

AN ASSESSMENT OF ECONOMIC (IN)SECURITY CHALLENGES FACED BY
MIGRANT WOMEN IN MADIBENG LOCAL MUNICIPALITY AREA.

BY

OUTRACY NCUBE

A MINI-DESSERTATION SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE
MASTERS DEGREE IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES IN THE FACULTY OF
ECONOMIC AND MANAGEMENT SCIENCES AT THE UNIVERSITY OF THE
FREE STATE, BLOEMFONTEIN.

JANUARY 2020

SUPERVISOR: DR PHILIPPA KERR

DECLARATION

I, Outracy Ncube (Student Number 2016240273), am a student registered for Masters in Development Studies in the year 2019.

I do hereby declare that plagiarism (the use of someone else's work without their permission and/or without acknowledging the original source) is wrong. I confirm that work submitted for assessment for the above course is my own unaided work except where I have explicitly indicated otherwise.

I have followed the required convention in referencing the thoughts and ideas of others.

I understand that the University of Free State may take disciplinary action against me if there is belief that this is not my work or that I have failed to acknowledge the source of ideas or works in my writing.

I further cede copyright of this dissertation in favour of the University of the Free State.

Outracy Ncube

January 2020

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS AND DEDICATION

Above all, all glory be to God the Almighty for giving me strength to soldier on.

I am grateful to my supervisor Dr. Kerr Philippa for all the constructive discussion, guidance and encouragement through-out the research. It is a blessing to have you as my supervisor. I richly profited from the guidance. Unfortunately, my words are not enough to express my gratitude.

I am also grateful to Canon Collins Educational and Legal Assistance for the funding. It was almost impossible until the time you gave a helping hand. I also extend my sincere gratitude to the nineteen women who were part of the interviews. Thank you for your time and the information you provided.

I would also extend my profound gratitude to Dr. France Ncube for willingly editing this thesis. Julia Adam and Cassandra Lundu thank you for all the assistance and guidance through-out this journey.

I appreciate the support from my husband, Ratang Sitoboli who encouraged me through-out my studies. I also acknowledge the support of my parents; Esnath Tlou and Nellie Sitoboli. To my children; Keneiloe, Kebokile and Bokang thank you for giving me space and understanding. I hope this will inspire you one day.

This thesis is dedicated to my father, Morgan Ncube. It took long; but I got there. May your soul rest in peace.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION.....	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	ii
ABSTRACT.....	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	iv
LIST OF TABLES.....	v
CHAPTER 1 : INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.2 RATIONALE FOR CHOOSING MADIBENG LOCAL MUNICIPALITY.....	2
1.3 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM.....	3
1.4 AIM OF THE STUDY.....	3
1.5 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES.....	3
1.6 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY.....	4
1.6.1 International women migrants.....	4
1.6.2 Employers of migrant women.....	4
1.6.3 Department of Home Affairs.....	4
1.6.4 Scientific community.....	4
1.6.5 Researcher.....	5
1.7 SCOPE OF THE STUDY.....	5
1.8 STRUCTURE OF THE STUDY.....	5
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW.....	6
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	6
2.2 MIGRATION.....	6
2.2.1 Who is a migrant?.....	6

2.2.2 Migration trends in the SADC region.....	7
2.2.3 Criminalisation of migrants and migration in South Africa.....	9
2.2.4 Migrants and their work prospects in South Africa.....	10
2.3 EMPIRICAL ECONOMIC INSECURITY LITERATURE FROM SOUTH AFRICA.....	11
2.4 CONCEPTUALISATION AND KEY VARIABLES OF ECONOMIC (IN)SECURITY.....	18
2.4.1 Defining economic security.....	18
2.4.2 Aspects and elements of economic security.....	20
2.5 CONCLUSION.....	22
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY.....	23
3.1 INTRODUCTION AND RESEARCH AIMS.....	23
3.2 RESEARCH METHOD AND DESIGN.....	23
3.3 SAMPLING.....	23
3.4 DESCRIPTION OF DEPENDENTS.....	24
3.5 DATA COLLECTION STRATEGY.....	26
3.6 ETHICS.....	28
3.7 DATA ANALYSIS.....	29
CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS.....	31
4.1 RECAP ON AIMS AND OBJECTIVES.....	31
4.2 FINDINGS.....	31
4.2.1 “Pull” and “push” factors for the respondents’ migration.....	31
4.2.2 Worst economic security challenges.....	33
4.2.3 Basic social security and access to essential needs.....	36
4.2.4 Labour market security.....	36

4.2.5 Skill production security.....	37
4.2.6 Income security.....	37
4.2.7 Employment security.....	40
4.2.8 Work security.....	41
4.2.9 Representation security.....	43
4.2.10 Economic security for the self-employed.....	44
4.2.11 Other forms of challenges and risk at work.....	45
4.3 DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS AND LITERATURE.....	46
4.4 CONCLUSION.....	48
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	49
5.1 INTRODUCTION.....	49
5.2 CONCLUSIONS.....	49
5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	50
5.4 LIMITATIONS.....	53
5.5 CONSIDERATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH.....	53
REFERENCES.....	54
Addendum A Semi-Structured Interview guide.....	61
Addendum B Interview consent form.....	65
Addendum C Ethics Clearance letter.....	67

ABSTRACT

This study set out to explore the economic security challenges of international migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality in the North West province of South Africa. The study adopted human security as its conceptual framework. A qualitative research design was used. The snowball sampling method was used to select a study sample of 19 international migrant women. Data were collected using semi-structured interviews. The study found that all the interviewed international migrant women (19) were experiencing chronic economic insecurity although they were economically active. Thirteen (13) of the participants were in wage labour and 6 were self-employed. Participants had access to an income, but the monthly income was not equal through-out the year. The wages were season-dependent. Most participants (17) were employed in fixed-term contracts; with two in verbal and ambiguous contracts. Entrepreneurship by the international migrant women was not by choice but a means to survive. The women preferred formal employment to running small businesses. Accessing a wage/salary does not necessarily equate to economic security. Seasonal work, contracts of not more than a year and lack of documentation from the Department of Home Affairs, were some of the main economic security challenges that international migrant women experienced. Economic (in)security is a condition that changes with time. The economic insecurity of most women worsened en-route to South Africa while for others it worsened as soon as they arrived in South Africa. However, the economic security for all the international migrant women improved with length of stay in South Africa. Lastly, recommendations for future research were suggested. Economic reasons were the main push factors while social networks were the main pull factors, for the interviewed international migrants to come to South Africa. The research also found out that “stokvels” and “saving clubs” were some of the devised plans to help the women to save their income. Social networks were important for saving and also helped the migrant women to secure jobs around the area.

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 INTRODUCTION

In the SADC region and across the world, migration has increased after 1990 and this has adverse repercussions to receiving communities and female migrants (Mudungwe, 2014). The major factors that influence migration are economic well-being and economic dynamics (Crush and Williams, 2004; Kok, Gelderblom, Oucho and van Zyl, 2006). Migration has a significant impact on women migrant's economic security. Women face potential threats to their economic security not only due to migration, but their gender, documentation and other factors. The Rand Corporation (2008) reported that international migrant women are faced with the "double disadvantage" of being a woman in an unequal society and a migrant. This double disadvantage makes it very difficult for women to penetrate the labour market. The questions that arise are: what economic security challenges do women migrants face once they are in South Africa and how do they tackle such economic (in)security challenges? This study sought to undertake a qualitative assessment of economic security challenges faced by migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality in the Northwest Province. An understanding of such challenges can help guide public policy with regards to addressing the economic insecurities of international migrant women.

Low wages and sub-contract employment are some of the main causes of economic (in)security in South Africa across gender and races. The Business Report in Valodia, Lebani, Skinner and Devey (2006: 91) quotes Thabo Mbeki when he says "casualisation has produced the phenomenon of the working poor ... (who) have little say over their wages... (and) their employers are not required to provide them with medical and retirement benefits." Crush and Williams (2002) claim that mines and farms still have the freedom to contract international migrant workers but extensive sub-contracting leaves farm and mine workers more vulnerable to exploitative conditions. Such observations are in line with Benya (2015) and Valodia *et al* (2006) who note that subcontracted mine employees perform exactly the same duties as full-time employees but the remuneration and labour protection are not the same.

Approximately half the world migrants are women (UN: 2004, 2017). The highest migration within Southern Africa is South-South migration (from one developing country to another) (Landau, Dodson, William and Tevera, 2017). Uneven

development and employment opportunities in the SADC region has led to uneven migration flows (Crush *et al*, 2017). This has increased the international migration flow into South Africa. The increase of international migrants to South Africa has been enormous if one considers that in 2000 South Africa was not even in the top 20 of global migrant destinations, whereas now it is in the top 15 (Segatti and Landau, 2011 and (Scalabrini Institute for Human Mobility in Africa (SIHMA), 2017).

This thesis aims to research economic (in)security among international women migrants in Madibeng Local Municipality which has a history of migrancy in mine and farm labour. Economic security refers to the ability of individuals to access a stable source of income that would enable a sustainable standard of living. It also involves access to social basic needs like health, food, shelter and education without the anxiety of how they will be meet in the new future.

Gender and gender inequalities influence women's economic (in)securities. Women's opportunities for employment are influenced by their country of origin and their destination (Nawyn; 2010). Donato in Nawyn (2010) gives an example of how one's access to education at home determines how one is able to access scarce skills visas. This analysis applies to South Africa because the critical skills visa has a list of qualifications that enables one to apply for the work visa; and most of the qualifications are male dominated trades. This makes women vulnerable because of gender prejudices. These findings will be kept in mind as the researcher is analysing her findings in the following chapters. With these possible disadvantages faced by international migrant women, one would want to understand what economic (in)security challenges these women face around Madibeng Local Municipality.

1.2 Rationale for choosing Madibeng Local Municipality

The focus of this study is on international economic migrants. The study area was Madibeng Local Municipality area because it has a substantial number of international migrants. This category of the population is attracted to the area by work opportunities in the mines, farms and several tourism attractions. In South Africa, cross border migrants are concentrated in agricultural and mining areas (Crush, 2007) and farmers often employ undocumented migrants on a seasonal basis (IOM, 2013). Madibeng Local Municipality is surrounded by mining houses like Lonmin, Glencore, Samancor, Herrenic, Crocodile, Implats and several commercial farms and tourist attraction

destinations. These attract high numbers of migrants searching for better job opportunities.

Madibeng Local Municipality is located in the Bojanala District in the North West province along the Magaliesburg mountain range. The local municipality is bounded by some of South Africa's big cities like Johannesburg, Pretoria and Rustenburg. It covers an area of 3 814km (Madibeng Local Municipality, 2015). The main towns are Brits and Hartbeespoort. Other additional areas are Skeerpoort area (an area with vast orchards and agricultural land), 9000 farms and 43 villages (Madibeng Local Municipality, 2015). Lastly, Madibeng Local Municipality was chosen because the author stays in the same municipality and conducting the study in the same area would help in curbing costs and saving time.

1.3 Statement of the problem

International migrant women in South Africa are an understudied group with regards to economic security challenges. There appears to be limited published research on this population group. Resultantly, much remains unknown about the economic predicaments faced by international women migrants in this country. Given that South Africa commonly experiences xenophobic attacks targeted on international migrants, an understanding of the economic securities of international migrant women may help guide South Africa's public policy with regards to improving the economic security of this population group. International migrant women are faced with the "double disadvantage" of being a woman in an unequal society and a migrant (Rand Corporation, 2008). This study was, therefore, carried out to assess the economic security challenges of international migrant women using Madibeng Local Municipality area as a case study.

1.4 Aim of the study

The aim of the study is to assess economic security challenges faced by migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality.

1.5 Research Objectives

- To identify and document economic security challenges faced by international migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality area

- To evaluate whether and how women migrants' educational levels influence their economic security challenges.
- To recommend how the economic security for migrant women can be improved.

1.6 Significance of the study

Findings from the current study have implications to international women migrants, their employers, the Department of Home Affairs, the scientific community and the researcher:

1.6.1 International women migrants

The study -helps us understand whether migration in the south-south context improves or deteriorates women migrants' economic security. Such knowledge is essential for guiding public policy concerning migrant workers' economic security.

1.6.2 Employers of migrant workers

The current study identified some areas of priority areas requiring improvement with regards to issues such as employment contracts that employers give to international migrant workers and work condition of migrant workers. It is envisaged that employers will take deliberate efforts to address these concerns.

1.6.3 Department of Home Affairs

The current study yielded some recommendations that consideration and auctioning by the Department of Home affairs with regards to the improvement of the economic security of international migrant women. The author hopes to receive feedback from the Department of Home Affairs concerning the feasibility of the proposed measures.

1.6.4 Scientific community

Findings from this study will be communicated to the scientific community through: (a) provision of a soft copy for online uploading by the library of the University of Free State, (b) submission of bound library copies for use by other researchers and scholars, and (c) publication of the thesis findings in a refereed journal. Such dissemination of findings to the scientific community is intended to broaden and enrich the knowledge base on financial insecurity of international migrants in South Africa.

1.6.5 Researcher

This investigation offered the researcher opportunities to enrich and sharpen her research skills with regards to conduction of qualitative studies and analysis of data. The researcher also identified priority areas to improve on in future similar investigations. Lastly, the findings also broadened the researcher's knowledge on international women migrants and economic security literature.

1.7 Scope of the study

The study focuses on international migrant women in Madibeng local Municipality area in the North West province of South Africa. It focuses on a small snowball sample of international adult female migrants with at least one length of stay in South Africa. The sample comprised international migrants employed in any field and under any contract (part-time, full-time and temporary), self-employed migrants and traders. The inclusion criteria were: being a woman who is economically-active age and having stayed in South Africa for at least one. Short-term visitors and tourists were excluded from participation in the current study.

