

UNIVERSITY OF THE
FREE STATE
UNIVERSITEIT VAN DIE
VRYSTAAT
YUNIVESITHI YA
FREISTATA



The moral formation, pastoral leadership and contemporary Pentecostal/Charismatic Churches in Soweto

Thembelani Jentile

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements in respect of the Master's Degree qualification in Theology in the Department of Religion Studies in the faculty of Theology at the University of the Free State

September 2016

Promoter: Dr. Luvuyo Ntombana

Co-promoter: Prof. R. Venter

The financial assistance of the National Research Foundation (NRF) towards this research is hereby acknowledged. Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at, are those of the author and are not necessarily to be attributed to the NRF

DECLARATION

“I Thembelani Jentile declare that the Master’s Degree research dissertation that I herewith submit for the Master’s degree qualification in Theology at the University of the Free State is my independent work, and that I have not previously submitted it for a qualification at another institution of higher education.”

“I Thembelani Jentile hereby declare that I am aware that the copyright is vested in the University of the Free State.”

“I Thembelani Jentile hereby declare that all royalties as regards intellectual property that was developed during the course of and/or in connection with the study at the University of The Free State, will accrue to the University.”

Signature.....

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to Nosandile Jentile (1959-2014), my lovely mother whose dreams were cut short, but lived her life to the fullest. In spite of the squalor in which we were living, she kept us off the streets and made us feel that we were not the ordinary product of poverty but unique and distinguished children.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The journey to complete a dissertation is not one travelled alone. Many people have in one way or another helped me in the process of completing this thesis. Their contributions have varied in style and content but it is safe to say they have made the thesis both possible and satisfying.

Dr. Luvuyo Ntombana, who served as supervisor, has offered encouragement and patient guidance from the beginning. His invitation to the fascinating literature of the religious studies accompanied by his fresh insights has been a continued catalyst.

Appreciation is also expressed to Prof. Louis Kretzschmar of the University of South Africa (UNISA) whose wealth of knowledge concerning Christian Leadership and Moral Formation proved valuable in my research.

The Soweto Ministers fraternal for being ready to assist where possible, and the contacted pastors for their time, resources and willingness to participate without any remuneration whatsoever, I am grateful.

Refilwe, my wife, for believing in me and supporting me through the good and the bad, the frustrating and the rewarding. She has had to endure my late-night studying, typing and printing even though she was tired from work, and in raising our three boys, Siphosethu, Lubabalo and Ntuthuko. I am blessed!

The congregation of Mamelodi Baptist Church and the officers of the Baptist Convention of South Africa, for allowing me to pursue my studies while serving them as a Pastor and a First-Vice President respectively. I am most grateful.

Numerous friends and colleagues have accompanied me throughout the different stages of this journey. Through thoughtful words and kind deeds they have taken my hand and steered me onward. Words on a page cannot express my appreciation to all of you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION.....	i
DEDICATION.....	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
ABBREVIATIONS	viii
ABSTRACT	ix
CHAPTER 1	1
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background to the study	1
1.3 Site of the research study	2
1.4 The value of the study	3
1.5 Problem statement	4
1.6 Aim and objectives of the study.....	5
1.6.1 Aim of the study	5
1.6.2 Objectives of the study	5
1.7 Main research questions	5
1.8 Design and methodology	6
1.9 Chapter outline.....	6
1.10 Conclusion	6
CHAPTER 2	8
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	8
2.1 Introduction	8
2.2 Qualitative research	8
2.3 Exploratory – descriptive research	9
2.4 Sampling population.....	9
2.4.1 Purposive sampling	10
2.5 In-depth interviews	11

