend that the Constitution (1996), the White Paper 1 (1995) and the CAPS (2011) promote place-attentive education (cf 4.2.1.1).

The analysis of the Constitution (1996) makes a clear case for the need to redress past injustices, a fact which is echoed by the White Paper 1 (1995) and the CAPS (2011) respectively. I contend that this can be achieved through incorporating place-based pedagogies into education. Through language skills (cf 4.3.1.3; 4.3.1.4; 4.3.1.4) outlined in the CAPS (2011), the importance of place can be reinforced. For example, the activities which are assigned to learners within the classroom can be such that they teach learners about environmental preservation. Learners may be requested to write about or create presentations on the impact of pollution on the environment. Through this, writing and

presenting may be used to promote the importance of environmental preservation, and by implication, places.

5.5.2 Becoming increasingly attentive to place for the promotion of decoloniality

Based on the analysis of the Constitution (1996), the CAPS (2011) and the White Paper 1 (1995), a realisation of the need for decoloniality is prevalent. I contend that through being attentive to place within education, decoloniality can be realised. The documents and policy refer to the historical suppression of indigenous knowledge systems, and the fact that this marginalisation of non-European ideals should no longer be the case. Moreover, in order to achieve decoloniality within education, the values which are outlined in the Constitution (1996) and the White Paper 1 (1995), should be embraced and implemented. The White Paper 1 (1995) refers to the promotion of cultural expression, which is interlinked with indigenous knowledge systems and language. The suppression of indigenous knowledge systems led to a lack of cultural expression (cf 4.5.2), which subsequently affected the prevalence of indigenous languages. Therefore, the deliberate suppression (cf 3.2.2; 4.3.1.4; 4.6.1.2) and even destruction (cf 3.2.2; 4.5.2.2) of indigenous knowledge forms reinforced coloniality. As a result, acknowledging and recognising indigenous knowledges will inevitably lead to the recognition of indigenous languages (cf 4.2.1.1; 4.2.1.2). It is through this acknowledgement of indigenous knowledges and indigenous languages as equal to Western knowledge forms that decoloniality may begin to be practiced through teaching and learning.

5.6 CHALLENGES OF THE STUDY

Seeing the study to its completion proved increasingly challenging. In addition to the nature of the study and its mainly philosophical nature, obtaining a firm grasp of the topic and its philosophical conceptions was an uphill task. Before conducting this study, I focused on the Psychology of Education, so donning a philosophical lens required extensive reading to enable this study to be positioned within a philosophical point of view. Additionally, time constraints in terms of time given to the research and writing was a challenge, and balancing personal aspects, familial commitments, and career demands proved increasingly challenging to me at times.

5.7 LIMITATIONS AND AVENUES FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

Certain potential limitations of this study have been identified. The fact that the study is a desktop study is one limitation, as the research was restricted to the analysis of documents and policies. A desktop study relies on the analysis of documents and policies as the sole means of data collection and to generate data. While the policy and document analysis provided adequate and substantial data, other qualitative research methods may have assisted in providing relevant responses to assist in responding to the main research question of the study. As a result of the time constraints and the nature of the study, the data analysis and data generation were only limited to the sections of the policy documents which are related to education and the aim of the study. As such, the above-mentioned limitations provide avenues for additional research. I therefore suggest that an empirical study in relation to teachers' voices should be added to the analysis section, and could very well be used to embark on further studies.