1.8 Structure of the study

This dissertation has five chapters. Chapter one provides an introduction of the problem and outlines the research aim and objectives. Chapter two is a review of literature on economic security, international migrancy, migration trends in the SADC region and on how gender is related to the first two concepts. Chapter 3 describes the research methodology. It provides details about the study population, sampling methods, data collection procedures. Data presentation, analysis and discussion of findings is presented in chapter 4. Chapter 5 outlines the conclusions and recommendations of the study.

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter discusses available literature on the intersections of economic security, gender and migration. Migration "... is part of the social fabric, part of our very make-up as a human family... [although] the face of migration is changing ... [with] ... migrants ... coming from and, going to, more places than ever before" (Ban Ki-Moon, 2013). This chapter highlights migration trends in the Southern Africa Development Community (SADC) region, where South Africa is a regional member. In addition, the chapter presents empirical literature on economic security around the world and in the South African context. Lastly, the chapter defines and discusses economic insecurity challenges faced by international migrants

2.2 MIGRATION

2.2.1 Who is a migrant?

A migrant is "... any person who is moving or has moved across an international border or within a State away from his/her habitual place of residence, regardless of (a) the person's legal status, (b) whether the movement is voluntary or involuntary, (c) what the causes for the movement are or (d) what the length of stay is." (International Organisation for Migration, 2019). This definition does not differentiate between people whose movement is within the country or from one country to another, nor the reason for their movement. Consequently, the above definition considers the following categories of persons as migrants: (a) one who migrates from rural Limpopo to a town within the same province, (b) persons who migrate from a province in South Africa to another province in the same country (e.g. from Eastern Cape Province to the North-West province) and (c) persons from a different country (e.g. from Zimbabwe to South Africa). UNESCO (2011) defines a migrant as "...any person who lives temporarily or permanently in a country where he or she was not born, and has acquired some significant social ties to this country". This definition focuses on international migrants. In the current study, a migrant is considered to be a person who move from other countries to South Africa (other than tourists): (a) for either temporary or permanent settlement regardless of their reasons, (b) who has or lacks without proper documentation, and (c) who spends at least a year in South Africa. , The one year timeframe was based on available literature (Statistics South Africa, 2011)).

2.2.2 Migration trends in the SADC region

The number of cross-border migrants in the SADC region has remained fairly stable since 1990. South Africa is the major destination for most migrants and hosts about 52% of the SADC region's migrants. In 1990 it hosted only 29% (Crush *et al*, 2017; Crush & William 2002). While there has been a substantial increase of international migrants into South Africa, this has not been as great as the media and government officials portray (Crush and Williams, 2002). Palmary's (2016) concurs that international migration, although still significant, does not surpass internal rural-urban migration in South Africa. Moreover, past and present international migration figures for women are little understood because of lack of documentation, as the Department of Home Affairs does not breakdown migration statistics according to gender (Dodson and Crush, 2015).

South Africa, like any other country in the face of globalisation cannot encounter development without international migration (Department Home Affairs South, 2002). The highest movement within the SADC region is by economic migrants and most of them are unskilled (Mudungwe, 2014). On the contrary, South Africa as the economic power-house of the region does not offer work permits/visas to cater for this majority (Mbiyozo, 2018). Most of the South African work visas go to skilled migrants from outside the SADC region (Mbiyozo, 2018; Palmary, 2002). Such an approach excludes a substantial proportion of unskilled international migrants. In addition, the eligibility of most South African visas/permits are male-biased because they are based on male-dominated employment, capital, education and skills (Mbiyozo, 2018). In this regard, the approach lacks gender equity by segregating women. Palmary (2002) stated that the Department of Home Affairs complains that economic migrants burden the asylum application system. The White Paper on International Migration proposes to implement restrictive means for low-skilled migrants and asylum seekers (Mbiyozo, 2018). Asylum could be a way to be in the country legally, and access documentation which would enable some international migrants a chance to work legally.

Until 2000, Zimbabwe was a major destination for international migrants but it is now a major migrant exporter in the region (Crush *et al*, 2017). Between 1940 and 1980, South Africa got cheap labour from neighbouring countries for the mines, agriculture and services sector (SIHMA, 2017). Between 1990 to 2000, the Employment Bureau

of Africa (TEBA) recruited about 1.7 million international migrants from SADC countries on a seasonal basis (SIHMA, 2017). The trend of importing migrants continued even after apartheid, although South Africa also experienced brain drain (SIHMA, 2017). Compared to other regions, South Africa attracts and hosts a higher number of migrants (Statistics South Africa, 2011).

The population breakdown of international migrants' destination in South Africa is as follows: 52% are in Gauteng, 12% in the Western Cape, 8% each in KwaZulu-Natal, North West and Limpopo, 7% in Mpumalanga; 2% in Free State and Eastern Cape and only 1% in the Northern Cape (Statistics South Africa, 2011). About 23% of the migrants were living around or below the national income poverty level of R 9 600 per annum and 18% in the national food poverty group of R1000-R4 800 per annum (Statistics South Africa, 2011). The distribution of migrant labour force in sectors of the economy is as follows: 49.5% in the mining sector, 6.4% in the informal sector, 2.2% are self-employed, 1.8% are in the agriculture sector and over 1% in other sectors (SADC, 2013). Do the given employment sectors cultivate or impede economic security? There are no statistics for the other 39% international migrants' employment and one can assume they are either unemployed or self-employed. The next question will be what are the economic (in)security challenges faced by such migrants?

Although South Africa contributes to 65.7% of Southern Africa Development Community (SADC)'s Gross Domestic Product (GDP), it has the highest inequality levels with a GINI coefficient of 66 and a Human Development Index (HDI) estimate of 0.67 (UNDP, 2018). A GINI coefficient of 0 reflects absolute equality while 100 reflects absolute inequality in the distribution of income, and the HDI measures a long and healthy life, knowledge and a decent standard of living. (UNDP, 2018). Despite the elevated levels of inequality, the country's economic stability has seen an increased number of international migrants flocking into South Africa. A relatively stable democracy, infrastructure and economic stability make South Africa a common destination for migrants, with 85% of the country's work permit holders being in the economically active group (Statistics South Africa, 2011). Data on undocumented migrants is very difficult to monitor (Crush and Williams; 2010 and Dodson and Crush, 2015). Crush, Dodson, Williams and Tevera (2017) and SIHMA (2017) also argue that most migration in the SADC region is not refugee motivated but rather for economic

and livelihood reasons. Indeed, half of all international migrants to South Africa are aged between 25 and 44 which constitutes the prime working age (Crush *et al*, 2017). The neoclassical theory of migration argues that economic reasons and financial benefits are the main stimuli of migration (Haas; 2010 and Kurekova, 2011). The theory argues that people migrate from countries with very low wages to countries with higher wages (Nyasalu and Dinbabo, 2015). By contrast, the social capital theory is based on available social networks as enablers of migration (Nyasulu and Dinbabo, 2015). This theory is rooted in social relations (Kurekova, 2011). Social networks are likely to influence the destination that a migrant chose. One of the main questions that arise from these observations is: what are the economic security challenges that women migrants face in an economically stable country with very high inequality levels? Secondly, since economic deprivation is the primary push factor for most migrants, do they gain any economic security once they are in South Africa? If they do not, is there any connection to one's economic security and being an international migrant?

2.2.3 Criminalisation of migrants and migration in South Africa

The amendments to the South African Immigration Act do not prevent people who cannot meet the requirements of accessing permits/visas from entering the country. However, it criminalises undocumented international migrants (Palmary, 2002). The researcher uses "criminals" to describe undocumented international migrants because the system quickly changes international migrants to perpetrators of crime (crimes of being illegal migrants) and this affects how they can access help (Palmary, 2009). Crush and Williams (2002) remark that South African government officials equate international migrants and criminality by reporting gruesome crime statistics of armed robbery, car hi-jacking and rape with the same gravity as "illegal immigrants". The authors further quote an ex- Director general of Home Affairs who claimed that 90% of foreign nationals have fraudulent documentation without any reference or evidence. Palmary (2002) even comments that international migrants from Africa are viewed as a burden but those from other continents are seen as tourists and economic investors. The Amendments to the Immigration Act of 2002 has made it difficult for international migrant women to access visas/permits and actively discriminates against the poor and unskilled (Department of Home Affairs, 2002). Lastly, lack of documentation for

some international migrants is viewed problematic as such migrants are not traceable when they commit crimes (Landau, Segatti and Misago, 2011). Such perceptions make international migrants vulnerable because the perceptions might affect how the South Africa citizens interact with the international migrants. This is in accord to Palmary (2002) who reported that 30% of the City of Johannesburg municipal police trainees and officers believed that “foreigners cause crime”. The survey further revealed that the municipal officers had very poor understanding of the different kinds of international migrants.

2.2.4 Migrants and their work prospects in South Africa

Most international migrants work in the mines and most of these mine workers are male (Benya, 2015). There is no equivalent employment sector for women with easy entry as the mining sector. This leaves agricultural labour as an option for most international migrant women. The situation is worsened by lack of documentation and sometimes by the delay in documentation processes from the department of Home Affairs. Crush and Williams (2002) claim that mines and farms still have the freedom to contract international migrant workers but extensive sub-contracting leaves farm and mine workers more vulnerable to exploitative conditions. Such observations are in line with Benya (2015) and Valodia *et al* (2006) who note that subcontracted employees perform exactly the same duties as full-time employees but the remuneration and labour protection are not the same.

International migrants are often segregated in low-skilled occupations and are more likely to be over-qualified for their jobs (Kawar; 2016). The International Labour Organisation (ILO) (2010) labels this as brain waste or skill-mismatch. This refers to a situation where one works in a job below one’s skills and qualifications. The ILO (2010) further notes that this is prevalent with international migrant women. A skill-mismatch hinders international migrant women from making full use of their skills and potential. Valodia *et al* (2006) note that education is a determining factor on one’s salary and three quarters of low earners have do not have a qualification at NQF 1 (equivalent to grade 12), but this research was focussing mainly on South African citizens. It raises questions about whether having a higher level of education automatically increases international migrants’ chance of earning a higher salary.

2.3 EMPIRICAL ECONOMIC INSECURITY LITERATURE FROM SOUTH AFRICA

Crush *et al* (2017) note that the Department of Trade and Industry's (DTI) Draft Business Licensing Bill of 2013 states that any business, not matter how small, needs a trading licence; and international migrants would only be licenced if they have a business permit/visa and not a work permit/visa. On the other hand, the Department of Home Affairs in their Immigration Act 2002, clearly state that to qualify for business permits one should have ZAR2.5 million to invest in South Africa and such permits must be applied for in one's home country. If someone has that amount to invest, one can assume that they already have economic security. The DTI's bill therefore disadvantages and excludes poor international migrant workers in attaining economic security (Crush *et al*, 2017). Since unemployment and employment in '3-D' jobs (dirty, dangerous and demanding, or dirty, dangerous and difficult jobs) is common for international migrant women, their ability to start small businesses to improve or curb economic insecurity are significantly affected by the bill. The DTI implemented a nationally coordinated policy approach to the informal sector but the approach had anti-migrant sentiments as international migrants were identified as a challenge to the business of local small business entrepreneurs (Crush *et al*, 2017). The DTI even went further by suggesting the type of businesses in which international migrants will be permitted to participate and their own demarcated areas where they (international migrants) should be active (Crush *et al*, 2017). Rogerson in Crush *et al* (2017) notes that the policy is an anti-development approach for international migrant entrepreneurs. Charman and Piper in Crush *et al* (2017) describe the DTI's approach as "violent entrepreneurship" which uses intimidatory violence as a business strategy to drive away non-South African competitors. The formalised attack as noted by Crush *et al* (2017) has serious implications on the economic security of international migrant workers.

Another challenge faced by international migrant women, which might impact on their economic security is documentation from Home Affairs. Crush *et al* (2017) also note that opening a bank account for international migrants is a challenge because some banks believe the documentations (like the asylum seeker's permit or work

visa/permit) from the Department of Home Affairs are not as secure as the South African Identity card. There is also a challenge with the wait times and length of permits given by the Department of Home Affairs. For instance, the Zimbabwe Dispensation permit offered in 2010 has been changing names, and has a length of four years when permanent residence requires five continuous years in one permit. Its successor; the Zimbabwe Exemption Permit was finalised in February 2018, but there are still people who have not yet received their permits up to September 2019. This might result in their bank accounts being frozen if they are in the country without a permit. Regulations in the private sector make it very difficult for international migrants to open bank accounts, get cell-phone contracts and cash a cheque (Crush and William, 2002). These challenges directly affect how international migrants can access information, run a business, apply for employment and register for any training.

There have also been economic (in)security studies conducted in South Africa. De Wet (2016) researched economic insecurity among South African youth and how their economic security changed as their relationship status changed. The research found that marriage and child bearing affect economic security with single parents suffering severe economic insecurities compared to their married counterparts. De Wet's research focused on the youth, regardless of gender. The Institute for Justice and Reconciliation (IJR) conducts an annual survey on South African perceptions of economic security and well-being. In 2016, their findings indicated that 61% of the respondents' economic situations either deteriorated or never changed since 1994 and 67% of the respondents said their income and the inequality, they faced worsened or stayed the same since 1994. Secondly, if the economic situation has not improved since 1994 for above 60% of South Africa's citizens, one is left to question the economic (in)security for international migrants especially women.

