The 'Janus Face' of Planning in South Africa:
The Case of the Free State

Teboho Maine

A dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Natural and Agricultural Sciences, University of the Free State, in partial fulfilment of the degree of the Master in Urban and Regional Planning

Supervisor: Professor W JvH Botha

Bloemfontein, 2002

Acknowledgements

This research is the result of observing the way planning has changed in the Free State Province as a result of legislations and the way beneficiaries of planning services would like to perceive planning happening. For this opportunity, and the encouragement to write up, I am delighted and would like to extend my sincere thanks to Professor W JvH Botha, my *supervisor*, a great man who believed my difficult years this effort would one day be completed. His constructive criticisms and assistance is immeasurable. I really thank you.

- ❑ To Professor JJ Steijn, your constructive criticisms were valuable. I am grateful for everything.

- ❑ I am also grateful to all who helped me in preparation of this work. Specifically, I would like to thank Professor Lucius Botes for assisting in compilation of questionnaires.

- ❑ I am also indebted to numerous friends and family for their support and encouragement. Thank you all.

- ❑ Finally, I would like to thank my fiancée Ntsikane Matela who put up with me working, and who make it all worthwhile.

This thesis represents the author's viewpoint and not that of the department or the University of the Free State.

Teboho Maine
19 November 2002

Abstract

This thesis documents and analyses the image of planning as perceived by the users or beneficiaries of the planning service and by planners in practice (both public and private sectors) in the Free State and suggest some principles to be considered to fill the gap that exist between what planners do, based on what the users of planning services expect from planning fraternity. It analyses the image of planning along historical lines, with respect to the development of planning.

The research illustrate the importance of the perception of people with regard to the way they would like to see development is happening, in order their quality of life can be improved using planning as a tool for governance approach that demonstrate that beneficiaries of planning services' view is important, showing that people can make a contribution and a difference and building up a sense of identity and community.

Citizens and communities are beginning to realise the benefits of exerting influence over development in their environment. Similarly, administrative officials are also beginning to develop confidence in the ability of ordinary users of planning services to construct well-considered, practical and sustainable development programmes and projects. Communities are gaining valuable experience on the pragmatics of sustainable community-based ward planning. This has exposed them to the challenges of local governance and the need to create a cooperative governance framework where officials, elected councillors and citizens take responsibility collectively for development at the local level.

It is believed that this research will be of significant assistance to the policy makers in that it will inform, illuminate and provide a basis for sound policy decisions in planning practice, especially in the search for new direction during this era. In order for planning to be responsive to the challenges of the post-apartheid planning era, its image will have to be closely revisited so as to assess its relevance to Free State Province changing situations.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Addenda

List of tables

List of abbreviations

AIA	American Institute of Architects
ANC	African National Congress
CBP	Community-based Planning
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
IDP	Integrated Development Planning
SACTRP	South African Council of Town and Regional Planners
SAITP	South African Institute of Town Planners
SAITRP	South African Institute of Town and Regional Planners
RIBA	Royal Institute of British Architects
RTPI	Royal Town Planning Institute
TTPA	Transvaal Town Planning Association
USA	United States of America
WC	Ward Committees

1.　INTRODUCTION

1.1　THE PROBLEM STATEMENT

The planning system that exists in South Africa in 1990s and 2000s in the form of laws, policies, institutions and practices has been shaped by different governments (that is, the apartheid and the post-apartheid governments). Each government including ANC government responded to the problems that are defined as the most significant at the time. As such the image of planning in the form of problems identified and planning systems created, primarily reflected the interest of the minority enjoying varying degrees of personal mobility and more emphasis is now placed on the previously disadvantaged. The result of this is that the pattern created by planning is fundamentally at odds with the majority of people having to use it. The concentration of poverty on the periphery of urban system, and in many instances, in isolated positions beyond the urban fringe is one of the most obvious examples of this. The nature of these interests varied regionally so that the planning system we have is complex. These systems have had impacts on the way people perceive planning.

> It is a reality that South Africa is *"... enmeshed in processes of fundamental societal change that is placing formidable demands at the door of planning... As the country drags itself out of the desert of racial discrimination in which it has floundered..., the response to the question of the role of planning in the emerging post-apartheid era becomes pressing" (Muller, 1992, p.27).*

Post-apartheid policy formulation responsible for aspects of the restructuring of social, economic, spatial and local governance administration had major responsibility, to redress and address the historic legacy of apartheid in communities both in urban and rural areas. As a result of ongoing socio-political changes in South Africa the communities to which planning is responsible to, has broaden. In turn, how has planning as a consequence of transitional and post-apartheid policies adjusted its development priorities to these changing needs and expectations of the "new" communities, that is, the previously disadvantaged black communities as part of

beneficiaries of planning service in South Africa? Although the these policies have already contributed to the restructuring of communities, the question is still viewed more critically provided that the way communities perceive planning service is not fully understood and/or captured.

1.2   THE AIMS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE THESIS

The aim of this thesis is to determine the "Janus Face" (image) of planning in the Free State Province, as perceived by the whole spectrum of beneficiaries of the planning service and by the planning specialists from both public and private sectors.

Within this aim, the objectives will be:

❑   To understand what planners in both public and private practice perceive to be the generic characteristics of planning. In so doing, it will be possible to identify the perceived gap between what planners do, based on what the users of planning services expect from planning. However the users of planning will not be right all the time, that is, to bring together planning's core concerns: means and ends and the extent to which they are known;

❑   To discover and assess the extent to which the planning has changed in response to the changing needs and expectations and in response to uncertainties that exist in previously disadvantaged black communities, as the most beneficiaries of the planning services today;

❑   To understand any possible strengths and/or weaknesses of planning in the light of emerging challenges; and

❑   To understand planning ideology, based on democratic principles that are grounded on humanistic and an apposite value system (Christensen, 1985, p 63-73).

1.3   SCOPE OF THE THESIS

This thesis will include discussions on the image of planning as Bennion (1969) noted that planning contributes to the development of human beings and deals with the provision of services, thus necessitating the need for personal relationship between

University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, South Africa

planning officials and the users of planning service, or in some cases, by way of historical illustration, on the wider concepts of socio-economic and political circumstances that are useful to describe stages of social change and how planning responded to those conditions. Although this thesis was intended to cover Greater Bloemfontein area, it was later felt that due to transformation processes underway, and consequently new emerging perceptions of planning, economic restructuring and development concepts, it should be more representative to broaden involvement of all planning officials and the ultimate users of planning service in the Free State.

Chapter one, as an introductory part in which the problem statement, the aims and objectives and the methodology to be adopted are dealt with. **Chapter two** deals with certain concepts that are used in the study. It is found that descriptions of concepts often vary to such an extent that it may lead to misunderstanding. Brech (1964) realises this when he says *'the real problem is that the word planning means different things to different people and often to the same people in different contexts'* (p.7). The definitions of the concepts of 'planning' and 'profession' will provide in part, a foundation for the formulation of an independent planning ideology, which will be based on the theory of political democracy. It is from this planning ideology that the criteria for determining the image of the planning will emerge.

Chapter three focuses on the morphology of the image of planning, based on the criteria that will be derived from the envisaged planning ideology. **Chapter four** provides a brief and selective theoretical review of the historical development of the town planning in both the international and local contexts, using the British experience (since it is an important influence on South African town planning) and South African experience respectively, from as early as the 1890s up to the present, 2000s. In both contexts, emphasis is placed on the social, economic and political conditions and how planning responded to those circumstances. In both contexts, an attempt is made to pass judgement on the performance influencing the way the planning profession was perceived by both the planners and the users of the planning services. In overall, chapters two, three and four will provide a full spectrum of this thesis.

Chapter five is a case study that is primarily aimed at understanding the image of planning in the Free State Province. The challenges facing planning in the Free State will be the subject of **Chapter six**. The emphasis in this chapter will be on image building mechanisms and principles in the form of recommendations. This will be followed by a concluding chapter (**Chapter seven**), which will look at the document holistically.

1.4   RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The methodology of this thesis will be:

Firstly, focus on the establishment of appropriate reference points and the ideological guidance for planning. This will be done by firstly defining the words planning, profession, users/beneficiaries or consumers of planning service, as they will be used in this research, and the extent to which they have an influence in image building. That is, the way these concepts will be defined will have clear implications in the way planning services is likely to be perceived by both planners and the users of planning services. The defining of the above will lead to the formulation of an envisaged independent planning ideology, whose attributes are rooted in the theory of political democracy and which are central to the shaping of the image of planning. The attributes of these envisaged planning ideology would be used as the criteria for determining the image of planning in both the international and local contexts, as perceived by the planners then and users of planning services.

Secondly, the image of planning will be assessed along historical lines, with respect to the development of planning. This historical assessment of the image of planning will be based on both the international and local experiences, that is, the British and the South African planning experiences respectively. These will be based on various stages that planning is perceived to have gone through in the process of its consolidation and development. It must be noted that this will be examined through secondary sources, from various perspectives. The objective of looking at the historical development of the image of the planning in both contexts is mainly because, as Welch (1993, p.27) pointed out, an understanding of the origins, growth

and development of planning over time is fundamental to planning decisions concerning a desirable future. In this case, one needs to know what the image was in the past and what it is, before speculating on what it is likely to be in the future, since the future depends to a large extent on the present. All the above will form the core of the theory base of the dissertation.

Thirdly, the historical assessment of the image of planning in both international and local contexts will be concluded by the determination of the image of planning as it is in South Africa today. This will be done by means of a survey of a 'historical' image that will be undertaken in the areas to be chosen by the author in the Free State Province. The technique to be used in the collection of research data is the questionnaire. Two structured interview schedules will be prepared, one for the planners (both in public and private sectors) and another for the users of planning services. This is aimed at obtaining information from two broad perspectives, namely the professional and the users or beneficiaries of the planning services respectively. The substantive content of research questionnaire will be adapted around the research question (problem statement) and sub-questions (the aims and objectives of the dissertation) which form the basis for this research.

1.5   THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THIS RESEARCH

It is believed that this research will be of significant assistance to the policy makers in that it will inform, illuminate and provide a basis for sound policy decisions in planning practice, especially in the search for new direction during this era. In order for planning to be responsive to the challenges of the post-apartheid planning era, its image will have to be closely revisited so as to assess its relevance to Free State Province changing situations. Also, as the pillars to the "traditional" planners' world view crumble, so will be the beginning of the search for a new direction for the future. At the juncture, it will become necessary for an independent ideology of planning to be established. This will obviously call for strenuous but worthwhile reforms for planning fraternity.

2.   DEFINITIONS

2.1   INTRODUCTION

This chapter will concentrate on the definitions of concepts such as 'planning' and 'profession' as they will be used in this thesis. The provision of what is regarded as appropriate definitions of the above terms is crucial in this thesis since they affect the way the planning professionals tend to behave, the role they adopt. Of more significance, the provision of apposite definitions for this thesis enables the author to have some ideological basis to pass judgement on whether planning as it exists today is the way it should be or not, based on current circumstances.

2.2   DEFINITION OF PLANNING

The term has been accorded different definitions by various theorists, most of which are not appropriate for the purpose of this study. There are a number of approaches to the definition of planning (which are discussed below), but for the purpose of this thesis, only two approaches will be considered, namely the traditional and the extensive approaches in subsection 2.2.1 and 2.2.2 respectively.

The concept planning is widely used in modern scientific circles, which necessitates an attempt to establish the relevance of planning theory to this study. Izard (1969) discusses the possibility as to whether a unique theory for planning is possible or whether it must simply utilise the methods, techniques and theoretical structures of other fields, that is whether is planning as such, or whether there are simply different kinds of planning associated with different disciplines. He makes distinction between a focus on understanding, which is concerned with goals on the one hand, and problem solving on the other. The latter area - planning - must apply the techniques and theories of the former, but the problem he experiences *"is that in the field of urban and regional studies the last generation or two has seen no development of basic theory which might lead to good problem solving" (Blumenfeld, 1972, p. 144).*

In order to fill the vacuum, the theoretical framework for planning consists of social science theoretical structures suitable for helping to solve urban and regional problems.

Blumenfeld agrees with Izard regarding the non-existence of a general planning theory, but he sees the distinction between regional science towards understanding on the one hand and planning towards goals on the other, as different phases of one continuing process. Since there can apparently be no theoretical framework for planning as such he speaks rather of a basic planning approach which can best be achieved by so-called specialists with generality. This, inter alia, involves *"an ability to come to grips with value problems, have a social consciousness and identify your own goals with those of the community"* (1972, p.145). The planner is thus required to obtain knowledge of comparative values and value systems in order to facilitate rational decisions about the community goals.

Mitchell (1995) differs partially from Izard and Blumenfeld. They acknowledge the necessity and desirability of heavy borrowing of techniques from other fields, but apparently find in land use theory at least the beginning of a specialised theoretical structure of planning. Rose (in Bruton, 1984, p.75) also notes that planning, like science or branches of scientific activity, has a number of aspects that may be considered from different viewpoints. Similarly, it is linked with other social activities.

Hendler (1995, p.145), however, argues that if Mitchell is correct in their statements, then up to now planning theory, in so far as it has a separate and independent existence, is a branch of economic theory, which only confirms the viewpoints of Izard and Blumenfeld that there is no distinct planning theory.

It seem from the above that the approach to planning should still be regarded as an applied field, heavily borrowing from other relevant fields, all within a special focus on how urban and regional problem can be solved best. In this reach for the ultimate goal of planning, Hendler (1995, p. 146) distinguishes three frameworks, namely:

❑ the framework of economic theory which is the only way of relating the components of capital to each other;

❑ the framework of human needs and values, in order to determine the ends themselves to which these same components are related;

❑ the framework of firms which is required to translate these needs into physical capital.

Cullingworth (1997, p.6) attaches three interrelated elements to the policy-making part of planning. They are firstly, the task of implementation and control, secondly, the task of goal formulation, and thirdly, the decision-making role of selecting a plan from a number of alternatives according to appropriate criteria. The choice between alternatives is made possible through the creation of a framework of values. Cullingworth (1997, p.6) also feels that public debate on goal formulation is highly essential.

Abercrombie (1959, p.10) makes a generalisation that *"planning occurs when mankind in the group makes a definite and conscious attempt to model or mould his environment"*.

Lee (1955, p.7) points out the nature of planning, when he says *"planning is predicated on the assumption that man's past experience gives him the insight and foresight to prevent various aspects of disintegration (and hence social problems) by taking deliberate action"*. Brech (1964) says, *"the essential feature of a plan is that it shows relative positions, not necessarily actual ones"*. Planning is thus the determination of the vital relationships of the objectives that are most desirable at that time in accordance with planning principles that are most acceptable at the stage.

Planning is not only determining certain objectives, such as rising standard of living, but is also an analysis of the relationships between those objectives together with the relationships between a whole range of subsidiary objectives to be achieved in order to reach the ultimate objectives. Definitions of planning abound: there is a large literature devoted to exploring the meaning of the term as indicated above. One general common element in these definitions is that planning is forward-looking and

is a continuous process of human activity whereby man tries to exploit or alter certain aspects of his/her environment for his /her own benefit, that is it seeks to determine future action.

Some authors have opted for a definition which covers almost every aspect of human affairs in the modern world, that is, a broad based or an extensive kind of definition. Other has adopted a more limited definition, that is the traditional approach, thus tying planning closely to the physical environment (Cowan, 1973, p.3). However, the focus of the thesis will be on the general approach to the definition of planning, which is sharper and comprehensive in focus than the traditional one.

2.2.1 TECHNOCRATIC PERSPECTIVE

Towns and cities are not God-given or natural. They are the result of decision-making by individual owners and developers, and of government intervention. Whilst topography and geography do play a part, they do not absolutely determine development. The nature of towns and cities depends on who shouts the loudest, and who has the influence over policy. Town planning is to do with property and land, and therefore with the money and power. Blowers (1980, p.141-149) points out that politics is about power, and planning is one way that power is used. Therefore it is inevitably a highly political activity, inextricably linked with the prevailing economic system, and reflective in policy-making. Planners are therefore operating not in a vacuum but within a complex political situation at central and local government levels which reflects these social forces.

Here is one traditional definition: *"Town planning is the art and science of ordering the land-uses and siting buildings and communication routes so as to secure the maximum level of economy, convinience and beauty" (Keeble, 1969, p.1).* This sounds plausible, but the situation is not so straightforward. The statement was made during the post-war era and the definition has only expressed inadequately one of the aspects that planning has had at one stage of its development. Many ideas incorporated in this definition were later rendered out of date by the unexpected rate of growth of car ownership towns and cities, and by wider social and political changes in the context of town planning.

Fainstein and Fainstein (1971) concluded that technocratic perspective arose out of the perceived need to address the social problems that had resulted from the rapid, haphazard urbanisation accompanying the industrial revolution. The emphasis was on the utilitarian, sometime utopian establishment of social order in the context of capitalist technological progress. Indeed, the technocrats sought to harness the power of technology, reason and science to create a new society. The characteristic style of planning in a technocratic context is described by Fainstein and Fainstein (1971, p. 13) as traditional, blue-print or physical planning. The rational comprehensive mode of planning that was dominant in both Britain and America in the 1950s and 1960s, was also based on the technocratic ideology (Alexander, 1979, p.121) This model assumes that the planner knows or can discern the public's needs (and therefore there is a homogeneous public). It also assumes that the goal of *"orderly development is in the general public interest and that planners are in the best position of any group to determine the plan's ...goals" (Catanese, 1984, p.59)*. The current view today is that this view of planning is misguided and has resulted in many of the criticisms of planning as being land-use oriented at the expense of social-orientation. This, one can argue, tends to accord planning a limited and passive role, painting a picture of an occupation that is ignorant of the prevailing crucial social, political and economic conditions in which the majority of people live in, especially in South Africa.

Fainstein and Fainstein (1971) also criticise the public interest assumption but stating that planners adopting the technocratic role fail to see that the so-called apolitical planning process which they follow actually embodies values of the upper-middle class. South African planners have traditionally been white, male and from these socio-economic class. Most have found employment in state or local government planning agencies, and the kind of planning which they have tended to engage in therefore has been largely in the interests of the state, and by extension, the dominant class of which they are part:

> *"The interface between the predominantly white planning fraternity and the black communities in South Africa has been distant and devoid of mutual discovery; it has been one of minimal contact and hence little reciprocal understanding. That plans for black communities have been produced,*

implemented and imposed under circumstances is not only a consequence of the apartheid doctrine, but is also an indictment of the planning discipline" *(Muller, 1982, p.254).*

This kind of planning is able to take place in the technocratic environment where planner's role is that of technician-administrator. Indeed, Catanese is of the opinion that apolitical technician planners actually try to avoid political involvement and attempt to perform technical functions *"without invoking their political and social values" (Catanese, 1984, p.59).*

However, a significant function of the limited approach that is the traditional approach is that it allows an in-depth study of a particular segment of planning, in this case, the physical aspect of planning. Davidoff (1965, in Faludi, 1973, p.292) is of the view that critical questions such as *"who gets what, when, where, why and how"* cannot be satisfactorily answered by using the traditional approach to the definition of "planning" because it tends to be biased in favour of physical criteria, that is, the land use criteria. Such a limited and myopic view of planning will be challenged, by looking at the extensive approach to the definition of the word 'planning'.

2.2.2 DEFINING PLANNING IN BROAD SENSE

The extensive approach defines "planning" as a multitude of ingredients. This is reflected in Rose's definition of "planning" as a *"... multi-dimensional activity and ought to be integrative, embracing social, economic, political, psychological, anthropological and technological factors" (Rose, 1984, p.26).* The appropriate definition of the term "planning" as advocated in the thesis is much more than both the traditional and the extensive approaches.

The word "planning" has been defined as "... an activity by which man in society endeavour to gain mastery over himself and to shape his collective future by power of his reason ... a certain manner of arriving at decisions and actions, the intention of which is to promote the social good of a society undergoing rapid changes" *(Friedmann, quoted in Dror, 1963, in Faludi, 1973, p.329).* "Planning" is also defined as *"... a means for better use of what we have, a means for emancipation of millions of*

personalities now fettered, for enrichment of human life ..." (Dror, 1963, in Faludi, 1973, p.329). As though this definition was not adequate, Dror went further and provide another definition of "planning" which he presents it as *"... the process of preparing a set of decisions for action in the future, directed at achieving goals by preferable means" (Dror, 1963, in Faludi, 1973, p.330).* Another definition of planning is offered by Davidoff and Reiner (1962, in Faludi, 1973, p.11), who define planning as *" ... a process of determining appropriate future action through a sequence of choices".*

One could go on and quote large numbers of additional definitions of planning or various definitions could be subjected to critical examinations, while at the same time illustrating the limited relevance of each definition in some other aspects sought by this research. Therefore, it is considered appropriate for the key features of the definition to be taken out and elucidated in detail. The following section focuses on the important elements that are present in more sophisticated forms of planning: forethought; a process; means and ends; decisions and actions; concern with human welfare (that is balance of opportunities, a redistributive function; allocation of scarce resources to benefit those most in need), choice between alternatives, consideration of constraints, the possibility of alternative course of action dependent upon differing conditions, and the interdependence of the various aspects of planning, for example, the economic, social, political and the physical aspects shaping the direction that planning takes. Of course, when a plan involves people (which it usually does), it must incorporate an acceptable way of resolving differences among the participants: this is a major feature of any type of planning; and the more numerous and diverse participants, the greater the difficulties of planning. At the extreme, fundamental clashes in outlook, beliefs, or objectives may make planning impossible.

This underlines another important aspect of planning that there has to be a sufficiently sound basis of agreement for planning to be effected. In democratic societies, large numbers of diverse interests not only have to be considered but also have to be involved in the planning process. Much of planning then becomes a process of reaching agreement on objectives. Therefore, based on the above common themes planning, an appropriate definition can be derived:

"A process of arriving at appropriate decisions for future actions through a sequence of choices" (Davidoff and Reiner, 1973,p.11) which are intended to promote the enrichment of human life in a society undergoing rapid changes in the economic, social, political and environmental spheres. The validity and utility of the above definition on the context within which it is to be used must be borne in mind. The key features of the definition of planning as proposed above are in turn elucidated below.

2.2.2.1 Planning

The fact that planning is a process implies that it is a continuous activity, and is not a once off activity, but a recurrent decision-making process which requires review and revision in order to adjust to changing circumstances. It is a recurring act *"... taking place within a unit and requiring some input of resources and energy in order to be sustained" (Dror, 1991, p.330).* This quote implies that for planning to be continuous, it must be maintained by participation of those involved in the process. Planning, being a process, has a recurring cycle of operations, a cyclical activity. The idea that planning is defined as being a cyclic activity stems from the fact that there is a strong need for continuity, adaptability and revision, all of which are aimed at arriving at apposite decisions for future actions (Bruton, 1974; Ratcliffe, 1981). It is basically for this reason that monitoring and review are necessary so that previous actions can be evaluated so that the outcome of future actions will be an improvement on the past, hence the need to continuously review the performance of decisions made and adjustments made whenever necessary (Ratcliffe, 1974).

2.2.2.2 Decision-making for Future Actions

Nearly all the definitions reviewed recognised that planning is directed towards the future. This is one of the most significant characteristics of planning which touches on elements of prediction and uncertainty. Therefore, planning is aimed at achieving ends that are oriented to the future. Decision-making raises some critical questions of acceptance, legitimacy and moral rightness. One may as well ask: to whom are the decisions for future action appropriate and what makes them to be appropriate? It is significant to note that decision-making and actions depend, firstly, on the means-ends relationship, which is fundamental to the planning process.

The very nature of planning is that it is geared towards the shaping of the future according to the way people want it to be. If what people want to achieve (the goals/ends) can be achieved by the means agreed upon by them, then the decisions and actions can be deemed appropriate. Hatch (1998) asserts that each project begins with people as they are, and moves them toward a better understanding of themselves and their alternatives. At the same time, the designers/planners are groping toward forms that can speak intelligibly about new relationships and needs. The process is slow, no single participatory effort can take more than a few steps forward. Yet each project gives its participants a taste for the power of planning. In South Africa the cardinal consideration lies in the need to advance and empower the least privileged sector of our society in the decision-making process. As Muller (1993) notes,

> *"The goal must therefore be the empowerment of this sector, with the associated objectives of decreasing dependency; of increasing social, economic and personal development; of promoting self-determination, self-reliance and dignity; of dismantling discriminatory, oppressive and paternalistic structures and replacing these with developmental, democratic and liberating systems".*

The decision is deemed appropriate only if the people affected by the consequences of such a decision are party to its formulation, and also if they have a full or a fair knowledge of the likely consequences of those decisions. In summary, the decisions will be perceived to be appropriate if the people to benefit from such decisions express the exercise of moral judgement.

In addition to decision-making of future actions, a strong notion of sustainable planning in order for planning agencies to ensure that people's expressed needs are sustainable represent a profound challenge to planning process and profession as such. Stretton (1998, p.62) goes further and proclaims that in order to sustain the needs of people, and the poor in particular, a thorough-ongoing societal transformation to install know-how in planning is necessary. More than this, he pointed out this understanding of planning require planning process which will involve fundamental changes which prioritise the needs of the world's poor. The emphasis on people is

important, since virtually all planning agencies prioritise the need to engage people in decision-making and implementation processes of planning.

2.2.2.3 Choice of plan outcomes

Given the fact that resources are scarce, it becomes necessary that social and individual choices be made concerning the way in which resources are to be allocated. It therefore, becomes crucial that questions such as who gets what, how much, when and for what purpose and in what combinations become inescapable. It must be admitted that the allocation of resources is a political process, and this puts planning more and more in the centre of political arena (Baum, 1983, p.17). Thus ends are in question, and decisions are ultimately a matter of judgement, and decisions are taken by an exercise of power (Cowan, 1973, p.9).

Therefore, the redistribution of resources such as land views planning as essentially concerned with the balance of opportunities between various sections of the population and between well-off areas and deprived areas (Cowan, 1973; Eversley, 1973). Within this thinking, planning is thus viewed *as "... a model for optimum allocation of sets of goods and services in response to preferences to participants (Davidoff and Reiner, 1991, p.15-16)*. If this view is accepted, especially if one realises that the very need for planning arose out of the inequalities, deprivation and squalid conditions caused by the interplay of free-market forces and the lack of social concern prevalent during the turn of the twentieth century.

The redistributive function of the planning system finds its justification in explicit political decisions in order to balance and spread the opportunities among the areas and populations in need (Webber, 1991, p.95-112). This is mainly because the expansion of choice requires deliberate political actions, designed both to extend and restrict individual liberties, as the contextual circumstances may demand. Dyckman (1978, p.279) intensifies this argument by saying that planning is "nothing without politics", but that it is in politics and that it is not politics.