5.8 CONCLUSION

The aim of the study was to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) in order to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. Thus, this study was undertaken because of my interest in determining the potential of the CAPS (2011) to promote place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality. To develop a conceptual framework for the study, in Chapter 2 place and attention was conceptualised in terms of sense of place and place-based pedagogies, Grunewald's (2003) five dimensions of place, and Ingold's (2017) principles of attention. This was framed through the principles of habit, volition and correspondence, which assisted me to grasp the relationship between place attention. In Chapter 3, place-attentive education was conceptualised through considering decoloniality, and the historical impacts of colonialism and coloniality. I was also interested to see how place-attentive education and decoloniality intersect. Furthermore, Chapter 5 of the study enabled me to analyse policy documents and education-related documents in order to explore the potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality. Based on the findings which resulted from the document and policy analysis, I propose two suggestions that can be imbued in order to fully complement the CAPS (2011), by aiding in the realisation of place-attentive education as a practise of decoloniality within teaching and learning. I argue that, within teaching and learning, more emphasis should be placed on place-based pedagogies, which entail the importance of the place and its role in teaching and learning. Conversely, I suggest that place-attentiveness should be incorporated within education in order to achieve the promotion of decoloniality. Therefore, arguably, once the South African education system is focused on and includes place-based pedagogies and adopts a more place-attentive approach, decoloniality can be promoted.

REFERENCE LIST

Adom, D., Hussein, E. & Agyem, J.A. (2018). Theoretical and Conceptual Framework: Mandatory Ingredients of a Quality Research. *International Journal of Scientific Research*, 7(1), 438–431. https://www.worldwidejournals.com/international-journal-of-scientific-research-(IJSR)/article/theoretical-and-conceptual-framework-mandatory-ingredients-of-a-quality-research/MTM5NDE=/?is=1

Abrazaldo, G.A. (2023). Colorism, Colonial Mentality, and dating and relationships for Filipino American Women. https://research.library.fordham.edu/international_senior/107

Agyemang, C., Bhopal, R. & M., Bruijnzeels. (2005). Negro, Black, Black African, African Caribbean, African American or what? Labelling African origin populations in the health arena in the 21st century. *Journal of Epidemiology & Community Health,* 59(12), 1014-1018. https://doi.org/10.1136/jech.2005.035964

Akhtar, I. (2016). Research Design. In *Research in Social Science: Interdisciplinary Perspectives*. Kanpur: Social Research Foundation. http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2862445

Anderson, B., 2008. For Space (2005): Doreen Massey. *Key texts in human geography*, *8*, pp.227-235

Andic, M.1999.“Introduction.”In Simone Weil and the Intellect of Grace, edited by H.L. Finch,1–10. USA: Continuum

Andreotti, V., Ahenakew, C. & Cooper, G. (2011). Epistemological Pluralism: Ethical and pedagogical challenges in higher education. *AlterNative: An International Journal of Indigenous Peoples*, 7(1), 40–50 https://doi.org/10.1177/117718011100700104

Aravacik, E. (2018). Social Policy and the Welfare State. In *Public Economics and Finance*. IntechOpen. DOI: 10.5772/intechopen.82372

Ball, S. (1993). What is policy? Texts, Trajectories and Toolboxes. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 13(2), 10–17. https://doi.org/10.1080/0159630930130203

Bennett, K. (2007). Epistemicide! The tale of a predatory discourse. *The Translator, 13*(2), 151-169 https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.2007.10799236

Bhat, A. (2019). *Exploratory Research: Definition, Methods, Types and Examples.* QuestionPro https://www.questionpro.com/blog/exploratory-research

Bowen, G. (2009). Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27–40 https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027

Botha, L., Griffiths, D. & Prozesky, M. (2021). Epistemological decolonization through a relational knowledge-making model. *Africa Today*, *67*(4), 51-72. https://philarchive.org/rec/BOTEDT-2

Boyd, S. (2020). *Place-responsive principles of sustainable networked learning*. Paper presented at the International Conference on Networked Learning 2020, Kolding, Denmark, 18/05/20 - 20/05/20

Bulhan, H.A., 2015. Stages of colonialism in Africa: From occupation of land to occupation of being. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology*, *3*(1)

Byrd, J.A., Goldstein, A., Melamed, J. & Reddy, C. (2018). Predatory value: Economies of dispossession and disturbed relationalities. *Social Text*, *36*(2), 1-18 https://epublications.marquette.edu/english_fac/519

Castagno, A. & Brayboy, B.M.J. (2008). Culturally responsive schooling for indigenous youth: A review of the literature. *Review of Educational Research*, 78(4), 941–993 https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654308323036