2.6	Data analysis.....	12
2.6.1	Identifying biases and noting overall impressions.....	12
2.6.2	Review the data and focus the analysis	14
2.6.3	Coding the data and development of categories	14
2.6.4	Drawing conclusions.....	15
2.7	Ethical considerations	16
2.7.1	Informed consent.....	16
2.7.2	Right of privacy.....	16
2.7.3	Avoidance of harm to participants	17
2.8	Identifying biases and noting overall impressions	17
2.9	Validity and reliability.....	17
2.10	Research process.....	19
2.11	Conclusion	19
CHAPTER 3.....		20
NEWER PENTECOSTAL-CHARISMATIC CHURCHES.....		20
3.1	Pentecostal and Charismatic movements	20
3.2	South African Pentecostalism	23
3.3	The newer Pentecostal and Charismatic Churches	27
3.3.1	NPC leaders	27
3.3.2	NPCs leaders and their message.....	28
3.3.3	NPC Leaders and their socio-political involvement.....	28
3.3.4	NPC leaders on morality.....	31
3.4	Conclusion	33
CHAPTER 4.....		34
MORAL FORMATION.....		34
4.1	Introduction	34
4.2	The importance of morality.....	34
4.3	Moral formation from the developmental psychology	34

4.3.1	The psychoanalytic approach	35
4.3.2	The social-learning theory	35
4.3.3	The cognitive-structural theory	35
4.3.4	Criticism of Kohlberg's theory	38
4.4	Moral formation from Christian theology	41
4.4.1	Moral formation models	42
4.4.2	The five conversions of character formation	44
4.5	Conclusion	48
CHAPTER 5		49
STUDY FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS		49
5.1	Introduction	49
5.2	Findings of the study	50
5.2.1	Case studies	50
5.2.2	Categories identified	57
5.2.3	Calling to ministry	58
5.2.4	Mentorship	58
5.2.5	Theological training	59
5.2.6	Community involvement	59
5.3	Content analysis	60
5.3.1	Calling to ministry	60
5.3.2	Mentoring and affirmation	62
5.3.3	Theological training	65
5.3.4	Involvement in the community	68
5.4	Conclusion	69
CHAPTER 6		70
DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS		70
6.1	Discussion	70
6.2	Experience and cognitive	71

6.3	The media of moral formation	72
6.3.1	Moral exemplars	72
6.3.2	Moral action	74
6.3.3	Moral community	77
6.3.4	Moral education: incorporating ethics into spirituality	78
6.4	Recommendations	82
6.5	Directions for future research	83
6.6	Conclusion	84
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	86
	Appendix	98
	Interview Questions	98

ABBREVIATIONS

CICA	Christian Indigenous Churches Association
IFCC	International Federation of Christian Churches
NPC	Newer Pentecostal Church
SACC	South African Council of Churches

ABSTRACT

This study is a comprehensive investigation into moral formation of leaders among the Newer Pentecostal-Charismatic Churches (NPC). The NPCs are traditionally known to emphasise the importance of a transformed life (being 'born again') that results in moral integrity. However, contradiction arises when the leaders of Pentecostal-Charismatic Churches are associated with serious occurrences related to stories of immoral leadership. Lack of accountability, abuse of power and resources, followers being fed snakes, ordered to eat grass and consume petrol prompted the call for the regulation of religion and the investigation into religious abuse.

The study employed the exploratory phenomenological approach which includes open-ended questionnaires. Informants were youth pastors/leaders of various NPC around Soweto in Gauteng Province. The study was drawn to issues around the "calling into ministry", "Mentorship or assistance", "Theological versus other studies", and "involvement or lack of involvement in both the general and the Christian community". The findings of the study suggest that there is no specific and purpose-driven way of grooming and developing leaders within most of the Charismatic and Pentecostal churches. Moral formation was not being intentionally pursued, and that has a direct impact on the gap between what the young ministers believe ought to be (belief) and what they are expected to be doing (action). Consequently, young ministers venture into the world of ministry raw, with no theological/ pastoral education and with no proper guidance.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 Introduction

Kumalo (2014:224) observes the 'mega-church movement' as a growing form of Pentecostalism. Anderson (2002:1) refers to these churches as the "newer Pentecostal and Charismatic Churches" (NPCs), and are a rapidly growing form of African Christianity. The NPCs are characterised by large congregations and the dominant position of the charismatic founder (Kumalo 2014:224), who tends to be younger, and more formally educated (Anderson 1992, 2002:170). Their education is usually in other fields than Theology and among them there is no encouragement and emphasis of theological training as pre-requisite for ministry.