Palmary is one researcher who has contributed enormously in South Africa's academic research field. One of her research projects was in Cape Town; focussing on refugees and their access to service delivery. Service delivery includes health, housing and safety among other things. Segatti and Landau (2011) note that legal migrants and refugees are entitled to service delivery at municipal level as per South Africa law; and that the Refugee Act allows refugees to access health care, seek employment and access education equally as citizens. Segatti and Landau (2011) and

Palmary (200) further on notes that there is lack of awareness at local government level to fulfil this legal obligation. In the research, Palmary (2002) quotes one official who states that it is the responsibility of central government, especially the Department of Home Affairs to provide services for all international migrants. Such utterances and views give a perception that international migrants' service delivery needs should be divorced from the needs of the citizens (Palmary, 2002). This is contrary to the South African constitution which advocates for equal rights for all that are within the Republic; and the Refugee Act which states that refugees should assimilate with the general South African communities. A failure by the local government to deliver basic services as stipulated by law might contribute to international migrants' economic challenges (Palmary, 2009).

Additional research on international migrants in South Africa was undertaken by Clacherty (2014) and Clacherty and Walker (2014). Clacherty (2014) describes the Suitcase Project that was conducted in Johannesburg and focussed on male migrant children aged between nine and seventeen. Most of these children were unaccompanied and had been through traumatic experiences in their home countries. The children were housed in Hilbrow and supported by a church organisation in the same suburb. The research concluded that there were greater levels of xenophobia directed against the older boys and this meant they lived in fear. The research also noted that the police around Hilbrow target male foreigners and only a bribe at the police station would free them. The Suitcase Project used art to explore identities and tell stories with these international migrant boys. Finding accommodation in the church helped the children to access basic services. However, uncertainty always lay ahead for those who turned 18, because the shelter only accommodates the boys until they were 18 years old.

The Wardrobe project (Walker and Clacherty, 2014) was conducted in down-town Johannesburg in a shelter at the St. Saviour church. The shelter accommodates about 120 women with most women being South Africans and a few being nationals of Zimbabwe, Swaziland, Democratic Republic of Congo and Malawi. Walker and Clacherty (2014) observes that: there are a few NGOs that focus on women in South Africa and most are not government funded. Also, a third of the South African shelters are church-based, meaning there is an inclination to religion; and also, most shelters

are in urban areas primarily Johannesburg, Durban and Cape Town and have very long waiting lists. This seems to confirm Palmary's (2009) remark that there is a high concentration of NGOs and better opportunities in cities than in border towns and rural areas. Madibeng local municipality is mostly rural, and has one shelter for abused women and children, Grace Help Centre in Mooinooi. This shelter caters for the whole North West province, but this raises issues of over-crowding and possible long waiting lists. Having a few shelters that focus on women only indirectly negatively affects the quality and chances of help that women will get. Secondly, having as many as a third of shelters being church based means that some women will not get assistance because of a feeling of religious intrusion. Not having adequate shelters that help women might have effects on how vulnerable women access assistance.

The employees at St. Saviour's shelter noted that there were no explicit tensions among residents based on race but there were tensions based on nationality (Clacherty, 2014; Clacherty and Walker, 2014).). The researchers also noticed that South African women in the Wardrobe Project made a clear distinction between themselves and migrant women. The research also found that most international migrant women at the shelter migrated to escape poverty, conflict or risk but on arrival in Johannesburg would stay with a man who would promise them work and accommodation but end up having an abusive intimate relationship with them. One of the research participants had a diploma in education and childcare but struggled to find work. Walker and Clacherty (2014) noted that struggles of finding work were common for all women in the Wardrobe Project (citizens and international migrants). To qualify for admission to the shelter women should be abused by their intimate partners or homeless. These criteria left a lot of women out in the cold. The shelter has a clinic that caters for all in the shelter and surrounding areas. Migrants reported experiencing negative attitudes and discrimination by service providers (Walker and Clacherty, 2014). The research noted that during the research, only one woman out of 120 women in five years got a permanent job and changed her situation. It was also difficult for international migrants especially those with no documentation to get any job (Walker and Clacherty, 2014). This demonstrates the "... precariousness of the women's situation and the kinds of uncertainties they are forced to live with before, during and after their time at the shelter" (Walker and Clacherty, 2014:41).

Lakika, Kankode and Ritchters (2014) investigated the forms of support available to migrants around Johannesburg. They reported that shelter, food and access to healthcare were the main forms of support rendered to migrants. All these essential needs form part of economic security. Lakika, Kankode and Ritchters (2014) indicated that most interviewed respondents reported that they only would only access public health services when referred by the CSVR or the Bienvenu shelter. One respondent slammed the fund-raising approaches of the NGOs as the respondents were “asked” (which the respondents felt as coercion in exchange for services) to re-tell their anguish to strangers. Most international migrants orally learn about shelters, NGOs and access to services from fellow migrants (Lakika, Kankode and Ritchters, 2014). This meant that there is no clear and easy access to documented information by international migrants to get help. This might also be a hinderance to solving economic challenges they might be facing. In addition, Lakika, Kankode and Ritchters (2014) reported that all studied migrants complained about xenophobic attitudes towards them especially from public health providers.

Palmary (2009) focused on children who migrated (into South Africa) alone or with adults and on those that remained behind when their parents migrate into South Africa. According to Palmary (2009) international migrants without their children are financially much better than those with children and most children who migrate with their parents are vulnerable. International migrants without children earn more than those who travel with children. The research did not give any reason but one can assume that child-care time affects the type of work one can do and one’s total working hours. One can also deduce that migrating with children poses a significant financial burden to their parents and increases the international migrant children’s vulnerability. Palmary (2009) also reported that 76% of international migrant children in Musina and Komatiport were boys with the youngest being 7 years old and the eldest 18 years old. She further argued that there is a high possibility that girls were invisible as domestic workers or sex workers. Palmary’s (2009) research went further to document that 96% international migrant children in Johannesburg were in school, with only a few employed in exploitative conditions and an astounding 94% and 63% in Musina and Komatiport respectively were not in school. Palmary (2009) concluded that there were gaps in service delivery for unaccompanied minors especially on health and other basic rights. There is lack of implementation to secure children’s rights although the

constitution, policy and legal framework are in place. All the respondents of this thesis did not have any children within the republic. Eight women said they sent their children to their home countries when it was time to register them at school because they did not have any necessary documentation.

Benya's research on (2015) focussed on women mine workers in the platinum mines around Rustenburg and reported documented several scenarios that disadvantaged women mine workers' economic security efforts. South African mines use subcontracting to evade labour laws, lower labour costs and make it easy to terminate workers' contracts (Benya, 2015). Sub-contracting erodes the contracted workers' labour rights like the right to organise a strike or join an independent workers' union. (Crush *et al*, 2010). This contributes to insecure employment conditions because without a union, one has no voice or bargaining power. Insecure employment leads to economic security. It creates anxiety on one's economic security perceived economic (in)security and higher probabilities of neglect from the employer on further training and protection.

Benya (2015) found that a number of South African mining policies that seek to promote local employment of women were highly problematic. It is important to note that the South African mining industry is inherently masculine in nature. It predominantly depends on local male migrant labour force and on regional labour force (Lesotho, Botswana, Swaziland, and Mozambique) (Mathur-Helm, 2018). The recruitment policy in the mining sector stipulates that women that employed in the industry should live within 60km radius from the mine (Mathur-Helm, 2018). Benya (2015) highlighted that this policy was strictly enforced because unions do not want to separate women from their families and destabilise their homes. Such policies discriminate against women and treat them as primarily home-makers. The policies view working and being economically secure as a secondary need for women. Such an observation is in line with Pienaar, Naidoo and Malope (2018) who note that there are disparities in the workplace are notable in the treatment of women and the provision of benefits and rights to women by treating women as child-bearing members of society.

Benya (2015) also found that sub-contracted workers belonged to “sweetheart” or “phony” unions and affiliation to these unions was compulsory only as a way to be compliant with the Chamber of Mines; not that the interests of the subcontracted workers were actually being fulfilled. “Sweetheart and phony” unions are unions that are created to fulfil compliance on paper without real representing the needs of the union members. Women raised several issues that facilitated their economic (in)security (Benya, 2015). Among other issues, women complained of affiliation to unions but with lack of representation, their complaints being gendered and not taken seriously, sexual harassment and such cases being ignored, and constructive dismissal where one is isolated and alienated and given an unrecognised job category. The above complaints create discrimination for women in the mining sector. Such gender-inclined unfair practices affect the women’s economic security. Sexual harassment can lead to insecurity because it can affect one’s performance at work.

Benya (2015) also notes that some sub-contractors do not give any employment contracts and this makes them “susceptible to arbitrary dismissal”. She further reported that full-time employees have adequate Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) from the mine but most contractors are expected to acquire their own or the mine provides on a credit system. Without PPE, mine workers are exposed to health and safety hazards like loss of eye-sight or hearing which will later render them useless to the mines and unemployable. Once they are unemployable, they experience economic insecurity. Subcontractors also complained of being denied medical care and their employers asked the subcontract employees to visit public hospitals for work-related injuries and thereby forfeiting any compensation because their work injuries will not be recorded. Subcontracted workers are paid irregularly and have no social benefits, such as the disability income protection and other payments that compensate any work-related injury. (Benya, 2015).

Mathur-Helm (2018) conducted a research on blue-collar jobs (clothing and textile factories) in South Africa. She noted that women workers were confined to low-paying and low-status jobs, earning less than men for equal work. The study also reported that pregnancy and maternity also work against women and become barriers for those

in blue-collar jobs because their pay stagnates as soon as they become pregnant and male workers are seen as a better fit employees because they have no maternity leave to “disturb” their commitment to work (Mathur-Helm, 2018). Mathur-Helm (2018) also reported that blue-collar employees lack HR interventions in terms of compensation policy, pay disparity, working conditions, leave, and health benefits. Men had an advantage over women, as they operated bigger and wider machines, while women operated smaller machines (Mathur-Helm, 2018). This created an advantage for men to earn better than women. Martha-Helm (2018) argued that the men and women have the same outputs but women were perceived to be less productive and as doing easy jobs, which reflected in their wages.

The hospitality industry is another sector that employs many international migrants (Vettori, 2018). Lack of union association is the main cause for precarity in the in this sector (Vettori, 2018). Possible reasons of low union membership in the hospitality sector include irregular working hours, fixed-term contracts, seasonal work and part-time work (Vettori, 2018). Although Vettori (2018) identifies these factors as reasons for lower membership, they also qualify to be referred to as causes of economic insecurity among hospitality workers.

2.4 CONCEPTUALISATION AND KEY VARIABLES OF ECONOMIC (IN)SECURITY

The focus of this thesis was on the micro-level of economic (in)security. The micro-level economic security is a component of human security which identifies poverty and unemployment as threats to an individual’s security. The referents for this thesis are individuals and households. The research documented the economic insecurities experienced by international migrant women in Madibeng and how this population group tries to achieve and secure economic security.

2.4.1 Defining economic security

Osberg (2011) describes economic insecurity as an “... anxiety produced by the lack of economic safety”. Shafique (2018) defines economic security as “(t)he degree of

confidence that a person can have in maintaining a decent quality of life now and in the future, given their economic financial circumstances”. Shafique (2018) elucidates that economic insecurity “... is a harmful volatility in people’s economic conditions that incorporates exposure to objective and perceived risks to the people’s well-being and their capacity to prepare, respond and recover from shocks and adverse events.” Shafique’s (2018) definition is consistent with Osberg, with regards to the concept of economic certainty, which refers to a scenario where one has no anxiety about their economic and financial safety.

According to the International Committee of the Red Cross (2004) economic security refers to the “... condition of individuals, households or communities able to cover their essential needs and unavoidable expenditure in a sustainable manner, given physiological requirements, the environment and prevailing cultural standards” Examples of essential needs are food, basic shelter, clothing and hygiene while related expenditure includes unavoidable costs such as taxes and livelihood-supporting activities (e.g. health and education). The International Committee of the Red Cross’ definition does not only dwell on anxiety and certainty in relation to one’s financial conditions but goes further to include meeting one’s indispensable necessities and inevitable expenditure in a sustainable manner. The definition portrays fulfilling one’s essential needs as not only a once-off activity, but a lifelong engagement. Lastly, the definition also looks at the fulfilment of these needs viz a viz “... physiological requirements, the environment and prevailing cultural standards”.

The above definitions of economic security allude to a case of uncertainty in relation to one’s economic safety and ability to live a fulfilling life. There is also reference to time (connoted by the use of past, present and future) reminding us that overall economic security is based on one’s past experiences, current economic condition and expectations for the future. This implies that one’s economic security can change for the better or worse.

A distinction can also be made between the subjective and objective connotations of economic security (Shafique, 2018). The subjective part of economic security draws from one’s experience (present and past) and expectations (future) while the objective lies between the past and future (as the current reality that one is facing). Shafique

(2018) identifies the objective factors of economic security as income, employment, savings and personal debt. Such factors are tied to decent work (that gives a living wage, has predictable patterns of income and decent conditions) and financial protection (which is ensured by issues like parental leave, sick pay, life insurance and other elements of lifetime financial security). The objective concept of economic security is not only about being employed but the quality of work, the assurance and stability of saved income that will enhance one's ability to meet any shocks and enable one to respond well and recover from the shocks.

The subjective factors of economic security are perceptions of security and future risks (Shafique, 2018). In other words, they mean the felt experience of the economy. This is what Kosny and Piotrowska (2013) refer to as a risk, fear or perception of economic loss. Thus, subjective elements of economic security are largely based on feelings (emotions) and perceptions. Nesarudai (2005) referred to human security as "freedom from fear and freedom from want". When applying this concept to economic (in)security, "freedom from fear" can be classified as the subjective part of economic security and "freedom from want" can be categorised as objective economic security.