The idea that planning is political is not conceived in its wider sense that *"planning assumes power. Planning is politics" (Wildavsky, 1973, p.132)*. Rather it implies that

planning establishes goals that *"must win approval from a democratic political process" (Altshuler, 1973, p.194).* It is not that planning itself is political but that it must inevitably operate within a political framework. This formulation enables planners to retain their claims to rationality while accepting that the translation of their policies into outcomes requires the involvement of politicians. But politicians are seen as legitimating not determining planning policy that remains firmly within the competence of professional planners.

The objective of planning tends to be one of replacing the imperfectly operating market system with a scheme for distribution of scarce resources in response to claims upon them. Then planning is viewed more as a direct agent of change, thus implying that the professional planner should aspire to become an agent of social change, and not the mindless servant of an insensitive bureaucracy (Cowan, 1973; Hague, 1984). If the professional planner comes in conflict with that bureaucracy, according to Peiser (1990, p.496-503) there is a serious communication gap between the two. Bridging the gap is a major part of the professional planner and the bureaucracy. How it works in practice is discussed at length in Cullingworth (1997, p.6-19). He continues stating that the adjective 'formal' is used to indicate that there may be informal ways of dealing with problems as they arise.

2.2.2.4 Promotive planning

It is accepted that planning, by its very nature and terms of reference, is concerned with the future, but most significantly it is concerned with the betterment and improvement of human conditions. The proposed definition of planning recognises that planners and the planning profession both have a new social role combining political and technical dimensions, a role that cannot be separated from judgements of value and issues that are inherently social and political in nature.

The proposed definition of "planning" takes into account that the social front of planning is part of the political foreground. The conventional wisdom points out that planning ought to be more concerned with the social benefits which the planning skills may increasingly assist to bring to a world in which the majority remain hungry and poorly housed. As Dror (1963, in Faludi, 1973, p.323-343) pointed out, planning

is much more than activity intended to promote the enrichment of human life, it is more on self-reliance, self-esteem and community empowerment in the social, economic, political and environmental spheres of life, to enable *"... man in society ... to gain mastery over himself and to shape his collective future consciously by power of his reason" (Friedmann, 1973, p.9)*. Promotive planning, as proposed by Muller (1982, p.247-257) is based on the promotion of democratic ideals and the associated prerequisite of community participation in decision-making. The promotive process of planning is cyclical in nature (involving mutual learning by both the planner and the community through the cyclical feed-back and feed-forward loops) based on the premise that *"planning is a continuous process of choice involving the evaluation of various alternatives in the light of desirable end states" (Dekker and Maastop, in Muller, 1994, p. 17)*.

Therefore, the proposed definition of planning accepts that planning has a social purpose that should not only result in a better and more habitable environment for man, but also in a just redistribution of resources. The fundamental theme of planning is also strongly re-emphasized by Essex, (1991, p.86) who stressed that *"... the desire to improve people's lives and the environment we live in should be at the heart of planning"*.

2.2.2.5 Societal change

The proposed definition of planning recognises the fact that planning is a response to social, economic and political changes in societies, hence its concern about the predictions and certainties. The fact that planning is a continuous and dynamic process implies that it must anticipate change and is subject to regular re-examination in order to adapt and adjust with the least possible friction and loss of resources (Dror, 1963, in Faludi, 1973, p.329). This means planning is an organised effort that utilise fundamental facts regarding resources that must be brought together in order to avoid clashing of policies or lack of unity in general direction. Societies are dynamic entities that change as a result of changes in social, economic and political circumstances. Following on from this, it can be argued that the planning must be flexible enough to be able to change or adjust to new circumstances if an attempts to meet the new challenges and expectations being laid at its door by transformation

processes is to be made. Flexibility and robustness of the planning system will be at the heart of the planning process if the challenges being unleashed by the transformation process are to be met.

2.2.2.6 Physical, political and socio-economic environments

The interdependence of the various spheres of life is acknowledged by the proposed definition of planning. The independence of the above spheres is reflected by the enlarging of the scope of activities subjected to planning, hence the use of the extensive approach in attempting to define planning. This is also precisely because the process of planning the human environment requires the ability to analyse and comprehend the existing situation in the context of its social, economic and political, as well as its physical circumstances (Ratcliffe, 1981, p.3). Thus, planning must anticipate and accommodate change in the economic, social, political and the environmental spheres of life.

2.3   PLANNING AND PROFESSION

2.3.1 EMERGENCE OF PROFESSION

As the earlier societies became more and more industrialised and complex, the need for specialisation based on the division of labour emerged. This implied the need to acquire and master some specialised skills. There was a cultural expectation that skills, by its nature were specialised. As the world became extremely complex, the perception that knowledge about it was possible only when it was broken down and analysed in depth (Baum, 1983, p.3) pervaded the world. This belief was supported because it was generally accepted that problems were capable of being solved only when they were defined in narrowly focused, tightly bounded terms (Lindblom's emphasis in his "Science of Muddling Through", 1959, and Etzioni's emphasis in his Mixed Scanning Approach, 1967). This argues Baum (1983, p.4) necessitated the existence of specialisation, because broad overviews about the world were regarded as being superficial, and not touching on the fundamentals of the universe.

2.3.2 PROFESSIONALISATION

Professionalisation is the process by which an occupation attains professional status and recognition (Millerson, 1964, p.10). This process can in general be interpreted as a response to the need for occupations to establish a toehold in the career structures, and this meant the demarcation of the sphere of professional realm. Hague (1984, p.99) claims that this was a conscious and orchestrated effort *"to resist the predatory claims of the other professions, ...and as such practitioners ...had to define the tasks that they alone could undertake"*. The process has also been interpreted as a reaction to and consolidation of the tendency towards a structure of individual achievement tied to education and occupation (Hague, 1984, p.100). The primary factor here being that there was a pervading fear among status conscious practitioners that their status as experts in specific fields were being threatened (Baum, 1983; Hague, 1984). The engineering, medical, legal and the divine occupations were among the first occupations to attain professional status, and there is no doubt that their model was used as a basis for judging other occupations which deserved professional status and recognition.

The use of the traditional model of a profession in giving the professional status to certain occupations such as planning tended to have structural limitations that made it very difficult for a dynamic discourse of the word "profession" to take place, as it will be demonstrated below.

2.3.3 DEFINING PROFESSION

There are problems with attempting to come up with an apposite definition of a profession. Various theorists have attempted to throw some tentative ideas on what a profession is. Some background definitions of the word profession will be presented with a view to identifying the core factors that contribute to the making of a profession, as it is understood today.

Baum (1983, p.3) regards the word profession as *"... certain groups of practitioners who hold a special, privileged status in comparison with other practitioners and in relation to their clients"*. This implies that the professionals consciously strive to

acquire traditional professional autonomy in relation to their clients. This is certain to lead to ineffectiveness as the gulf between the practitioners and the clients' interests widen. The fact that professionals set themselves as being autonomous and independent of the public has been criticised by Schon (1983, p.12) who argued that *"the more powerful the professions, the more serious the dangers of laxness in concern for public service ..."* Millerson (1964, p.1) points out that the word professions is usually used as a polite synonym for *"... job, work or occupation"*, and he adds that the mere connotation of *"professional"* implies the successful completion of a task with great skill. Moore is of the view that a *"... profession involves the application of general principles to specific problems, and is a feature of modern, societies that such general principles are abundant and growing" (quoted in Schon, 1983, p.22)*. Moore went further to suggest that professions are highly specialised occupations, and to this effect he identified two primary bases for specialization within a profession, i.e., the substantive field of knowledge that the specialist professes to command, and the technique of application of knowledge over which the specialist claims to master.

Bennion (1969, p.14-15) in attempting to come up with a definition of a profession adopted the attributional approach. He regards an occupation to be a "profession" in the strictest sense only when it has the following six attributes, namely: intellectual basis, private practice, advisory function, tradition of service, representative institute and a code of conduct. To avoid being caught off-guard, Benion (1969) qualifies his definition by pointing out that the absence of any one of the attributes does not necessarily rule out professionalism in the wider sense.

The above definitions of the word "professions" have specific features that are central to the definition of professionalism. The key features of the above definitions are listed in Table 2.1 (p. 21). The above definitions seem to be in line with the traditional definition of a profession. They all tended to adopt what Baum (1983, p.15) calls the *"attributional approach"*. The main features that were identified by various authors are summarised in the table below.

Table 2.1: The key features of the definition of "profession"

Definition	Millerson (1964)	Benion (1969)	Moore (1983)	Baum (1983)
Special and Privileged status	-	-	-	x
Job / Occupation	x	-	-	x
Specialised Skill	x	-	x	-
Intellectual Basis	-	x	x	-
Tradition of Service	-	x	-	-
Code of Conduct	-	x	-	-
Representative Institute	-	x	-	-

2.3.3.1 Model of a profession and planning

The key features (Table 2.1) of the definition of profession conform to the ideal or the traditional historical definition of professions. This is reflected in their bias towards a professional model of the medical, legal and the technical occupations. The inappropriateness of the above definitions to the planning profession is looked at in detail in the following critique of the traditional model.

The problem with the traditional definition of the word "profession" is that the theorists who defined the word tended to have *"... their group affiliations and roles determining the choice of items to be included in the definition' and those to be left out" (Millerson, 1964, p.3)*. Also, the bounds of the definition of the concept were presented with their own occupations in mind, thus implying that the definitions were consciously moulded to fit arguments. On this basis, it can be argued that the traditional image of the professional as defined by the criteria used does not fit the planning practice.

The traditional elements of the above definitions of the word "profession" are captured in Millerson's description of a traditional professional which runs like this:

> *"He was a 'gentleman', an independent practitioner dispensing a necessary public service of a fiduciary nature. His competence was determined by examination and licence. His integrity was ensured by observance of a strict ethical code. Unprofessional conduct could lead to complete deprivation from further practice. His training and education were institutionalised. Here was the model for all professions" (Millerson, 1964, p.6).*

The above attributes of the traditional professional present some structural limitations to the dynamic discourse of the word 'profession'. The majority of professionals are no longer independent practitioners, either due to the nature of their work, especially planning, whose work tends to take place in a social context and itself being political, or through special restrictions, which are established, in the political process. Therefore, based on the fact that planning operates in a constantly shifting context (as a response to changing economic, social and political circumstances), the static models of both planning and profession are becoming irrelevant to current practice. Planners operating within the traditional framework tend to experience what one may, in Schon's (1983) and Hague's (1984) terminology, call the 'crisis of confidence' and the 'motivation crisis' respectively.

It also needs to be borne in mind that not all professionals are involved in a direct, personal, fiduciary client-professional relationship. The close, confidential, single-client relationship found in legal and medical professions has a particular quality peculiar to those professions. Within the planning context the professional would retain an expertise, but that expertise would be rooted in self-awareness with a conscious of the ways in which the planning context is pervaded by various ideologies, all of which are making claims to the context. Within the traditional model of a profession, practitioners claim autonomy as essential to their practical effectiveness (Schon, 1983, p.13). They further assert that their practical effectiveness or independence provides legitimacy for their autonomy. This is highly questionable because by adopting a traditional model, practitioners tend to disregard

concerns and expectations of their clients and constituents. The planning profession no longer follow the traditional model of a profession because it is not appropriate to the work that planners do.

The pursuing of the model enjoyed by medical practitioners, lawyers or surveyors, planners may set themselves off as experts who have independence over their clients and constituents. This may give the planners the perception that they have both the intellectual and technical wisdom to decide on what is appropriate for their constituents. This, one can argue, may lead to a decline in the legitimacy of the planning because *"... planners legitimacy as experts depends on their responsiveness to group interests" (Baum, 1983, p.15)*. On this note, Davidoff and Reiner (1962, in Faludi, 1973, p.22) warn that this is very crucial. They argue that *"... neither the planner's technical competence nor his wisdom entitles him to ascribe or dictate values to his immediate or ultimate clients"*. Therefore, this line of thinking totally rejects the notion that planners are endowed with the ability to determine the development outcomes of the public.

The traditional professional model was used to fit or even bolster an orthodox professional stance that emphasizes a neutral technical expertise. If the expert planner adopts this stance, it will imply that he/she does not understand the context in which planning takes place. The conscious or unconscious ignorance of the context in which planning profession operates reduces professional expertise and practice to mere application of scientific theory and technique to the instrumental problems of practice. This is a clear positivist interpretation that legitimates and justifies the status quo. This has a potential of contributing to a negative image of the planning profession in the eyes of the users of the planning service and planners who are critical of their roles. The traditional model depends to a great extent on agreement about ends and means. Therefore, when ends are fixed and clear the decision to act can present itself as an instrumental problem. But when ends are confused and conflicting, as is usually the case with planning issues, the application of a 'neutral technical expertise' may be inadequate. Instead, the contemporary professional may have to opt for what Christensen (1985, p.66) calls *"contingent planning processes"*, that is, planning processes that are not predetermined, but those that depend instead on problem

conditions. The fact that the planning profession does not fit the traditional model is also because the problems to be solved are not static, but are constantly changing, sometimes unknown (in the case of uncertainty) and sometimes confusing (in the case of conflicting values), as is the case in the South African planning context today.

Therefore, realising that the definitions of the word 'profession' contain a historical element based on the traditional professions, it is considered proper to consider definitions which contain *"... realistic elements relating ideal and tradition to current form and practice"* (Millerson, 1964, p.6).

2.3.3.2 Defining the planning fraternity

The critique of the traditional model of professions rendered the traditional image valueless. Given the fact that there is a need for a dynamic understanding of the word 'profession' as it is used today, a search for relevant definitions is pursued below. Millerson (1964, p.10) defined the word profession as *"... a type of higher grade, non-manual occupation, with both subjectively and objectively recognised occupational status, possessing a well-defined area of study or concern and providing a definite service, after advanced training and education"*.

The above definition is not regarded as being satisfactory, though it clearly represents the product of much thought and deliberations. The dissatisfaction stems from the fact that the definition rules out any occupation that involves the use of manual and other physical techniques, from a dentist extracting teeth, to a commercial artist drawing a poster or a town planner on the drawing board (Bennion, 1969). Therefore, the manual effort should not be used as a disqualifying factor.

However, there are a number of aspects that have been left out by both the first definitions (those with a traditional bias) and Millerson's (1964) definition of a profession. These elements are captured in the definition put forward by the RIBA which suggests that *" a professional is a person expert in some field of activity who shares the responsibility for decisions, and gives a service to others in that part of their affairs to which the professional expertise applies, bringing to bear in this participation wider values than those whom he is advising may necessarily themselves*

consider relevant " (Benion, 1969, p.2). These two definitions incorporate both the normative and the traditional elements of the definition of the word 'profession'. These definitions have identified some key features forming the core of a profession. They point out that the profession is a job, based on specialised skills which have a theoretical background, acquired through the educational process, and used positively for the provision of essential services which are accepted and recognised as being important by those who provide them and by their recipients. Further, the job involves very crucial aspects of joint responsibility between the professional and the users or beneficiaries of the planning service, accountability and the sharing of values. The key elements of the above definitions will be looked at in detail in order to substantiate on the value of Millerson's (1964)'s definitions.

2.3.3.2.1   Institutionalised occupation

According to the definitions, a profession is a higher-grade occupation. Higher grade implies that the intellectual and/or practical technique involved depends on a substantial theoretical foundation that is acquired through an institutionalised educational system. The prolonged period of study prepares and moulds that practitioners, and at the same time socialising them into the professional world (Millerson 1964; Benion, 1969).

2.3.3.2.2   Professional recognition

In order to achieve some professional status, the occupation must be objectively and subjectively recognised as a profession. From a subjective point of view, the members of the occupation must be conscious of themselves as professionals, and from an objective viewpoint, the beneficiaries of the planning service must be willing to recognise and to accept the occupation as a profession. Recognition can take the form of high remuneration, delegation of responsibility or authority, use of service in preference of others and requests for advice.

Growth of self-awareness constitutes one of the most crucial aspects contributing to the success of the process of professionalisation. This self-awareness and self-consciousness demands of professionals to be bound by a moral commitment to use

their skills to further shock equity. The lack of such a moral commitment in societies characterised by gross inequalities and uneven distribution of resources (South Africa for example) is not a neutral stance at all, but an endorsement and sustenance for inequality and repression (Hague, 1984, 99-102). The perceived technical neutrality of a traditional professional produces social ignorance. Therefore, within the new definitions of professionalism, planners should be critical and provide their specialised expertise for the improvement of living conditions of the communities in which they work with.

The fact that the public must objectively recognise the profession implies that their expectations should be matched to professional skills. That is, if the practitioners are to be recognised as professionals and as such conferred the professional status, their specialised skills must be matched to the general expectations of the users of the planning service. Simply put, their need for the service must be felt, that is, a 'tradition of service'. Once the planning is not matched to the expectations, then one would talk of the planning having a *"limited influence" (Baum 1983)* in its supposed constituents, and there may be no need for the service. It is therefore crucial for the occupation to continually assess its performance against the rapidly changing expectations of its constituents in order to make sure that the service rendered has relevance to societal needs.

The value that the users of planning services place on planning will ultimately determine the status that will be conferred upon it. Usually, essential services will be accorded very high status in accordance with their perceived value. If the services are of a fiduciary nature, i.e. those that whose value is determined by public confidence, this is likely to be demonstrated by one or more of the following ways, namely: high remuneration, delegation of responsibility, use of services in preference of others and also requests for advice or boycott of such services, low remuneration, distrust of professionals, resorting to self-help approaches instead of seeking advice from professionals.

2.3.3.2.3   Theory base

The occupation gains professional status if it is able to achieve a clearly defined theoretical knowledge and practice. Defining the area of practice implies the institutionalisation of a specific area of concern so as to further promote the specialisation and the division of labour. Specialised theory helps to span the boundaries of professional concern for the occupation, thereby creating prestige for the occupation.

The specialised theory is institutionalised so as to control access to the profession's area of practice so as to maintain an occupational prestige for group members. The institutionalisation of the specialised knowledge and practice provides some subsidiary benefits to the occupation. For example, this may contribute to the raising of standards of the service to be provided thus including uniform practice, determining entrance of new practitioners into the occupation, and introducing the certification of potential members. Institutionalised training therefore allows for greater control over status development of the occupation (Millerson, 1964, p.14).

2.3.3.2.4   Responsibility and accountability in the public realm

The fact that solutions to identified problems is not made for the client by a group of elite technical and bureaucratic experts is reflected in the definition presented by the Royal Institute of British Architects (RIBA, in Bennion, 1969, p.2). The sharing of responsibility in decision-making represents the creation of a cultural revolution in which class barriers between the 'experts' and the layman are broken down and a joint educational and social experience for both sides is forged. This places the professional in a role of a 'conscious' advisor, a role that challenges the pseudo-neutrality of the traditional professional. Within this role, the planner offers advice to the client and the onus is on the client to make a decision. The responsibility of the advice given lies with the planner, and that of the decision to either consider the advice or not lies with the client. Therefore, joint responsibility in decision-making is the crux of the matter, which embodies an element of accountability. This represents a learning experience for both the professionals and the users of planning services.

2.3.3.2.5   Mutual learning

According to the definition by the RIBA (in Bennion, 1969), the professional offers the service to others in the sphere that he/she has competence, and in the process of doing so, the planner brings with him/her in the joint participation process wider values that those whom he is advising may necessarily consider relevant. This is in line with the 'transactive approach' to planning as proposed by Friedman (1973) in his book: *Retracking America,* which can be interpreted as a response to the widening gulf between the values held by 'experts' and those held by the client. This represents a fundamental shift from the traditional model of professionalism, whereby the professional planner brings with him/her preconceived values and solutions that are perceived to be right for the client, without necessarily finding from the client. The tendency of viewing a professional, as an independent practitioner who has the intellectual and the technical wisdom to determine the public will is totally rejected by this cultural revolutions.

Following on from above, it can be argued that the role of the planning profession can only be said to be appropriate and widely accepted in society only if it has some tenable ideological background, which is characterised by the way the society is organised. For example, a democratically organised planning system because its arrangement may guarantee them some opportunities that most democratic packages have to offer. It is therefore based on this and other factors looked at in this section that an ideological guidance for planners is a prerequisite to a democratic way of planning our environment, and the following section looks into it in detail.

2.4   THE PLANNING IDEOLOGY

The word "ideology" has been overused and sometimes misused, and this made it to be closely associated with conservatism and resistance to change. The word "ideology" is used in this thesis to denote *"a system of values (be they political, social, etc.) necessary for appropriate intervention to justify and legitimate actions"* (Harvey, *1978, p.7).* According to Eversley (1973) an ideology involves believing in something which one is conscious of and which in some ways imposes constraints on one's

actions. Therefore, from these facts, it is clear that an ideology provides a set of personal values, beliefs, hopes and bases for making decisions.

2.4.1 THE NEED FOR A PLANNING IDEOLOGY

It must be noted that this is not an alternative planning approach or methodology. Also, it is not an alternative to any planning theory, be it procedural or substantive. The lack of an ideology committed to planning, reflecting the degree of commitment of the work that planners do has a tendency of subjecting the planning fraternity to dominant interests of state and capital. It is now acknowledged that planners operate in social and political contexts, similarly Davidoff (1973, p.277-296) holds that planning, by prescribing actions leading to the future state, is obliged to participate in the controversy surrounding political decision-making, whose characteristics and needs are often at odds with the planners' ideology of reason. This has a potential of creating *"motivation crisis" (Hague, 1984, 104)* and the *"crisis of confidence" (Schon, 1983, p.27)* because planners do not have an ideological guidance, and as such they tended to succumb to powerful ideologies.

What is being advocated here is an independent moral value, which is capable of rising above the politics of planning. It must be realised that the adoption of an independent "set of values" is not to deny the inextricable link that exists between planning and the political system. To put it in Dyckman's words the establishment of an independent planning ideology is an acknowledgement that *"where the state exists cannot be separated from the environment of that state, but is nonetheless an independent intellectual creation whose ideology has grown up in a variety of states, and whose uses have been turned to the advantage of many, states and non-states"* (Dyckman, 1978, p.293).

2.4.2 THEORY BASE UNDERLYING THE PLANNING IDEOLOGY

The envisaged planning ideology is grounded on the theory of political democracy, which, it must be admitted, to the western conception of democracy. This will provide

a basis for the justification of the proposed planning ideology. The key principles of democracy will form the basis on which the planning ideology will be shaped.

2.4.2.1 Political democracy

The word "democracy" is derived from the Greek words for people ("demos") and power ("kratos") (Louw and Kendall, 1986; and Fagence, 1977). This simply means a government of the people by the people, thus describing particular form of distribution of political and social power within the society (Lively, 1975). The term "democracy" has a long history of application, especially in justification of many and diverse political systems; even those by modern standards are not democratic. Of more significance, the democracy has a long tradition of being intimately associated with political and social equality; majority rule; the general interest; the common good; participation in decision-making; accountability and responsibility; freedom to choose; sensitivity and awareness; liberty and justice. These are the principles that prompted the author to use the theory of democracy as a basis for the formulation of the planning values, because most, if not all of the principles of democracy are consistent with the definitions of both planning and profession.

2.4.2.2 Principles of democracy

Drawing extensively from Lively (1975) and Fagence (1977), key features of a fair and just democracy can be identified, and these form the basis of the theory of western democracy.

2.4.2.2.1   Planning participation in decision-making

The people should be involved in legislating or deciding on general policy, in applying laws and in governmental administration. This implies that even those who may be politically, economically or socially disadvantaged should have a stake in the decision-making process. This obviously ignores the practical social, political and economical realities that characterise the contemporary society. Participation is very crucial in democracies because decisions are not only accepted because of their effectiveness, but also because of the way in which they are arrived at. Therefore, for decisions to be regarded as being legitimate in a democratic state, the principle of

democracy requires the maximum possible participation of all citizens (or their representatives) in the activity of public decision-making. This, one can argue, tends to justify the methodology of any democratic organisation, be it local community council or a government body because the decisions are arrived at in a mutually agreed manner, with minimal conflict. Apart from the above contribution that participation can make in decision-making, it also has an educative motive. The extension of the right to participate constitute what Lively (1975, p.134) regards as *"... the social recognition of the moral and intellectual worth and dignity of the individual..."*. This aspect of acknowledging the individual worth of citizens has traditionally provided the strongest emotional thrust towards democracy, especially when recognising the fact that such individual worth was not measured in terms of social, economic or political status of an individual.

2.4.2.2.2   Public accountability and responsibility

The elected rulers should be accountable to the ruled. This implies that they should be obliged to justify their actions to their constituencies. This according to Lively (1975) demands elected representatives to be responsible and answerable in full to their constituencies. This requires another crucial element essential for the regulation of the functioning democracy, which is transparency.

The fact that elected representatives should be accountable and responsible to their constituents' demands that they be entrusted with a certain degree of autonomy. This is because responsibility can bed rendered impossible if the elected representatives do not have autonomy (not autonomy in the traditional/paternal or blueprint mode), since responsibility will be perceived to lie with someone else, not the elected representatives. The problem here tends to be a practical and crucial one. This is with regard to the protection of the citizens against administrative abuses. There is unfortunately no guarantee that it may not happen, unless checks and balances are introduced to protect personal liberty and personal rights (Lively, 1975).

2.4.2.2.3   The common good

The rulers should act in the interests of their constituents. Within this context, democracy tends to be perceived as a means of making decisions based on

conceptions of the common good. This means that since the citizens of that country or region have elected the rulers, the elected officials or representatives should pursue their interests, failing which the electorates have the capacity to remove them from power. This may be true for an ideally democratic situation, but not for dictatorships which claim to be democratic.

The democracies are viewed as the forum in which people meet to debate and collectively decide what is best for the society as a whole on grounds of general social principles, the common good. This view, according to Rousseau (quoted in Lively, 1975, p.120) is grounded on the fact that *"he did not see men as essentially or solely altruistic who can be ordinarily relied on to act for others"*. He argues that individuals tend to ignore the social obligations entrusted on their shoulders as self-interest or passions lead them astray. Rousseau's view is in line with the democratic prescriptive that public decision-making and action should reflect the will of the constituents (Davidoff and Reiner, 1962, in Faludi, 1973, p.23).