Charmaz, K. (2017). The power of Constructivist Grounded Theory for Critical Inquiry: Qualitative Inquiry. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 23(1), 34–45. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800416657105

Chavoustie, C.T. (2021). *What Does 'Indigenous' Mean? How to Use it (and When to Avoid It).* Healthline https://www.healthline.com/health/what-does-indigenous-mean

Chilisa, B. (2012). *Indigenous research methodologies*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage

Christie, P., (2020). *Decolonising schools in South Africa: The impossible dream?*. Routledge

Citton, Y. (2017). *The Ecology of Attention*. Cambridge: Polity Press

Clark, J. (2006). Philosophy of Education in Today's World and Tomorrow's: a View from 'Down Under''. *Paideusis*, 15(1), 21–30 https://journals.sfu.ca/pie/index.php/pie/article/view/40

Coulthard, G. & Simpson, L.B. (2016). Grounded normativity/place-based solidarity. *American Quarterly*, 68(2), 249–255. https://doi.org/10.1353/aq.2016.0038

Cresswell, T. (2009), Place. In Kitchin, R. & Thrift, N. (eds.). *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*. Elsevier, 169-177 https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-008044910-4.00310-2

Creswell, J.W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed methods approaches,* 3rd ed. Los Angeles: Sage Publications

Cronin, P., Ryan, F. and Coughlan, M., 2008. Undertaking a literature review: a step-by-step approach. *British journal of nursing*, *17*(1), pp.38-43

Crossman, A. (2018). *An Overview of Qualitative Research Methods: Direct Observation, Interviews, Participation, Immersion, Focus Groups.* ThoughtCo https://www.thoughtco.com/qualitative-research-methods-3026555

Cusicanqui, S.R. (2012). Ch'ixinakax utxiwa: A Reflection on the Practices and Discourses of Decolonization. *South Atlantic Quarterly*, *111*(1), 95-109 https://doi.org/10.1215/00382876-1472612

Davies, C. J. (2016). *Whose Knowledge Counts?* Exploring Cognitive Justice in Community-University Collaborations. Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, Brighton: University of Brighton

De Clercq, F. (2020). The persistence of South African educational inequalities: The need for understanding and relying on analytical frameworks. *Education as Change*, *24*(1), 1-22 http://dx.doi.org/10.25159/1947-9417/7234

Department of Education. (1995). *White Paper on Education and Training*. Cape Town: Department of Education. https://www.gov.za/documents/white-paper-education-and-training

Department of Basic Education. (2011a). *Curriculum Assessment Policy (Grades 10-12).* Pretoria: Department of Basic Education

Department of Basic Education. (2011b). *Report on the Annual National Assessments of 2011*. Pretoria: DBE. https://evaluations.dpme.gov.za/evaluations/4

De Preester, H. (2021). Life is what you fill your attention with – the war for attention and the role of digital technology in the work of Bernard Stiegler. *Phenomenology and Mind*, 20, 102-116. https://doi.org/10.17454/pam-2009

De Sousa Santos, B. (2016). Epistemologies of the South and the future. *From the European South,* 1,17–29 http://www.boaventuradesousasantos.pt/media/Epistemologies%20of%20the%20south%20and%20the%20future_Poscolonialitalia_2016.pdf

Denzin, N. (2017). Critical Qualitative Inquiry. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 23(1), 8–16. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800416681864

Doane, G.H., & Varcoe,C.(2015).Howtonurse: Relational inquiry with individuals and families in changing health and health care contexts. Baltimore, MD: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.

Eppert, C., Vokey, D., Nguyen, T.T.A. & Bai, H. (2015). Intercultural Philosophy and the Nondual Wisdom of 'Basic Goodness': Implications for Contemplative and Transformative Education. *Journal of Philosophy of Education,* 49(2), 274–293. doi: 10.1111/1467-9752.12141

Ergas, O. (2015). The deeper teachings of mindfulness-based 'interventions' as a reconstruction of 'education'. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, *49*(2), 203-220. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9752.12137

Fataar, A. (2017). *Decolonising education in South Africa: An interview with Aslam Fataar*. Interviewed by Kruger, E. LitNet University Seminar Series. https://www.litnet.co.za/decolonising-education-south-africa-interview-aslam-fataar/

Flick, U. (2016). Challenges for a New Critical Qualitative Inquiry. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 23(1), 3–7. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800416655829

Fries, C.H., (2012). *Teaching style preferences and educational philosophy of teacher education faculty at a state university*. Oklahoma State University.