2.4.2 Aspects and elements of economic security

The International Labour Organisation (2004) identified two aspects of economic security. These are (a) basic social security, which is concerned with social protection and access to basic services (e.g. health, education, housing, information), and (b) work-related security. This work-related economic security has eight further elements (Kosny and Piotrowska, 2013; Chernyshev, 2005 and ILO, 2004): The eight elements are described in Table 1.

Table 1. Work-related elements of economic security

Labour market security	Adequate employment opportunities and adequate salary for the job.
Basic needs security	Capacity for fulfilling a focused intervention by safeguarding one's subsistence or basic well-being
Job security	Ability to perform tasks compatible with the interests of workers; training opportunities, career development.
Skill reproduction security	Opportunities to gain and retain skills and access to training opportunities and guaranteed leave.
Income security	The protection of income through pegging of minimum wages, having a pre-determined wage guide, comprehensive social security and taxation to reduce inequality during employment, after retirement and during illness
Employment security	The protection against arbitrary, sudden or unjustified dismissal, and protection against loss of income-giving work
Work security	The protection against accidents and illness at work, through safety and health regulations, and limits in working time, unsociable hours and protecting employees from excessive stress.
Representation security	This refers to the rights of individuals as well as to the existence of competent and independent trade unions. It encompasses the protection of collective voice, independent trade unions and employers' associations

Table 1: adopted from Kosny and Piotrowska, 2013; Chernyshev, 2005 and ILO, 2004

These elements leave a gap on how to evaluate the economic (in)security of the unemployed, self-employed and informally-employed. The elements give an impression that only formal employment can fulfil economic security. In order to have a sound analytic frame for data analysis in chapter 4, I will incorporate the different aspects from the definitions of economic security. On top of the elements listed above, I will use access to basic social security and essential needs (Red Cross, 2004); anxiety caused by lack (D'Ambrosio and Bossert, 2011) and confidence of sustaining

a decent lifestyle now and in the future (Shafique, 2018) as criteria by which to assess the economic situation of the participants in this study.

2.5 CONCLUSION

Economic security is defined as the concern about several risks and uncertainties that people experience and anticipate based on their current financial situation. There are two aspects of economic security which are work-related aspects and access to basic services. Migration in the SADC region has not increased per se but there have been some shifts on the primary migrant senders and migrant receivers. The empirical literature section has several examples of the economic security challenges that were faced by women in general. Empirical literature reflected that gender-inequality and international migrancy have an influence on women's economic freedom.

The empirical literature discussed above raised some interesting observations. The Department of Home Affairs (2002) acknowledges that South Africa needs international migration in order for the country to experience development. On the other hand, the approach by the DTI discourages the involvement of international migrants in small businesses. This presents a conflict of policy by departments of the same government. The white paper on International Migration proposes a restrictive means to low-skilled migrant workers. When the Immigration Act of 2002 made the access to permits difficult, international migrants did not stop coming to South Africa as undocumented migrants. It just turned the international migrants into illegal migrants instead. The mining sector has been the highest employer of international migrants, but Benya (2015) documented precarious situations that are faced by women mine workers in the sector. If mines are evading labour laws by engaging sub-contractors, what are other sectors doing to evade the labour laws.

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION AND RESEARCH AIMS

This chapter presents the research design and methodology used in this study. The objectives of the study were to: (a) identify and document economic security challenges of international migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality area, (b) assess the kinds of economic security challenges among women migrants, evaluate how women migrants' educational level in the country influences their economic security challenges, (c) and (d) recommend how the economic security for migrant women can be improved. The study also sought to understand whether migration in the south-south context improves or deteriorates women migrants' economic security.

3.2 RESEARCH METHOD AND DESIGN

The research was qualitative and exploratory in nature. Qualitative research emphasises words rather than quantification in the collection and analysis of data and helps to capture the socially constructed nature of reality in a particular context (Bryman, 2016). Qualitative research also helps to identify intangible factors (e.g. participation, communication mechanisms, behaviours, power relations and opinions) which are difficult to quantify yet worthy of research (Bryman, 2016). Maree (2016) further defines qualitative research as an interpretation of the social meaning people (participants) attribute to their experiences, circumstances and situations. Babbie (2008) highlights that qualitative interviews should be based on a small set of topics to be discussed in depth.

3.3 SAMPLING

Snow-ball sampling was used to select the study sample (19 participants). Snowballing is non-probability sampling method which can be considered as a form of accidental sampling where respondents located based on personal contacts and referrals by the others (Babbie, 2008). The method is appropriate when the population falls into a special group of people such as homeless individuals, migrant workers and undocumented migrants (Babbie, 2008). This method was selected because the research was on international migrants and some migrants might fear to be identified given the prevailing xenophobic climate in South Africa. Secondly, some migrants are undocumented and might conceal their identity for fear of authorities and deportation.

Such a fear would make it difficult for the researcher to find enough participants to the research. The decision to use snowball sampling was further justified because the data-collection in mid-September coincided with new “xenophobic” attacks in Gauteng and calls for international migrants to leave South Africa.

The first participants were chosen to fit as closely as possible in the following criteria: (a) international migrants who probably do not know each other, (b) live and work in different locations within the municipality, (c) who are in different jobs, (d) who are of different age-groups and (e) who have stayed in South Africa for different lengths of time. The assumption was that this maximum variation sampling (Noy in Tracy, 2013) would help curb the chances of involving a homogenous group of international migrant women. I visited international migrants I knew around Madibeng Local Municipality for referrals with the first interview respondents. My first consultations were in Majakaneng village, Bapong village, Brits CBD, Oukasie old location, Bokfontein and Hartbeespoort dam. I got initial respondents in all the places except Hartbeespoort dam, where no international migrant showed any interest. Hartbeespoort dam area has some leafy suburbs and some “rich” people. Thereafter, referrals were used to locate the next respondent who matched the desired profile. All respondents who stayed outside the researcher’s location were given taxi fare from their place of residence to the interview venue and back. No other compensation was given to the participants.

3.4 DESCRIPTION OF RESPONDENTS

Nineteen semi-structured interviews with international migrant women were conducted in the data-collection phase. Only international migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality were considered. All respondents were above the age of eighteen and have been in the country for more than one year. Their exact ages were not asked as the Ethics Committee suggested that it was a very sensitive question. I only confirmed that they were above eighteen. The demographic profile of the study participants is shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Country of origin and employment status of the respondents

Participant	Country of origin	Occupation	Highest of Education	Years in SA
A	Mozambique	Farm-worker	Primary education	8
B	Zimbabwe	Goods-seller (door-to-door)	Did not disclose	5
C	Zimbabwe	Waitress	Diploma in Sales and Marketing	3
D	Malawi	Farm-worker	Dropped in secondary school	6
E	Zimbabwe	Farm-worker	Dropped in secondary school	10
F	Malawi	Farm-worker	Dropped in secondary school	8
G	Zimbabwe	Adult education facilitator contracted in a mine	Three-year Bachelor's degree	9
I	Mozambique	Fruit and vegetable seller (Stall)	Completed primary education	3
H	Zimbabwe	Goods-seller (door-to-door)	Completed secondary education	6
J	Mozambique	Farm-worker	Did not disclose	9
K	Zimbabwe	Goods-seller (door-to-door)	Completed secondary education	12
L	Zimbabwe	Farm-worker	Completed secondary education	5
M	Mozambique	Farm-worker	Did not disclose	9
N	Zimbabwe	Goods-seller (door-to-door)	Completed secondary education	13
O	Zimbabwe	Farm-worker	Secretarial course in a Polytechnic college	6
P	Mozambique	Farm-worker	Dropped in a secondary school	10

Q	Zimbabwe	Goods-seller (door-to-door)	Completed secondary school	4
R	Zimbabwe	Farm-worker	Did not disclose	7
S	Malawi	Waitress	Three-year diploma	8

In total, there were 10 farm-workers of 4 were from Zimbabwe, 4 from Mozambique and 2 from Malawi. There was one Adult education facilitator working for a mine sub-contractor. She was from Zimbabwe. Of the 2 restaurant workers, one was from Zimbabwe and the other from Malawi. Self-employed workers were 6 in total. Five (5) of them routinely sold various goods to households (door to door) around the local municipality. The 6th participant was stall-based fruit and vegetables vendor.

All respondents were from the SADC region. Zimbabwe had the most respondents, followed by Mozambique and lastly Malawi. Because the sample was small, it was not clear if Crush's *et al* (2017) assertion that most international migrants are economic migrants and most migrants were from the region could be evaluated.

3.5 DATA COLLECTION STRATEGY

The study used in-depth, face to face semi-structured qualitative interviews. I had an interview-guide with a list of specific aspects to be covered, and asked open-ended questions that allowed for a discussion with the interviewee (see Addendum A). I conducted all the interviews by myself. Creswell (2009) mentions that the researcher is the key instrument in data collection. Semi-structured interviews were chosen because they allow for an intensive and detailed examination of a case (Bryman, 2016). Such an approach enabled the researcher to ask follow-up questions and probe responses where the responses were not clear. The one-on-one semi-structured interviews also enabled the researcher to ask about people's experiences, understandings and perceptions of their own economic security challenges.

I explained to potential participants that I am a student and was conducting research for a mini-dissertation to fulfil her Master's degree requirements by conducting research. I am an international migrant herself and the research took place at the researcher's house. The respondents felt safer in my house than any other public areas. I asked my family to leave while the interviews were taking place and not to

meet the respondents. Interviews took between about one hour and one hour thirty minutes. The proposal had planned for 45 minutes to one hour. I audio-recorded and transcribed all interviews, with no visual recording or identifying respondents with names. There were times where I would code-switch to SeTswana or Xitsonga when the respondent would not understand me.

Questions in Addendum A were not followed rigidly. They were only used as a guideline. Some questions were not asked in the order that they appear in the interview guide and others were asked that were not in the original interview guide. For example, respondents were asked if they knew the legal minimum wage in South Africa. This question is not part of the original interview schedule. Self-employed respondents were also asked questions like: "What were some of the challenges you face in your business? Have you ever got assistance from any government or private sector organisation? If yes please elaborate on the type of assistance? If no, what were the reasons for the denial of getting the assistance?" There was also a question that asked whether social relations influenced their decision in deciding to migrate to South Africa.

There were several changes from the proposal during data collection. I had planned to conduct interviews from mid-June to early July during school holidays, as I am a teacher. However, there were delays in the ethics clearance process which resulted in data-collection being moved to August and September. There were also attacks on foreign nationals in Gauteng in early September 2019. I then postponed all scheduled interviews so that the respondents would feel safe. Interviews were later resumed on the 22nd September and concluded on the 29th September. The interviews were concluded after nineteen people were interviewed instead of the initial twenty that were proposed. The changes did not affect the findings as Creswell (2009) also explains that qualitative research can be based on an emergent design because the initial plan is not tightly prescribed.

The interview guide questions were sent to participants in advance to improve their preparedness for the interview. This was not in the proposal, but was decided on later when the researcher was experiencing delays and the interviews were taking longer than anticipated. The interviews solicited information on the respondents' economic (in)security situation within South Africa in comparison to their home-country or in

comparison to the period of transit to South Africa. Questions also touched on basic social aspects of economic security, social protection and labour related aspects. Some self-employed participants were also interviewed but did not respond to the social protection and labour related aspects of economic (in)security.

All interview sessions were audio recorded with the respondents' consent. Bryman (2016) cautions that respondents' responses must be recorded verbatim to avoid errors. The researcher took notes to complement the audio recording and also for further questions that needed further clarity during the interview.

3.6 ETHICS

This thesis identified international migrants as a vulnerable population. The IOM (2007) stated that human mobility can be read as a barometer of both resilience and vulnerability. Being in a foreign country creates vulnerability and might expose migrants to new risks such as exploitation. Resilience can be a surviving strategy from the difficult situations that migrants are commonly exposed to. Hurst in Bracken-Roche et al. (2017) reported that vulnerable people are those that have "...an identifiably increased likelihood of incurring additional or greater wrong". The United States of America Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues (2016) pointed out that "... vulnerability ... stem(s) from a person's inability or impaired ability to give ethically or legal valid consent, or from a situation or circumstance ... that puts an individual or group of individuals at greater risk of being exploited or unfairly taken advantage of in the research setting".

From the above definitions, vulnerability is a "condition" that can affect one's ability to protect their own interest based on individual and/or situational factors. It therefore calls for a researcher to take the responsibility to be more sensitive towards those with limited or compromised autonomy. International migrant women can be classified as vulnerable people because of being women (in a gender-unequal world) and being in a foreign country (which indirectly means they might have lost some of their networks and support systems).

Social scientists usually conduct their research with people. This gives a rise to ethical issues that must be observed. First, no interviews were conducted before the Ethics Committee from the University of the Free State gave an ethical clearance certificate (attached Addendum C). Second, some of the general ethical agreements in social research are: voluntary, informed participation, no harm to participants, anonymity and confidentiality, and no deception (Babbie, 2008). The researcher considered all the ethics listed above throughout the research. Bryman (2016) identifies harm to include physical, reputational and emotional harm. The author was careful such that there was no physical harm, a cause for embarrassment, humiliation and emotional stress to respondents. Written and verbal consent was obtained from the study participants (see Addendum B). Participants had the choice to withdraw from the interview anytime if they felt that they were no longer willing to continue with the study (Bryman, 2016). The researcher also emphasised that the participants were free to decline to answer some questions that they did not feel like answering. All participants were identified using letter of the alphabet; with 1 being the first respondent, 2 the second and so on. No names were used to ensure that the participants' identity was concealed. The use of pseudonyms helps to ensure privacy, anonymity and confidentiality. All the participants were briefed on the objectives of the research. Although an effort was made to treat participants respectfully through-out the research, it is only the respondents that can judge if they felt respected or not.