2.4.2.2.4   Liberty

Democracy in western conception has been conceived as a means of protecting the liberty of citizens, thus protecting them against unnecessary or arbitrary constraints on their actions. This is partly guaranteed by the system of popular elections and representative bodies. Therefore, the law of the land, that is the constitution of the country, embodies elements of popular will which explicitly act as a restraint on government. In this regard, accountability; transparency and responsibility are all valuable because they provide *"... a powerful antidote to the corrupting effect of power" (Lively, 1975, p.127)*. Other sources of protection of citizen liberty, other than the above may include the Constitutional Court; an Ombudsman; and the Bill of Rights.

The democratic government, in its course of being responsible, it should allow for freedom of association and freedom of speech, thereby promoting diversity and competitions between political parties without suppressing others.

2.4.2.2.5   Sensitivity and awareness

The fact that democracies are barred from any coercive actions by the checks and balances of the country implies that the rulers will be expected to be sensitive and be aware of the plural interests that are likely to be affected by their interventions, either in the form of direct or indirect actions or policies. This has potential of being achieved in a democracy that is characterised by a pluralist social order that ensures a degree of compromise and co-operation, based on shared democratic values.

It is evident that the theory of democracy has a lot to offer the planning practice, especially with regard to its substantive principles. Democracy achieves legitimacy in terms of the quality and nature of the decisions that emerge from it, but of most significance is the *modus operandi* of arriving at such decisions in which the following aspects become guiding principles in search of legitimate decisions: social utility (the common good), the satisfaction of actual wants, participation, the assurance of a broad area of liberty, accountability and responsibility, and the sensitivity and awareness of elected representatives couples with transparency. These virtues are central to the making of a universal social principle of democracy. The next chapter will focus on the implications of these democratic principles to planning theory and practice, and most significantly how they are likely to influence the image building process of the planning practice.

2.4.3   THE IMPLICATIONS OF POLITICAL DEMOCRACY TO PLANNING THEORY AND PRACTICE

The above principles of democracy have direct relevance to planning theory and practice than ever before. Given the fact that South Africa is currently recognised as a fully democratic country, so will the democratic ideals and virtues, have to penetrate the planning theory and practice. The implications for democracy in planning theory and practice, especially in South Africa are well documented (Muller, 1980; 1982; 1991).

The lack or the loss of an independent ideological guidance for planning necessitates the need for a planning ideology based on these principles of democracy. The adoption of these principles will demand dramatic transformation of politicians, and between the former and the users of the planning services, whereby they will have to be treated as people who are in most cases right, who can choose, criticise and reject what they do not need (Goodchild, 1990, p.13). The following section elucidates the basic essentials of the planning ideology, based on these basic principles of political democracy. The author here subscribes to Muller's view that *"planning has not in itself the capacity to create human liberty and dignity, but it does have the capacity to promote movement toward the attainment of these attributes" (Muller, 1982, p.22)*

2.4.4 THE PROPOSED PLANNING IDEOLOGY

The fact that a profession is a job implies that the course, which the professional is expected to pursue, derives from a tenable ideology that allows for both its subjective and objective scrutiny (Millerson, 1964, p.9). The value of the ideology on which planning is grounded should be reflected in the seriousness and effectiveness with which the practitioner goes about the tasks which confront planning practice (Friedmann, 1973, p.77). Based on the proposed definitions of "planning" and "profession" it can be said that the tradition of the planning profession must be its readiness to serve, thus involving a sense of dedication and a willingness to accept a measure of self-discipline as well as the ability to reflect deeply and sympathetically on the problems of planning with disadvantaged communities. This will demand of contemporary planners personal attendance of the users of the planning service wherever needed (Bennion, 1969; Eversley, 1973).

The planning fraternity should have a positive ideology that embodies a kind of value system that is oriented towards social action. Since a total ethical vacuum is untenable, the social vision of the planning profession must be backed and sustained by an apposite ethical stance which is rooted in *"... the desire to improve people's lives and the environment we live in ..." (Essex, 1991, p.86)*, including that of the historically disadvantaged black communities. This is in keeping with the democratic prescriptive of enhancing access to the forum on which these communities can

compete for resources with other interest groups on equal basis. Since Lively (1975) viewed participation as part of the development process and the social acknowledgement of individual worth of citizens, so should be the recognition that those previously disenfranchised communities should gain that social acknowledgement of individual worth. This is not to discriminate against the other social groups in a society, but is to attempt to balance the distribution of opportunities. This is based on *Rawls' (1984) "Theory of Justice"*. In overall, the envisaged planning ideology is *"the commitment of the planning profession to plan with (as opposed to for) the disadvantaged communities in our society"*.

Therefore, commitment to action will find backing in this tenable planning ideology, which will be based on the basic principles of democracy, namely: responsibility; accountability; transparency; integrity (reputation and fairness); legitimacy; competence; sensitivity and awareness; commitment and objectivity. All these principles are embodies in a tenable social vision. These principles provide a *raison d' etre* for the envisaged planning ideology, and they go beyond what can be scientifically proved and could ultimately lead to positive social action. These principles will be elucidated in detail in the next section on the morphology of the planning profession's image, and of more significance will be how they relate to the making of the image of the planning profession (Chapter Three).

2.5   SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Even though there were difficulties in attempting to define the word "planning" and "professions", an attempt was made to establish appropriate points of reference in terms of the two terms. That is, for the purpose of this research, acceptable definitions were arrived at. This chapter revealed that the traditional definition of "planning" and the historical alignment of the planning profession with the traditional model of professionalism no longer have relevance for planner today. This is mainly because the traditional definitions of both "planning" and "profession" tend to give one an image of the planning profession as being negative, since the traditional models assume that planning is a land use oriented activity, with little or nothing to do with the social, economic and political issues. Also, the model assumes that the planner has

the independence and technical wisdom to determine the will of the users of the planning service. It is these paternalistic, top-down, prescriptive and patronising characteristics that contribute to the discrediting of planning.

Also, the irrelevance of the traditional model of both "planning" and "profession" is in the light of the rapid changes which affect the social, economic and political contexts in which planning takes place. Even though the "new" definitions appear to be a response of the historical perspectives, they do not in any way suggest a total rejection of the past, because the present is based on the past, and the future depends, on the present. The preferred definitions of the terms "planning" and "profession" provided in part, a foundation for the formulation of an independent planning ideology, which is supposedly free from the ideological dominance either by the state or capital. The basis of the envisaged planning ideology is the theory of political democracy, which was discussed in brief. The principles of the theory of political democracy were utilised in the formulation of the proposed planning ideology. The envisaged planning ideology in this regard is "the commitment of he planning profession to plan with (as opposed to for) the disadvantaged communities in our society". This commitment is to be informed by the adoption of the democratic principles that form the basis for the ideology. It is also expected that the roles to be played by planners in this regard will be informed by these democratic principles.

These principles of the envisaged planning ideology will be used as the criteria for assessing the image of the planning profession in both the international and local planning contexts (Chapter Four). The rationale behind the use of these principles of democracy will be to test if planning under different governments, some of which claimed to be democratic did conform to these democratic principles. Extensive elucidation of these attributes or principles, especially with regard to the way in which they relate to the shaping of the image of planning will form the core of the next chapter (Chapter Three).

3.   THE MORPHOLOGY AND IMAGE OF PLANNING

3.1   INTRODUCTION

The Concise Oxford Dictionary (1987) regards the term *image* as a *"mental representation; idea, conception; character of an object as perceived by the public"*. An image is a mental perception that is subject to value judgements, and it varies from society to society depending on the value-system of the society concerned. An image is a highly dynamic concept that is subject to change, either in its internal or external environment.

In this thesis, the perception of the public of the image of planning will be looked at as a reflection of the effectiveness or ineffectiveness and the impact of the planning in practice. Based on what has already been said in Chapter Two, the image of planning is created by the extent to which the practice is able to satisfy one or more of the following aspects, namely: responsibility, competence, accountability, transparency, integrity (reputation, fairness and fearlessness); legitimacy; sensitivity and awareness, commitment and objectivity. These aspects have a significant influence in making planning either an effective or an ineffective service. These are the perceptions that the beneficiaries or users of the planning service look for in planning service.

In addition to these attributes of democracy, it has been shown earlier that the way we define both 'planning' and 'profession' has a direct bearing on the way professional planners are likely to behave and consequently the way the image of the planning may be perceived.   Therefore, reference to both the traditional and contemporary perspectives of defining the two terms (that is, planning and profession) will also be referred to in this section in an attempt to explain how the definitions affect the image morphology. The key attributes of the image of the planning are dealt with below.

3.2   THE MAIN FEATURES OF THE IMAGE OF PLANNING

3.2.1 PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY AND RESPONSIBILITY

Responsibility of the planner carries with it full accountability to the client that one serves, be it the immediate or the ultimate client, and the fellow practitioners (Bennion, 1969, p.99).   This implies that the professional planner should be answerable in full of the advice that is given to the clients. This must demand of the planning fraternity to be transparent in its dealings with the users of the planning service. This does not in any way suggest that the planner has unlimited obligation as an expert in a particular field, but that one is rendered liable for unlawful or unacceptable professional conduct such as fraud, bad faith or negligence.

In providing a professional service to his/her clients, the planner carries with him/her the responsibility of ensuring that his/her standing as a professional, his/her employers and that of his/her profession are upheld by avoiding any conduct that may constitute an unprofessional conduct. The violation of any of the professional codes is likely to bring the profession to a disrepute, and consequently a tarnished image of the profession because the users of the planning service, will perceive the occupation as being not able to live up to its promises and expectations. There may be situations where the client may be a layperson, unfamiliar with the rules and practices of the profession. In such cases, there may be conflict between the needs of the users of the planning service and the duty of the planner. This is likely to lead to a temptation where the planner exploits his/her relationship with the client. This is a situation that must be avoided at all costs, since it may contribute to a tarnished image not only of the professional concerned but also of the planning as a whole.

3.2.2 INTEGRITY

According to Bennion (1969, p.108), *"integrity, ... is a priced quality in almost every sphere of life, and nowhere so than in the profession"*. It is generally accepted that the inner character of an organism can only be speculated from the external outward manifestations, which may be reflected in the reputation of an organism. Ideally, the

conduct of the professional should reflect the standing and as a result the image of the profession. If this analysis holds, it therefore means that when a professional causes damage to his/her reputation as professional, this actually damages the reputation of the profession as a whole. The integrity of a professional and the profession is enhanced by its reputation, which is determined by the degree to which the profession is able to achieve some fairness, sensitivity and awareness, all of which are crucial for the users of the planning service, and which in turn influence the way planning is perceived.

3.2.3 REPUTATION

Integrity according to Benion (1969, p.110) can be displayed in a number of ways, ranging from the preservation of confidence, the display of impartiality, the assumption of full responsibility and public accountability, among other ways. These ways will reinforce the integrity of planning, especially when advice is given only where competence exists, and such competence being maintained within the chosen field of practice.

3.2.4 FAIRNESS

The issue of fairness involves the full disclosure of facts by the professional to the client, even if they may not be palatable to the client (Benion, 1969, p.68). This tends to put the professional planner in a position of an 'honest broker'. This introduces another normative aspect of the relationship between the professional planner and the client, that is, the professional must not take an unfair advantage of the inexperience, illiteracy, lack of knowledge or exposure and the low social status of the users of the planning service (Benion, 1969, p.68). Here there is a serious problem of clients not knowing what is to expect from the service or what rights they have in a situation where they were not exposed to planning activities. If the professional planner takes an unfair advantage over his/her clients, this can impair the image of planning.

Another significant aspect linked to a fair advice is the commitment to providing an objective advice to the users of the planning service. Objectivity entails doing what is best as a professional rather than doing only what the professional thinks the client would like to hear. This therefore implies that a planner would render advice as a

matter of judgement based on a system of acceptable values reflecting the needs of the beneficiaries of the planning service.

The issue of doing good as opposed to the issue of doing what may be perceived to be right, is embodied in the principles of fairness and fearlessness which are central to the integrity of the professional and the planning practice (Bennion, 1969, p.70). While realising that the planner has to serve the client groups in a fair manner, the pursuance of such needs should not exceed the legitimate bounds, since the professional has a duty and an obligation to the professional fraternity, other professionals, the other client groups and the general public at large.

3.2.5 FEARLESSNESS OF THE PLANNER

Courage in the face of opposition is a very significant attribute of integrity if the professional is to be an agent of social change (Bennion, 1964, p.71). This can only be possible if the planning profession has an independent ideological guidance. Courage should be displayed in defending a client group's interests, as long as they are fair, just and professionally sound. This may involve a conscious effort and a constant vigilance and perseverance. In practice this may prove to be a very difficult position for a planner to adopt, especially when the professional is working in the public sector, where the requirements of the bureaucratic context may in principle be in conflict with those of the professional. In this case it may be very sensitive for the planner to resist to employer's demands and maintain the standard and morale of the profession.

Ideally, in cases of conflict, especially where public bodies are concerned, an independent professional body can play a significant role in supporting their members against unjust, unsound and unethical demands that may be made to them by their employers. This can only happen when the professional institute is a countervailing agency, arable of breaking down the barriers of the inner professional world and producing knowledge freed from domination by the powerful interests of state and capital (Hague, 1984, p.112).

3.2.6 LEGITIMACY

Baum (1983, p.10) regards legitimacy as the *"... authority which clients or constituents accord practitioners to exercise their expertise".* This authority is accorded as a result of a positive response of the public to the moral basis of practitioners and their organisation (Krumholz, *et al,* 1990, p.23). In the traditional sense, for planners to acquire or retain the authority to practice their expertise, they need to obtain the organised political or legal approval of legitimate decision-makers. These efforts have involved the organisation of administrative approval by officials who are regarded as legitimate public representatives. Whether those professional planners have competent expertise remains to be proved by the exposure of professionals in the practical field.

Based on the above, it becomes clear that the planning tends to be loyal and answerable in full to the administrative system, instead of being accountable to those who receive the planning services. Nowadays the role of planning and development professionals tends to focus more on facilitating what communities aspire, and putting communities development outcomes into context as also influenced by politics. Therefore, one may argue that planning happen at local level influenced by end users to a greater degree, leaving the role of facilitation and coordination at professional level. This serves to reaffirm earlier arguments (See Chapter Two) that planning is in politics, that is, without politics, planning is nothing (Dyckman, 1978, p.291). This, however, does not in any way suggest that planning is politics, but that it cannot be separated from politics, where the exercise of power and value judgements are inherent.

Therefore, as the relationship between professionals and the users of the planning service becomes bureaucratically organised, the users tend to lose control over the professionals. The impact that it has on the image of the planning profession is that the users tend to single out the planning profession as a state apparatus, which is impermeable to public opinion, insensitive to client needs and running out of control (Baum, 1983, p.15). This can give planning a negative image, associated with control, restrictions and delays.

What emerges from the above facts is that as long as legitimacy of the planning profession is not sought by the effectiveness of its services there is little possibility that it can be seen as serving the interests of the users of planning services. As a result, this has the potential of creating a negative image of planning.

3.2.7 SENSITIVITY AND AWARENESS

The professional planner's awareness and sensitivity is heightened by the planning's ideology which is based on a clearly defined value system, which may be normative in orientation. This entails the integration of the planner into the community whom he/she is supposed to serve, thus increasing the level of sensitivity and awareness of the importance of the planner's role, whilst at the same time making him/her little humble in his/her judgements. Therefore, if the planner can be conscious of his/her role, and play it without tyrannising the weaker sections of the community, his/her status as a professional and that of the professional institute being represented will grow.

Awareness and sensitivity of the professional planner to the clients' conditions implies the need to abandon the traditional model of the professional practitioner that makes practitioners to be insensitive to value inputs of their work. One can argue that awareness is a product of phenomenology, a sense of knowing based on primary experience with the users of the planning service. This involves a significant element of the relationship between the planner and the users, that is their right to present their case, as they understand it. This ability to listen and to communicate contributes to the making of a favourable image of the professional and the profession itself (Eversley, 1973). Therefore, a sensitive professional planner will therefore listen, see and possibly feel the needs of the communities (that will be put on agenda by politicians) with whom he/she works. This can enhance the reputation of planning.

The other side of the coin can have adverse effects to the image of planning. For instance, if the planner is not sensitive or perceived not to be sensitive to the value orientations and the needs of communities that he/she serves, there is a strong possibility that conflict between the practitioner and the community will result. This will give the professional and the planning practice a perception of being an aggressor

to the needs and interests of the users of the planning service, and this may be associated with a negative image.

3.3   PLANNING PRIORITIES

Two views of town planning immediately come to mind. Benevolo (1980, p.7) suggested that town planning is usually a little more than a belated response to an existing crisis. Although cynical in content, it is true that the urban crisis was the mother of planning. On the one hand Heap (1973, p.5) said that the function of planning is to ensure a healthy, pleasant and orderly urban environment in order to make the town a fit and decent place in which to live. In short, the continual improvement of the town for the benefit of the community is the essence of town planning. According to McCarthy (1979, p.3) the first step in identifying the fundamental planning priorities is to briefly review the original function of town planning in Britain and the U.S.A. Such a review is of particular relevance, as the British legislation served as the model for much of the planning legislation in South Africa.

Muller (1991, p. 23-24) showed that in both Britain and America, town planning and hence, the planning practice arose out of the need to reform the appalling living conditions of the people. There were two lines of thought as to how this should be achieved:

❑   the social planning movement which emphasised social reform was directed towards improving the urban condition (for example, housing, land use, etc.) and;

❑   the physical planning movement, which concentrated on the urban form. Both streams of thought influenced what planners perceive as priorities.

The origin of town planning in Britain lay in the general response to the appalling conditions created by the industrial revolution. In a move to support the government of the day for the introduction of reform, it was Edwin Chadwick who strove to promote social reform through legislative reform. His report on "The Sanitary

Conditions of the Labouring Population of the Great Britain" was according to Cherry (1974, p.16) startling and irrefutable that the Public Health Act, the Housing Act and the first Housing and Town Planning Act of 1905 followed it.

Four conclusions may be drawn from these events:

❑   the need and desire to improve the health, housing and living conditions of the working class, underpinned town planning legislation in the U.K.;

❑   the acts recognise that it was the responsibility of the authorities to establish and maintain minimum standards;

❑   the planning act recognised the need to protect the residential areas, through zoning, from the ravages of the filthy industry of the time; and

❑   these functions are still exercised by local authorities throughout the world today.

With the passing of time, however, the priority moved from social reform to physical form. The focus fell on the creation of a pleasant environment and the integration of nature with built form. Howard's Garden City Association had an international impact as planners throughout the world strove to create garden cities, or new towns, in green fields.

Looking at the U.S.A., one can perceive a similar pattern. The initial planning priority in the U.S.A. was the need to reform terrible conditions, which accompanied urbanisation and industrialisation. The importance of the physical form in U.S.A grew through the "City Beautiful Movement" and "Park Movement". The movements stressed beauty and improvement of the physical environment to the point of neglecting the basic social and economic priorities. The movement also promoted the comprehensive view or "Grand Plan". In the past, town planning has varied from the rigid and detailed Master Plan of the pre-war era, to the recent, flexible Structure Plan.

Finally, the point worth-mention is that the type of society, and the type of social organisation will effectively determine and influence the type of planning, planning

priorities and the role of planners. For example *"a rigid, hierarchical society is likely to require a rigid, deterministic form of planning. On the other hand, a flexible, open society with free enterprise economy is likely to require a flexible, indicative form of planning" (McCarthy, 1979, p.23)*. Accordingly, planning is a formal means of using, or distributing private and public resources.

3.4   SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The above facts and arguments bring one to a conclusion that the planning practice deals with the provision of services to human beings, thus necessitating the need for personal relationship between professional planners and the users of the planning service.   The humanistic view of relationship calls the professionals to be sympathetic, sensitive, respectful and understanding of their clients' position, all of which are embodied in the ideological guidance of the planning profession.   In addition to these, an ability to create confidence in the professional and the users of professional planning services alike is equally crucial.

It is realised with concern that the attributes of the planning practice cannot be successfully achieved in the current relationships between the planning fraternity and the political system. This is primarily due to the fact that the planning practice has had a historical alignment with the traditional model of planning and professionalism. The shift from this historical model will place huge compromises, not only on the political system alone, but also on the planning service. This will demand of the planning fraternity to adopt an independent set of value system, some ideological basis as a basis for decision-making, which is not aligned to the dominant interests. In this regard, the independent ideological basis for planning will be crucial in the next chapter as its attributes will be used in the determination of the image of planning as perceived by planners on one hand, and by the users or beneficiaries of the planning service.

4. THE ORIGIN, EVOLUTION AND THE IMAGE OF TOWN AND REGIONAL PLANNING

4.1   INTRODUCTION

The development story of planning in continental Europe and America is undoubtedly and significantly different. The international experience in this thesis will be based on the British planning experience, mainly because the town and regional planning in South Africa has been more strongly influenced by the way in which the discipline evolved in Europe (Britain) than by African settlement patterns. The essence, of this Chapter is to present a brief review of developments of planning, spanning from the later part of the nineteenth century (1890s) and extending to the later part of the twentieth century (1980s and beyond). Since this is a brief review, much of the details about the history of the British planning origins can be added from the rich canvass of social history (Cherry, 1974; 1974b; 1982 and 1993).

The evolutionary development of town planning in Britain has been extensively dealt with by a number of authors from various perspectives, including authors such as Goodman (1972), Rose (1974), Cherry (1974a; 1974b; 1982 and 1993), Ratcliffe (1974 and 1981), Hague (1984), among others. It is not the intension of this discourse to duplicate such effort, but rather to identify the various stages in the development of town and regional planning, and from those stages assess the image of planning as perceived by planners and by the user of the planning service.

4.2   THE INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION

The Industrial revolution, which began during the 18th century in Britain, and the resultant urbanisation induced a gradual reverse of the proportion of people living in rural and urban areas. The urban environment reflected these processes, with poor urban families living in rapidly increasing densities and under steadily deteriorating standards either in older parts of towns or in new working class areas surrounding factories. During the first half of the 19th century there were no building restrictions.

This meant that overcrowding took place, resulting in little open space, low housing standards and unhealthy living conditions. The spread of radical reform movements and socialist ideas grew out of concern for the poor living and working conditions of the majority of the population.

The Utopian thinkers of this period - Saint-Simon, Fourier and Morris - arguably grappled with the implications of industrialisation and urban and rural life. Robert Owen was one of the first of many individual reformers to argue and work for better working and living conditions for the poor. He was convinced that a community could be radically changed if their physical conditions were improved. He put his theories into practice in the town of New Lanark. The success of New Lanark and others like it (Saltaire, Bournville and Port Sunlight), had an effect on early town planning (Ashworth, 1953, p.15).

Owen's great achievement was to transform the character of New Lanark without "injury" to the business on which it depended. He tried to provide comfortable housing in a favourable environment for his employees. New Lanark became something more than a compact community living, at the indulgence its employer, in greater comfort and happiness than most others. It was all that, and it was also *"the transformation of a common contemporary pattern into a form which was intended to be an example for the re-organisation of communal life throughout the world"* *(Ashworth, 1953, p.17)*.

Soria Y Mata, a Spanish engineer, regarded transportation as a major problem and proposed a linear city concept (1882) with residential areas developed along axis of high density transport routes from an existing city. He also argued that equitable land distribution would result from the linear city. This must be seen in historical context, for at that time much of Spain's rural areas were large landed estates run by absentee landlord (Ashworth, 1953, p.30).

4.3   EARLY AND MID- 20TH CENTURY

In his book *Garden Cities of Tomorrow* (1902) Ebenezer Howard synthesized an array of planning issues: those of the ideal city, the community experiment and social issues of the day, as well as housing standards and health conditions. Howard's garden City was a holistic concept that integrated town and country. The Garden City was the progenitor of the New Town movement. Howard introduced ideas that were to become standard planning strategies, for example, decentralization as a solution to urban sprawl, the containment of city growth through satellite towns, the notion of a balanced community in terms of working and living space, an emphasis on open space in the form of 'green belts' and issues of management and ownership of a city. Howard regarded the crowded cities as a result of selfishness and rapacity, but entirely unadapted for a society in which the social side of human nature demands more recognition. He felt that the physical and social problems of the nineteenth century were incurable. Therefore, completely new cities could provide a more acceptable answer to modern needs of industrial society.

Ebenezer Howard's work also gave rise to the Garden Cities movement and the formation of the Town Planning Association in 1907. One of the Association's aims was to promote town planning. This Association has had a significant impact on planning thought in Europe and America.

4.3.1 PLANNING IN ENGLAND

The first town planning legislation to be passed was the Housing, Town Planning Act, 1909, which aimed in broad outline to secure, *"the home healthy, the house beautiful, the town pleasant, the city dignified and the suburb salubrious" (Cullingworth, 1974, p.258).* The emphasis of this Act was on raising the standard of new development. *"The passing of the 1909 Act gave new attention to town planning beyond activities of propagandist bodies and their projects, and there was competition for supremacy in handling the statutory powers in preparing schemes" (Cherry, 1974).* Yet at this stage it was not clear what town planning involved. The effect of the Act in practice and associated academic developments drew attention to the need for a new professional body. The Town Planning Institute was formed in London in 1914. Subsequently, two

significant pieces of legislation guided the discipline. The Town and Country Planning Act (1932) extended planning authority over almost any kind of land use, while the Restriction of Ribbon Development Act (1935) was introduced to control development sprawling along major routes.

In 1937 a Royal Commission was appointed under the chairmanship of Sir Montaque Barlow to consider the geographical distribution of the industrial population. The Barlow Report turned out to be one of the most influential documents in the history modern of town planning and Osborn and Whittick (1969, p. 89) pointed correctly that *"the Barlow Report did in the event prove the historic turning point in the governmental concern with urban development"*. This intensive study into problems raising from excessively large conurbations, revealed many social and economic drawbacks of urban sprawl type of development, and all the Committee's recommendations pointed *"towards the imperative necessity of limiting great-city congestion and further growth" (Osborn and Whittick, 1969, p.90)*. It regarded a balanced distribution of industry and population as being in the national interest. The Commission considered the control of industrial development in London as an inadequate measure; it was necessary to offer inducements in order to help secure a better balance and a greater diversification of industry throughout the country.

The Greater London Plan, prepared by Abercrombie in 1944, was based on the idea of planned decentralisation that became a post-war model for all urban areas. At the end of World War II, the Labour government gave added momentum to the New Towns concept, by basically applying Abercrombie's proposals (of the planned decentralization of London by reducing the population density of the inner metropolitan core) to the rest of the United Kingdom.