Greenwood, D.A. (2019). Place, Land, and the Decolonization of the Settler Soul. *The Journal of* Environmental Education,50(4-6),358-377 https://doi.org/10.1080/00958964.2019.1687412

Grosfoguel, R. (2007). The Epistemic decolonial Turn: Beyond Political Economy Paradigms 1. *Cultural studies,* 21(2-3), 211-223. https://doi.org/10.1080/09502380601162514

Gruenewald, D.A. (2003). Foundations of place: A multidisciplinary framework for place conscious education. *American Educational Research Journal*, 40(3), 619-634. DOI:10.29086/2519-5476/2019/sp27a3

Gruenewald, D.A. (2008). The Best of Both Worlds: A Critical Pedagogy of Place. *Educational Researcher*, 32(4), 3–12. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X032004003

Gruenewald, D.A. and Smith, G.A., (2008). Creating a movement to ground learning in place. *Place-based education in the global age: Local diversity*, pp.345-358

Hall, B.L. & Tandon, R. (2017). Decolonization of knowledge, epistemicide, participatory research and higher education. *Research for All*, 1(1), 6–19. DOI 10.18546/RFA.01.1.02

Hart, C. (2018). *Doing a literature review: releasing the research imagination,* 2nd ed. Los Angeles: Sage Publications

Henriksen, D., Richardson, C. and Shack, K., 2020. Mindfulness and creativity: Implications for thinking and learning. *Thinking skills and creativity*, 37, p.100689

Hlatshwayo, M.N. (2019). The Organic Crisis and Epistemic Disobedience in South African Higher Education Curricula: Making Political Science Relevant. *Alternation Special Edition,* 27, 65-87. https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2019/sp27a3

Hoadley, U. (2017). Pedagogy in Poverty: Lessons from Twenty Years of Curriculum Reforms in South Africa. London: Routledge

Ingold, T. (1993). The Temporality of the Landscape. *World Archaeology*, 25(2), 152-174. DOI: 10.1080/00438243.1993.9980235

Ingold, T. (2011). *Being Alive: Essays on movement, knowledge and description.* London, UK; Routledge

Ingold,T. (2017). *The Art of Paying Attention*. Keynote presentation at the Art of Research Conference, Helsinki, 29–30November 2017 https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2Mytf4ZSqQs

Ingold, T. (2018). *Anthropology and/as education*. Abingdon, Oxon: New York: Routledge

Jabareen, Y. (2009). Building a Conceptual Framework: Philosophy, Definitions, and Procedure. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 8(4), 49–62. https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690900800406

Janz, B.B. (2012). *Philosophy in an African place*. Lanham, Md.: Lexington Books

Jharotia, A. & Singh, S. (2015). Use of Research Methodology in Research: An Overview. *International Journal of Social Science, Journalism and Mass Communication*, 2(2), 44–51. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/309319968_Use_of_Research_Methodology_in_Research_An Overview

Johnson, J.T. (2012). Place-based learning and knowing: critical pedagogies grounded in Indigeneity. *GeoJournal*, 77(6), 829–836. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10708-010-9379-1

Kruger, F. (2020). The movement of thought: Walking as decolonial praxis of knowledge-growing. In Crul, M., Dick, L., Ghorashi, H. & Valenzuela, A. Jr. (eds.). *Scholarly Engagement and Decolonisation: Views from South Africa, The Netherlands and the United States.* Stellenbosch: SunMedia, 323-34

Kovach, M. (2009). *Indigenous methodologies: Characteristics, Conversations, and Contexts*. Toronto, Canada: University of Toronto Press