3.7 DATA ANALYSIS

Data analysis involves consolidating, summarising what people said and making sense of data (Merriam, 2009). All audio collected data were transcribed and saved as per pseudonyms that the researcher had allocated to the respondents. There was no particular time that was allocated for transcribing; it was done simultaneously with interviews (Creswell, 2009). The researcher identified parts of the data that answer the study questions (Merriam, 2009). Braun and Clarke (2006) advice that theoretical thematic analysis would be driven by the researcher's theoretical or analytic interest. The researcher focused on the analysis of eight elements of work-related social security, basic social security and social protection. Relevant examples that fitted in these areas were identified in the gathered data and included Basic social security,

social protection and the eight elements of work-related social security were used in grouping and analysing the findings.

CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

4.1 RECAP ON RESEARCH AIM AND OBJECTIVES

This study aimed to assess economic security challenges faced by migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality area. The study objectives were to: (a) identify and document economic security challenges of international migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality area, (b) evaluate how women migrants' educational level country influences their economic security challenges, and (c) recommend how the economic security for migrant women can be improved.

4.2 FINDINGS

The findings of the current study are presented under two main section. The first section details respondents' experiences well before they entered South Africa and their current basic social security and access to essential needs. The second section discusses of the findings in terms of the eight elements of work-related economic security. The various definitions of economic security that were cited in the literature review will also be considered when analysing the findings. These will involve all 19 respondents.

4.2.1 "Pull" and "push" migration factors

All respondents reported that they viewed themselves as economic migrants. This was in response to the questions: Do you see yourself as an economic migrant? What could be the reason for you to be a migrant? That is, what were the push and pull factors?

Some of the responses were:

"If things were well at home, I would not be here".

When asked to clarify what exactly she meant by "things" she said,

"There are no jobs in Zimbabwe. (sigh) It is very tough. The educated are not working. If you try to sell there are no customers because everyone is broke. I am here because I need money." (Extract 1, Participant B; August 2019)

Another respondent had the following to say from the above question:

"The political situation which made the economic crisis forced me to come to South Africa. I was seeking better living conditions, due to the political situation

in Zimbabwe which lead to the closure of many companies and the value of the local currency deteriorating life became difficult. If it was politics only, I would have soldiered on. But when you cannot feed yourself and children, it is natural to move. So, it was either South Africa or Botswana and I chose South Africa.” (Extract 2, Participant I; September 2019).

All Zimbabweans ($n = 11$) pointed out that the economic melt-down in the country was the main cause of their decision to migrate. The political situation was only mentioned as a cause for the economic hardships that were experienced, not as a direct push factor.

When the same questions were asked to Malawians ($n = 3$) and Mozambicans ($n = 5$), their reasons for migrating were also economic. Apart from securing jobs in South African, respondents mentioned the advantage of the South African Rand having more value compared to the Malawian Kwacha and the Mozambican Metallica.

The question was: “Do you see your-self as an economic migrant? What could be the reason for you to be a migrant? That is, what were the push and pull factors?”

One Malawian answered the questions as follows:

“I came to South Africa for work. My parents used to work in Rhodesia; today’s Zimbabwe during the Federation. When things became bad for Zimbabwe, South Africa was a choice because of jobs. The money is powerful. One rand gives me fifty kwacha. You see how it is. Money made me come here.” (Extract 3, Participant F; August 2019)

These factors are in line with the neoclassical theory (Haas, 2010; Nyasalu and Dinbabo, 2015 and Kurekova, 2011) that emphasises economic factors, especially difference in wages and employment conditions, as a predominant cause of migration. Economic incentives are both a push and a pull factor for all the interviewed migrants in South Africa. Lack of employment at home was reported as a push factor (for all 19 respondents) while the prospect of being employed and earning money with a good currency exchange rate was considered a pull factor (for eight of the respondents).

Respondents were asked: What are some of the considerations you took before deciding to come to South Africa? Social networks played a crucial factor for the migrants to decide which country to visit. There were migrants who mentioned that they chose South Africa because they knew someone who was already in South Africa, and this made their travel arrangements much easier. This is evident from a response given by study participant who said:

“When deciding to come to South Africa, it was easy because I would find sleeping place. Most of our brothers, sisters and neighbours have been coming to South Africa for years. I have options of someone who will give me a way, I mean direction; shelter, food, a plan to get a job or ask their white man to hire me.” (Extract 4, Participant A; August 2019)

After this response, I included a question in future interviews about social networks as a contributing factor to come to South Africa or relocate to Madibeng Local Municipality if the municipality was not the migrant’s initial destination. For all participants ($n = 19$), their final destination was because the respondents requested or were called by someone they knew. None of the respondents just appeared in Madibeng Local Municipality without someone they knew. They all explained that they were called for work, or offered accommodation and then learnt what to do to find some kind of employment. Migrants emphasised the importance of existing networks of friends and family in South Africa that helped in deciding to come to South Africa. This was in line with the social capital theory of migration which states that people will move to communities consisting of people similar to them (Tiebout in Glazier and Kondo, 2007).

4.2.2 Worst economic security challenges

The research found out that the worst economic security challenges were experienced in the home country for all Zimbabweans, and in transit and on arrival for some respondents from the other two countries (Mozambique and Malawi). Overall, participants said that over the long term, their situation improved with the time they spent in South Africa.

Some of the responses to: “What was your worst economic security challenge and where/when did it happen?” were:

“My worst economic security challenge was in 2008 when my salary of millions was a mere R72. When I looked at the money, I could tell that it would not transport me to work for the whole month and also provide me with food and rentals. When I got to South Africa it became worse because I did not even have the R72.” (Extract 5, Participant C; August 2019)

“When I first got to South Africa in 2010 life was worse. I was broke, and needing transport money to go and find jobs, money for food. It was worse than my situation back home. I worked for a plate of food, just food! Right now, things are better, but I cannot forget 2010 suffering.” (Extract 6, Participant M; September 2019)

These responses show that one’s economic (in)security can change over time. I also derived that even when there were economic pull and push factors considered before leaving one’s home country, entering South Africa alone was not a solution. Depending on circumstances, some respondents became broke and face severe economic challenges compared to when they were their home countries. However, with time, their economic insecurities changed for the better as they created networks within their communities.

All three Malawians mentioned that they experienced the worst economic insecurity both in transit and soon after arrival. One Malawian had this to say:

“Malawi is too far, travelling money is never enough. We cross many borders come to South Africa. Sister, its bribe after bribe to cross the two countries. Especially with South, you pay to get more days at the border. Plus, bus-fare for the long journey. No good food futhi. You even arrive in South Africa with no Tambala.” (Extract 7, Participant F; August 2019)

A Tambala is a monetary unit of Malawi that is equal to one hundredth of a kwacha. From the three respondents I learnt that the distance from Malawi to South Africa meant that more money was needed to reach South Africa. This could mean that distance negatively affects the international migrants’ economic security because they

have to spend a lot of money to travel between the two countries. This could also mean that the amount of money one has or can access has an influence on the decision to migrate or not and one's destination.

Another respondent mentioned that her worst year of economic insecurity was 2008 in Zimbabwe before migrating to South Africa. She said:

“End 2008, I was a widow working as a civil servant, earning equivalent to R30. My two sons were my sole responsibility. One was in university. How would I feed us and send the boy to university? I had to choose between staying in my home country and my kids drop-out from school or migrating and fend for the family.” (Extract 8, Participant I; August 2019)

The extract shows that some decisions to migrate are executed after taking into consideration family responsibilities. Secondly, a change on one's social relation can also affect one's economic security. Participant 9 mentions that she was a widow. When she was asked if being a widow caused her economic insecurity, she said that not necessarily, but sourcing an income for the family became her responsibility. This showed that there are times when changes in social relations leave people with economic insecurity.

All the nineteen respondents indicated that they are employed. Of the nineteen respondents, five had tertiary qualifications. Of these five, only the AET facilitator was working in the field that almost what she was trained (training environment). The respondent indicated that she was hired based on her lower qualification, and had later studied two different qualifications that were not related to her initial qualification. She indicated that she has failed to get better working jobs that matched her new qualifications. She believes this is mainly because of the South African government policies that prescribe that there should be an extensive search and failure to secure a citizen employee before an international migrant can be considered for any job. The other four with tertiary qualifications were working in different fields ranging from restaurant waitressing to door-to-door vending. This finding confirms the concept of skill-mismatch (ILO, 2010; Kwarar, 2016). Valodia *et al* (2006) mentions that in South Africa one's level of education is a determining factor on one's salary. However, this was not the case for five of the women in the research. Therefore, being employed on

a lower qualification when you have higher qualifications is a disadvantage because one's salary is pegged lower than they deserve.

4.2.3 Basic social security and access to essential needs

The respondents were asked to narrate their access to services like housing, health and education for their dependents. All the respondents highlighted that their school-going children were attending school in their home countries. They indicated that this reduced the burden of paying for child-care with the little money they earned. All the other services were grouped as be satisfactory except access to health which had its own troubles.

“There are two services that we struggle to get. The clinic is a big problem. We have to produce passports or IDs by the gate. We make plans. But when inside, there are some sisters when they know you are a foreigner, they treat you rough.” (Extract 9, Participant P; September 2019)

Apart from enduring the long queues, there were also complaints of negative attitudes of some nurses in some clinics towards international migrants. This was mentioned by all respondents. All the respondents said they favour visiting a private doctor if they have money because they felt the public clinics were not reliable to foreigners. There was also a problem of long queues and over-crowding in clinic which could mean that one would spend the whole day seeking attention. However, when asked if long queues affected them only, respondents said that the queues were generally long and this affected everyone that visited the clinic regardless of nationality and gender. The respondents explained that this indirectly meant loss of income because any sick-leave was unpaid for all farm workers and restaurant workers. Vendors also argued that their absence from their businesses meant loss of income; and visiting a doctor would only be for a short time compared to public clinics.

4.2.4 Labour market security

The six self-employed employees said their work relied on the demand and the weather. All six self-employed respondents mentioned that given a choice they would rather be working somewhere else than being traders. This is in line with the observations made by Kalitanyi, and Visser (2010) who reported that lack of

employment forces migrants who do not find work to enter necessity - based entrepreneurship. The minimum hourly wage of farm workers in R16.25. Of all the ten respondents, none of them was sure of the rate that they got at work. One respondent said it is around R16 but was not sure. The other four claimed it was R14. The last five said they do not know. When I look at the hourly rate stipulated by the government, I can conclude that it does not help with any economic security. The figure is very low.

4.2.5 Skill production security

All farm employees said they are offered various on-the-job training to improve how they perform their duties. However, one respondent said:

“They only train and workshop us but they don’t give us certificates. They just want to improve their produces, not helping us to be better or to be our own bosses.” (Extract 10, Participant P; September 2019)

All the other training that would require certification required the respondents to pay for themselves. Most of them claimed they do not afford nor have the strength to study because they will be tired after work. Skills reproduction involves acquiring new skills and accessing training opportunities and getting guaranteed leave. In this case above, the respondent is only given training that will benefit the organisation only; without any personal skills development that the organisation contributes to. There is a wish of leading a better economically secure life by the respondent when she mentions that the company does not help her to be her own “boss”. Such an ambition cannot materialise because of lack of skills and support from the employers. The salary that the respondents were earning was very low; and the training only keeps them relying on the company for salaries.

4.2.6 Income security

The respondents said that getting a stable income and a better livelihood improves with the length of time spent in South Africa. This was echoed by 15 of the respondents. They noted that with time they have created networks that will always notify them where there is work, what goods need to be bought for resale, which areas

to go to for quick employment, where to buy in bulk for savings; and most importantly who to approach for guaranteed help. One respondent said:

“With time you know when the farms will hire; what is needed and what documentation should be prepared; and maybe where to get it because sometimes they need papers which we do not have and accounts to put our money which banks don’t give to us.” (Extract 11, Participant E; August 2019)

Another respondent said:

“Our monies do not become stable but we know the difficult times that have no work and the good times where we are working and earning even bonus. We just learn to save for rainy days and live the same lifestyles when there is money coming in or not. It is a survival skill. We buy things on sale and only send home in parts so that the people back home do not waste thinking more is coming.” (Extract 12, Participant L; September 2019)

The above quotation shows that the income does not stay the same through-out the year but with time the women migrants learn how to manage it better and therefore make it effective. This was common in 5 of the respondents.

These responses showed that the income was not stable but the international migrants had devised ways to get through the times when there is no income. All respondents mentioned that they also have ‘clubs’ or ‘stokvels’ where they give someone a fixed amount in turns to help them have a lump sum that they can use to buy something big or build their homes. They explained that they do so as a means of saving or a way to have some tangible projects finalised. This approach was mentioned by all respondents regardless of their nationality and job description.

Respondents also noted that sometimes they have clubs of saving money but some people swindle them and they lose their savings under different scenarios. One instance was when one group member disappeared after being given their “stokvel” share but before honouring other rounds. This was done deliberately. One respondent mentioned that such cases sometimes happen because of issues beyond one’s control like being arrested for lack of proper documentation and then deported, or death. Walker and Clacherty (2014) mentioned the “stokvel and savings clubs” were

used as an approach for sex workers in Johannesburg, that was used to empower the women and assist them save money.

There was one participant who works under a mine subcontractor for Adult Education and Training (AET). She noted that she does not earn the same salary as what is offered by permanent mine employees or the Department of Education offering AET. She claimed she is earning half of what her counterparts are earning but doing exactly the same job. This is in line with Benya's (2015) observation that mining contractors perform exactly the same job as workers directly employed by the mine but there is a salary and benefits difference.