The New Towns Act was passed in 1946 and set up the machinery for building New Towns. Development corporations were given wide powers to acquire land, design and construct. The basis of the New Towns was the neighbourhood unit. The idea was that there would be small, self-contained areas with its own school and local shops. The intention was that each neighbourhood could operate on a pedestrian level. The New Towns had their origins in Howard's "Garden City" concept, which aimed at

combining the best qualities of both urban and rural life in one compact settlement. Post-War British (and French) new towns were designed to be independent and self-sufficient so as to eliminate commuting as far as possible. Together with the "greenbelt" towns of the USA, these new towns had a significant influence on urban planning worldwide and have been repeated with modification in many countries.

4.3.2 PLANNING IN FRANCE

In France, Le Corbusier's ideas responded to the housing shortages after World War I and the increasing congestion in early twentieth century cities. He argued firstly, that the traditional city had become obsolete - as the increase in size and congestion indicated; and secondly that the city could be decongested by increasing mobility, by encouraging traffic flow and, paradoxically, by increasing residential density. His book, *Radiant City* (1933), visualised a multi-level transportation system, satellite suburbs, multi-storied buildings with green open space stretching beneath and around.

4.3.3 PLANNING IN THE U.S.A

During the 1930s local authorities began to establish city planning commissions and introduced land use zoning regulations. According to Lee (1955, p.527) this city planning commissions concentrated *"major portion of their efforts... in enacting and enforcing zoning laws, rather than in city planning"*. The development of Radburn was inspired by the 'Garden City' idea and its residential character has become a prototype of sound community planning. The City Housing

Corporation intended to build housing for workers within commuting distance of New York. Wright and Stein produced super-blocks with streets surrounding rather than traversing the areas.

After World War II, rapid increases in urban population and car ownership resulted in severe housing shortages, urban decay and traffic problems. In response, programmes were created to provide new housing, recreation areas, parks and improved industrial and commercial areas. The Philadelphia urban renewal programme of 1950 typified this approach. The new transport technology of the 1950s permitted the outward expansion of the American city, whereas the new building technology enabled the

metropolis to grow vertically. Osborn and Whittick (1969, p.153) sees the USA with its high urbanisation rate as one of the countries *"in direst need of a policy of planned limitation and dispersal for the relief of city constipation and avoidance of suburban sprawl".*

Due to several factors like the strong influence of private developers and the sophisticated forms of transport in the U.S.A, inner-city problems became more and more appalling. It was logical that it was merely a matter of time before a national policy had to be adopted. In 1970 the Housing and Urban Development Act became legislation in the United States. This Act, which can be described as the introduction of new town legislation in this country, makes provision, inter alia, for *"a national urban growth policy... and to encourage and support development which will assure our communities of... well balanced neighbourhoods in socially, economically and physically attractive living environments"* (Morris, 1982, p.72).

Re-planning and redevelopment of large areas of European cities such as Munich, Hamburg and Coventry also marked Town planning in the mid-twentieth century. It was a period that saw a large contiguous urban areas (called city-region megalopolis) that led to the formation of metropolitan planning authorities and planning at that scale. This period also saw concerted, large-scale concern for planning at regional scale - Tennessee Valley Authority (1933), and the advent of new, planned capital cities such as Canberra (1959) and Brasilia (1960).

In Britain, the Town and Country Planning Act (1968) was "a major attempt to bring planning system up to date, to shed the cumbersome and inflexible procedures of the established system, to redefine the respective roles of central and local government (with far less central concern with detailed planning matters) and to provide the framework for a greater degree of citizen participation in the planning process" (Cullingworth, 1974, p.16).

4.4   LATE 20TH CENTURY

The demands of an accelerating rate of urbanisation world-wide have dominated contemporary town and regional planning. Mallows (1988) points out that we are dealing with industrial urbanisation. " This type of urbanisation which started 200 years ago with a wholly new source of power, gave a new direction to society in two ways: a vastly increased productivity per worker and secondly, in consequence, a drastic change in work time - the combination resulting in far more consumer goods being available and far more time to use them. These benefits can only occur in cities where the economics of proximity, scale and location can be optimized and where these increased benefits can fuel a permanent on-going process of adaption and invention. This internal dynamic of cities, which is the life-blood of modern societies, depends of course on the degrees of skill and commitment that are devoted to it" (Mallows, 1988, p.6).

> Furthermore, he continued *"... cities have from their beginning, mostly grown not from their own natural increase of population, but from immigrants coming to them from elsewhere: from rural districts or other countries where conditions were inferior. The traditional tendency expanded to massive proportions with the new industrial urbanisation and the urban expansion, which has created our present standard of living, would have been impossible without this immigration. The price to be paid for this increase in living standards is obvious: the creation of new skills through education to permit these re-educated immigrants to be absorbed into city life as quickly as possible to maximize the productivity and preserve the on-going increase in living standards" (Mallows, 1988, p.7).*

Rapid urbanisation in Third World countries has caused problems such as sprawling, unplanned cities, and extensive informally developed areas. Uncontrolled urban growth, coupled with widespread poverty and lack of jobs lead to a current emphasis on particularly aspects of town planning, such as housing for low income households, upgrading informal settlements, and the provision of minimal (previously regarded as sub-standard) infrastructure that can later be upgraded. Town and regional planners

have also been drawn into related issues such as employment creation, deregulation, financing urban development and fostering increased participation of local people in decision-making structures.

The latter decades of this century have also been marked by the emergence of vast discrepancies between the wealthy and the poorer areas of cities, and between cities in developed and poorer countries. These widening disparities have led to a divergence in concerns for town and regional planning. These range between the provision of high quality recreation areas and fine-tuning of land use controls at neighbourhood level in well developed areas in a typical First World city on the one hand, and the provision of basic needs for millions of people living in unplanned areas with virtually no facilities or services on the other.

Town planning in the mid- and later twentieth-century has also had to respond to a widespread concern with social and economic issues. Providing access to basic needs such as shelter, water, sanitation, transport and jobs have become important aspect of town and regional planners' work. At the same time, an increased concern for the natural environment and the need to sustain non-renewable resources has become an issue of major concern to planners' worldwide.

4.4.1 PLANNING ISSUES AND CONCERNS

If attention is to be given to the effectiveness of planning initiatives aimed at addressing the problems that pervaded the British society at the time, the origins of the problems must be understood. Here, the author is interested in the issues and the contexts that formed the basis for the emergence of the planning. As Cherry (1974a and 1982) pointed out, the factors which have contributed to the emergence and development of planning thought are numerous and complex. He argues that these have been intertwined over time and woven into the fabric of British social, political and economic history. Even though the circumstances that led to the emergence of planning in Britain are said to be numerous and complex; the social, political and economic conditions of the British social history provide a useful point of reference.

Towards the end of the nineteenth century (1890s) and the early twentieth century (1900s), the British working-class witnessed a period of great social and political upheavals and economic transformations. The extent and severity of the problems varied from town to town, but the types of problems experienced were critically the same. These included poor housing, overcrowding, ill health, unemployment, low and irregular pay (Cherry, 1982). These factors combined to create a situation one could collectively describe as 'social deprivation'.

4.4.2 COMPLEXITIES AND PROSPECTS

The above problems that could be collectively regarded as 'social deprivation' marked a period of rapid urban growth characterised by population explosion, social distress, unrest and economic crisis. These continued towards a heightened awareness and ultimate acceptance for the introduction of some form of regulation regarding the management, direction, control and intervention in the development processes (Cherry, 1974a; 1974b and Ratcliffe, 1974). During this era, rapid urbanisation, social and environmental manifestations that posed a threat to the industrial expansion and economic growth necessitated state intervention in urban development.

The state responded to the pressures at the time by intervening through the public health measures (Goodman, 1972; Cherry, 1974a and 1974b; Haque, 1984). Complimentary to these measures was the introduction of sanitary and building controls over developments. This led to increasing pressure for effective municipal control over the development and use of land and the precedence in this regard was set by several Social Reform Acts and Public Health Acts, such as the Housing Act of 1909 (Cherry, 1974b). The Act provided sufficient political pressure to secure reform through legislation.

Even though developments were evolutionary, after almost so many years emerged the social welfare state, central to which was the idea of planning. Therefore, formalised town planning emerged primarily as a response to the legacy of the nineteenth century British industrial growth (Friedmann, 1973; Rose, 1974, Hague, 1984; Greed, 1993). Within this context, town planning, with a strong welfare and social philosophical background, as an exercise in land and environmental

management, took shape as a movement in its own right. The welfare state from a planning perspective, provided an inner drive of social conscience as expressed in a concern for a range of issues which among others had to do with the *"better working-class housing, temperance, reform, and an improvement in living conditions and environmental surroundings" (Cherry, 1974b, p.61)*. Therefore, it can be noted that even though town planning had no simple origins, nor has its emergence and development been determined in any specific ways, it can be legitimately said "town planning had its origins in the work of the nineteenth century social reformers" (Bruton, 1974, p.20), which had as its base the social concern for human life.

The early planning approach to problems was essentially a rational, conformist approach to urban problems. The approach had its origins in the positivist model and the rational decision model. These formed the basis on which decisions could be made. The early planning approaches were criticized for being control oriented and paternalistic. Initially, especially the end of the nineteenth century there was a reliance on voluntary social reform efforts that were responsive to a set of urban problems. The institutionalisation of social reform efforts witnessed a considerable shift to a dependence on a largely centralist and unilateral system, which was thought of as being confident in solving the problems of the working classes. This culminated in the birth of blue-print planning approach. The blue-print approach, one may argue, was strengthened by the fact that there was perceived sureness about what needed to be done and how it could be achieved, and at the time the authorities could be on to undertake planning without interference by the users of the planning services (Cherry, 1974a). The Blue-Print approach has been widely discredited, criticisms leveled at this approach to planning are well documented (Prinsloo, 1972; Drake, 1991).

The above points provide adequate evidence to suggest that the rapid urbanisation of the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century necessitated state intervention in urban development processes. Therefore, one may argue, the blue-print planning approach can be interpreted as an instrument for the extension of state intervention in urban development processes. There is no doubt that this planning approach ensconced in the traditional model of the town planning practice, which tended to be

narrower in focus and predominantly land-use orientated. The effectiveness of the approach in relation to the image of planning will be dealt with below.

4.4.3 TECHNOCRATIC PERSPECTIVE

Town and regional planning seems to have shifted from being an activity concern with the plight of the laboring-classes and their housing conditions, to the concern for all the land uses and all social classes, that is, the general public. During this era, town planning occurred in a technocratic context. According to Jakobson (1970) three categories of planners happen to fall within the scope of the technocratic category. Jakobson identified firstly *"utopian planners who aim to create their ideal society. Secondly, scientific planners who seek a predicable society and thirdly, bureaucratic planner who hope to create an orderly society" (Jakobson, 1970, p.125)*. This technocratic political culture presupposes an autocratic style in which the state, controlled by the scientific and industrial classes regulates the economy and engineers social change in what it holds to be the public interest. Social change, it is believed, is for the benefit of the whole society but needs to be initiated paternalistically by the user or dominant classes.

The technocratic approach to planning tended to assume an autocratic, paternalistic and top-down style of operation in which planners or state authorities were assumed to knows or can discern the public's needs (and therefore that there is homogeneous public). It also assumes that the goal of *"orderly development is in the general public interest and that planners are in the best position on any group to determine plans... goals" (Catanese, 1984, p.59)*, with the emphasis still on what Dyckman (1978, p.279) calls bureaucracy and efficiency, which necessitate and emphasis formal or procedural rationality. Davidoff and Reiner (1962, in Faludi, 1973, p.22) criticize this stance by maintaining *"... that neither the planner's technical competence nor his wisdom entitles him to ascribe or dictate values to his immediate or ultimate clients"*. This view is in keeping with democratic prescriptive that public decision-making and action should reflect the will of the client.

The fact that earlier social reformers and planners adopted a traditional model of planning, which implied that issues such as value judgment and technical neutrality

remained unquestioned, tended to create an image of planning as pro status quo in the eyes of the laboring classes. This is because of most of the land-use decisions taken tended to reflect the needs and interests of the powerful and dominant groups. In this manner planning was perceived as being in the interest of the dominant ideology, that is the state and capital (Rose, 1974; Hague, 1984). This is supported by the fact that the assumption of technically-neutral stances and the subsequent lack of moral commitment *"... in an unequal society is not a neutral stance, it is an endorsement and sustenance for inequality and repression" (Hague, 1984, p.326)*. The pseudo-neutral stance of the earlier planners tended to produce social ignorance and a perception that planning was for the wealthy and the state, and not necessarily directed at alleviating the plight of the working classes. From the point of view of the state and capital, town planning was viewed as a way of creating favourable conditions for the reproduction of a more contented and efficient working class, through reform measures that were advocated, especially during the turn of the twentieth century. This therefore, gave planning activity an image of being used as an instrument for social control, intended to suppress the working classes.

The above circumstances provide sufficient information to say planners at that time perceived the image of planning as being positive since they saw nothing wrong with the status quo, hence their reluctance to challenge it. However, Beauregard (1978, p.235) criticises the acceptance by technocratic planners of the kind of state intervention, as well as the orientation of such planners toward the preservation of the status quo of middle-class power and privileged. Kirk (1980, p.131) finds that the pre-occupation in the technocratic planning context is on competition for scarce resources: that rather than the emphasis being on choice - for both individuals and society as a whole - it is on constraint; the subtle constraining of those who do not have access to resources, thereby ensuring the maintenance of the status quo.

4.4.4 PLANNING ACHIEVEMENTS AND FAILURES

4.4.4.1 The underlying issues

The British social politics took a turn with the election of a majority labour government in 1929. This was the time that conditions of recession were felt in the

British economy (Cherry, 1982, p.19). From a town planning perspective, certain developments in planning legislation were of interest. The focus of legislation in the 1930s was still on housing, as were the 1909 and the 1919 precedents. The 1930 Greenwood Housing Act focused on housing policy towards slum clearance (Hague, 1984; Cherry, 1982, p.45). This was a difficult policy to pursue, given the state of the economy at the time, especially the international financial crisis. During this time, Britain was still exhausted by the First World War (1914-1918), and compounded with an increasingly declining share of world trade and markets as the available employment opportunities declined (Goodman, 1972, p.31). The impacts of the world economic crisis of the 1930s were felt by traditional industries of coal, cotton and wool, which were regarded as the mainstay of the British economy. The incoming Conservative government advocated calls for large scale expenditure reductions and strict *laissez-faire* orthodoxy (Goodman, 1972, p.31; Hague 1984, p.330) so as to support measures which they believed would restore public confidence and at the same time elevating a disparate financial situation. From these developments it seemed as if town planning stood very little chance in a strictly *laissez-faire* orthodoxy.

4.4.4.2 Problems and prospects

The political undercurrent during this period of unprecedented mass democracy was the rising influence of the working class and its containment. From a town planning interest, the most significant features of this period is the way the planning responded to the prevailing political, economic and social circumstances at the time.

The traditional model of a planning that was adopted in the reform era (Late 1890s - 1930) was still firmly entrenched in the planning practice. As mentioned earlier, during the earlier years of the reform era (1900-1910) planning was not formally organized. It was only during the period prior to the depression era that the profession became formally organized, especially from 1914 onwards. The prevailing economic conditions of the depression era necessitated a slight change in practice. This change, argued Rose (1984, p.321), the adaptive response to pressing socio-economic and political problems that threatened the very basis of industrial society.

The responses to those circumstances culminated in the shift to rational comprehensive planning approaches, with particular emphasis on allocative planning approaches, town and country planning was redefined to match the stringent financial imperatives of the day. It was during this era that comprehensive planning was depicted as a rational middle ground between the extremes of *laissez-faire* totalitarianism, a neutral and expert means of managing change that could protect the capital and the political interests. The planning process was therefore viewed fundamentally as a centralist matter whereby an elitist political and technical hierarchy framed for and on behalf of the society as whole, policies. The era witnessed the consolidation and the strengthening of the traditional model of the professional planner, with a slight shift, a shift to the role of a planner as an allocator of scarce resources. Allocative planning emerged in this situational context (Friedmann, 1973, p.17). During this era, planning tended to be perceived by the planning fraternity as a redistributive mechanism of society's scarce resources. Even though professional planners had to shift their emphasis to the allocation of scarce resources, their activity focus was of interest to the majority of the working classes, but it threatened the industrial interests, for planning was perceived by the industrialists to be the same thing as socialism.

It can therefore, be argued that based on the above, planners had, using Schon's (1983) and Hague's (1984) terminology respectively, a "crisis of confidence" and a "motivation crisis" because their supposed moral commitment, that is the use of their skills to further social equity was being challenged by powerful state and capital interests. In this way, references to equity and distributional justice virtually disappeared as planners sought to reassure the government and the business that planning was not the same thing as socialism, which was associated with collective ownership of the means of production.

The logic of allocative planning requires that the system over which resources are to be distributed has a single set of comprehensive, system wide objectives which are ordered in such a way that the more inclusive, overriding objectives are places at the top and the more narrowly conceived, instrumental ones at the bottom. There is no doubt that this requirement for allocative planning tended to force 'allocative'

planners during the depression and World War II Era to adopt the misnomer concept of the "public interest" which assumes that there is agreement over society's values and norms. Also, planners were expected to identify and order such values. By assuming such a role of ordering other people's values and norms, planners tended to view the planning constituents as being harmoniously ordered with conflict and struggle being absent (Catanese, 1984, p.159). This overemphasis on stability was strengthened by the fact that planners at the time were 'married' to the equilibrium or structural functional model. This model, according to Hague (1984), treats the society as a single unit in which the social science concepts of power, class, conflict and values are consciously excluded in professional discourse.

Allocative planning did not only have an impact on the distribution of resources as it was intended, it also had far reaching implication on the behaviour of 'allocative planners'. There is no doubt that the allocative planning approach strengthened and reinforced the planners's reluctance to consider innovative actions, especially due to its overemphasis on stability. The allocative planning approach did not envisage any social change, and as such any innovative actions were perceived as being *"... risky and might upset the fragile balances they have projected" (Friedmann, 1973, p.56).* Furthermore, there was an unconvincing claim that the decisions about the allocation and redistribution of scarce resources were based on functional rationality alone. This claim can be challenged. In a realistic situation, where value judgment are unavoidable, decisions about the allocation and redistribution of resources definitely involve a significant normative component, one that reflects someone's interest, which are necessarily the public's. This claim to functional rationality tended to make planners to be insensitive to the value implications of their work. These facts prove the fact that allocative planning was in favour of the established interests, hence Friedmann (1973, p.60) labelled it *"planning for the maintenance of status guo".* The planners's 'motivation crisis' and the 'crisis of confidence' which planners experienced during this era was not satisfactorily resolved until during the post- war era (1945-1960) which will be looked at later.

The role that planners adopted as allocators of scarce resources was very much in line with the scope of central planners, whose sole aim of rationalisation of the allocation

of resources consciously put the planners in the stance of the traditional planning model. Within this model, planners tended to set themselves off as experts who were independent, over and above their clients, with the technical and intellectual wisdom that enabled them to determine the public will. This then led to the loss of any real or perceived legitimacy that planners had, and consequently their effectiveness in attempting to address the problems of inequities in the British society were seriously undermined.

These circumstances present substantial evidence to suggest that the image of planning in Britain during the depression and World War II era was a negative one, as perceived by the users of the planning service. This suggestion is supported by the fact that the redistribution function of planners tended to be biased in favour of the powerful interests in the British society, at the expense of the laboring-classes. Sceptics at the time perceived the planning fraternity to be a capitalist wagon intended to sustain the capitalist system by legitimizing the behavior and actions of professional planners. On this basis, the planning practice was thus perceived as having a tainted image because it was not furthering the interests of the users of the planning service, but those of the state and the capital.

4.4.5 TOWARDS POST-1947 PLANNING

4.4.5.1 Issues of concern

This phase of British social history found Britain recovering from the Second World War (1939-1945). The country's morale after the war was sustained by the setting up of a number of committees and commissions to consider urgent problems of post-war reconstruction and development. One of the committee, which was to have fundamental implications on planning in both its traditional forms and new forms, was Beveridge Committee (Goodman, 1972; Cherry, 1974a; Muller, 1992a). The committee's report touched on the basic issues that the planning was legitimately expected to act upon. The issues included; want; disease; ignorance; squalor and idleness. The need to react to the war-created conditions and addressing the above issues was pervasive.

4.4.5.2 Reformist perspective

The period immediately after the war witnessed considerable activity and expenditure in the field of town planning, but the achievement of targets in terms of solving the many and complex war-created problems was limited. This is reflected in the programmes that were unleashed during the time. Planning authorities reacted to the situation by embarking on comprehensive clearance programmes that were let loose in many British cities. The clearance programme were seen as a solution to dealing with the problems of poor and inadequate housing and the physical fabric of cities, but the social consequences of destroying well-established communities to replace them with high-rise blocks were not anticipated. The traditional model of the planning that persisted during the Reform era (1890s-1930) and the Depression and World War II Era (1930-1945) continued to do so in the post-war era. Within the traditional model, planners tended to be perceive themselves as being entitled with the independence of deciding what was appropriate for the general public. This was reflected in the urban renewal programmes that were designed unilaterally by the planning authorities in the name of the public interest.

The urban renewal programmes were based on a theory that is incomplete. The theory, argued Goodman (1972), was rooted in *"environmental/physical determinism"*. This is *"...a crude belief in the power of physical arrangement of buildings to cure all social ills, ..." (Rose, 1974, p.43)*. The large-scale clearance of sub-standard housing coupled with the actual and planned destruction of part of British cities brought planners face-to-face with their constituents often in circumstances of conflict. This was a response to the paternalistic and undemocratic manner in which the decisions affecting the planning constituents were made.

There is, therefore, sufficient evidence to conclude that the users of the planning service, especially the disadvantaged communities who were affected by slum clearance programmes perceived planning practice to be an aggressor to their interests, in the sense that it contributed to the destruction of social and neighbourhood networks which were created for many years. There is no doubt that

this placed a rather bad image of planning, as the displaced communities perceived it, most of whom were the poor, the deprived and the homeless.

As mentioned earlier, the planners' crises of motivation and confidence were not satisfactorily resolved until the post-war era. The professional planners' response to these crises led to a dramatic shift in planning approach. Morris (1982, p.54) found that while traditionally planning had a reproducing or reinforcing function, it could, in other circumstances, be an influential means of counteracting or compensating for the negative effects of power. It has the potential for a reforming function if it can help people to *"articulate and assert their own meanings" (Morris, 1982, p.54)*, and it can help resolve those meanings into a collective strategy of action to impose more constraints on the powerful.

The extent to which planners became involved in social issues of planning has to a considerable degree been a reflection of the prevailing conflictual climate between themselves and the community groups that were supposed to benefit from the planning service rather than any internal professional discourse among planners themselves (Hague, 1984; Essex, 1991). In this conflicting situation, planners saw it fit to involve public in any planning activity taking place in the context of 'public participation'. Also, the emergence of social planning approach and processes such as advocacy planning and participatory planning approaches emerged in the light of this background (Davidoff, 1965, in Faludi, 1973, p.280). Those favouring the advocacy approach also take up the issue of power and its distribution in society. Many have expanded on the ideas first proposed by Davidoff (1959, 1965).

> *"Advocate planners accept the pluralist viewpoint that society is made up of many interest groups and that these interest are not always compatible. Conflict then, becomes very important in resolving incompabilities. But whereas the pluralists assert that the outcome of competition and conflict between groups is one that ultimately represents a fair balance between groups and is hence the optimal or most democratic solution, advocate planners are most sceptical of the optimality of the status quo. For advocate planners equilibrium of politics in capitalist society yields winners and*

> *losers... Thus (they) see a land-use plan as the embodiment of particular group interests - interests which are usually those of the most powerful and articulate groups" (McCarthy and Smit, 184, p.134).*

The emergence of advocacy planning and other social planning approaches posed a threat to the traditional model of planning, because there was a realisation that planning activity was no longer a technical and neutral expertise, but more of a social service with a strong sense of moral commitment of enhancing the use of professional skills to further social equity. This change in planning approaches can be interpreted as a direct response to the negative image of planning, and also a way of reshaping the relationships between the planning fraternity and the displaced communities.

Advocacy planning has on various accessions been criticized for not making it possible for the affected groups to talk for themselves in the planning process. The approach was criticized for its retention of some features of the traditional model of planning, for example, the fact that somebody had the capacity to articulate and interpret the needs and aspirations of certain groups in a society. This paternalistic tendency received extensive criticism from many quarters, especially the poor, and planners who were critical of their roles to view the image of planning as being negative since access to the planning process was still closed to the majority of the beneficiaries of the planning service. The patronising attitude of advocacy planners could be attributed to the fact that the approach was derived from one of the early professions, which had traditional legal perspective.

The image of planning at the time had ambiguous interpretations from planners. On one hand, it was perceived as being negative by those planners who, it can be argued were conscious and critical of their roles. On the other hand, planners who were not conscious or critical of their roles, and who probably saw nothing wrong with the status quo perceived the image as being positive. The users of the planning service perceived planning as being negative, as a result of its intimate links with the political and economic system and its contribution to the implementation of the renewal programmes. The peak of the post-war era resulted in the era of awakening, which

was a strengthening and sustenance of the post war era indicatives, which led to the opening up of the planning process in British planning system.

4.4.6 THE ERA OF AWAKENING (1960 -1980)

4.4.6.1 Issues shaping the era

During this era, theories of participatory democracy were gaining ground, both in national politics and in planning context. The era was also marked by the increase in pressure group activity in the mid-sixties, including the rise of the influential trade unions that was characterised by labour militancy and community activism. These developments had an influence on the development of the social planning approaches that emerged during the post era (1945-1960). It was during this era that Davidoff and Reiner (1962) wrote their influential planning approach, a *"Choice Theory of Planning"*. Their definition of planning then reflected the changing mood of the democratic political culture both in the political circles and the planning context, and also the roles that the public was expected to play in the determination of their future through the planning process. For example, Davidoff and Reiner defined planning *"... as a process for determining appropriate future action through a sequence of choices"* (1962, in Faludi, 1973, p.11). It can also be argued that the developments during this period were a direct response to the negative image of planning during the post war era.

4.4.6.2 Planning response and its image

The traditional model of planning together with the negative image of planning persisted in the early years of this era of awakening. Traditionally, planning had been universally regarded as outside politics, with a kind of technical wisdom all of its own. As such, it was ideally suited to the centralist philosophy whereby universally applicable solutions were dispensed.