Lipsitz, G. (2011). *How racism takes place*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press. https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5ad0d247af209613040b9ceb/t/5dfe57e88c6e911e4fe87695/1576949740234/George+Lipsitz+-+How+Racism+Takes+Place++-Temple+University+Press+%282011%29.pdf

Le Grange, L. and Ontong, K. (2019). Towards an Integrated School Geography Curriculum: The role of Place-Based education. *Alternation Special Edition* 21, 12-36 https://doi.org/10.29086/2519-5476/2018/sp21a2

Levy, Y. and Ellis, T.J., (2006). A systems approach to conduct an effective literature review in support of information systems research. *Informing Science*, *9*

Lugones, M. (2010). Toward a Decolonial Feminism. *Hypatia*, *25*(4), 742–759 https://www.jstor.org/stable/40928654

Lynch, J. and Mannion, G., (2021). Place-responsive Pedagogies in the Anthropocene: attuning with the more-than-human. *Environmental Education Research*, *27*(6), pp.864-878

Ndlovu-Gatsheni, S.J. (2015). Decoloniality as the Future of Africa. *History Compass,* 13(10), 485-496. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/hic3.12264

Ndlovu, M. (2018). Coloniality of knowledge and the challenge of creating African futures. *Ufahamu: A Journal of African Studies*, *40*(2). https://doi.org/10.5070/F7402040944

Ngobeni NR, Chibambo MI and Divala JJ (2023) Curriculum transformations in South Africa: some discomforting truths on interminable poverty and inequalities in schools and society. *Frontiers in Education,* 8,1132167. https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2023.1132167

Nicol, R. (2014). Fostering environmental action through outdoor education. *Educational Action Research,* 22(1), 39–56. https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2013.854174

Nieuwenhuis, J. (2007). Introducing qualitative research. In Maree, K. (ed.). *First Steps in research.* Pretoria: Van Schaik, 47 - 67

Maldonado-Torres, N. (2011). Thinking through the decolonial turn: Post-continental interventions in theory, philosophy, and critique—An introduction. *Transmodernity: Journal of Peripheral Cultural Production of the Luso-Hispanic World*, 1(2), 1–14 https://doi.org/10.5070/T412011805

Malone, K., 2016. Reconsidering children's encounters with nature and place using posthumanism. Australian Journal of Environmental Education, 32(1), pp.42-56

Mannion, G., Fenwick, A. & Lynch, J. (2013). Place-responsive pedagogy: Learning from teachers' experiences of excursions in nature. *Environmental Education Research*, 19(6), 792-809. https://doi.org/10.1080/13504622.2012.749980

Mansour, A.M. (2011). *The Use of "Policy-analysis" to improve the Quality of Policy Making in Government and Non-Governmental Organisations*

McKeever, M. (2017). Educational inequality in apartheid South Africa. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 61(1), 114-131. https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764216682988

McKittrick, K. (2006). *Demonic grounds: Black women and the cartographies of struggle.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press

Mgqwashu, E. (2019). Education for public good in the age of coloniality: Implications for pedagogy. *Journal of Decolonising Disciplines*, 1(1), 65–81.

https://upjournals.up.ac.za/index.php/jdd/article/view/50

Mignolo, W.D., (2009). Epistemic disobedience, independent thought and decolonial freedom. *Theory, culture & society*, *26*(7-8), pp.159-181

Mignolo, W.D., (2011a). Epistemic disobedience and the decolonial option: A manifesto. *Transmodernity*, *1*(2), 3-23. https://doi.org/10.5070/T412011807

Mignolo, W.D. (2011b). *The darker side of Western modernity: Global futures, decolonial options*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press

Mignolo, W. (2013). Geopolitics of sensing and knowing: On (de) coloniality, border thinking, and epistemic disobedience. *Confero: Essays on education, philosophy and politics*, *1*(1), 129-150. https://journal.ep.liu.se/confero/article/view/3593

Mignolo, W.D. & Walsh, C.E. (2018). *On decoloniality: concepts, analytics, praxis*. Durham, London: Duke University Press