None of the interviewed respondents have a provident or pension fund to protect them against any loss of income. The AET facilitator claimed that they had asked for a provident fund but when they approached service providers, they were told that provident funds can only be given to people with a certain number of years in their contracts not one-year contracts. All farm workers said they were registered for UIF but had problems of claiming it when the work season ends.

"Remember, we don't use our papers (identification documents); so how do we claim for the blue card?" (Extract 13, Participant P; September 2019)

Blue card is used to describe UIF.

One restaurant employee said that she did not have a wage but relied on "tips" from the restaurant patrons. This scenario creates economic insecurity because it is difficult for the respondent to know how much she will earn in a month. It affects all her planning and budgeting. When asked why she could survive on the "tips" she said January was the most difficult month and that's when the "tips" are extremely low because the restaurant patrons will be few. She claimed that she was earning about R4000 or more on good months, plus had the liberty of getting free food anytime which reduced some of her costs. The other respondent mentioned that she had a fixed wage of R1500 that was supplemented by "tips" from patrons. However, this respondent claimed that all the tips received are consolidated and shared equally among all waiters/waitresses at month-end regardless who had received what amount. The two respondents said that they do not work on hazardous areas and they felt safe.

4.2.7 Employment security

Thirteen respondents were employed on a fixed-term contract basis; with farm workers being seasonal workers who said they were employed full-time between May and November. The Adult Education Facilitator's contract was renewed on a yearly basis even though her employer had three to five-year contracts with the mine. The worker said:

"The mine gives my employer three to five-year contracts. Would you believe that every year I get a yearly contract? If I had longer contracts; I believe I would get a provident fund. I now want to conclude that my employer is saving by not giving me a longer contract". (Extract 14, Participant G; August 2019)

When asked why she thinks the employer is saving she said:

"If I have no provident the company only contributes UIF which is just 1%. Provident fund would be more than 1%". (Extract 15, Participant G; September 2019)

If the employee's suspicion is true then sometimes the economic insecurities of employees are because of greed from employers.

Two restaurant workers said they could not tell if they are on contract or permanently employed because their agreement was verbal and the only term they remembered was, "You are hired, come and start tomorrow." They had never signed any contract. All employment and termination of employment was done verbally. All farm workers claimed they had signed contracts but they cannot remember what was in the contracts. They said a few minutes after being hired, someone representing the farms would hand out contracts, and the tell them to quickly sign them and submit them before starting work. This was in line with findings by Devereus, Lavendal and Yde (2017) who said a significant majority (70%) of seasonal workers in Northern and Western Cape did not receive a copy of their contract after signing it.

I interviewed ten farm workers from three different companies. The seasonal nature of the farming sector increases the economic insecurity of the respondents. All the respondents said their salaries do not vary from those of South African citizens

although they claimed the salaries were low. This claim meant that working in the farms caused economic insecurity for all employees in the field, not necessarily for migrant women only. They however claimed that there is no international migrant that was a permanent employee and permanent employees going on pension were being replaced by seasonal workers regardless of citizenship. This meant that farm owners were reducing their permanent employees naturally through pension retirement but not giving any permanent work even to their long serving employees. This also created an economic insecure situation because the women will be job hunting again in January and employment was not guaranteed. However, having worked until the year end was said to increase one's chance of being employed with the first group in the following employment season. The farm workers also claimed that there were more women international migrants in the farms than local women. The farm workers said their salaries increased during winter when the farm harvest was high. In other seasons working hours will be reduced and sometimes some of them were unemployed. This meant that the wages were season-dependant.

The farm workers also claimed that they give hiring supervisors "cold drink money" to get the jobs every year. This was reportedly topped with small presents that were commonly given to the supervisors to reduce chances of being the first or next retrenchment target. They also clarified that this act (cold drink money) is not formally known by the farm owners but all the employees know about it. What was disheartening was that the supervisors collected these "presents and gifts" but only the highest paying worker would stay longer at work! Two sources revealed that the highest they had paid for seasonal farm-work was R1200. They also claimed it's a common act around Bojanala District Municipality where Madibeng Local Municipality falls under; even in the mines around work is being sold.

4.2.8 Work security

All the respondents, except the AET mine contractor said they do not know of any programmes that were relevant to sick or stressed employees at their workplaces. The AET mine worker said she the mine she is based on has programmes (like Employee Wellness) that are open to all people in the mine premises and basic services were free. She however noted that the situation requires personal employment numbers if

it the sickness or health issue needs specialised attention and that indirectly excludes all contract workers because some do not have personal employment numbers while the other contractors have the employment numbers but they are different from the mine's hence they are incompatible with the service provider's scope. Some farm workers mentioned that they have never seen any first aid boxes for those injured at work. They also have never experienced any follow-up visits from the employers if someone is sick. Two Mozambicans mentioned that most Mozambicans always help each other when one of them becomes too sick to work. They said they help with mobilising resources and sending the sick person home; and if there is a need one volunteers to accompany the sick person home, even if they are not related.

All farm workers claimed there were toilets at work. The respondents can be grouped into two groups. One group worked in the field while the other group worked in the packing shed. Those that worked in the field claimed that they used portable toilets that are emptied daily. The group that worked in the shed said they had clean, permanent toilets and hygiene was very high because they were packing perishable fruits that were going to retail supermarkets for sale. The employees in the field said pesticides and other chemicals were sprayed whilst they were in the field. They would only be asked to work a few meters away while the spraying was in progress. For employees in the field, no uniform, gloves, shovel or gumboots were provided. Employees that worked in the packing shade said they are given uniforms, head-cover gear. They further said that all the uniforms are left at work for someone to wash for them. The only things they needed were warm clothing because the packing shade was refrigerated and very cold. The field farm workers indicated that they commonly worked without gloves and were not allowed to handle any plants or to harvesting crops using gloves, regardless of the season or type of work. They gave examples of the planting season where they are expected to create planting holes using their bare hands because any gloves would damage the seedlings. Farm workers working in the fields had a challenge on work security. Spraying of pesticides in the presence of farm workers is a health hazard. It is even worse for workers employed in farms where no remuneration is paid for the sick leave period. If an employee becomes sick of the pesticides and need medical attention; this would mean a day without the day's income. It might also reduce the income they have if the employee decides to visit the

doctor and not the clinic. The farm workers also highlighted different treatments that they received from their employers. Shed employees have uniforms and a much safer environment than field workers. It leads one to conclude that shed employees receive better treatment because they are working with the final product that is going to the market as compared to field workers.

4.2.9 Representation security

None of the farm employed respondents was allowed to belong to a union. Respondents also highlighted that there was no protection against unjustified dismissal. The farm workers explained that at the end of the season when the farmers want to reduce employees, a small mistake that does not normally warrant dismissal can cause one to lose their work. The AET facilitator said her contract had a statement that read:

“The employee agrees not to take part in or incite any other person to industrial action. Industrial action includes and is not limited to strikes go-slows, work to rule, boycotts, stay-aways and so on” (Extract 16, Participant G; September 2019)

She went further to say:

“We are not allowed to join any union. My contract has a statement that any affiliation with a union is not to be tolerated and can result to dismissal or failure to renew your contract.” (Extract 17, Participant G; September 2019)

She said belonging to any union was prohibited and they were told it could even result to dismissal. Such a threat denies the employees an opportunity of a collective voice that will strengthen the employees' voices when they are bargaining. On the other hand, when asked about union representation, both restaurants employed respondents did not belong to any union. They also claimed that they were not aware of any unions in their sector. Vettori (2018) argues union membership in the hospitality sector in South Africa is notoriously low.

4.2.10 Economic security challenges for the self-employed

Of the six informal traders, five routinely sold their wares to households (door to door) and one had a stall. The respondents indicated that vending was their only source of income and it provided them with food and basic needs. However, they complained of losses incurred when some South African customers who buy goods on credit fail to pay back. Respondents also highlighted that some people would pay late or in very small instalments, which made it very difficult to ensure a stable income. All the respondents mentioned that they sell on a credit basis and this enabled them to get sales but also involved some risk.

“If you sell cash, no one will ever touch your things. Even how cheap. People do not buy. Credit makes the things to move quick.” (Extract 1, Participant M; September 2019)

All respondents pointed out that although credit increased sales, the traders faced challenges when it was payment time. The most challenges they all listed were slow-paced payment which did not meet the agreed timelines on purchase. Sometimes no payment was made at all. In certain months, some clients hurled insults on traders to arouse emotions and defy payment. Some clients returned bought goods although some will be in bad condition.

Respondents indicated that it is better to sell goods in foreign land than selling in their home countries because there are fewer customers back home and the costs of importing goods from South Africa would erode their profits. None of the respondents accessed any start-up capital from banks or other formal financial institutions. This is in line with Kalitanyi and Visser (2010) who reported that immigrant entrepreneurs in South Africa often have no access to finance and credit. All six respondents said they did not even try other money-lenders because they were afraid of the exorbitant interest which they felt would be paid forever. They claimed they got the start-up capital from family and savings from piece work. The most common source of economic insecurity from the informal traders was caused by their customers' way of payment.

The vegetable stall woman claimed that most of her customers are international migrants who bought most of her vegetables. She further claimed that her access to income is mostly determined by how much income they also have. She also claimed that the more people you know, the more sales one will make. She however complained of the fact that there were more and more vegetable stalls that have mushroomed. This meant she has competition and her sales are dwindling. Dwindling sales meant a huge loss since vegetables are perishable goods with a short shelf-life.

The traders also mentioned effects of weather conditions on the day to day business sales outputs. Vendors that walk door to door claimed that very hot days meant they would cover a limited distance while rainy days meant no sales at all or they risk a loss when rain damages their goods.

4.3 Other forms of challenges and risk at work

Some respondents mentioned that they start with meagre wages from 'piece-works' and raise money to hire citizen's identity cards, bank cards, and buying proof of residences which enable them to be employed in the local farms without struggling with documentation. This was common to all respondents who did not have any documentation to work in South Africa. Some migrants resorted to illegal ways of securing documentation which would help them access jobs. One could then note that when the attainment of documentation has red tape and when it seems "impossible" for some, it increases illegal activities indirectly. When asked if they knew that it was illegal, the respondents noted that they knew that it was illegal but they had no other option than to resort to the bribes.

The mine contract worker claimed that medical assessment for work-related purposes as required for all people working in mine premises would be deducted from her salary. She felt this was "odd and unfair" since she did not require any medical assessment but it was a requirement by the mine from the contractor. Thus, paying for medical reports from one's pocket once every year whilst it is a mine requirement was one contributing factor to economic insecurity, but may have contributed to other kinds of security in the event that she never needed medical attention. Her explanation said

these reports have nothing to do with the well-being of the employee but to determine if an employee is still fit to work in a mining or not. If for example, one has a report that he has lost hearing, then that person might lose their job.

The farm workers also claimed there are a few male employees who were drivers and machine operators. There were no woman drivers because their employers “do not believe” that there are women drivers at their work place. The respondents however claimed drivers and machine operators earned better than general farm workers. When asked to explain they indicated were not sure of the amount. When asked why they do not try and attain the drivers’ and operator’ licence they said they do not have money or the time to do that.

Additionally, all farmer workers did not have a fixed lunch time hour. They claimed that when it is not busy, they have an hour-long lunch break. However, during busy days the lunch break would be reduced to thirty minutes. This was applicable to both the shed employees and the field-based employees. Work started at 6 o’clock a.m. and the first and only lunch hour break was at 12 noon. All the farm workers stayed in villages around the farms and received transport to work in a lorry. When asked if they pay for the transport, they said they do not know and neither does it reflect on their payslips and they have never bothered to ask if it is free or there are deductions. All farm worker respondents said they receive their payslips a day before pay day and their pay days were consistent. Four respondents working in different sites but one company said they get paid on a Friday that is before the 25th if the 25th will be a weekend or a Friday after the 25th if the 25th is midweek. The other six respondents from two different companies said they get their salary on the last day of the month regardless on which day the day fell on excluding weekends.

4.3 Discussion of findings and literature

Questions can be raised on whether the work can be classified as decent work. Statistics South Africa (2019) finds that international migrants are more likely to be

employed than internal migrants, but they largely participate in employment that cannot be classified as decent work. It was also found that the lack of documentation makes it difficult for the international women migrants to access their UIF savings. This is mainly because the international migrants end up utilising other people's documentation to secure work, and take the illegal route to secure jobs. None of the respondents had any provident or pension fund that they were contributing too. Although a solid reason could not be established, their employment on a contractual or seasonal basis could be a reason for lack of pension.

The second finding was that economic security for the migrants improves with the time they have spent in South Africa. This was enabled by the networks that would have been built as explained by Oluwatobi, Edkins and Ogundele (2015) that networks are of paramount importance in the survival migrant communities among Nigerians and Zimbabweans in South Africa. The writers use the networks migration theory as the pull factor for most of South Africa's migrants. During the interviews; farm employed respondents mentioned that at their workplaces there are more women international migrant workers compared to males. Of these women, only South African nationals were permanently employed but every time they retire, they would be replaced with seasonal women employees. The respondents believed that there are more international migrant women working in farms in Madibeng Local Municipality than South Africans. It was nevertheless found that all interviewed respondents are economically insecure although they have access to an income.

The third finding was that informal traders are not there by choice but resort to trading as a means of survival. Migrants said they wish they would have fulltime employment that would help them have a guaranteed salary/wage. Unfortunately, however, being employed doesn't guarantee a salary/wage. This can be learnt from the two restaurant workers. One of them noted that she earns from personal "tips" from restaurant patrons while the other one said all the "tips" are consolidated and shared. All farm workers did not know their hourly rate and indirectly did not know how much they earn until when they see their payslips. The AET facilitator contractor knew her salary but

also claimed she earns less than her South African counterparts that are employed by the mine but performing the same duties.