After the rejection of advocacy planning during the post war era, the planners at the time were increasingly criticized for their professional arrogance, their "planner knows best attitude", their neglect of socio-economic issues and the way they

paternalistically impose their educated values and narrowly conceived policies on ordinary people (Goodman, 1972; Thomas and Healey, 1991). Fagence (1977, p.260) points out that "most of the criticisms points to the use of the comprehensive, elitist master plan approach to decision-making, in which the process proceeds along a path dictated by expert with perhaps a preconceived plan in mind, in ignorance (consciously or innocently contrived) of the aspiration or preferences of the client public". What is eminent here is that it seem that the comprehensive planning approach that dominated the planning practice in the 1930s was still deeply entrenched in the planning system of the 1960s.

With the new political and social science insight of the 1960s, there seems to have been much appreciation that the planning activity, far from being above or below politics, was very much part of it (Cherry, 1974b; Dyckman, 1978). This position of acknowledging that planning takes place in a socio-political context, made it possible for the image of planning to undergo significant changes during this era. There seems to have been the realisation that the negative image of the planning profession at the time was partly due to the undemocratic nature and its denial of citizen involvement in decision-making processes. This realisation became evident in the appointment of the Skeffington Committee, under the chairmanship of Arthur Skeffington (Fagence, 1977; Cherry, 1982). The Skeffington Committee was appointed *"to consider and report on the best methods, including publicity of securing the participation of the public at the formative stage in the making of development plans for their areas"* (Cherry, 1982, p.47).

There is no doubt that since the publication of the Skeffington Report, "people and planning", the image of planning in Britain has undergone significant improvements. With the emergence of environment movement from the early seventies, planning in Britain tended to secure its place in the British society because of the emergence of new roles for planners such as environmental mediation, the conflict resolution over environmental issues, among other roles, in an attempt to reconcile conservation and development objectives.

The betterment of planning in Britain can partly be attributed to the stance taken by the RTPI, and partly to the attitude adopted by the state authorities at the time. Based on the achievements of the RTPI, one can legitimately argue that the Institute displayed some willingness to take proactive initiatives that were to boost the image of the profession. The Institute seem to have recognised the fact that if the planning discipline was *"... to be guided for action instead of becoming an outdated bureaucratic routine"* (Castells, 1982, p.3), it had to respond to social change positively. The state authorities at the time displayed a degree of willingness to explore innovative routines regarding the involvement of the beneficiaries of planning service in the decision-making process concerning the distribution of such services.

These positions taken by the RTPI and state authorities in Britain still remained to be seen in the South African planning context. The development of planning thought in Britain has much in common to the development of the planning history in South Africa. The following section will focus on this planning heritage that South Africa inherited from Britain.

4.4.7 THE PLANNING HERITAGE

The development of planning thought in South Africa owes a great deal to the British planning experience (Muller, 1993; Drake, 1993; Mabin, 1993). This is reflected by the fact that planning in South Africa, especially in the early years before 1948, resembles much of the British planning history in terms of its regulations and land use orientation. Of more significance, it has developed under a parental umbrella of the traditional planners, that is, engineers, architects and surveyors, as much as it was the case in Britain.

The studies on the origins of planning in South Africa have been covered quantitatively by Floyd (1960) and others, and critically by authors such as Muller (1980; 1982a; 1982b; 1983; 1991a; 1991b; 1992 and 1993), Drake (1991; 1993), Mabin (1991; 1993), McCarthy and Smit (1984), Smit (1989) and other authors from wide ranging perspective. Therefore, this section will simply present a brief and selective review of the planning history in South Africa, with specific emphasis on the image of the planning profession. Given the fact that South Africa planning has so long been dominated by politics, this section can be considered as a history of town

planning in a political context. This history has value only when the social, economic and political circumstances underlying it are understood in context. Of more significance will be the way the planning responded to each context, and how both the communities who were supposed to benefit from the service and the planning professionals perceived its effectiveness. Then the determination of the image of the planning based on the criteria established in chapters two and three will be made.

4.5   THE LOCAL CONTEXT

An understanding of the political, social and economic contexts that shaped the development of the planning thought in South Africa is pertinent in the determination of the image of the planning. The image of the planning will be determined at four stages of development, namely: the colonial and union era (early 1900 - 1948); the apartheid era (1948 - 1980); crisis and chaos era – mid-apartheid era (1980's); and lastly, the transitional and uncertainty era (1990-1993). It must be noted that the approach to the analysis orientation, which is indebted to the work of McCarthy and Smith (1984); Smit (1989); Muller (1980, 1982, 1991a, 1991b, 1992 & 1993) and other critical authors such as Meredith (1988); Hague (1984) and Goodman (1972).

4.5.1 THE EARLY 1890s - 1948

4.5.1.1 Political and socio-economic issues

The constitution of the Union of South Africa came into effect during this era, after tense political antagonisms between the English and the Afrikaners, between 1899 and 1902. This era was also marked by the formal exclusion of the African, Asian and the Coloured population groups in the constitutional arrangements of the country. This is not to suggest that discriminatory practices did not exist before the Union government was established, but to highlight the fact that some exclusionary practices tended to be formalised. The Era offered these disadvantaged groups little prospects for advancement. Since they were not part of the National Convention that drew the Union Constitution, no attention was paid to protests and petitions that highlighted complaints about their lack of political and social rights. The objective here was to consciously and strategically deny these groups political, social and economic roles in the development of the country (Meredith, 1988, p.27).

During this era, non-white groups in general, but the black population in particular were soon subjected to a range of legislation which was designed to relegate it to a strictly subordinate role and to exploit its labour potential. The intentions of the Union government seem to have been explicitly spelt out in 1913 with the introduction of the Land Act which laid down the principle of territorial segregation along the lines

which later became an official policy of segregation along the South Africa. The introduction of the 1913 Land Act was, one can argue, in the wake of the increasing black urbanisation to what was conceived as the 'white man's preserve', i.e. the urban areas. By so doing, the Union government sought to reassure the white electorate that the increasing urbanisation of the black population was no threat at all.

The Land Act was complemented by other controls such as the migrant labour system that was introduced merely to serve the white capital interests, at the expense of the Non-white groups. Given the objective of the state of consciously excluding the black population groups from the cities, the migrant labourers could be housed in compounds which gave them no opportunity to put down their roots in what was perceived as the whit man's preserve. The common tendency at the time has always been to confine the black population to unskilled work, especially in the mines, on farms and in domestic services. To this effect a series of labour policies placed severe restrictions on black employment opportunities and advancement (Meredith, 1988, p.22 and Smit, 1989, p.21).

The period immediately after the First World War was characterised by a number of difficulties in all spheres of development. There were pressing domestic as well as international problems that the Union Government had to attend to. The problems included among others, high urbanisation rate; the high population growth rate coupled with declining employment opportunities; urban and rural poverty; the rise of African trade unionism and deteriorating housing conditions. These created tensions among the white electorate and posed a threat to the reproduction process of the black labour force (McCarthy and Smit, 1984, p.41; Smit, 1989, p.30).

The tensions were centered on the demands for the improvements in black living conditions and the granting of political and social rights as citizens of the country. These tensions signalled for attention from the state. It was during this time that the Transvaal Town Planning Association was formed (1919), after years of lobbying by the traditional planners that comprised mainly of engineers, architects and surveyors. A considerable number of commissions drew attention to the squalid conditions that the majority of black migrants were experiencing, but it was only in 1918, after the

high mortality rates of black migrants in the 'flu epidemic (1918)' that local authorities became stimulated to provide housing in formal townships for the black migrants (Non-European Affairs Committee, 1969/1970) (Muller, 1991b, p.19). The 1919 Public Health Act was introduced in the light of the above circumstances.

The above Act empowered *"... the Minister to make regulations, confer powers and impose duties on local authorities in respect of planning, land subdivision, zoning and densities" (Muller, 1991b, p.20)*. The implementation of the Act was a success, preoccupied with trying to clear existing slums and to reinforce health regulations. This is more or less the same stance taken by the British authorities during the Depression and World War II Era, when the Slums Clearance Act was introduced in 1931. Therefore, In South Africa, form the 1919 Housing Act, the tone of planning seems to have been physically and technically oriented, with an emphasis on control, restrictive and prescriptive of planning duties by higher levels (Drake, 1993).

This tone was to dominate the content and the modus operandi of planning in the years that were to follow. This is reflected by the fact that *"... from the very beginning town planning took the physicalist and technicist philosophical orientation of the 'city practical' movement which was also gaining ground in Britain" (Smit, 1989, p.55)*.

The TTPA was to act as a lobby group for the introduction of town planning legislation. This marked the beginning of the consolidation process of the planning profession, which later culminated in the formal institutional establishment of the profession in the years to come. The process started with the Transvaal Town Planning Association (1919), followed by the South African Branch of the British Town Planning Institute (1935), out of which emerged the South African Institute of Town Planners (1951), which was later renamed the South African Institute of Town and Regional Planners in the early seventies (Muller, 1993, p.37; Mabin, 1993, p.19).

The period from 1929 onwards was characterised by deteriorating economic conditions in South Africa (Mabin, 1993, p.23). Nevertheless, the depression was not as intense as that experienced by some other countries in the world. As employment

opportunities in the rural areas dwindled, the rate of black urbanisation increased. As poverty, hunger and harsh conditions on white-owned farms worsened, increasing numbers of the black migrants moved to industrial complexes such as the Witwatersrand areas, with the hope of finding work in the cities (Meredith, 1988, p.33).

The increasing black urbanisation and the high population growth rate of the black population at the time compounded by state reluctance to provide adequate housing to accommodate the newly urbanised black communities led to overcrowding and poor housing conditions (Mabin, 1991, p.4). The poor housing conditions were aggravated by the regulations of pass law; control of Black trade unionism; the harassment and constant interference with the freedom of movement of the black population, giving rise to a burning sense of grievance and injustice, all of which had unsettling effects on the black population as a whole.

It was during this era that the total amount of land reserved for Africans was increased form 8% to 13% of the total area of the country in terms of the 1936 Land Act (Meredith, 1988, p.33). With the increasing numbers of the Black population moving to urban areas, White officials became increasingly preoccupied with the need for urban controls. The prevailing view since the 19th century, according to Meredith (1988, p.34), had been that the towns were white preserves, and as such all the black population groups living there were treated as 'temporary sojourners', a convenient reservoir of labour for use when required, but whose real homes were in the reserves.

This king of thinking became the basis of official policy of racial segregation that was to stagnate the history of this country for decades that followed. This had fundamental implications on the way the state responded to national, regional and local problems. There is also no doubt that this thinking had fundamental implications on the manner on which the role of the planning profession in South Africa was shaped, especially after the 1948 general elections which witnessed the Nationalist Party coming to power.

4.5.1.2 Planning and the government

The role of the planning profession must be seen in perspective of the social and political intervention that were introduced by the then Union Government. The Union government has been instrumental in the clearing of slum areas and shanty towns, in the name of a good, healthy and orderly city, which, it was often claimed were the principles of good 'town planning'. As Smit (1989, p.60) pointed out, the issue of removing the Black population from the areas traditionally perceived as white preserves *"... found its way into the propaganda being used to promote town and regional planning at the time".*

This view found support from the then president of the Transvaal Town Planning Association in 1922, Charles Porter. Porter criticised the uncoordinated and haphazard manner in which South African cities were planned, using Johannesburg as an example. Further he went to an extent of pointing out the harsh conditions in which the "coloured" and the Black communities were experiencing in the locations (Muller, 1991b, p.20). But to one's surprise, Porter offered a simplistic and polemical solution to what can be regarded as the social, economic and political realities of South Africa that time.

The solution he offered, in support of what Smit (1989, p.63) highlighted above, as a 'town planning principle' was "that effort be made to obtain legal powers ... to secure some measure of effective control of the ingress of natives other than those coming to mining or other definite employments or to approved employment agencies" (Poter, 1931, Quoted in Muller, 1991b, p.22). The question of whether this was to mark the co-option of the planning fraternity by the government has not been adequately addressed, but later it became clear with the introduction of the Group Areas Act and the Group Areas Committee which had planners sitting in it (Muller, 1991b, p.21).

The early traditional planners during the era, who were predominantly architects, engineers and land surveyors, seemed to have had no social concern for the plight of the disadvantaged groups who were to be displaced by massive slum clearance programmes. Also, one can point out that they were neither sensitive nor sympathetic

to the disadvantaged communities who had to endure the suffering, especially the black and "coloured" groups in the country. It has to be borne in mind that the system which prevailed at the time, i.e. an undemocratic and oppressive political system seeking to control in particular. McCarthy and Smith (1984, p.63) have argued that the restrictive or control-oriented problems experienced by the disadvantaged groups, but tended to aggravate them. This is reflected in the rise of both labour militancy and community activism.

Even though South Africa claimed most of the attributes of western democracy, the planning system in the country did not conform to any of the democratic principles that were identified in chapter three of this discourse. Instead, the planning system, tended to be equated with a system of social, political and spatial controls, intended to promote the reproduction of the black labour force while at the same time protecting white status, power and privileges (Smit, 1989, p.64). But the problem here is that the necessary conditions for the reproduction of the black labour force were neglected, hence the contradictions in the poor living conditions of the black labour migrants and the need to maintain the cheap labour practices which became entrenched in the South African economy until today.

Based on these facts, substantial evidence exists to suggest that the problem of slum conditions which prevailed at the time in most South African cities were not understood as something requiring any social or physical reform, but rather total removal and control of influx of their occupants to areas where they were not wanted. This suggests that there seems to have been little concerns for the creation of reform-oriented solutions for the disadvantaged groups in South Africa (Smit, 1989, p.64). The conclusion to be drawn from these facts is that the planning profession in South Africa emerged not out of the need for social concern of living conditions experienced by the laboring black migrants, but out of the need to control and regulate their movement to urban areas.

These facts provide sufficient evidence to suggest that majority of the disadvantaged groups perceived planning as being negative, mainly because it was control orientated, prescriptive, paternalistic, patronising and undemocratic. Therefore, based

on the traditional roles which early planners adopted, conclusions can be made that there was an ambiguous interpretation of the image of planning. On one hand, the image was by and large perceived as being neutral by most government appointed planners, who comprises mainly of engineers, surveyors and architects. On the other hand, planners perceived the image of the planning as being negative, most of who were in private practice or educational institutions at the time.

This neutral image of planning can be attributed to the fact that the early traditional planner probably did not understand the context in which they were operating. This is reflected in their neutral stance to potentially political and controversial issues such as the removal of slum areas in the areas traditionally perceived as white preserves. They're unquestioning of their moral stance contributed to making them insensitive and unaware of the fact that they were involved in political activities. The fact that planners advised politicians on matters of policy which had to do with the allocation of certain land to specific groups implicitly placed them in the political roles of planning, roles in which moral and value judgments are inescapable.

By performing roles of 'neutral-technical' experts, they tended to separate context from the substantive issues that the context has to do with, which were appropriate at the time. Hague (1984, p.9) in this regard argues that the adoption of a 'neutral' stance in a society characterised by gross inequality (as South Africa was and still is) cannot be justified or defended at all. He argues that this merely endorses and contributes to the legitimating and sustenance of the status quo. In support of Hague's (1984) criticism, one can argue that a total ethical vacuum is not acceptable and does not have currency now, especially in South Africa, where the profession had no moral stance to back its practice.

The negative image of planning on the other had, as was perceived by planners who were critical of the role of the planning practice in South Africa at the time can be attributed to 'liberal views' that such planners had. Most of those liberal view of democracy and participation, which were not accommodated in the planning or political system of South Africa tended to be reflected in the teaching philosophy of certain planning schools which were later to emerge during the era, the University of

the Witwatersrand Planning School for example (Muller, 1991a; 1991b & 1993). Whether this ambiguous interpretation of the image of planning was to disappear or to continue remained to be seen in the apartheid era that followed.

4.5.2 THE APARTHEID ERA (1948 -1994)

Prior to the 1948 general elections, a number of issues were cause for concern, ranging from grievances over unemployment, housing, and inflation and food shortage for the country. Of more significance among the White electorate seemed to have been the high population growth rate of the black population (Meredith, 1988, p.40). The latter issue became an area of considerable contention among the Afrikaner community, that the National Party had its election manifesto and programme of action centred around it, which tended to attract both the mining houses and the white commercial farmers, both of which were in favour of tighter controls imposed on the movement patterns of black people so as to overcome acute shortages of cheap black labour (Meredith, 1988, p.41). From this analysis, it can be concluded that there was a link between the need to control the black urbanisation process, and the establishment of an intitutionalised and disguised mechanisms to deal with the control aspects of the urbanisation process. Therefore, the recognition of town and regional planning in the apartheid years can be seen in this light.

4.5.2.1 The early years

Generally, the Apartheid Era marked the elevation of practices of segregation commonly employed throughout South Africa since as early as the 19th century, to a level of political doctrine. This does not in any way suggest that racial discrimination did not exist before 1948, but simply that its existence became an explicitly acknowledged political ideology of the government of the day. The early years of the apartheid era were marked by a strong Afrikaner Affirmative Action programme (Meredith, 1988, p.45). It was during this era that the then government began to construct an apparatus of laws, regulations and bureaucracies which successive Nationalist governments developed and sustained.

On the social front, the notion of mass housing became so popular in many black residential areas, and at the same time, the state, through its Group Areas Act (1950) and the Natives Resettlement Act (1954), engaged in wholesale removals of the disadvantaged communities and the physical demolition of compact, inner city, low income residential districts such as Cato manor in Durban and Sophiatown in Johannesburg (McCarthy and Smit, 1984, p.36). The separation of population groups continued at every level of social, economic and political life throughout the country. Of interest here will be the way the planning fraternity responded to the introduction of apartheid, and how its responses contributed to the shaping of the image of planning in South Africa.

4.5.2.2 The 1960s -1970s

Throughout the 1960s South Africa experienced one of the highest rates of economic growth in the world, second only to that of Japan. Its mines produced record amounts of gold and other minerals. Its factories boomed as domestic consumption soared. Foreign trade and investments with western countries increased, with very lucrative returns (Meredith, 1988, p.47). But all these came to a threat, with the Sharpeville Massacre (21 march 1961). This is the time when the black liberation movements were banned, followed by the arrest of their leaders and more suppression of press freedom (Meredith, 1988, p.53).

Since the Sharpeville massacre, anger and frustration among the black community was building up, and it was to explode in 1976. The Soweto uprising marked a turning point in the South African social, economic and political history. The event, one can argue, represented the explosion of anger of the Black population which was fuelled and ignited by old grievances over a number of pertinent issues which among others included the pass laws which insisted on controlled urbanisation of the Black population, poor living conditions for the disenfranchised Black communities (poor health, education, housing, employment opportunities, discriminatory labour practices, among others), insecurity of tenure, police harassment, and the issue of introducing Afrikaans as a medium of instruction in Black schools.

This represented a time bomb that was set in the early twentieth century (Union Era). These crises were a signal to the government that more radical changes were required than rhetoric, but the government seemed to have been reluctant to introduce such reforms. In Mabin's words, *"the townships were becoming pressure cookers, yet little was done to turn down the heat" (1991, p.6)*. Throughout the 1980s the situation worsened until the apartheid era reached its peak in the 1990s.

4.5.2.3 The apartheid doctrine and the image of planning

The introduction of the Apartheid system in South Africa marked the institutionalisation of the planning system as a form of political control over the use of land in general (racial zoning) and the control of movement of the Black people in particular. This is evidenced by the fact that the adoption of a physical interventionist approach to urban land use and development by the state was backed up by a political ideology of apartheid (Drake, 1993, p.42). Eventually, as most planners were employees of municipalities, they had to come to grips with their new status as civil service bureaucrats hired to 'manage and control' development.

The Nationalist government accepted planning inasmuch as it met their needs and interests that were embodied in the Group Areas Act and other legislation which formed the basis of separate development. As much as apartheid outlined the ideal South African city (from a segregated city to an apartheid city), by comparison, it has much in common with the Blue Print planning approach, which is currently widely discredited, both in the South African and the international contexts. The link between apartheid as a political ideology and the blue-print planning approach is well documented (Drake, 1991, p.17). Following on from this it is clear that 'apartheid' has relied on the blue-print approach to map out the future model of a South African city, as conceived by the National Party government.

Within the blue-print planning approach, planners became servants of the then government, and they could not entirely reconcile their professional ideology with the realities of professional practice. To some extent, their ambivalent attitudes towards the public and their employer (state) in the grand scheme of things tended to reflect

some of the contradictions between the role of the planner in theory and in practice (Grant, 1989, p.33).

A multitude of responses from South African planners were evident in the way they handled their role ambiguities as professionals. The dichotomies in the planning profession were evident with the development of the dual from that characterised planning in South Africa, with one part concerned with the planning for segregated black areas under state control and the other part concerned with planning for the white areas (Drake, 1993, p.45; Mabin, 1993, p.25). Muller (1992b, p.7) highlights the fact that planning for the latter group had international currency and relevance, while that of the former group had no international currency, divorced from the boarder political, social and economic processes affecting the supposed beneficiaries of the planning service. These are some of the issues that contributed to the divisions within the planning fraternity in South Africa, especially during the apartheid era.

Therefore, faced with the situation, planners responded in South Africa differently:
Firstly, many undoubtedly accepted the status quo as the natural state of affairs, and went on with their own activities unquestioningly. To this extent, they became the 'yes-men' whose opinions and skills could be relied upon to reinforce rather than undermine the society, whatever its nature. By so doing, they retreated to a role they perceived to be value-neutral, but at the same time advising politicians on potentially controversial issues (Hendler, 1995, p.40; Goodman, 1972, p.65). One may as well pose a question as to how did they reconcile these role ambiguities? These types of planners, argued Hague (1984), tended to face problems about the ambiguous relation between their professional expertise and political judgements. One can argue that the position that planners found themselves in was mainly because they did not have an independent planning ideology which could offer some ideological guidance for them, and as a result they tended to succumb to state ideology.

The **second** tendency displayed by planners was towards reformism. Those planners who, whilst not questioning the underlying relationships in the society, would nevertheless press through their work for a more equal distribution of rights and benefits demonstrated this. Pointing to the exclusion of certain classes or groups of

people from knowledge of, or participation in the planning process. The will then offer to put their professional skills to work in representing and interpreting the interests of the groups concerned. A notable example in this regard is the emergence of Non-Governmental organisations (NGOs) such as the Urban Foundation, and service organisations such as PLANACT, among others. This was a response by the business community, prompted by the aftermath of the Soweto conflagration, which shocked the country in the mid-seventies. The Urban Foundation's main aims, according to Mabin (1991, p.6) were mainly of *"initiating pilot projects to alleviate deteriorating urban conditions and influencing urban policy"*. Planners working for development organisations such as the Urban Foundation, arguably, tend to pursue a value-laden and normatively directed course of action aimed at enhancing social equity.

The **third** tendency was reflected by those planners who openly criticised apartheid from the onset and setting themselves off as independent planners who were to challenge the system from outside (Goodman, 1972, p.65). This breed of planners, it must be admitted, was undoubtedly rare at the time.

The image of planning during the apartheid era as perceived by the users of the planning service, most of who were the disadvantaged black communities was very negative. This perception can be attributed to the fact that planning was deeply implicated in the furthering of iniquitous social and political policies of apartheid, especially the implementation of racial zoning through the Group Areas Act (1950). Here, there was contradiction between professional rhetoric and practice (Hague, 1984). Of more importance is the fact that planning in South Africa at the time undermined the very basic fundamental principles of democracy which included among others, the right to choose, fairness, accountability, justice (and sensitivity), legitimacy, respect for human life, participation in decision-making and the freedom of association.

Muller (1982a; 1982b; 1991a & 1991b) provides an excellent critique of planning with regard to the way it responded to the introduction of the apartheid doctrine as a

planning ideology. Writing for the twenty-fifth anniversary of the University of the Witwatersrand Planning School, in the SAITRP Journal (1991) Muller points out that:

> *"The consequences of apartheid ... on the black citizens of South Africa must be acknowledged. It has deprived the majority of the population of the Republic of access to land and property; it has curtailed freedom of movement and settlement; it has compromised educational opportunities and standards; it has split families and forced those who are not white to live in degraded conditions. It has forced black citizens into situations of inferiority in all areas of activity. Planning has played a role in more of this than one would wish to acknowledge'' (Muller, 1991b, p.23-24).*

The above quote sum it all up. The image of planning in the eyes of the disadvantaged communities was tainted because of its association with untenable inhumane social and political doctrine.

The image of planning as perceived by the planners at the time was arguably, varied according to the various responses and tendencies which were displayed by planners. On one hand, it can be argued that those who responded by towing the line of apartheid planning, they probably saw nothing wrong with the system which was invading planning. This could be attributed to the fact that the moral and ethical stance of those planners was congruent with that of the political system, i.e. the apartheid ideology or that they did not understand the context in which they were operating. Based on this, they therefore perceived the image of planning as being positive or neutral.

On the other hand, those planners who displayed a reformist approach to dealing with the encroachment of apartheid in planning practice were arguably aware of the fact that the image of planning was becoming negative. These are those planners, while not divorcing themselves from the system, sought to work within. The third group of planners is that which totally denounced the apartheid ideology as being inconsistent with professional value of planning. This is the group that opposed the discriminatory planning policies from outside the system, precisely because it perceived the image of

planning as being tainted as a result of its association with the apartheid ideology. This group of planners, it can be argued was sceptical of the possibility of reforming from within.

The divisions that pervaded planning in the apartheid era are partly attributed to the fact that the professional body, the South African Institute of Town and Regional Planners, tended to adopt an ethical vacuum, which implies that it did not have any moral stance of its own. Muller (1991b, p.23) summarizes this lack or a moral and ethical stance by highlighting that *"at best, planning can be said to have turned a blind eye to the plight of the majority of the population of this country, and to have remained silent when voices should and could have been raised"*. It therefore remained to be seen whether the image of planning as perceived by the disadvantaged groups has change or not.

Based on the above facts, it seems clear that *"generally, planners in South Africa were not interested at the time in promoting public participation within the planning process as it was considered to waste time and interfere with completion of the plan, ..."* *(Drake, 1993, p.47)*. The opposition to citizen participation by South Africa planners, from both the public and private practice is well documented (Muller, 1991b).

4.5.3 POST-APARTHEID RESTRUCTURUNG IN AN ERA OF TRANSITION AND UNCERTAINTY

The social and political changes in South Africa which set the democratisation process in motion in the nineties have had significant implications for the future of the country in general, and the future of the planning in particular. The coming into power of a democratically elected government in the history of the country has posed some questions with regard to the orientation and future of planning. During this era of social and political change and uncertainty, has the image of the planning profession changed from being perceived as being negative to a positive one? Has planning reassessed its future role in the new dispensation? It is only appropriate to ask some of these questions since it is generally accepted that the inner character of an organism (that is planning) can only be speculated from its outward/external manifestations,

which may be reflected in the reputation of an organism (Benion, 1969). It is these and other questions that an attempt will be made to answer in Chapter 5 of this thesis.