Mlachila, M.M. & Moeletsi, T. (2019). *Struggling to make the grade: A review of the causes and consequences of the weak outcomes of South Africa's education system*. IMF working paper 047. https://doi.org/10.5089/9781498301374.001

Mole, C. (2011). "The Metaphysics of Attention", in: C Mole, D. Smithies, and W. Wu (eds.), Attention: Philosophical and Psychological Essays, Oxford University Press: 60-77

Morgan, H. (2022). Conducting a qualitative document analysis. *The Qualitative Report*, *27*(1), 64-77. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2022.5044

Muchenje, F. (2017). Cognitive justice and indigenous knowledge systems in the postcolonial classroom. In Shizha, E. & Makuvaza, N. (eds.). *Re-thinking Postcolonial Education in Sub-Saharan Africa in the 21st Century.* Rotterdam: Sense Publishers, 69-83

Ontong, K. & Le Grange, L. (2015). The Need for place-based Education in South African Schools: The case of Greenfields Primary. *Perspectives in Education*, 33(3), 5–20. https://hdl.handle.net/10520/EJC178500

Ortiz C (2022). Storytelling otherwise: Decolonizing storytelling in planning. Planning Theory

Oyedemi, T. (2020). (De)coloniality and South African academe. *Critical Studies In Education, 61*(4), 399–415. https://doi.org/10.1080/17508487.2018.1481123

Parveen, H. and Showkat, N. (2017). *Research Ethics.* https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Nayeem_Showkat/publication/318912804_Research Ethics/links/5984c72daca27266ad9a26ca/Research-Ethics.pdf?origin=publication_detail

Pillay, S. (2021). The problem of colonialism: assimilation, difference, and decolonial theory in Africa. *Critical times*, *4*(3), 389-416. https://doi.org/10.1215/26410478-9355201

Quijano, A. (2007). Coloniality And Modernity/Rationality. *Cultural Studies*, 21(2–3), 168–178. https://doi.org/10.1080/09502380601164353

Reddy, P. (2018). *The Differences between Research Methods and Research Methodology.* Differencebetween.net.http://www.differencebetween.net/science/the-differences-between-research-methods-and-research-methodology/

Resnik, D. (2019). *What is Ethics in Research & Why is it Important?* National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences https://www.niehs.nih.gov/research/resources/bioethics/whatis/index.cfm

Rytzler, J. (2019). Turning the gaze to the self and away from the self – Foucault and Weil on the matter of education as attention formation. Ethics and Education, 14(3), 285 297. DOI: 10.1080/17449642.2019.1617452

Samuel, M.A. (2017). Understanding policy analysis: South African policies shaping teachers as professionals. In Ramrathan, L., Le Grange, L. & Higgs, P. (Eds.). *Education Studies for Initial Teacher Development*. Cape Town: Juta, 3-29

Seroto, J. (2018). Dynamics of Decoloniality in South Africa: A Critique of the History of Swiss Mission Education for Indigenous People. *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae*, 44(3), 1–14. http://dx.doi.org/10.25159/2412-4265/3268

Siegel, H., (2009). Introduction: Philosophy of education and philosophy

Singh, Ajit. (2023). Re: Conceptual papers vs. research papers, what are the clear differences between the two types?. https://www.researchgate.net/post/Conceptual_papers_vs_research_papers_what_are_th

e_clear_differences_between_the_two_types/64183033e4498b0a940f7615/citation/download

Simons, M., Olssen, M. & Peters, M. (2009). *Re-reading education policies: a handbook studying the policy agenda of the 21st century*. Rotterdam, Boston: Sense.