4.4 CONCLUSION

Most economic security challenges are embedded in the field that the respondents are working in. Therefore, there is a need for the agricultural sector, hospitality industry and mine-subcontractors are over-hauled to improve the economic security of their employees. The findings also reflect that the eight elements of work-related economic security do not affect the interviewed international migrants equally. This chapter is a precedent to the next chapter which will discuss the general conclusions to the research, summary of findings, limitation of the study, areas of future research and recommendations that might positively affect the economic security of international migrant women. Lastly, the last chapter presents a general conclusion to the entire study.

CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This is the final chapter of the research. It presents the conclusions and recommendations of this study. The conclusions are based on data collected from interviewing the 19 respondents from Madibeng Local Municipality area. This research assessed the economic (in)security challenges faced by international migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality area. The research also intended to understand if south-south migration improves or deteriorates international migrant women's economic security. It identified and documented the economic security challenges of the 19 international migrant women. The challenges were assessed against issues such as access to reliable and stable sources of income that does cause any anxiety or adverse effects to one's well-being. The research also explored how migrant women and their dependants accessed basic services that include health care, education and training, food and shelter, personal clothes and work protective wear, and access to information. The chapter also discusses the limitations of the current study and areas for future research.

5.2 CONCLUSIONS

This thesis concludes South-to-South migration does not improve the international migrants' economic security but it increases their access to income. It is not only work that matters but the quality of work and how it helps one meet his or her economic security. Findings from this research showed that none of the study participants had a secure and decent work.

Furthermore, results of the current study suggest that the most common kinds of economic insecurity are seasonal work and/or fixed term contracts, failure to access adequate income to meet daily needs, and job and work security. Economic insecurity was also exacerbated by employment contract issues. None of the respondents had contracts that were longer than a year. Farm workers signed contracts in a hurry without adequate time to consider the details of the agreement. This means that the workers were susceptible to signing work contracts without fully understanding the conditions of employment. All the nineteen respondents did not retain a copy of the

contracts they signed. Farm workers reported that the termination of contracts was not always done with prior warning because when the supervisors target retrenching a substantial proportion of employees, a mistake as small as resting for a few minutes when one has worked in an awkward posture for a prolonged period of time can cost one's job. Failure to provide employees with copies of their contracts and to inform them in advance on when their contracts will be terminated, creates economic insecurity.

There was also a documentation challenge among the international migrants. The lack of documentation adversely affected access to much-needed UIF. Furthermore, lack of documentation compelled international migrant women to resort to criminal activities that include: (a) "hiring" identity documents to use at work, (b) "buying days" at the border from immigration officers, (c) paying bribes to attain proof of residence to use for employment advantages in certain areas, and (d) bribing to supervisors to secure employment in the following year.

The current study concludes that one's educational qualifications have very little effect on the nature of job one gets. At least five respondents had a tertiary qualification, but only one was employed as an AET facilitator. Two were working in a restaurant, one was a trader and the other one worked in a farm-shed (labelling and dispatching products to the market). Similar qualifications also do not guarantee the access to equal or fairly comparable e salaries for employees under labour brokers in the AET mining sector. This phenomenon is referred as brain-waste or skill-mismatch (ILO, 2010). There was also lack of union representation for all the research's participants. All participants reported that they have never seen any unions recruiting at their workplaces. One mine labour-broker employee mentioned that being a member of any union was prohibited and written in black and white on their contracts. Entrepreneurship became an alternative when international migrant women failed to secure a job.

Findings of this study showed that better economic opportunities were the main reason for international migration with regards to for migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality area. Social networks also played a role in the decision of selecting South Africa as a destination. For all the research respondents, worst economic security challenges were experienced in their home countries, in transit and in South Africa (when they first arrived). Economic security improved over time. Some of the reasons given for the improvement in one's economic security were: (a) the number of years spent in South Africa, (b) joining social clubs, (c) utilising new and old social networks to find better opportunities, and (d) saving money in anticipation of most difficult days for accessing income in the near future. Savings and "stokvels" were considered helpful in generating money but sometimes the respondents lost money through swindling one another or through arrests of members for being illegal international migrants. Losing money is common among international migrant women because they use only cash in their stokvels since lack bank accounts.

Basic social services such as food, shelter, information and housing were readily accessible to international migrants except for health services at the nearby clinic. There were two main reason for this. The first one was overcrowding which meant that respondents could spend the whole day in the clinic and lose a day's wage. Overcrowding is not only peculiar to international migrant women because they do not use a separate clinic from South African citizens. A loss in a day's wage contributes to economic insecurity. The international migrant women said they resort to visiting a doctor for quicker services. This exposes them to additional costs and erodes the amount of money that one could save and use on other services and needs. The second reason was the negative attitude that was portrayed by some clinic employees towards international migrants. Such attitudes can also result in some international migrant women avoiding visiting clinics even when there is a serious need. This in turn affects their access to work and economic security since an unhealthy person might have not easily perform routine job tasks.

All international migrant women interviewed had no provident or pension fund. Lack of documentation also meant that UIF contributions in their "names" were not accessible

in times of need. Such findings indicate great insecurities in time of unemployment and lack of a source of income to cushion the migrant women in time of need Seasonal work also caused economic insecurity. This was not unique to international migrant women. The research found out that all new appointments are not permanent, especially in the farms. The length of one's work contract in the previous year determined the chances of one returning earlier to work in the following year. This meant that those that left the job earlier would experience prospects of longer periods without any income unless they secured another job. On a positive note, all respondents mentioned that their pay days were always consistent and regular.

5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

In light of the above findings and conclusions, the following are recommendations of the current study:

5.3.1 Economic security is very significant in people's lives and is vital in alleviating poverty. International migration cannot be avoided but should be managed very well. In as much as the Department of Home Affairs in South Africa is managing the offering of work permits/visas, there is a need to increase work visas/permits for the unskilled labour international migrants who resort to crime to access documentation. The white paper on migration has a recommendation to increase the number of SADC permits (Home Affairs; 2017). An improvement of the offer of work visas/permits will help most employees to save money that they use to hire other persons' identity documents and to "buy" days at the border. It might also assist them to have bank accounts for earning their wages in. Accessible documentation will also ensure that the rightful people can access their UIF in times of need.

5.3.2 Union representations and the Department of Labour should be visible in different work places. Union representation might assist in the protection of the employees. The visits from the Department of Labour may also assist in monitoring that the rights of workers are safe guided.

5.3.2 Economic reasons and poor governance were also listed as reasons for international migration. In light of this, South Africa's neighbouring countries should

create conducive work environments so that the number of international migrants flocking to South Africa is reduced and manageable. Regional organisations such the SADC and AU should assist member countries to attain economic and political stability. A reduction in low-skilled international migrants might reduce the magnitude and effects of xenophobia and the competition for access to services (like the long queues that were mentioned in one clinic in this research).

5.4 LIMITATIONS

Findings of the current study should be considered in the context of the following limitations. First, audio-recording may have limited what participants felt free to share. However, audio recording is necessary for an accurate record of what was said in the interviews. Last, the study relied on the experiences of the sampled population without interviewing other stakeholders (employers, non-governmental organisations, and government officials). This omission could have limited opportunities to triangulate data collected from our sample. Third, there are chances that some migrants may have forgotten some economic security related issues of what happened a long time back. This may have unintentionally introduced recall bias, which may adversely affect the quality of collected data. In additionally, September 2019 was marred with new attacks on foreign nationals in Johannesburg. This might also have limited the responses that were given in the interviews. Last but not least, the research did not include any South Africans and therefore could not establish if the challenges were only unique to international women migrants.

5.5 CONSIDERATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

There should be more research on how the lack of or delay in documentation from the Department of Home Affairs can be prevented to help to curb challenges that cause economic (in)security among international migrants including migrant women. Furthermore, there could be further research on the economic insecurity of South Africans and findings compared to the economic insecurity of international migrants.

REFERENCES

Babbie, E. 2010. *Introduction to social research: International Edition*. 5th ed. Belmont: Wadsworth.

Benya, A. 2015. Women, subcontracted workers and precarity in South African platinum mines: A gender analysis. *Labour, capital and society*, 48(1&2): 68-91.

Bracken-Roche, D., Bell, E., Macdonald, M, E, and Recine E. 2017. Health Research Policy and System [online]. Retrieved from:

<https://health-policy-systems.biomedcentral.com/track/pdf/10.1186/s12961-016-0164-6?site=health-policy-systems.biomedcentral.com>

[Accessed 9 February 2018].

Braun, V. and Clarke, V. 2006. Using thematic analysis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3: 77-101.

Bryman, A. (2012) *Social Research Methods*. 4th ed. New York: Oxford University Press.

Chernyshev, I. 2005. Socio-economic security and decent work in Ukraine: A comparative view and statistical findings [online]. Retrieved from:

http://www.ilo.org/integration/resources/papers/WCMS_079176/lang--en/index.htm

[Accessed 9 June 2017].

Clacherty, G. 2014. The Suitcase Project: Working with unaccompanied child refugees in new ways. In: Palmary, I., Hamber, B. and Nunez, L. (eds). *Healing and change in the city of gold: Case studies of coping and support in Johannesburg*. Springer: New York. (pages 13-30)

Clacherty, G. and Walker, R. 2014 Shaping new spaces: An alternative approach to healing in current shelter interventions for vulnerable women in Johannesburg. In: Palmary, I., Hamber, B. and Nunez, L. (eds). *Healing and change in the city of gold: Case studies of coping and support in Johannesburg*. Springer: New York.

Creswell, J.W. 2009. *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*. 3rd ed. London, Sage.

Crush, J. and Williams, V. 2010. Labour migration trends and policies in Southern Africa [online]. Retrieved from: <https://www.africaportal.org/publications/labour-migration-trends-and-policies-in-southern-africa/>. [Accessed 26 September 2017].

Crush, J. and Williams, V. 2002. Criminal tendencies: Immigrants and illegality in South Africa [online]. Retrieved from: <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/9a08/d181d113af5c7281620034c14017cd4ab458.pdf>. [Accessed 26 September 2017]

Crush J., and Williams V. 2010. Labour Migration Trends and Policies in Southern Africa, Southern African Migration Project, SAMP Policy Brief No 23 [online]. Retrieved from: <http://www.queensu.ca/samp/sampresources/samppublications/policybriefs/brief23.pdf> [Accessed 26 September 2017]

Crush, J., Dodson, B., William, V. and Tevera, D. 2017. Harnessing migration for inclusive growth and development in Southern Africa [online] Retrieved from: <https://samponline.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/SAMPSpecialReport.pdf>. [Accessed 13 September 2019].

D'Ambrosio, C. and Bossert, W. 2011. Measuring economic insecurity. IARIW-OECD Conference on economic insecurity. Paris, France. 22-23 November 2011.

Department of Home Affairs South Africa. 2016. Towards a white paper on international migration in South Africa [online]. Retrieved from: http://www.home-affairs.gov.za/files/Guidelines_for_Consultation-GreenPaper.pdf [Accessed 9 June 2017]

De Haas, H. 2010. Migration and development: A theoretical perspective. *International migration review*, 44(1): 227- 264

Devereux, S., Levendal, G. and Yde, E. 2017. "The farmer doesn't recognise who makes him rich": Understanding the labour conditions of women from workers in the Western Cape and Northern Cape [online]. Retrieved from: <https://www.groundup.org.za/media/uploads/documents/WFP%202017%20->

[%20Labour%20Rights%20report%20v7%2024-aug-2017.pdf](#). [Accessed 14 September 2019].

Dodson, B. and Crush, J. 2015. Migration Governance and Migrant Rights in the Southern African Development Community (SADC): Attempts at Harmonization in a Disharmonious Region[online]. Retrieved from: [http://www.unrisd.org/80256B3C005BCCF9/\(httpPublications\)/0CDF578939EEC5AC1257EE300393CF1?OpenDocument](http://www.unrisd.org/80256B3C005BCCF9/(httpPublications)/0CDF578939EEC5AC1257EE300393CF1?OpenDocument). [Accessed 14 September 2019].

Nicole De Wet, N (2017) Family formation and economic insecurity among youth in South Africa. *Development Southern Africa*, 34(6):694-703.

Enigbokan, O. Edkins, B. and Olukunle O. 2015. Relevance of Migration Theories in the identification of influencing factors for Nigerian and Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa. Economic Society of South Africa (ESSA) conference, Cape Town, 2015

Glazer, A. and Kondo, H. 2005. Migration in Search of Good Government [online]. Retrieved from: <http://www.economics.uci.edu/files/docs/workingpapers/2005-06/Glazer-13.pdf>. [Accessed on 02 July 2019].

International Committee of the Red Cross. 2004. ECOSEC handbook: Assessing economic security [online]. Retrieved from: https://shop.icrc.org/ecosec-handbook-assessing-economic-security.html?__store=default. [Accessed 9 June 2017].

International Organisation for Migration. 2007. Outlook on migration, environment and climate change [online]. Retrieved from: https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/mecc_outlook.pdf. [Accessed 9 June 2017].

International Organisation for Migration. 2013. The well-being of economic migrants in South Africa: health, gender and development. Working paper for the world migration report 2013 [online]. Retrieved from: https://www.iom.int/files/live/sites/iom/files/What-We-Do/wmr2013/en/Working-Paper_SouthAfrica.pdf [Accessed 12 March 2017].

Kalitanyi, V. and Visser, K. 2010. African immigrants in South Africa: Job takers or job creators? *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, 13(4): 376-390.