4.6   SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

This chapter was mainly about the development of the planning thought both internationally up to 1770s and locally, using the British planning experience and the South African planning history. Of more significance was the attempt that was made to determine the image of planning in both contexts, as perceived by professional planners and the users or beneficiaries of the planning service. What emerged is the fact that planning emerged primarily as a social reform movement, which later became consolidated into a powerful mechanism for state intervention in the land development processes. During its inception, the planning movement had a social welfare philosophy that drew its inspiration and strength from its concern with the living conditions of the ordinary people during turn of the twentieth century. This initial social philosophy that the planning aspired to in its inception is confirmed by the planning ideology mentioned in chapter two of this discourse.

During the first three phases of the development of planning in Britain, the planning practice had on one hand, a negative image, as perceived by the users or beneficiaries of the planning service (mainly the laboring classes) and planners who were critical of their roles. On the other hand, the image was perceived as being positive and sometimes neutral by the planners, especially the traditional planners (engineers, architects, surveyors, lawyers). The negative and positive image of planning at the time could be attributed to the context in which the practice was conducted and the manner in which planners behaved. As it shown, planners who adopted the traditional model of a professional behaved in a certain way befitting their roles, while those who could be referred to as radical or progressive planners behaved differently in their roles as planners.

It was only in the last phase of the development of planning that the image in the British planning history improved. The improvements in the image of planning could be attributed to the willingness by state authorities to improve decision-making

procedures by searching for innovative routes which resulted in the opening up of the planning process to the poor; the racial minorities; and other previously excluded participants. It was hoped that the South African planning history would follow the same pattern of development of the image, but unfortunately this was not to be the case.

The South African planning history followed the same course of development as the British planning history, at least up to 1948. Firstly, it is clear that from the onset that planning in South Africa emerged as a mechanism for social control and political control of certain population groups in general, but the black majority of this country in particular. Even though there might have been other reasons for the need for planning it the country, political considerations seem to have dominated other considerations.

As a result of the context in which planning was taking place in South Africa, the image of planning for the three phases reviewed was on one hand negative, especially as perceived by the users or beneficiaries of the planning service, and planners who were critical of their roles. On the other hand, the image of planning was perceived as being positive and sometimes neutral by planners who adopted the traditional model of planning and most of whom, one could argue, had an ethical and moral stance that was congruent with that of the previous government. Many South African planners who were employed in the public sector to challenge the racial zoning that was introduced by the previous government reflect this in the reluctance. The nature of planning in South Africa tended to reflect the political culture of the country then. Even though South Africa claimed most of he democratic attributes that characterise most western democracies, the planning tended to reflect the contradictions between rhetoric and practice. The planning system in South Africa did not conform to any of the democratic principle discussed in sections two and three of this discourse.

Compared to the British planning practice, South African planners are faced with many challenges for reconstruction and development of the image of planning. The author here is of the view that South Africa planners will probably have to start where they left off prior to 1948 if an attempt to improve the image of the planning

profession in this country is to be made. If South Africa is to follow the route that it followed before the apartheid era (1948 - 1980), it may as well considered possible routes for future for planning.

As South Africa moves away from the prescriptive, patronising and paternalistic tendencies which dominated planning practice for decades, a positive image of the planning fraternity will have to be shaped if planning is to become *"... a guide for action instead of becoming an outdated bureaucratic routine" (Castells, 1982, p.3).* The following chapter will attempt to explore that possibility in the form of a questionnaire that forms the case study of the thesis, thus confirming the image of planning in the Free State Province. Whether the negative image of planning as perceived by the users of the planning service, and the ambiguous perception of the image by planners will disappear still remain to be proved by the next chapter.

5.   CASE STUDY: THE IMAGE OF PLANNING IN THE FREE STATE PROVINCE: UNDOING THE APARTHEID PLANNING

5.1   INTRODUCTION

There are various perceptions tainted on the image of planning. As South Africa is in the new era of planning set out by democratisation process and developmental legislations, the society is beginning to be open to social and political processes with the acceptance of planning as a mechanism assisting them to express their developmental outcomes and aspirations.

The question is whether planning is ready or not for the ongoing socio-economic and political changes. As Castells (1982, p.3) pointed out, *"... if we want our discipline to be a guide for action instead of becoming an outdated bureaucratic routine"*, the need for planning to change in order to exploit emerging opportunities in the Free State is inevitable.

The purpose of this chapter is to attempt to determine what planners in practice, on one hand perceive planning to be concerned with and how it is changing or has changed; which are the main problems and how these issues are significantly affecting the image of planning. On the other hand, attempt will be made to determine what the beneficiaries of planning services perceive planning to be concerned with and what they regard to be the problems concerning planning services and how this influence the way they perceive planning.

5.2   IDENTIFICATION OF TARGET GROUPS

The research case study attempted to cover the views from the broad spectrum that is broadly representative of the Free State people.

5.2.1 SAMPLE SELECTION AND SIZE

Two questionnaires schedules were prepared to cover planners in practice (both in public and private sectors) and the beneficiaries of planning services. Although the interview followed a set format in the form of questionnaires, an attempt was made to keep those questionnaires aimed at users of planning services as spontaneous as possible. It must be noted that the questionnaires were designed to allow for both open-ended and closed questions.

Overall, a total of five hundred (500) responses were received. Of the five hundred questionnaires, 8% (39) were distributed to planners in public practice in the Free State, about 2% (9) to planners in private practice and the remaining 90% (452) were distributed to the users of the planning services in the selected district areas, also in the Free State. Initially, it was envisaged that the sample could reach 1000, but due to financial and time constraints, the sample was limited to five hundred. The fact that the number of planners' responses (10%) is smaller than that of the users of the planning service is mainly because it is recognised that same professional planners were involved in the planning in various district areas. However, the author think 10% response from planners is reasonably high. The survey was based in district municipal areas in the Free State Province, covering district areas such as Xhariep (Zastron), Motheo (Bloemfontein), Lejweleputswa (Welkom), Thabo Mafutsanyana (Bethlehem), and Northern Free State (Sasolburg).

It is realised that the technique of sample selection may not necessarily be scientific, but it was thought to be one of the best options that was believed would enable the research to solicit as wide a range of views as possible regarding the image of the planning in the Free State Province. The fact that views were extracted from as wide as a range of socio- economic groups as possible made it possible for an objective conclusion with regard to the image of planning to be arrived at.

5.3   PLANNERS' RESPONSES

Raw data taken from questionnaires was recorded in the form of summary sheets, categorised, analysed and then interpreted. This enabled the author to highlight similarities and differences; trends and items that are of particular significance with regard to the image of planning in the Free State Province.

These two sets were analysed separately and joint conclusions about the image of the planning were made at the end. The first analysis was the planner's responses, with focus on planning and its services.

5.3.1 NUMBER OF YEARS IN PLANNING SERVICES

Table 5.1   shows that the sample is dominated by people who have been in the planning service for 3-5 years (35%), secondly those who are in the profession for 5-10 years (25%), and thirdly followed by those who were in the service for 10-20 years (17%). Respondents who are in the service for 0-3 years, and 20 years and above, together constitutes 23% of the total sample. Numbers of years in practice are crucial with regard to the perceptions that those planners have concerning the image of the planning.

Table 5.1: Number of years in public and private planning service

Time in years	Number	Percentage
0 - 3	6	13
3 - 5	17	35
5 - 10	12	25
10 - 20	8	17
20 +	5	10
Total	48	100

It is assumed here that the more the number of years in practice, the more experience the respondents have regarding planning, especially when it comes to judging the performance of planning on a historical context. Also, there is a significant number of respondents who have recently entered the planning profession (13%) than those who were in the profession say for 20 years and above (10%) and close to planners with 10-20 years of experience in practice. This difference is important in that it is expected that most of the critical views and perceptions of the planning image and its performance in the Free State, will by and large be coming from the 'new blood'.

5.3.2 SOURCE OF EMPLOYMENT FOR RESPONDENTS

The sample (Table 5.2, p.87) reveals that the bulk of the respondents (35%) are from the private sector, with respondents from the public sector constituting 33% of the total sample. Thirteen percent of the respondents are drawn from the district. Within the private sector, about 19% of the respondents are drawn from the private consultancy sector. In overall, the total number of respondent covers various respondents from different contexts.

Table 5.2: Sources of employment for planners' respondents

Source	Number	Percentage
Local Municipality	17	35
District Municipality (PIMSS)	6	13
Provincial Government	16	33
Self-employed	-	-
Non-governmental Organisations	-	-
Consultants	9	19
Total	48	100

It is hoped that this combination of respondents will assist in arriving at an objective assessment about the performance of the planning and consequently the image of the planning based on their perceptions.

5.3.3 Respondents' understanding of planning

It is evident from Table 5.3 (p. 88) that the majority of the planners within the sample are involved in policy formulation work (48%), followed by a number of respondents involved in development control (44%). This is to be followed by the number of respondent involved in rural planning (40%), community-based planning (35%), which is then followed by urban planning (27%) 5%), after which comes regional planning, project and property development (19%) each, with 10% of the respondents involved in geographic information systems (GIS).

It is not surprising that from the sample a large number of planners are still involved in control-oriented field of planning as opposed to those involved in development and community/social planning, showing the fact that control-oriented planning will always be dominant. The more development, the more control will follow. However, development and community planning is one of the fields that planning should increasingly be shifting its focus to, in the light of the current changes in the political context of the country and the challenges facing planning to date, especially when realising the need to address the imbalances created by the apartheid era. This does not in any way imply that work that most of the planners are currently involved in is of no value, but simply highlights the fact that planning in South Africa has not yet changed its focus.

The involvement of planners in the relatively new field of Information technology, the geographic information systems is noted (10%). This is the collection, processing, storage and dissemination of information using computers and telecommunications (Wilcox, 1994). This low involvement of planners in this field can be explained by the fact that it is a relatively new field, which is more expensive, and probably that it can work for or against the empowerment of different groups.

Table 5.3: Types of jobs planners' currently involved

Type of Jobs	Number (48)	Percentage
Project and Property Development	9	19
Policy Formulation	23	48
Development Control	21	44
Urban Planning	13	27
Rural Planning	19	40
Research	-	-
Teaching	-	-
Development and Community-based Planning	17	35
Regional Planning	9	19
GIS	5	10

5.3.4 PLANNING AS A CAREER

Asked why the respondents decided to choose town and regional planning as a career, the responses were varied, interesting and some discouraging. The reasons for choosing town and regional planning as a professional career ranged from social; economic; environmental; political and technical.

Table 5.4: Reasons for choice of planning as a career

Reasons	Number	Percentage
Social	18	37
Economic	7	15
Political	4	8
Socio-political	8	17
Technical	11	23
Total	48	100

The assessment reveals that the over-riding reason for the respondents for having chosen planning were predominantly social and then followed by technical reasons. This is really encouraging, highlighting the fact that planners are becoming sensitivity regarding social needs and aspirations of communities that tends to enhance the image of planning. The low number of respondents who chose town planning as a career on political grounds is rather disappointing, because it was hoped that a number of respondents would realise that planning cannot be separated from politics, hence the need for politically motivated responses for choosing planning. This should not be interpreted in the way that suggests that planners should become politicians, but that they should have the political consciousness when entering the planning arena.

5.3.5 RESPONDENT'S PERCEPTIONS OF PLANNING

An understanding of planning by the planning respondents was assessed by asking the respondents (Questions 9 and 10), what they perceived planning to be concerned with (Table 5.5). From the table it is clear that almost all the respondents perceived town planning to be concerned with upgrading and rejuvenation (94%), to be followed by community empowerment; promoting the enrichment of human life in a society; and the decisions for future actions (92%). This was to be followed by township establishment and the legal use of land/zoning zoning (79%); followed by the distribution of opportunities and allocation of resources (75%). The management of

environment (63%) was followed by policy formulation (48%); infrastructure development (42%); rural development (40), and the design and construction of built environments (35%);

Table 5.5: Respondents' perceptions of planning

Activity	Number	Percentage
Environmental management	30	63
Land redistribution	36	75
Planning, upgrading and rejuvenation	45	94
Design and construction	17	35
Infrastructure development	20	42
Rural development	19	40
Policy formulation	23	48
Township establishment, zoning	38	79
Decision-making, community involvement and empowerment	44	92

What is striking from this assessment is the fact that there is large percentages (94% and 92%) of respondents from the sample who perceive planning to be concerned with social planning improving the quality of life of citizens (planning, upgrading and rejuvenation, and decision-making, community involvement and empowerment), yet only 35% of the sample is actually involved in this field of planning (Table 5.3, p.89). This can be attributed to a number of factors. Firstly, there seems to be contradiction between rhetoric and practice in terms of what planning should be concerned with and what it is actually concerned with. Secondly, as one respondent pointed out, planners

do not have adequate training in "people skills negotiation, conflict resolution and team building". Following on from this it becomes evident that there is a gulf between planning theory and practice which reflects a mismatch of the traditional patterns of practice and knowledge to features of the practice situation which is characterised by complexity; uncertainty; power and value conflicts (Millerson, 1964; Dyckman, 1978; Baum, 1983; and Schon, 1983) which are inherent in a transformational and uncertain socio-political context such as that in the Free State Province.

To illustrate the point further, design and construction of buildings which has traditionally been perceived as being the task of architects, engineers and builders/contractors, is perceived by 35% of the sample as being within the realm of planning. This perception of planning by 42% of the sample as being concerned with infrastructural development such as street and sewer construction can be best explained by acknowledging the fact that planners are increasingly being expected to be involved in in-situ upgrading programmes of informal settlements, which as part of the programme are involve the layout of physical infrastructure such as streets; sewer and water reticulation services.

This perception can only be understood in the context of developmental orientation, the changing stigma that is still attached to the planning. Therefore, planning has an impact on the way its present image is perceived by the planners.

5.3.6 ATTRIBUTES OF THE IMAGE OF THE PLANNING IN THE FREE STATE PROVINCE

5.3.6.1 Legitimacy and credibility

As mentioned in the earlier sections of this dissertation, legitimacy is fundamental for planning decisions and organisations to be acceptable and functional. Legitimacy depends on the number of factors such as viability, credibility, openness and accessibility in terms of public participation; how representative it is; fairness; equality; sensitivity and accountability; all which are central to the making of planning.

5.3.6.2 Public participation in decision-making

When asked whether the planning respondents felt it is desirable or not for the public participate in the planning process, all most were of the view that participation is very desirable. Commenting on this most of the respondents expressed satisfaction that currently the planning systems such as integrated development planning (IDP) allow genuine participation by the general public.

5.3.6.3 Planner, politician and the general public relationship

An assessment of the relationship of the planner to the public and politicians was undertaken.

Table 5.6: Relationship between the planner and the public

	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Don't know	Varied	Total
Number	27	6	4	-	11	48
Percentage	56	13	8	-	23	100

What came out from this assessment was that 56% of the respondents perceived the relationship of the planner to the general public as being positive, 8% perceived it is being negative, and 13% perceived it is being neutral. Of the total sample, 23% of the respondents perceived the relationship as being varied, depending on where one stand in terms of moral ideology and the place of employment (whether public or private sector).

What is clear from these assessments is that the positive relationship of the planner to the general public is indicative of the improving image of planning. On this note, some respondents pointed out that the general public knows the planner and that the public holds a positive attitude towards planners. Historically planners have been associated with apartheid planning whilst from a developer's perspective planners have been regarded as interfering in the market process. And comments such as dictatorial tendencies no longer exist in our municipal planning processes. Planners treat communities as though they know what they want and that the relationship is

positive due to role performed - strong emphasis on public involvement and planners' facilitatory role provide sufficient evidence to conclude that the relationship between the planners and the general public is positive. This obviously has a positive impact on the image of planning.

Concerning the relationship between the planners and the politicians (Table 5.6), an assessment revealed that the number of planners' respondents who perceive the relationship to be positive is more than the number of respondents who perceive it to be negative.

Table 5.7: The relationship between the planner and the politicians

	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Don't know	Varied	Total
Number	17	-	21	-	10	48
Percentage	35	-	44	-	21	100

It is realised that the respondents who perceive the relationship to be positive are arguably those who still have interests not to challenge the status quo and still believe in physical planning rather than development planning. This situation is likely to have been so, predominantly in the public sector, where most planners worked for many years as technical advisor to politicians. Clearly, comments such as they serve the interest of proper land use control to a large extent serves to confirm this assessment of the relationship between the planners and politicians. Those respondents who perceived the relationships between the planners and the politicians as being negative are arguably planners who realise their role as critical to the development of planning and believe in inclusive planning processes that could change the lives of many people. These are mainly those who were employed in the private sector and local municipality who arguably have the interest of forward planning at heart.

In overall, the above assessments of the relationship between the planner and the general public and the politicians, makes it clear that the nature of the general relationships depended to a greater extent on the context in which he/she was

operating, the mode of operation (i.e. the planning approach adopted) and lastly the way the other party (i.e. the general public and the politicians) perceived the planners. In the end, it becomes clear that the way the relationship between all the parties was perceived was a purely subjective assessment, subjected to change at any time as the interests and aspirations of the various actors changed.

5.3.7 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN THE PLANNING PROCESS

All planners who responded to question 11 and 12 indicated that it is important that communities should be involved in the planning process right from the onset, especially the disadvantaged groups. The message from respondents is that more has been achieved through legislations that enable planning practitioners to be sensitive to community participation and their needs. This should be in line with principles such as sustainability, efficiency and effectiveness, responsiveness, manageability, resource envelope and common purpose to mention but few.

Ideally, planners' involvement of communities in the planning process carries with it full responsibility and accountability to the client he/she serves, to the beneficiaries of planning service. This implies planners will be answerable in full to the constituency he/she serves. The case study present sufficient evidence to suggest that planners tend to be depicted as 'instrument of government' not close enough to their supposed constituents. The fact that planners' relationship with the ultimate users of planning service is institutionalized and organized implies that planners are accountable to public, since their loyalty is paid to political masters who represent community needs and aspirations.

As the RTPI has indicated, *"the provision of efficient, responsive service ... implies not only more participative planning, and better service at the office counter, but better information and more openness"* (RTPI, 1991, p.7). This quote has more relevance in the Free State, and perhaps elsewhere in the sense that while planners currently do not take political responsibility for decisions taken by politicians, they are nevertheless important suppliers of information to politicians, and as such are partly responsible for political decisions that they implement. It is therefore, important that the way planning is undertaken become effective and competent by

being relevant to current circumstances that include political, environmental and socio-economic developments.

A serious challenge facing planning however, is to ensure maximum inclusion and participation of all, but particularly the poor and the rural communities in development planning as well as enhanced access to basic services for all citizens. This also applies to the marginalized groups such as the youths, elderly, disabled, women, unemployed, etc.

5.3.8 PLANNING PROCESS IN THE FREE STATE IN GENERAL

The general planning process in the Free State is perceived by 67% of the sample (48) as being permissive in terms of responding to and accommodating change.

Table 5.8: Permissiveness of planning process

	Yes	No	Mixed	Not sure	Total
Number	32	11	3	2	48
Percentage	67	23	6	4	100

Of the total respondents, only 23% argue that the planning process in the Free State Province has not been permissive in terms of responding to accommodating change, followed by 6% who are of the view that it has partially been permissive and partially not been permissive, with 4% who declined to respond to the question. A number of respondents who argued that the planning process has not been permissive in terms of responding to and accommodating change were of the view that the process in the Free State has essentially remained blueprint, with its character of being restrictive; control-oriented, static, inflexible, and static.

The blueprint planning approach has been widely discredited because of its failure to achieve the flexibility required with time (Prinsloo, 1972 and Drake, 1991). In addition, this process has been criticised for being single-minded with little or no scope for diversity through community participation. The character of the existing planning process in the Free State has a positive impact on the role of planners. This

in turn tends to impact on the image of the planning as a whole since it is generally accepted that planners' roles are influenced by the methodology which they adopt, which in turn impacts on the outputs.

5.4   USERS OF PLANNING SERVICES' RESPONSES

It was recognised that the questions to this sample had to be designed in such a way that the responses sought would be spontaneous, allowing for both open-ended and closed questions. Because of the fact that the majority of the people who were going to be interviewed were totally excluded from the planning processes in the past, an attempt to gain an understanding of how they perceive planning was made. The questionnaire for this sample covered the issues concerning the respondents' understanding of planning.

5.4.1 RESPONDENTS' UNDERSTANDING OF PLANNING

5.4.1.1 Sources of town planning information

Of the total 452 respondents, only 74% pointed out that they have heard about town planning, in contest to 26% who claimed that they have never heard or know about town planning before the day they were interviewed by the author. From table 10 it is clear that the 74% (N=334) of the respondents who heard about town planning, 46% of them have heard about town planning from friends, following by 25% of them who heard about it from community meetings, following by about 13% who heard about it from newspaper. Of the total 334 respondents who pointed out that they have heard about town planning, 8% have heard about it from the radio, 4% from work, 3% from television, with one percent gained from personal experience. What comes out from this assessment is the fact that certain informal sources tend to command a higher share of the respondents' responses, than some formal sources, for example the television. The implication for image building is that it will be appropriate for an emphasis on informal mechanisms in the project and the promotion of the image of planning in the Free State.

What was surprising about the 74% who said that they have heard about town planning is that most of them do not know what town planning is all about or concerned with. There is no clear-cut explanation for this, but it is admitted that the users or beneficiaries of planning services were previously not exposed to the planning system, even if it affected their lives. The lack of knowledge about the planning process can also partly be attributed to apathy on the part of the respondents, and partly on the reluctance of the planning fraternity to project and promote its image in these communities. The fact that planning in the Free State has rather been reactive in projecting and promoting its image implied that has enjoyed a very low profile and consequently an unimportant position in these societies.

These problems have further implication for the planning process, especially with regard to the protection of its status and standing in these communities because there is a great possibility that it cannot place itself properly if the public does not know what it is all about, and what it has in store for them (Schon, 1983). Based on this assessment of sources of town planning information, it is therefore crucial to focus on what the respondents perceived planning to be concerned with

Table 5.9: Sources of town planning information

Source	Number	Percentage
Friends	154	46
Community meetings	84	25
Newspapers	43	13
Work	13	4
Television	10	3
Personal experience	3	1
Radio	27	8
Total	334	100

5.4.1.2 Beneficiaries' perception of planning

When beneficiaries of planning service were asked what they thought town planning was concerned with (question 5), the table below makes it evident that the township establishment is perceived by about 87% of the respondents as being the important task that town planning is concern with. This is followed by upgrading (of existing informal settlements) and rejuvenation with 75 % and third, by decision-making, community involvement and empowerment 73%, fourthly by land redistribution 55%.

It is notable from the responses that the traditional tasks of planning are perceived by the majority of the respondents (with the exception of the upgrading of existing informal settlement) as being the core of planning. This can be attributed to the fact that the stigma attached to the planning of being intimately planning policies such as development control and decisions still exists. The impact of such policies is that those on the receiving end of such policies perceived them as blunt and inelastic political acts, executed by planners as administrators and technocrats, who were accountable and responsible to the government of the day, and not the user or beneficiaries of planning services. As a result of this there is no doubt that such actions of planners have dire consequences for the way the users of planning services perceived the standing of planning in the society, as a service-oriented and delivery mechanism.

Table 5.10: Beneficiaries' understanding of planning

Activity	Number (N=452)	Percentage
Environmental management	249	55
Land redistribution	298	66
Planning, upgrading and rejuvenation	339	75
Design and construction	108	24
Infrastructure development	231	51
Rural development	190	42
Policy formulation	217	48
Township establishment, zoning	393	87
Decision-making, community involvement and empowerment	330	73

This puts planners in the forefront into implementing policies. The users of planning services saw planners as having the decision-making powers that politicians really have in terms of involving communities into activities that affect and influence their lives. There is no doubt that this has a positive effect on the reputation and the credibility of planning, and consequently improved image of planning in the Free State.

5.4.1.3 Beneficiaries' perception of what planning should be about

Public participation is a fundamental part of local governance's planning and oversight process. Asked what planning should be about (question 6), beneficiaries responded by indicating that planning should seek to improve and better their quality

of life and also empower communities. There is a perception that planning has moved away from its traditional role to a developmental one. Beneficiaries see planning as a tool providing alternative options they can make choice from and as a means of putting resources to their preferred choice to be implemented. The important point here is the changing perception of communities with regard to planning in attempting to address their needs.

Table 5.11: Community perception of what planning should be.

Activity	Number (n=452)	Percentage
Expansion of choices	339	75
Allocation of resources	303	67
Redistribution of land	158	35
Drawing of plans	199	44
Development control	271	60
Management of urbanization	267	59
Improved living conditions	402	89
Resettlement of communities	258	57
Upgrading of existing informal settlements	181	40

All most all community respondents though it pertinent if they involved in the formulation and implementation of projects (question 7) that seek to address their development outcomes. Planning in this case would be promoting democratic decentralization, the empowerment of communities, and their direct involvement in planning and managing their own development or project (question 8). Communities felt they would know exactly what is going to happen in their locality if they participate and the reaction to proposed projects would be positive and great degree of sense of ownership would prevail. This initiative is one way to strengthen the relationship between citizens, politicians and planners through active community involvement in planning and also commitment of politicians and planners to hearing

what planning beneficiaries are saying and to support implementation of their initiatives.

Public participation and management of projects by communities themselves provides a clear role for everybody involved in planning, and on the side of planners and politicians they would now understand the needs of their citizens far more deeply. They would now have a clear programme to implement projects, and the politicians understands in much more depth the strengths, preferred outcomes, opportunities and risks, for the different social groups within planning locality. The result of active community involvement is to increase communication and debate amongst and between the poorest and those in decision-making positions, and by means of well-structured annual participation to better inform politicians and officials about how they should spend their 'investment' budget. However, the real benefits of community participation lie in the spin-offs, such as a new feeling of citizenship and ownership, greater transparency, the re-vitalisation of local politics, co-operation between sectors and increased social capital.

In terms of problems with regard to projects (question 9), communities responded by pointing the main challenge is to get sufficient resources to execute their projects. Another challenge is to get stakeholders to fund their various projects because communities realise that it would be impossible for politicians and their administrators to have resources to implement all community projects. In attempting to address those challenges, beneficiaries of planning felt it would be appropriate to have partnerships with major role players internally as well as externally and that proposal was discussed at political level to get buy-in (question 10 and 12).