Spaull, N. (2013). *South Africa's education crisis: The quality of education in South Africa 1994-2011*. Johannesburg: Centre for Development and Enterprise

Springgay, S. & Truman, S.E. (2018). *Walking Methodologies in a more-than-human-world: WalkingLab*. New York: Routledge

Springgay, S., Truman, A. & MacLean, S. (2019). Socially Engaged Art, Experimental Pedagogies, and Anarchiving as Research-Creation. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *26*(7), 897– 907. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800419884964

Sundberg, J. (2014). Decolonizing posthumanist geographies. *Cultural Geographies, 21*(1), 33-47. https://doi.org/10.1177/1474474013486067

Taylor, N. (2012). Curriculum 2005: Finding a balance between school and everyday knowledges. In Hoadley, U. & Jansen. J. (eds.). *Curriculum: Organising knowledge for the classroom*, 3rd ed. Cape Town: SAIDE and OUP Southern Africa, 255-261. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/331476452_255_CURRICULUM_2005_FINDING_A_BALANCE_BETWEEN_SCHOOL_AND_EVERYDAY_KNOWLEDGES

Taylor, S., Rizvi, F., Lingard, B. & Henry, M. (1997). *Education Policy and the Politics of Change*. London: Routledge

University of North Florida. (2020). *Conducting a literature review.* https://libguides.unf.edu/c.php?g=177129&p=1163732

Tuck, E. & Yang, K.W. (2012). Decolonization is not a metaphor. *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education and Society*, 1(1), 1–40 https://jps.library.utoronto.ca/index.php/des/article/view/18630

Tuck, E., McKenzie, M. & Mccoy, K. (2014). Land education: Indigenous, postcolonial, and decolonizing perspectives on place and environmental education research. *Environmental Education Research,* 20(1), 1-23. DOI: 10.1080/13504622.2013.877708

Tuck, E. & McKenzie, M. (2015). Relational Validity and the "Where" of Inquiry: Place and Land in Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Inquiry, 21*(7), 633-638 https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800414563809

Tuck, E. & McKenzie, M.. (2015). *Place in Research: Theory, Methodology, and Methods*. New York: Routledge

University of the Free State: Faculty of Education Postgraduate Office. (2015). *Master's Degree in Education/ Master's Degree in Higher Education* https://www.ufs.ac.za/docs/librariesprovider24/school-of-higher-education-studies-documents/all-documents/masters-guide-2015-266-eng.pdf?sfvrsn=0

Van Eijck, M. & Roth, W.M. (2010). Towards a chronotopic theory of "place" in place-based education. Cultural Studies of Science Education, 5, 869–898 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11422-010-9278-2

Vasudevan, R. and Novoa E, M., (2022). Pluriversal planning scholarship: Embracing multiplicity and situated knowledges in community-based approaches. Planning Theory, 21(1), pp.77-100

Waghid, Z. & Hibbert, L. (2018). Advancing border thinking through defamiliarisation in uncovering the darker side of coloniality and modernity in South African higher education. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 32(4), 263–283. https://hdl.handle.net/10520/EJC-10c4c52f13

Walsh, C.E. (2015). Decolonial pedagogies walking and asking. Notes to Paulo Freire from AbyaYala. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 34(1), 9-21 https://doi.org/10.1080/02601370.2014.991522

Ware, S. (2017). All power to all people? Black LGBTTI2QQ activism, remembrance, and archiving in Toronto. *TSQ: Transgender Studies Quarterly*, *4*(2), 170-180 https://doi.org/10.1215/23289252-3814961

Wattchow, B., Jeanes, R., Alfrey, L., Brown, T., Cutter-Mackenzie, A. and O'Connor, J., (2016). *Socioecological educator*. Dordrecht: Springer

Weil, S. (2012). *Awaiting God. A New Translation of Attente De Dieu and Lettre À Un Religieux*. (B. Jersak, A. Gamble & A. Ruch, Trans.). Canada: Fresh Wind Press

Li, W. & Shein, P.P. (2023). Developing sense of place through a place-based Indigenous education for sustainable development curriculum. *Environmental Education Research*, 29(5), 692-714. DOI: 10.1080/13504622.2022.2098933

Veletsianos, G. and Houlden, S., (2020). Radical flexibility and relationality as responses to education in times of crisis. *Postdigital Science and Education*, *2*, pp.849-862

Winkler, T. (2023). What might decoloniality look like in praxis? *Planning Theory* https://doi.org/10.1177/14730952231163240

Zembylas, M. (2018). Decolonial possibilities in South African higher education: Reconfiguring humanising pedagogies as/with decolonising pedagogies. *South African Journal of Education*, 38(4), 1–11. http://dx.doi.org/10.15700/saje.v38n4a1699

APPENDIX A: FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS

The potential of the English Home Language Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements (Grades 10–12) to promote place-attentive education as a practice of decoloniality.