Kawar, M. 2016. Gender and migration: why are women more vulnerable [online]. Retrieved from: <https://books.openedition.org/iheid/pdf/6256>. [Accessed 9 June 2017].

Kosny, M. and Piotrowska, M. 2013 Economic security of households: assessment based on scenario analysis. Wroclaw University of Economics [online]. Retrieved from: http://www.ecineq.org/ecineq_bari13/FILESxBari13/CR2/p183.pdf [Accessed 9 June 2017]

Lakika, D., Kankode, P. and Ritchers, A. 2014. Violence, suffering and support: Congolese forced migrants' experiences of psychosocial services in Johannesburg. In: Palmary, I., Hamber, B. and Nunez, L. (eds). *Healing and change in the city of gold: Case studies of coping and support in Johannesburg*. Springer: New York.

Madibeng Local Municipality. 2015. Madibeng Local Municipality Spatial Development Framework 2015 [online]. Retrieved from: https://www.madibeng.gov.za/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/Madibeng-SDF_June-10.pdf. [Accessed 14 April 2017].

Maree, K. (ed.) (2016) *First Steps in Research*. 2nd ed. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Mathur-Helm, B. (2018). *Lack of HR management interventions specifically directed at women blue-collar workers*. In A. Bosch (Ed.), South African Board for People Practices Women's Report 2018, pp. 24 – 28. Rosebank, South Africa: SABPP.

Merriam, S.B. 2009. *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mbiyozo, A. 2018. Gender and migration in South Africa. Talking to women migrants [online]. Retrieved from: <https://issafrica.s3.amazonaws.com/site/uploads/sar-16.pdf>. [Accessed 12 July 2019].

Mudungwe, P. 2014. Migration and development in the Southern Africa Development Community region: The case for a coherent approach [online]. Retrieved from: [https://www.academia.edu/26136525/Migration and Development in the SADC Region The Case for a Coherent Approach](https://www.academia.edu/26136525/Migration_and_Development_in_the_SADC_Region_The_Case_for_a_Coherent_Approach). [Accessed 11 June 2019].

Nesadurai, H.E.S. 2005. Conceptualising economic security in an era of globalisation: What does the East Asian experience reveal? [online]. Retrieved from: http://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/1963/1/WRAP_Nesadurai_wp15705.pdf. [Accessed 11 June 2019].

Nawyn, S. J. 2010. Gender and migration: Integrating feminist theory into migration studies. *Sociology Compass*, 4(9):746-765

Nyasulu, T. and Dinbabo, M.F. 2015. Macroeconomic immigration determinants: Analysis of “pull” and “push” factors for international migration to South Africa. *African Human Mobility Review*, 1(1): 30-53

Palmary, I. 2002. Refugees, safety and xenophobia in South African cities: The role of local government [online]. Retrieved from: <http://www.csvr.org.za/docs/foreigners/refugeessafteyand.pdf>. [Accessed 13 September 2019].

Palmary, 2009. For better implementation of migrant children’s rights in South Africa [online]. Retrieved from: <http://www.migration.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/For-Better-Implementation-of-Migrant-Children%E2%80%99s-Rights-in-South-Africa.pdf>. [Accessed 13 September 2019].

Palmary, I. 2016. Gender, sexuality and migration in South Africa: Migration, diasporans and citizenship. Palgrave Pivot Macmillan: London

Pienaar, H., Naidoo, P. and Malope, N. (2018). *Labour law and the trial and tribulations of women blue-collar workers*. In A. Bosch (Ed.), South African Board for People Practices Women’s Report 2018, pp. 29 – 35. Rosebank, South Africa: SABPP.

Rand Corporation. 2008. Technical Report Migration. Women in European labour force: Current situations and future prospects [online]. Retrieved from: https://www.rand.org/pubs/technical_reports/TR591.html. [Accessed 15 June 2018].

Segatti, A. and Landau, L.B. (eds). 2011. Contemporary migration to South Africa: A regional development issues. Washington: The World Bank.

Shafique, A. 2018. Addressing economic insecurity [online]. Retrieved from: <https://www.thersa.org/globalassets/pdfs/reports/rsa-addressing-economic-insecurity.pdf>. [Accessed 15 June 2018].

SIHMA. 2017. The African approach to regional integration and migration [online]. Retrieved from: https://sihma.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/SIHMA_African-Approach-to-Regional-Integration-Migration-WEB.pdf. [Accessed 04 March 2019].

Statistics South Africa. 2019. Labour market outcomes of migrant populations in South Africa, 2012 and 2017 [online]. Retrieved from: <http://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/02-11-04/02-11-042017.pdf>. [Accessed 4 November 2019].

Statistics South Africa. 2011. Migration dynamics in South Africa [online]. Retrieved from: <https://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/Report-03-01-79/Report-03-01-792011.pdf>. [Accessed 6 September 2018].

Tracy, S.J. 2013. *Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating analysis*. Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell.

The International Labour Office. 2004. Economic security for a better world [online]. Retrieved from: <http://www.Social-protection.Org/gimi/gess/ressourcepdf.Action?Ressource.Ressourceid=8670> [Accessed 12 March 2017].

UNICEF. 2011. The rights of children, youth and women in the context of migration: Conceptual basis and principles for effective policies with a human right and gender-based approach [online]. Retrieved from: [https://www.unicef.org/socialpolicy/files/The Rights of Children Youth and Women in the Context of Migration FINAL.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/socialpolicy/files/The_Rights_of_Children_Youth_and_Women_in_the_Context_of_Migration_FINAL.pdf). [Accessed 12 March 2017].

United Nations 2004. World survey on the role of women in development: women and international migration [online]. Retrieved from: <https://www.diaspora-centre.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/M-D-in-the-SADC-Region-The-Case-for-a-Coherent-Approach-7-Sept.pdf>. [Accessed 3 October 2017].

United Nations Development Program. 2018. Human Development Indices and Indicators: Statistical update [online]. <http://hdr.undp.org/en/content/human-development-indices-indicators-2018-statistical-update>. [Accessed 3 October 2018].

Vettori, S. 2017. The exploitation of Migrant Labour in the Hospitality Industry in South Africa. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 6 (4): 1- 12.

ADDENDUM A: SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW GUIDE.

An assessment of economic security challenges faced by migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality.

1. Qualitative interview introduction

Length: 45-60minutes. A respondent that can offer 30 minutes or even more than the estimated time will be accommodated as long as their time is practical. In case the interview is not completed within the suggested 45-60 minutes; extra time would be requested in another appointment.

Semi-structured interview starts here:

1. I am interested in international migrant women and the economic security challenges/difficulties they face.

Part A

This part is relevant for both employed and self-employed (all) participants.

1. What is your country of origin?
2. For how long have you been in South Africa?
3. Do you see yourself as an economic migrant?
4. What made you to come to South Africa in the first place? What could be the reason for you to be a migrant? That is, what were the push and pull factors?
5. What are some of the considerations you took before deciding to come to South Africa?
6. Have you been able to find a stable income/livelihood in South Africa compare to your home country?
 - a. Please can you tell me what your main source or sources of income are? Are they reliable?
 - b. If yes, do you work for a company or you are self-employed? If working for a company are you permanent, temporary/seasonal or part-time?
7. What was your worst economic security challenge and where/when did it happen? (Home country/South Africa/in transit to South Africa). Kindly narrate three different occurrences when your economic security was worst, good and better and give as much detail as possible? When was this (time)? What do you think were the causes for your hardest times of economic security? What changed the situation for the better? And when did the situation become better?

Are you better off in South Africa compared to your home-country; any reasons or explanations why it is like that?

8. Are you willing to tell me about any educational or training qualifications that you have? If yes kindly do so. Does having or lacking of a qualification help with earning an income?
9. Does being a migrant make it easy or difficult for you to find a stable income/livelihood in South Africa? In what ways? Kindly give some examples.
10. Do you get any financial assistance from friends, family or other significant people? What kinds of assistance are those?
11. Do you have any dependants here or at home that you support? If yes, are you able to support them?

NB- the respondents have to clarify if the experiences are peculiar to migrant women only or even to other local employees.

12. Basic social security aspects of economic security

- a. Economic security can be assessed using how one can access several basic services in a sustainable manner.
 - Can you get to the doctor or clinic and get necessary help each time you need to? (If yes, the writer notes down). If no, what are some of the difficulties or challenges that stop you from getting this service?
 - Do you have any children/ or dependents of school-going age? If yes, do they attend school? If no, what are the reasons for that (excluding learners who just abscond because they wish to). Do you also have access to any training that you think would better you as an individual?
 - Do you have any difficulties with getting adequate housing, clothes or food? Feel free not to answer this if it feels uncomfortable.
 - Do you have adequate clothing for your job, if applicable (e.g. protective clothing)?
 - Do you have manage to get information through the internet, television, newspapers and radio? If no, how do you keep yourself up to date with current issues?

If they are working continue to **Part B** and the following questions. If they are not, go to **Part C**.

Part B

13. Social protection and labour related aspects.

Labour market

- How did you find this job? /How did you learn of this job opportunity?
- Are you working in a job that needs a particular set of skills or special training?
- Was this the profession you trained for or had wished for all along? If know, how did you end up doing this job?
- Is the salary adequate for the job they are doing as per the general expectation?
- What explanations do you put forward to say the salary is adequate or inadequate? What is the difference and why do you think there is such a gap?

Job security

- Since you are employed; are there any training opportunities and possible career development offered by your employer and how accessible are they? Have you accessed any of such opportunities?
- If there are training opportunities, are they open to both males and females/ migrants?
- If not employed, what is your means of survival and does it offer you a chance to get further training that you need in that field; or even outside the field where you wish to be in future? What job progress forecasts are you imagining even though you are unemployed at this time?

Skill reproduction

- What opportunities to gain and retain skills and access to training and guaranteed leave do you have as a migrant woman at work?

Employment security

- How are they protected against uninformed and or unjustified dismissal?
- Do you have any UIF registration and company contribution?

- Is there any provident fund or pension fund to protect you against loss of income?

Work security

- Are you protected at work against illnesses and injuries through safety and healthy procedures and regulations?
- Does your employer respect and uphold safety values?
- How does their employer help you deal with excessive stress and if possible, try to avoid stress causing situations for the employees?
- What are your working hours and are they acceptable?

Representation

- What rights do you have as migrant working women?
- Do you have or are allowed to belong to any unions?
- Are the unions competent, active and independent?

Part C

- Since you are not employed, do you have any source of income?
- Is this source of income easy or difficult?
- Is it reliable?
- How do you make sure that you have dependable income with the source mentioned above?
- What are your future income prospects when looking at the above source of income?

Conclusion

This is the end of our interview. Thank you very much. I am kindly requesting for referrals to other migrant women. If possible, please accompany the prospect interviewee to the initial meeting for trust purposes. However, on the day of the interview session you will be not present to ensure that the respondent is free to express themselves.

Interview closed.

ADDENDUM B: INTERVIEW CONSENT FORM

Researcher: Outracy Ncube
70083 Soshanguve Section, Majakaneng
Madibeng
Telephone: 083 968 7344
Email: ncubeoutracy@yahoo.com

22 May 2019

Dear Participant,

RE: INFORMED CONSENT TO PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH

I am a Master of Development Studies student at the University of the Free State. I would like to invite you to take part in my research project entitled: Economic security challenges faced by migrant women in Madibeng Local Municipality. The aim of the study is to investigate economic security difficulties that international migrant women in South Africa experience, with a focus on this municipality.

Study procedures: The study involves interviewing women migrants on economic security challenges that they are facing in the country. With your permission I would like to use a tape recorder and take notes to record the interview. No visuals would be recorded. There would be a list of specific aspects to be covered as a guideline, but open-ended questions will be asked to allow us to have a discussion about the economic security challenges you might be facing.

Why you were selected as a participant: The study focuses on international migrant women. You were approached because you fall within this group. ***However, participation is not compulsory but voluntary.***

Benefits: There are no direct benefits for participating in this study, however the information that you provide might contribute towards an understanding of economic security challenges faced by women migrants.

Time and administration: The interview would be done during the day, at a place where you feel most comfortable without infringing on your privacy. Appointments will be made to suit your free-time and your safety is of utmost importance to me. I anticipate the interview will take about 45 minutes to an hour.

Storage of information: The audio recordings will be kept safely in password protected laptop with no names labelled. The notes will also not reflect any name except a pseudonym.

Confidentiality: The findings from this research will be published in my mini-dissertation which will be kept by the University of the Free State, Canon Collins Trust (my study sponsors) and a copy for myself. Findings may also be published in journal articles. In this sense, **the information will be available to a public audience.** However, no names will be recorded or linked to participants in the research report or at any stage. The interview will be conducted in a private place, and you may use a pseudonym of your choice. The study does not require you to say your name or name other individuals, and **you do not have to discuss any personal information that you do not feel comfortable talking about.**

Risks: There is no major anticipated risk that will be encountered by your participating in this study, but speaking about financial difficulties could be upsetting. Details of **Lifeline** free counselling services are provided on the other side of this page, if you feel in need of a professional counselling service.

Voluntary participation: Participation in this study is voluntary and you are under no obligation to conduct the interview or answer particular questions. If you have any concerns with the way the

research is being conducted, please feel free to contact and discuss it with my supervisor, whose contact details are given below.

Please feel free to ask any questions on any aspect of this study that is unclear to you.

Yours sincerely,
Outracy Ncube

Supervisor: Dr Philippa Kerr
Email: KerrPL@ufs.ac.za

Counselling services on these 24-hour lines:

Share call-0861 322 322

Landline-011 728 1347

Cell phones-067 019 0845; 074 129 6960

Crisis line-011 443 3555

WhatsApp call 065 989 9238

Email-lifeline@lifelinejhg.org.za