Beneficiaries of planning services perceive the major challenge of planning (question 16) to be to support the on-going planning process that attempt to focus on the question of what sort of community-based planning process and system can be implemented which is holistic, reflecting the complex reality of people's lives, linked to the mainstream planning system (usually municipality, but also sectoral), can be empowering, and is realistic within the resource envelopes (human and financial) available within a locality and to implement the reporting systems, support

beneficiaries to take their plans forward etc. This is all part of the learning-by-doing process. This is a big test - does planning at local level stimulate local action and local management of development or programmes or projects? This calls for a need for planning to change or improve.

Various respondents called for a new paradigm shift in planning (question 17). The main difference from the previous planning was top-down approach which need to change to more community-based approach that starts with community view where poor people are active and are involved in managing their own development (claiming their rights and exercising their responsibilities).

This is a demonstration that poor people's view is important, showing that poor people can make a contribution and a difference and building up a sense of identity and community. People think global and plan for local action. A key feature of community-based approach is the combination of people's strengths, opportunities, local indigenous knowledge and technical inputs (specialists' know-how) and not problems, to find effective solutions for communities. The difficulty with a problem-based approach is that problems are so large, one ends up paralysed, but when one plans from strengths, opportunities, local indigenous knowledge and technical inputs, it is possible to move forward.

The culture of dependency entrenched by the previous system of governance is in the process of being diluted by the community-based planning process. Citizens and communities are beginning to realise the benefits of exerting influence over development in their environment. Similarly, administrative officials are also beginning to develop confidence in the ability of ordinary citizens to construct well-considered, practical and sustainable development programmes and projects. Communities are gaining valuable experience on the pragmatics of sustainable community-based ward planning. This has exposed them to the challenges of local governance and the need to create a cooperative governance framework where officials, elected councillors and citizens take responsibility collectively for development at the local level.

5.5   SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion to this section, from the 500 questionnaires that were distributed to two broad respondents, i.e. planners and the users or beneficiaries of planning services, only 9.6% of them we distributed to the former, and the remaining 90.4% were distributed to the latter. The gender bias of the respondents from both categories was noted with concern. Most of respondents were males.

The respondents' responses that are reflections of their perceptions and subjective views have provided sufficient data to determine the image of planning in the Free State during this period. On the whole, the image of planning has had ambiguous interpretations from the planners in practice on one hand, and the image as perceived by the users or beneficiaries of planning service. The perception of image of the planning in the Free State by the users or beneficiaries of planning services as attributed to the historical stigma attached to planning's intimate links with the unjust and untenable political ideology which was to determine the scope and content of planning for many years in the country.

Most of planners, it can be argued, had a moral stance that was congruent with that of their political masters (Muller, 1982, p.247). Assessing the *modus operandi* of such planners, it becomes evident that this breed of planners had adopted the developmental mode of planning which really focuses on sustainable and socio-economic viable environment and of course the improvement of the livelihoods of the poor.

This has important implications for the future of planning. In overall, the image of planning in the Free State has improved and a positive one, this emphasis what Castells (1982) said, " ... *our discipline has to be a guide for action instead of becoming an outdated bureaucratic routing*" (Castells, 1982, p.3). To reiterate, in the opening speech at the SAITRP conference in 1991, " ... *planners must become attuned to the needs of the new South Africa that they must change many of the principles and percepts on which planning has been based, ... that if they adapted in this way they could make a huge contribution to solving the problems of the post-apartheid South Africa*" (Shepley, 1993, p.34). This statement instills courage and

restores confidence that all is not lost, and that there is still 'room' for further improvement of image of planning in the Free State. It is with this challenge in mind that the next section will attempt to focus on the challenges facing planning in the Free State.

6. THE CHALLENGES FACING PLANNING IN THE FREE STATE

6.1 INTRODUCTION

The challenges outlined in this section are merely exploratory in nature and they are not in any way intended as definite answers to the problems underpinning the issue confronting the image and character of the planning in the Free State. Rather, they are intended as a basis upon which to base policy formulations and debates. How effectively planning meets these challenges will best be measured in terms of the image projected by users or beneficiaries of planning services on one hand, and the planners on the other.

Also, it should be recognised that many of the challenges that face the image of planning today are not necessarily specific to the particular substantive area in which they are considered, nor limited in application to only one sector of planning, be it the planning fraternity; planning education and planning practice. All of these sectors equally face these challenges.

6.2 PLANNING PROCESS

Purification and restructuring of planning is crucial so that the society may gain a fuller, more justly understanding of planning. During this transformational and uncertainty era, planning is confronted with unprecedented requirement for adaptability and relevance. The dilemma facing planning today is the fact that both ends of the gap it is expected to bridge are changing rapidly, i.e. the body of knowledge that planners must use and the expectations of society that must be served. There is no doubt that both these changes have their origins in the same common factor, the socio-political change. Even though the majority of the respondents felt that planning should be involved in political decision-making, the problem cannot be usefully framed in terms of too much politicisation of planning. These, in itself pose some degree of uncertainty which exists in planning and according to Christensen (1985, p.63) a crucial task of planning is to discover, assess and address uncertainty.

This prototype conditions of planning fall within what Christensen (1985, p. 64) call conditions resulting from public commitment to address pressing problems (an agreed goal) without a proven solution (unknown technology/mean).

The question is therefore, whether we can generate or formulate changes in the planning processes and approaches easily and fast enough to meet the expectations and demands that the Free State socio-political changes have generated. This pronounce the way of dealing with uncertainty about means by moving ahead pragmatically, in an incremental, trial-and-error search for something that works (Christensen, 1985, p.65). This would be innovative way of finding solution that accommodates multiple preferences and eventually becoming responsive in a systematic way applying strategic variations (Christensen, 1985, p.67-70).

Based on this, the planning process in the Free State, which has traditionally been blueprint in orientation, cannot afford to be static any more. There should be a shift to planning process that allow for flexibility, cope with uncertainties by adopting style and processes suitable to actual problem conditions (Christensen, 1985, p.71), and dealing with continual changes in development objectives, approaches and policy, inputs by a variety of different public denominations at different points in time to encourage innovation.

6.3   ENGAGEMENT IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

One of the guidelines set down for the members of the AIA is that they have to participate actively in the life of their community in order "to project the image of professional competence which is basic to popular confidence in architects" (Doodman, 1972). This is one way in which the image of the planning profession in South Africa may be strengthened. This can also include volunteer work in poor or disadvantaged communities. This can be through programmes such as planning aid. This is a community development approach that has its origins in the British planning history (RTPI, 1991).

The notion of planning aid is very new in South Africa. As Boyle (1990, p.1) pointed out, "in a healthy democracy people should have the right to influence changes to their environment". The notion of planning aid in South Africa can be based on community planning approach. This approach gives people a handle on the levers of power. The case study pointed out that in general, planners in the Free State were taking part in public participation process. This therefore implies that something was done to find out what kind of environment people wanted, especially the disadvantaged communities. The idea of people planning things for themselves seem possible, and now is the time to realise this is a necessity.

Planning aid, with technical aid teams organised on voluntary basis, can be an effective way of bridging the gap between planning professionals and the users of planning service, who are less technical, Planning aid in the Free State can also be based on the transactive role that planners can adopt in the planning process (Friedmann, 1973). The role acknowledges the fact that both planners/professionals and the public have their own unique expertise about their contexts (Friedmann, 1973 and RTPI, 1991). It is admitted that both distrust each other, especially when one looks at the relationship between planners and the general public that was confirmed by the case study as being largely positive.

However, it has to be stressed that if both parties work together, they could be more effective in achieving what they want. Since the two sides possess unique expertise about their context, this can be a good learning experience for the users of planning services and the planners, since the two could be involved at all stages of the planning process rather than a situation whereby planners disappear for months and return with drawings and maps produced in isolation. Cherry (1974a) argues for a different style of planning that is currently the case with blue-print approach, which calls for planning that is built from below up rather than the other way round.

It is clear that nothing can more plainly show the communities the interest of planners in its life and future than this type of voluntary participation.

6.4   PROMOTION OF DEVELOPMENTAL PROGRAMME

Local government is a key role-player in the development process in South Africa. The transformation process to establish non-racial and viable municipalities is a crucial strategic move towards enabling local government to fulfil its planning and developmental role. In the Free State, the Department of Local Government and Housing should seek to promote planning and development by providing a clear and motivating programme through policy framework that will result in a more viable municipalities. Integrated development programme is one of the key tools for local government to tackle its planning and developmental role.

This kind of promotion can increase the awareness about the importance of planning in our society and the image of planning could be projected. As a result, the understanding of planning amongst the politicians, local communities and the community-based organisations can be enhanced, and their reaction could be proactive instead of being reactive to planning issues.

6.5   COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION SHARING

It was noted in the case study that there are gaps between an d within the planning profession in South Africa, which makes professional planners to have low confidence in the handling of some of their day to day tasks them today. As a result, this has an impact on the image of planning. This was attributed to a number of factors, including lack of communication between planners in practice and those in the academic level. In taking this challenge of filling in the gaps that exist, the author is of view that there should be a wide dissemination of information, especially the results of the research projects undertaken for planning schools on the effectiveness of aspects of the planning profession and service (especially dissertations). It sis accepted that this could enable planning practitioners to take greater account of the wide body of ongoing academic research, which might have a direct bearing on the way in which the practitioners function, especially in responding to changing contexts of planning. Continuing development of planners can complement this.

6.6   TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT OF PLANNING OFFICIALS

Training of planning officials both in the public and private sectors and career development is one way in which the effectiveness of the planning service, morale and job satisfaction can be achieved. These have a direct impact in promoting the efficiency of the planning service, not only through improving the capabilities of officials, but also by boosting morale, confidence, motivation and the satisfaction to be gained from the job. There is no doubt that these have a direct impact on the commitment of planning professionals facing the challenges confronting the image of the profession today.

The case study revealed that one of the reasons for the lack of confidence in planning was mainly because the planners did not get adequate skills in certain fields, that is people-oriented skills. These include for example, negotiation skills; conflict resolution skills; capacity building and empowerment skills. This kind of training is relevant for planners already in the practice because they it can be important to the effective performance in their jobs, especially for those with considerable public involvement. This mid-career educational development is a challenge that if taken, could go a long way in addressing the existing contradiction between rhetoric and practice. The breaking down of the barriers between theory and practice can also be achieved by introducing these elements of people-oriented skills in planning education. The restoration of confidence, morale and commitment and motivation in planners could have beneficial spin-offs for the image of planning in the Free State.

6.7   PRINCIPLES AND VALUES OF PLANNING

It is appreciated that in clearing up the dilemma of an ambiguous interpretation of the planning as it is currently, the values, principles and percepts on which planning had been based during the apartheid era, the crisis and chaotic phases would have to be abandoned. This will enable planning to take up the challenges and opportunities available. This challenge would demand planning to be critically assessed in terms of its role in Free State, especially in taking a lead in the formation, re-interpretation and application of the envisaged planning ideology that has its roots and basis in the

University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, South Africa

theory f political democracy. This will also involve the review of planning 'culture', the essence of which places the users or recipients of planning services at the centre and is sensitivity to needs and to the right of those come into contact with the service to customer care. This is part of the culture of responsive and effective planning system. It is noted that for such a culture to develop and become effective, it should pervade both the SAITRP and the SACTRP and be accepted and acted upon by all officers and members. There is no doubt that this will demand planning fraternity to critically examine both its past and current performances, learn lessons from the practice and develop a culture rooted in a set of tenable principles, percepts and values. The fraternity will have to be aware that it has to deal with a diversity of public, which is likely to have differential degrees of expertise in the knowledge of, and access to the planning service.

Linked to the new culture that planning has to adopt is the establishment of an opposite code of ethics. Some respondents in the survey seemed to have been confused about the difference between the code of ethics and the code of professional conduct, To clarify such confusion, Hendler (1991, p.157) differentiates the two by pointing out that codes of ethics on one hand, are visionary statements regarding the normative and ethical aspects of the profession. This presents a clear position on what a profession should profess. Codes of conduct on the other hand, are simply guidelines for professional behaviour, including conflict on interest, professional competence, among others. The two codes together constitute professional codes. They should be taken as the source of inspiration, and everyday guidance in planning practice.

It should be recognised that it is not only the content of codes that counts, but the process used to develop and improve the existing codes may contribute as much in terms of the legitimacy of the principles, precepts and values arrived at (Hendler, 1991, p.167). Given the fact that the professional codes function as a social contract entered into by various parties, including the public, planners, employers and employees, clients and the profession as a whole (Rawl, in Hendler, 1991, p.160), for it to be considered a fair contract, it would seem apparent that al individuals affected by this contract should be party to its development. A participative process involving

all parties in the planning stage would undoubtedly be in the best position of legitimating planning norms. This is in line with the democratic ethos which South Africa is in the process of familiarising itself with.

As Muller (1982) pointed out in his 'promotive planning', planning cannot give the human dignity and liberty that democracy promises, but it can promote achievement of these attributes. Therefore, the author subscribes to Muller's (1982) view, and argues that the adoption of a tenable value system based on the theory of democracy, will likewise go a long way in promoting the achievement of these democratic attributes, and only then will be restored what is presently lacking in planning. That is legitimacy, credibility, effectiveness, trust, confidence, commitment, sensitivity, objectivity about the capacity to deliver, and transparency. It is only with the achievement of the above that planning will become a guide for action instead of becoming an outdated bureaucratic routine (Castells, 1982, p.3).

7.   SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

In determining "Janus Face" of Planning in South Africa, one of the pieces of legislation that form the basis for wider involvement of beneficiaries of planning service is Municipal Systems Act, No.32 of 2000 which an attempt to modernise local government by bringing together public, service providers and communities across municipal area to allow more joined effort in strategic thinking to improve the quality at the local level and more particularly, address socio-economic in deprived areas.

The implementation of the said legislation by local government is an attempt to improve and enhance the "Janus Face" of Planning and this is a front-role in assisting with involvement of users of planning in influencing decision-making and taking action to improve their livelihoods. Beneficiaries of planning and planning officials now show willingness to break away from inherited traditional ways of governance and administration and embark on new and innovative management and service delivery strategies. There is therefore a fresh drive for innovation and the sharing of good practice.

Within the aim of the thesis aim, the objectives were:

- ❑ To assess the extent to which the planning has changed in response to the changing needs and expectations of the previously disadvantaged black communities, as the most users or beneficiaries of the planning services today;

- ❑ To understand what planners in both public and private practice perceive to be the major problems facing planning. In so doing, it will be possible to identify the perceived gap between what planners do, based on what the users of planning services expect from planning fraternity. However the users of planning will not be right all the time;

- ❑ To understand any possible strengths and/or weaknesses of planning in the light of emerging challenges.

The thesis has relevance wherever perception of both planning officials and users of planning services need to be understood with the hope to involve community groups or the socially excluded in difficult resource allocation.

Further aim of the thesis is threefold:

❑   Current decentralisation processes emphasise the role of different levels of local government. Any countries now have processes of decentralised planning, which usually emphasise district/local government levels. Many countries also now have an explicit objective of poverty eradication and there is increasing commitment to bottom-up, participatory or community-based planning (CBP) as a way of identifying locally appropriate poverty reduction interventions which reduces civil tensions, invests services efficiently and transparently, and increases social justice and equity;

❑   The planning system is a key system for resource allocation. Unless poor people can influence the resource allocation system, the ability to promote sustainable livelihoods for poor people is limited, as is the degree of local democracy. Recent planning attempts have often focused on ad-hoc, expensive and unreplicable participatory rural appraisals (PRA) which may generate a lot of information but are not clearly linked into decentralised planning systems;

❑   To offer those most excluded in the Free State the tools, knowledge and confidence to find solutions to their own poverty and exclusion. In particular developing networks around (single) women, disabled, youths, elderly, business groups, the homeless, etc. offering those traditionally marginalized and/or excluded by democratic processes a stake in their environment, and an equal voice with more affluent communities (who are better placed to successful advocates on behalf of their own asset-base.

Further challenges are:

How can CBP be a response to what legislation says about deepening local democracy, thereby improving service delivery and speeding up development?

❑   Creating citizenship and ownership in the community and planning service;

❑   People indicating what were their priorities which were different to previous priorities and in fact very strategic - in the process of them deciding on what they want planning officials are deepening democracy;

❑   In the response of the Municipality to people's priorities and their incorporation in the IDP, that democracy is being listened to;

❑   Community taking action immediately – is also an active democracy and increasing people's confidence in their ability to plan and manage their own development;

❑   Evidence that planning service has improved service delivery

Effective mechanisms to consult the community?

❑   CBP approach should be used as it is an effective methodology for obtaining the views of different groups within the community, building a consensus for ways forward. However, it is limited at present in that wards are large for a representative structure, and there is no structured form of representation at ward level. This makes it difficult to be sure that views are representative. However the meetings with different socio-economic groups means that all sections of society are involved;

❑   However this goes way beyond consultation and it is their view of the community's vision, strengths and threats;

The result of community-based ward planning is to increase communication and debate amongst and between the poorest and those in decision-making positions, and by means of well-structured annual participation to better inform decision-makers about how they should spend their 'investment' budget. However, the real benefits of community-based ward planning lie in the spin-offs, such as a new feeling of citizenship and ownership, greater transparency, the re-vitalisation of local politics, co-operation between sectors and increased social capital.

Ensuring that the mechanism is people centred?

❑　CBP is people centred as it is based on views of different groups within the community, recognising different social groups with different assets and interests, and identifying these separately before building a consensus about what is needed generally;

❑　This means that the information is very targeted at different groups and specifically identifies the most vulnerable and marginalised groups.

Does CBP represent a shift from the way communities would wait for services to be delivered to a more active role where communities participate in a partnership with municipalities and service providers?

❑　A strategic decision must be made that this is about empowering communities, not simply a consultation exercise, and the methodology forces the planning to ask "what will we do" (that is, users of planning service) not just "what others do for us";

How can we use this to collect information?

The use of information in the form of data is important in both compiling Integrated Development Plans as well as setting up performance management systems. Data collection can contribute to the development goals of the overall Municipality by promoting information-driven decision-making, coordinating planning and resource targeting within the Municipality and assist in reporting and communicating with the public and other stakeholders and so can assist transparency and accountability.

Role of ward councillors and ward committees generally

❑　Ward commitees provide a structure which can be used for participation for CBP and more generally;

❑　Where councillors and ward committees don't get on – then CBP and other issues are not taken forward;

❑ Ward committees improved the communication and provided a mechanism for mobilization;

❑ Also provided a platform for feedback;

❑ Provides a structure which can take responsibility for implementation and monitoring of the plans (and this has worked in Mangaung) ;

❑ There is a need for ongoing support of ward committees in a much stronger way than was possible first time round for CBP;

❑ CBP provided ward committees with a clear role to play – to facilitate, implement, and monitor the plan. It also provided a way of ensuring that councillors are accountable for what they are doing/promoting (the ward plan or something else?);

❑ CBP provided a lot of planning and facilitation skills to ward committee members, and some were then used as facilitators elsewhere;

❑ Ward councillors were critical in leading the process, in acting as a champion for the ward with the Municipality, as well as in mobilising. CBP also provided an opportunity for them to get to know their ward in much more detail and across cultures;

❑ Need for training for councillors and WCs, and then regular ongoing refresher training.

What capacities and resources required for effective ward-based plans – and Mangaung is well resourced, what about others?

❑ Champion in local government, if no interest in promoting participation from administrative and political heads it will not happen;

❑ Need fixed community structure like ward committee, and one which is committed.

Role of WCs and other community structures in implementation, monitoring and review of IDPs

❑ Ward committees should serve as a structure that will facilitate and promote good relations between council and administration on the one hand and the communities on the other;

❏   As the committees of council, ward committees have an important role of bringing governance more closer to the communities;

❏   Members of the ward committees must be empowered so that they are able to engage constructively with the administration and councillors, on behalf of the community on developmental issues;

❏   They should be a link between the community, councillors and the administration and must be the overseer of developments at the ward level;

❏   They must be able to bring forth issues on behalf of the communities and should be able to deal away with or report any deviations or wrong doings within their wards. They must at all times act in the best interests of both the community and the council in the execution of their functions and duties;

❏   As the non-partisan representatives of the communities, they are expected to provide fresh and independent views on issues that are being considered by the council. And where possible, they should be able to provide alternatives;

❏   The WCs are essential in mobilization and co-ordinating efforts of communities, facilitating the plan and ensuring implementation.

Strengthen linkage between ward plans and IDP

❏   Ward plans have directly led to the priorities in the Mangaung IDP – with the IDP priorities based on scoring of the ward priorities. They have also influenced the development programmes and their content;

❏   The projects proposed in the ward plans have not yet been technically appraised and answers given to people about which will be funded through the IDP. This is partly as the system was not established, and this was being done at the same time as the IDP. Standard project profile forms need to be agreed etc.;

❏   In future as there will be an IDP in place, some strategic direction can be provided to wards before the ward planning starts, as to what the Municipality (and potentially others) see as priorities and are likely to fund. We must however be careful that this does not skew local priorities;

❏   The Rep Forum includes WC (in Mangaung a ward counclioor and 1 ward committee member). The participatory planning was done through CBP, and

then the representatives in the Rep Forum agreed an overall approach, vision, priorities, and the development programmes. This takes participation much deeper than would otherwise be the case.

Reducing social exclusion and revitalizing community

The whole basis of WCs and community-based planning, and indeed much national policy, is the alleviation of social inequalities through community involve in decisions affecting their livelihoods. Mangaung is facing poverty that exists within its boundaries, and the need to find new socio-economic opportunities and strengths to replace the traditional but shrinking agricultural sector, is in a fair and transparent system that can allow local priorities to surface without raising unachievable expectations. The process of community-based planning presents a much-needed opportunity through which transformation, innovations and challenges of governance and development are addressed by all stakeholders. Specifically, the process brought together a diversity o f voices to consider the different scenarios for the future governance and development with respect to decentralization.

The above aim and objectives were achieved in the seven chapters of this discourse. The first chapter was an introductory part, outlining the problem statement, the aim and objectives, and the methodology of this study. Chapter two provided reference points or what one may regard as apposite definitions of the concepts of 'planning' and 'profession'. The definitions of these concepts provided in part, a foundation for the formulation of an independent planning ideology, which is supposedly free from ideological domination either by the state or capital. The basis of the envisaged planning ideology was the theory of political democracy. The envisaged planning ideology is 'the commitment of the planning profession to plan with the disadvantaged groups in the society'. The roles that planners could adopt within this framework could be informed by the ideal principles of the theory of democracy, which have universal reference and justification. These principles of democracy were used as the criteria for determining the image of planning in both international and local planning contexts in chapters three and four.

Chapter three focussed on the morphology of the image of the planning profession. The criteria that were used in the explanation of the morphology of the image of the planning profession were based on the theory of political democracy, which formed the basis of the envisaged planning ideology. The criteria included public accountability and responsibility; integrity; reputation; fairness; fearlessness; legitimacy; competence and effectiveness; sensitivity and awareness. According to the Royal Town Planning Institute (1991) these are the aspects that the planning service clients or customers look for in the service. These criteria were to be used in the determination of the image of the planning profession in both the international and local contexts in Chapter four of this discourse.

The historical analysis of image of planning fraternity, based on both the international and local planning experiences was the subject of Chapter four. This chapter provided a brief and selective theoretical review of the development history of the town planning profession in both the international and local contexts, focussing on the British and the South African planning experiences respectively. This brief and selective review of both contexts was done in conveniently demarcated phases, dating from as early as the 1890's to the present, the 2000's. In both contexts, emphasis was placed on the social, economic and political conditions that prevailed at the time and more significantly how the planning machine at the time responded to those circumstances they were face with. In both contexts, as an attempt were made to pass judgment on the performance of the planning and how both the planners and the users or beneficiaries of the planning service perceived the performance of the planning. The criteria used for judging the performance of planning were derived from chapters two and three.

On the international scene, the history of planning had the richness of a memorable social responsibility and obligations, partly because the profession emerged at the time when the social welfare state came to power. What emerged from the review of the British context was the fact that planning emerged primarily as a social reform movement, which after years of development, became a movement on its own right. During its inception, the planning movement had a social welfare philosophy that drew its inspiration and strength from its concern with the living conditions of the

ordinary people during the turn of the twentieth century. This was to influence the practice of British planning as known today.

The development story of the image of planning fraternity was looked at in four conveniently demarcated phases including the early reform era (late 1890's-1930); the depression and world war 2 era (1930-1945); the post-war era (1945-1960); and lastly the era of awakening (1960-1980). From the former three phases, the planning had on one hand, a negative image, as perceived by the users or beneficiaries of the planning service and planners who were critical of their roles. On the other hand, the image of the planning was perceived as being positive and neutral by planners, who, arguably had adopted the traditional model of planning or were themselves traditional planners (i.e architects, engineers, the surveyors and lawyers).

Therefore, the context in which they operated from, and the ideological position that they operated from, and the ideological position that they adopted tended to influence their perceptions about the image of planning. It was only during the last phase that the image of planning in Britain became relatively favourable than during the previous phases. The improvement of the image of planning was attributed to the initiatives of the RTPI together with the willingness of state authorities to improve the planning system in Britain. This was reflected in the appointment of the Skeffington Committee that reported in 1968 (Cherry, 1982 & Fagence 1977). This course of development of the image of planning in Britain was expected to be a model for South African planning history, but this was not the case.

From the brief and selective review of the South African planning history, it became clear that from the onset, planning in South Africa emerged as a mechanism for social and political control of the black population. Even though there might have been other reasons for the need for planning in the country, political considerations seem to have dominated other considerations. This orientation was to determine their *modus operandi* and planning approaches, and consequently the performance of the profession that tended to influence the perception of the image of planning. On the whole, the development of planning thought in South Africa followed closely on the developments of the British planning history at least until 1948, when the Nationalist

Party government came to power. From 1948 onwards, the beginning of the apartheid era, the development of planning was to stagnate and flounder the Nationalist Party rule.

The image of planning was to have ambiguous interpretations from the planners on one side, and the users or beneficiaries of planning services on the other. The image of planning during Colonial and Union Era (1900-1948) was on one hand perceived as being negative, by planners who were very critical of their roles as professionals. On the other hand, planners who were working in the interests of the political system at the time perceived it as being positive. Most of these planners were traditional planners, from the engineering, architecture, surveying and the legal professions, most of whom had adopted the traditional model of a professional which tended to be incompatible with the work that planners do. At the same time, the users or supposed beneficiaries of the planning services perceived the image of planning as being negative.