THEMES	QUESTIONS FOR ANALYSIS
Place-based education and attention	Does the text make reference to place and place-based education?
	Does the text advocate for place?
	Is the issue of language addressed in the text?
Attention	Is there a connection between attention and education?
	Does the documents refer to attention and education?
	Do the documents refer to attention directly or indirectly?
	Does the principle of volition as a form of attention show up in the text?
	Does the principle of habit as a form of attention show up in the text?
	Does the principle of correspondence as a form of attention show up in the text?
Decoloniality and education	

	What is the meaning for place-based and place-attentive education and decoloniality within the documentation?
	Is there an interest in the environment or the non-human within the text?
	Do the texts promote grounded normativity and grounded relationality
	Do the texts promote relations between people and the environment?
	Are there examples of indigenous related issues within the texts?
	Do the texts make-mention of the importance of cultural expression?
	Do the texts refer to language?
	Does the text foster consciousness of care for the environment and people through values such as respect and care?

APPENDIX B: ETHICS STATEMENT

UNIVERSITY OF THE FREE STATE
UNIVERSITEIT VAN DIE VRYSTAAT
YUNIVESITHI YA FREISTATA
UFS UV

GENERAL/HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE (GHREC)

24-Nov-2020

Dear Miss Matladi Tsoeu

Application Approved

Research Project Title:
"Exploring place-attentive education and decoloniality in the English Home Language Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement"

Ethical Clearance number:
UFS-HSD2020/2115/2311

We are pleased to inform you that your application for ethical clearance has been approved. Your ethical clearance is valid for twelve (12) months from the date of issue. We request that any changes that may take place during the course of your study/research project be submitted to the ethics office to ensure ethical transparency. furthermore, you are requested to submit the final report of your study/research project to the ethics office. Should you require more time to complete this research, please apply for an extension. Thank you for submitting your proposal for ethical clearance; we wish you the best of luck and success with your research.

Yours sincerely

Dr Adri Du Plessis
Chairperson: General/Human Research Ethics Committee

205 Nelson Mandela Drive Bloemfontein 9300 South Africa
P.O. Box 339 Bloemfontein 9301 Park West
Tel: +27 (0)51 401 9337
duplessisA@ufs.ac.za
www.ufs.ac.za

APPENDIX C: LANGUAGE EDITING

To whom it may concern

This is to state that the Master's study titled *Exploring place-attentive education and decoloniality in the English Home Language Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement* by Matladi Rosina Tsoeu has been language edited by me, according to the tenets of academic discourse. The final responsibility for applying any proposed corrections lies with the author.

Annamarie du Preez
B.Bibl.; B.A. Hons. (English)
0837641864

29-11-2023

APPENDIX D: TURNITIN REPORT

Exploring place-attentive education and decoloniality in the English Home Language Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement

by Matladi Rosina Tsoeu

Submission date: 30-Nov-2023 01:28PM (UTC+0200)

Submission ID: 2242973758

File name: Exploring_place attentive_education_and_decoloniality_in_the_English_Home_Language_Curriculum_and_Assessment_Policy_Statement.docx (313K)

Word count: 43282

Character count: 245160

Exploring place-attentive education and decoloniality in the English Home Language Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement

ORIGINALITY REPORT

10%	7%	5%	5%
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	works.bepress.com Internet Source	1%
2	www.ajol.info Internet Source	<1%
3	Submitted to Universiteit van Amsterdam Student Paper	<1%
4	Submitted to University of South Africa Student Paper	<1%
5	tandfbis.s3-us-west-2.amazonaws.com Internet Source	<1%
6	www.tandfonline.com Internet Source	<1%
7	Submitted to University of Stellenbosch, South Africa Student Paper	<1%
8	hdl.handle.net Internet Source	<1%