The apartheid era (1948-1980) witnessed the widening of the rift between the traditional planners on one hand, and the progressive (or what one may call racial) planners on the other. The introduction of racial zoning through group areas during this era contributed to a tarnished image of planning as perceived by the progressive planners and the majority of the disadvantaged black population (as the majority of the ultimate users or beneficiaries of the planning service) who were at the receiving end of the inhumane policies of apartheid, most of which were implemented by planners. This tarnished image of planning was to continue until the chaos and crisis era- amid the apartheid era (1980-1999). It was hoped that the ambiguity in the interpretation of the image of planning was to disappear in the transitional and uncertainty era (1994 and beyond). Chapter five confirmed this, which was a case study for discourse.

Chapter five was a case study that was primarily aimed at confronting the problems facing the planning profession, and the impact they have in the way the image of planning in the Free State is perceived. The technique used in the collection of data

was the questionnaire in the form of surveys. The same criteria for determining the image of planning as in chapter four were used.

After recording the raw data from the questionnaires in the summary sheets, it was categorised and analysed. The case study was very helpful in the confirmation of the image of planning in the Free State during the transitional and uncertainty period (1994 and beyond). From the analysis, it was confirmed that the image of planning in the Free State during this era especially the 2000s has improved and become positive, as perceived by the users or beneficiaries of the planning service. The challenges that are facing planning during this era of post-apartheid and uncertainty were subject of chapter Six. Chapter six attempted to provide solutions, options and strategies that could assist in the improvement of the image of planning. The challenge is for the profession to further enhance and work towards a positive image. As one planner respondent remarked, planning has been released from the chasm of the apartheid policies. Greater room to work which opens up the opportunity for planning to become more legitimate, transparent and inclusive in the ye of the public. The degree to which planning attains a positive image will be determined by the extent to which it takes up the above challenges.

Lastly, how effectively and best planning meets the challenges presented above will best be measured in terms of the 'Janus Face' (image) projected by both the beneficiaries of the planning service on the one hand, and the planners on the other.

Research Method

The research method used attempted to cover as wide range of people in the Free State as possible. The sample was selected using five District Local Municipalities in the Free State, covering Xhariep, Motheo, Lejweleputswa, Thabo Mofutsanyane, and Northern Free State.

The author administered questionnaires distributed to both planners in public and in private sectors. Free State Province has sizeable number of planners and the ones in private are mostly concentrated in Bloemfontein, and the questionnaires were distributed to them and collected after a week on the one hand. On the other hand public planners are located in various municipalities, which the author had to go to them and conduct personable interview.

With regard to the selection of the members of public, ward-based approach was used whereby three wards were selected from previously disadvantaged communities and one ward from former 'white' owned suburbs. The Ward Councillors with the assistance of ward committee members were requested to select members of the public to fill questionnaires and/or interview them. Various socio-economic grouping in a ward were used, namely: the disabled, the elderly, the youths, single parents, and business both formal and informal, and unemployed. A request was made to Ward Councillors to be gender sensitive. In the district of Motheo questionnaire were administered by interviews, whilst in the remaining districts the author personally visited Ward Councillor in those districts and debrief them and requested Ward Councillors to send back completed questionnaires by post after two weeks.

All 500 questionnaires were received though there were incomplete questionnaires and/or questions not fully answered. However, the quality of response was generally good. The results were compiled using form in addendum 3.

Addendum 2

Letter to Ward Councillors

Dear Ward Councillor,

Attached, please find two copies of questionnaires seeking to investigate the perception and the 'Janus Face' (image) of planning in the district municipality. If possible give one copy to one member of Ward Committee in your Ward to also solicit inputs from community members and complete and give back to you.

I will highly appreciate if completed questionnaires can be send back to Mr T. Maine at the Civic Centre on the 10th floor, Room 1007, Bloemfontein by August 17, 2001.

Thanking you in advance.

Teboho Maine
Teboho Maine
Town Planner

SECTION A : PERSONAL DETAILS

DATE : _____ : _____ : 2001   PLACE : _____   TIME : _____

1.GENDER

MALE	FEMALE

2.QUALIFICATIONS OBTAINED:

_____

_____

3.NUMBER OF YEARS IN PRACTICE

0 - 3	4 - 7	8 - 11	12 - 15	16 +

4.ARE YOU CURRENTLY WORKING IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR, PRIVATE SECTOR OR NGO?

Prov. Govt.	Local Govt.	Private Company	Private Consultant	Self Employed	NGO

5.TYPE OF JOB CURRENTLY DOING (Please give a full description of the nature of the work you are frequently involved in, eg development control, policy and strategy formulation, development planning)

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

6.WHY DID YOU BECOME A TOWN AND REGIONAL PLANNER

_____

_____

_____

128

SECTION B : PLANNING

7.DO YOU BELIEVE THAT THE PLANNING HAS ANY OBLIGATION TO SOCIETY AS A WHOLE?

YES	NO

8.IF THE ANSWER TO QUESTION 7 IS YES, PLEASE COMMENT (What do you think the obligations are?)

_____

_____

_____

_____

9.PLEASE COMMENT FROM YOUR EXPERIENCE ON THE GENERAL RELATIONSHIP OF THE PLANNER TO THE FOLLOWING

(a)The General Public:

POSITIVE	NEUTRAL	NEGATIVE	DON'T KNOW

Comment:_____

_____

_____

(b)The Politicians:

POSITIVE	NEUTRAL	NEGATIVE	DON'T KNOW

Comment:_____

_____

_____

(c)Community Organisations:

POSITIVE	NEUTRAL	NEGATIVE	DON'T KNOW

Comment:_____

_____

10.SHOULD TOWN AND REGIONAL PLANNING BE CONCERNED WITH:

(a) Political Decision-making?

YES	NO

Expansion of Choices	
Allocation of Resources	
Distribution of Opportunities	
Redistribution of Land	
Local Governance	

(b) Technical Issues?

YES	NO

Drawing of Plans	
Development Control	
Urban Management	
Management of Urbanisation	

(c) Social Reform?

YES	NO

Improvement and Betterment of Living Conditions of the Disadvantaged Communities	
Empowerment of Communities	
Planning Aid	
Enrichment of Human Life	
Resettlement of Communities	
Upgrading of Existing Informal Settlements	

130

11.DO YOU THINK THAT PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN THE PLANNING PROCESS IS DESIRABLE OR UNDESIRABLE ?

DESIRABLE	UNDESIRABLE

WHY ?:_____

_____

_____

_____

12.WHAT DO YOU PERCEIVE TO BE THE MAJOR PROBLEMS FACING PLANNING?

(a)Technically:

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

(b)Socially:

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

(c)Politically:

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

(d)Any Other (Please specify):

_____

_____

_____

_____

13. WHICH OF THE FOLLOWING ELEMENTS DO YOU THINK TOWN AND REGIONAL PLANNING IS CONCERNED WITH?

Physical Planning (national, regional and local level)	
Generation of Plans	
Urban Design and Site Planning	
Development Control	
Planning Surveys and Analyses	
Policy Formulation	
Provision of Alternative Environments	
Development Evaluation	
Decision of Future Action	
Upgrading of Existing Informal Settlements	
Removal of Existing Informal Settlements	
Forced Removals	
Design and Construction of Buildings	
Provision of Services	
Distribution of Opportunities	
Allocation of Resources	
Redistribution of Land	
Urban Development	
Rural Development	
Public Involvement	
Community Empowerment	
Promoting the Enrichment of Human Life	
None of These	
All of These	
Any Other (please specify)	

14.DO YOU THINK PLANNING HAS UNDERGONE ANY CHANGES DURING THE PERIOD 1996 - 2001?

YES	NO

If the answer is yes, please comment:

_____
_____
_____

If the answer is no, were changes positive or negative and comment:

_____
_____
_____

15.HAVE THE CHANGES (BE THEY POSITIVE OR NEGATIVE) AFFECTED YOUR PLANNING PRACTICE?

YES	NO

16.IS THERE ANY NEED FOR PLANNING TO CHANGE OR IMPROVE

YES	NO

17.DO YOU THINK THAT THE WAY PLANNING IS PRACTICED, IS SENSITIVE TO VALUES AND NORMS OF SOCIETIES IN WHICH IT SERVES?

YES	NO

18.WHAT ARE THE SOURCES OF LEGITIMACY OF THE PLANNING? (What gives the planning the right to exist?)

_____
_____
_____

19.HOW DO YOU VIEW FUTURE PLANNING IN SOUTH AFRICA?

OPTIMISTIC	PESSIMISTIC

20.HAS THE PLANNING PROCESS IN SOUTH AFRICA BEEN PERMISSIVE IN TERMS OF RESPONDING TO AND ACCOMMODATING CHANGE?

YES	NO

Please comment:

_____
_____
_____
_____
_____
_____

I EXTEND MY GRATITUDE TO YOU
FOR THE TIME SPEND
IN ANSWERING THIS QUESTIONNAIRE.

TEBOHO MAINE

SECTION A : PERSONAL DETAILS

DATE : _____ : _____ : 2001   PLACE : _____   TIME : _____

1.   GENDER

MALE	FEMALE

2.   OCCUPATION

_____

SECTION B : ABOUT PLANNING

3.   HAVE YOU, BEFORE TODAY, EVER HEARD OR KNOWN OF TOWN PLANNING?

YES	NO

4.   IF THE ANSWER TO QUESTION 4 IS YES, WHERE DID YOU HEAR ABOUT TOWN PLANNING?

TELEVISION	
RADIO	
NEWSPAPER	
FRIENDS	
WORK PLACE	
PERSONAL EXPERIENCE	
COMMUNITY MEETINGS	
ANY OTHER SOURCE (Please specify)	

5. WHICH OF THE FOLLOWING ELEMENTS DO YOU THINK TOWN AND REGIONAL PLANNING IS CONCERNED WITH?

Physical Planning (national, regional and local level)	
Generation of Plans	
Urban Design and Site Planning	
Development Control	
Planning Surveys and Analyses	
Policy Formulation	
Provision of Alternative Environments	
Development Evaluation	
Decision of Future Action	
Upgrading of Existing Informal Settlements	
Removal of Existing Informal Settlements	
Forced Removals	
Design and Construction of Buildings	
Provision of Services	
Distribution of Opportunities	
Allocation of Resources	
Redistribution of Land	
Urban Development	
Rural Development	
Public Involvement	
Community Empowerment	
Promoting the Enrichment of Human Life	
None of These	
All of These	
Any Other (please specify)	

Comment: _____

_____

6.   SHOULD TOWN AND REGIONAL PLANNING BE CONCERNED WITH:

(a) Political Decision-making?

YES	NO

Expansion of Choices	
Allocation of Resources	
Distribution of Opportunities	
Redistribution of Land	
Local Governance	

(b) Technical Issues?

YES	NO

Drawing of Plans	
Development Control	
Urban Management	
Prevention of Urbanisation	

(c) Social Reform?

YES	NO

Improvement and Betterment of Living Conditions of the Disadvantaged Communities	
Empowerment of Communities	
Planning Aid	
Enrichment of Human Life	
Resettlement of Communities	
Upgrading of Existing Informal Settlements	

7. DO YOU THINK THAT PEOPLE SHOULD PARTICIPATE IN THE FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMUNITY PROJECTS?

YES	NO

8. STATE WHETHER YOU STRONGLY AGREE (SA), AGREE (A), DISAGREE (D), STRONGLY DISAGREE (SD) OR ARE UNDECIDED (U) WITH THE FOLLOWING STATEMENT.

	SA	A	D	SD	U
I KNEW EXACTLY HOW THE COMMUNITY PROJECT WAS GOING TO BE DONE					
AS NA INDIVIDUAL I DID NOT HAVE ANY SAY IN THE PROJECT					
MOST OF THE PEOPLE ARE SATISFIED WITH THE WAY IN WHICH THE PROJECT IS MANAGED					

9. DID YOU HAVE A PROBLEM WITH ANY ASPECT OF THE PROJECT?

YES	NO

Elaborate : _____

_____

_____

10. IF YES, DID YOU DISCUSS THE PROBLEM WITH ANYBODY? (If no, go to 14)

YES	NO

11. IF YES WHO DID YOU TURN TO?

FAMILY/ FRIENDS	
WARD COMMITTEES/ COUNCILLOR	

138

COMMUNITY ORGANISATION	
NGOs	
CONSULTANTS	
MUNICIPALITY	
PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT	
OTHER, specify	

12. WERE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE WAY IN WHICH THE PROJECT WAS DISCUSSED OR HANDLED?

YES	NO

13. HOW WERE YOU INFORMED ABOUT THE PROJECT? (See question number 4)

_____

_____

_____

14. DID YOU ATTEND ANY MEETING WHERE THE PROJECT WAS DISCUSSED?

YES	NO

15. IF YES, WERE YOU SATISFIED IN WHICH THE INFORMATION WAS GIVEN AT THE MEETINGS?

YES	NO

16. WHAT DO YOU PERCEIVE TO BE THE MAJOR PROBLEMS FACING PLANNING?
(a) Technically:

_____

_____

_____

_____

139

(b)   Socially:

     _____
     _____
     _____
     _____
     _____
     _____

(c)   Politically:

     _____
     _____
     _____
     _____
     _____

(d)   Any Other (Please specify):

     _____
     _____
     _____
     _____
     _____

17.   IS THERE ANY NEED FOR PLANNING TO CHANGE OR IMPROVE?

YES	NO

18.   DO YOU THINK THAT THE PLANNING, THE WAY IS PRACTICED, IS SENSITIVE TO VALUES AND NORMS OF SOCIETIES IN WHICH IT SERVES?

YES	NO

19.   HAS THE PLANNING PROCESS IN SOUTH AFRICA BEEN PERMISSIVE IN TERMS OF RESPONDING TO AND ACCOMMODATING CHANGE?

YES	NO

Please comment:

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

20.   HOW SATISFIED ARE YOU WITH THE WORK DONE BY THE FOLLOWING PEOPLE OR INSTITUTIONS?

VS = very satisfied   VD = very dissatisfied

S = satisfied   D = dissatisfied

U = unsure   NA = not applicable to the specific community

	VS	S	U	D	VD	NA
PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT						
THE MUNICIPALITY						
PRIVATE COMPANY						
CONSULTANTS						
WARD COMMITTEES						
COMMUNITY ORGANISATIONS						
NGOs						

21.   HOW DO YOU VIEW FUTURE PLANNING IN SOUTH AFRICA?

OPTIMISTIC	PESSIMISTIC

I EXTEND MY GRATITUDE TO YOU

FOR THE TIME SPEND

IN ANSWERING THIS QUESTIONNAIRE.

TEBOHO MAINE

Addendum 5   **Manual data compilation and processing system**

Quesnnre # [ ][ ][ ][ ]   1-4

Questionnaire to Professionals

1   [ ]   5

2   [ ][ ]   6-7

3   [ ]   8

4   [ ]   9

5   [ ][ ][ ]   10-12

6   [ ][ ]   13-14

7   [ ]   15

8   [ ][ ]   16-17

9(a) [ ]   [ ][ ]   18-20

9(b) [ ]   [ ][ ]   21-23

9(c) [ ]   [ ][ ]   24-26

10(a) [ ]   [ ][ ][ ][ ][ ]   27-32

10(b) [ ]   [ ][ ][ ][ ]   33-37

10(c) [ ]   [ ][ ][ ][ ][ ][ ]   38-44

11   [ ]   [ ][ ]   45-47

12(a)(b)(c) [ ][ ][ ]   (d) [ ][ ]   48-52

13   [ ] 53-73
     [ ] 74-93

14   [ ]   [ ][ ]   [ ][ ]   94-98

15   [ ]   99

16. [ ]   100

17   [ ]   101

18   [ ][ ]   102-103

19   [ ]   104

20   [ ][ ][ ]   105-107

University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, South Africa

Addendum 6   **Manual data compilation and processing system**

Quesnnre #

Questionnaire to Beneficiaries of Planning Services

1   5   17   101

2   6-7   18   102-103

3   8   19   104

4   9   20   105-107

5   10-12   · 21   **108-109**

6   13-14

7   15

8   16-17

9(a)   18-20

9(b)   21-23

9(c)   24-26

10(a)   27-32

10(b)   33-37

10(c)   38-44

11   45-47

12(a)(b)(c)   (d)   48-52

13   53-73

                                                                  74-93

14   94-98

15   99

16   100

Addendum 7

Bibliography

Abercrombie, P. (1959) : *Town and Country Planning*, London: Oxford University press.

Alexander, E.R. (1979) : 'Planning Roles and Context'. In Catanese, A.J. and Snyder, J.C. (Eds). *Introduction to Urban Planning*, New York: McGraw-Hill.

Altshuler, A.A. (1973) : *City Planning Process: A Political Analysis*, New York: Cornell University Press.

Baum, H.S. (1983) : *Planners and Public Expectations*. Part I, Cambridge: Shenkman Publishing Co.

Beauregard, R.A. (1978) : 'Planning in Advanced Capitalist State'. In Burchell, R.W. and Stanlieb, G, (eds), *Planning Theory in the 1980s: A Search for Future Directions*, New Brunswick: Centre for Policy and Research.

Benevolo, L. (1980) : *The History of the City*, London: Scolar Press.

Bennion, F.A.R. (1969) : *Professional Ethics: The Consultant Professions and their Code*, London: Charles Knight and Co.

Blowers, A. (1980) : 'Much ado nothing? - A case study of planning and power'. In Healey, P., McDougal, G. and Thomas M.J. (eds). *Planning Theory: The Prospects of the 1980s*, London: Pergamon Press.

Bruton, M.J. (1984) : *The Spirit and Purpose of Planning*, London: Hutchinson.

Brech, R. : (1964) : *Planning Prosperity*, London: Longman and Todd Ltd.

Catanese, A.J. (1984) : *The Politics of Planning and Development*, Sage, Beverly Hills.

Castells, M. (1982) : 'Planning and Social Change'. *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, Vol.2.

Cherry, G. (1993) : 'International Transfers in Planning Ideas and Practice'. *International Planning History Journal*, Vol.15, No.2.

Cherry, G. (1982) : *The Politics of Town Planning*, London: Longman.

Cherry, G. (1974) : *The Evolution of British Town Planning*, Leighton Buzzard, Leornard Hill.

Cowan, P., *et al.* (1973) : *The Future of Planning*. Heinemann, London.

Christensen, K. (1985) : 'Coping with Uncertainty in Planning'. *American Planners Association Journal,* Winter 1985.

Cullingworth, J.B. (1997) : *Planning in the USA: Policies, Issues, and Processes,* London: Routledge.

Cullingworth, J.B. (1993) : *The Political Culture of Planning: American Land Use in Comparative Perspective,* New York: Routledge.

Cullingworth, J.B. (1982) : *Town and Country Planning in Britain,* London: Allen and Unwin.

Davidoff, P. (1965) : 'Advocacy and Pluralism in Planning', AIPJ, November 1965, Vol. 31. Reprinted in Faludi (Ed) (1973), *A Reader in Planning Theory,* Pergamon Press, Oxford.

Davidoff, P. and Reiner, T.A. (1962) : 'A Choice Theory of Planning'. In Faludi (ed) (1973), *A Reader in Planning Theory,* Pergamon Press, Oxford.

Dekker, F. and Mastop, H. (1979) : 'Strategic Choice: An Application in Dutch Planning Practice'. *Planning Outlook,* Vol.22 No.3.

Drake, M. (1991) : 'Impact of GIS in Procedural Theory and Planning Practice in South Africa'. *SAITRP Journal,* September 1991, No.31.

Drake, M. (1991) : 'Centralised Control: Historical Overview of Planning Preoccupation'. *International Planning History Journal,* Vol.15, No.2.

Dror, Y. (1963) : 'The Planning Process: A Facet Design'. In Faludi (Ed) (1973) : *A Reader in Planning Theory,* Pergamon Press, Oxford.

Dyckman, J.W. (1978) : 'Three Crises of American Planning'. In Burchell, R.W. and Stanlieb, G (Eds). *Planning Theory in the 1980s: A Search for Future Directions.* New Jersey: Centre for Urban Policy Research.

Essex, S. (1991) : 'The Nature of the Job'. In Thomas and Healey (Eds). *The Dilemmas of Planning Practice: Ethics, Legitimacy and the Validation of Knowledge,* Hong Kong: Avebury Technical.

Etzioni, A. (1967) : 'Mixed-scanning: a "third" approach to decision-making', *Public Administration Review,* December 1967 (reprinted in Faludi 1973).

Eversley, D. (1973) : *The Planner in Society: The Changing Role of a Profession,* London: Faber and Faber.

Fagence, M. (1977) : *Citizen Participation,* Oxford: Pergamon.

Fainstein, S.S. and Fainstein, N.I. (1971) : 'City planning and Political Values'. *Urban Quarterly Affairs,* 1971, March: 341-362.

Faludi, A. (1973) : *Planning Theory,* Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Friedmann, J. (1973) : *Retracking America,* New York: Anchor Press.

Goodchild, B. (1990) : 'Planning and the postmodern debate', *Town Planning Review,* No 61, 119-137.

Goodman, R. (1972) : *After the Planners,* New York: Simon and Schuster.

Grant, J. (1989) : 'From human values to human resources: Planners perceptions of public role and public interest. *Plan Canada,* 1989, Vol.26, No.6.

Greed, C.H. (1993) : *Introduction to Town Planning,* London: Longman.

Hague, C. (1984) : *The Development of Planning Thought: A Critical Perspective,* London: Hutchinson.

Hatch, R. (2nd Ed) (1998) : *The Scope of Social Architecture,* New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Co.

Harvey, D. (1978) : 'On Planning the Ideology of Planning'. In Burchell, R.W. and Stanlieb, G, (eds), *Planning Theory in the 1980s: A Search for Future Directions,* New Brunswick: Centre for Policy and Research.

Hawtree, M. (1981) : 'The Emergence of Town Planning Profession'. In Sutcliffe (ed), *British Town Planning: The Formative Years,* London: Leicester University Press.

Healey, McDougal and Thomas (1982) : 'Theoretical debates in planning: towards a coherent dialogue'. In McDougal, Thomas (eds), *Planning Theory: Prospects for the '80s,* Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Heap, D. (1973) : *An Outline of Planning Law,* London: Sweet and Maxwell.

Hendler, S. (1995) : *Planning Ethics: A Reader in Planning Theory, Practice and Education,* New Jersey: Rutgers University.

Howard, E. (1902) : *Garden Cities of Tomorrow*.

Izard, W. (1969) : *General Theory*, London: Massachusetts Institute for Technology.

Jakobson, L.(1970) : 'Towards a pluralistic ideology in planning education'. In Erber E, *Urban Planning in Transition*, New York: Grossman.

Keeble, L. (1969) : *Principles and Practice of Town and Country Planning*, London: Estates Gazette.

Kirk, G. (1980) : *Urban Planning in Capitalist Society*, London: Croom Helm

Krumholz, N. and Forester, J. (1990) : *Making Equity Planning Work: Leadership in the Public Sector*, Philadelphia: Temple Press.

Lee, R.H. (1955) : *The City*, J.B. Lippincott Co., Chicago.

Lindblom, C.E. (1959) : 'The science of muddling through'. *Public Administration Review*, Spring (reprinted in Faludi, 1973 and Campbell and Fainstein, 1996).

Lively, J. (1975) : *Democracy*, Oxford: Basic Blackwell.

Louw, L and Kendall, F. (1986) : *South Africa: The Solution*, Norwood: Amagi Publications.

McCarthy. T.T. and Smit, D.P. (1984) : *South African City: Theory in Analysis and Planning*, Johannesburg: Juta and Co.

Mabin, A. (1993) : 'Between Zevenfontein and Hillbrow: Alternatives for South African Urban Planning'. *SAITRP Journal*, April 1993, No. 34.

Mabin, A. (1992) : 'The Witwatersrand Joint Town Planning Committee 1932-1940: of rigour and mortis'. *Paper presented at Planning History Workshop*, Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand, August 1992.

Mallows, E.W. (1988) : *The Next 100 Years: A Planner's Viewpoint* (Nola Green Memorial Lecture, SAITRP)

Meredith, M. (1988) : *In the Name of Apartheid: South Africa in the Post-war Period*, London: Hamish Hamilton.

Millerson, D. (1964) : *The Qualifying Associations - A Study in Professionalism,* London: Routledge.

Mitchell, W.J. (1995) : *Reading in Urban Theory,* Cambridge: Massachusetts Institute for Technology.

Morris, A.E.J. (1982) : *The History of Urban Form Before the Industrial Revolution,* London: Godwin Ltd.

Muller, J. (1993) : 'Parell paths: The origin of planning education and planning profession in South Africa'. *International Planning History Journal,* Vol15, No.2.

Muller, J. (1992a) : 'From survey to strategy: Twentieth century developments in Western planning method'. *Planning Perspective, 7.*

Muller, J. (1992b) : 'Post-apartheid planning for the new South Africa'. *The Planner,* November 1992.

Muller, J. (1991) : 'Ethics: Theory and practice in South African planning'. *SAITRP Journal,* September 1991, No.31.

Muller, J. (1982a) : 'Promotive planning: Towards an approach to planning for the disadvantaged'. In Healy, P., McDougal, G. and Thomas M.J. (eds). *Planning Theory: The Prospects of the 1980s,* London: Pergamon Press.

Muller, J. (1982b) : *Theory and Practice: The Janus Face of Planning,* Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Osborn, F. and Whittick, A. (1969) : *The New Towns: The Answer to Megalopolis,* London: Hill.

Peiser, R. (1990) : 'Who Plans America? Planners or Developers?' *Journal of the American Planning Association,* Vol 56: 496-503.

Prinsloo, I. (1972) : 'Decision-making in Urban Planning'. *Msc TRP Dissertation,* Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Ratcliffe, J. (1974) : *An Introduction to Town and Country Planning,* First Edition, London: Hutchinson.

Ratcliffe, J. (1974) : *An Introduction to Town and Country Planning,* Second Edition, London: Hutchinson.

Rawls, J (1984) : *A Theory of Justice,* Oxford: Oxford university Press.

Rose, E.A. (1984) : 'Philosophy and Purpose in Planning'. In Bruton, M.J. (ed) *The Spirit and Purpose of Planning,* London: Hutchinson.

Schon, D.A. (1983) : *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action,* New York: Basic Books.

Stretton, R. (1998) : *Urban Planning in Rich and Poor Countries,* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Webber, M.M. (1991) : 'Comprehensive Planning and Social Responsibility: Toward an AIP Consensus on the Profession's Roles and Purposes'. In Faludi (ed), *A Reader in Planning Theory,* Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Welch, T.C. (1993) : 'Historical continuity in town planning'. *International Planning History Journal,* 1993, Vol15, No.2.

Wildavsky, A. (1973) : *Planning in Poor Countries,* New York: Wiley.