These churches are also well known for their emphasis and preaching on physical healing, spiritual gifts and speaking in tongues, prophecy, material prosperity with less emphasis on moral character and Christian lifestyle. Due to their emphasis on spirituality and miracles, not much is known of their stance on morality and moral formation of a leader. Consequently, this study conducts a comprehensive investigation into moral formation of leaders in the NPCs.

Moral leadership can be impacted by spiritual formation, healthy relationships (at home and church), and education. For example, among mainline churches and other evangelical churches like the Baptist, theological training is regarded as one of the pre-requisite for ministerial formation which involves character building of a leader. Consequently, this study also seeks to better understand among Charismatic Churches who do not necessary promote Theological training, how and where the moral character of a leader is molded and nurtured.

1.2 Background to the study

An acceptable definition of Pentecostalism encompasses classical Pentecostalism, the charismatic movement in the traditional churches, such as Roman Catholic and the indigenous churches that are not of Western origin (Khathide 2002:340). As noted above, the most recent type of Pentecostalism is newer Pentecostal-

Charismatic Churches (NPCs), mostly found in South Africa's urban Black townships (Anderson 1992:88), and they sometimes go by the names such as "ministries", "independent churches" or "fellowships".

The NPCs movement is of a more recent origin in Africa. Anderson writes that "in the 1970s, partly as a reaction to the bureaucratisation process in established churches, new independent Pentecostal and Charismatic churches began to emerge all over Africa" (2002:169). He adds that many of these vigorous new churches were influenced by the Pentecostal and Charismatic movement in Europe and North America and by established Pentecostal Mission Churches in Africa (Anderson 2002:169).

These churches are regarded as Pentecostal, because they too emphasise the power and the supernatural gifts of the Holy Spirit in the Church. Theologically, the NPCs, like most Pentecostal churches, are Christocentric and they emphasise the power of the Holy Spirit (Anderson 2002, Khathide 2002). Anderson (2002:171) observes a particular focus on personal encounter with Christ (being "born again"), long periods of individual and communal prayer, prayer for healing and for problems such as unemployment and poverty, deliverance from demons and the occult, the use of spiritual gifts such as speaking in tongues and prophecy.

Most of the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches also tend to have a younger, more formally educated, and consequently more westernised leadership and membership (Anderson 1992, 2002:170).

1.3 Site of the research study

The research is based in Soweto, an urban area of the city of Johannesburg in Gauteng, South Africa. Its name is an English syllabic abbreviation for "South Western Townships". Soweto came to the world's attention on 16 June 1976 with the Soweto Uprising, when mass protests erupted over the government's policy to enforce education in Afrikaans rather than English. The impact of the Soweto protests reverberated throughout the country and across the world.

Pentecostal movement as a predominantly oral community there has been a tendency in the movement itself not to produce material for academic consumption". He further observes that if Pentecostals do write, it is mostly for the nurturing of believers. Their material excels in apologetics and is designed to defend Pentecostal doctrine and practices. Therefore, there is a shortage of research and material on moral formation of the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic Churches. Thus the researcher decided to conduct an exploratory study of how NPCs morally form and train their leaders.

Its value for other social groups – the study has a potential of benefiting theological and pastoral students in universities and colleges of higher learning.

1.5 Problem statement

The main problem for this study arises from various recent immoral occurrences associated with Pentecostal, Charismatic and Evangelical churches in South Africa. That does not mean there has not been problems associated with other church denominations but the mentioned groups have been all over the news for all the wrong reasons. These churches have been associated with serious occurrences related to immoral leadership. Such included abuse of authority and resources, lack of and failure to account, church female followers told to worship naked, followers being fed snakes, ordered to eat grass and consume petrol.

As a result of such occurrences, the South African government is now even considering regulating churches. The Commission for the Promotion and Protection of the rights of Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Communities (CRL Rights Commission), has in fact launched an "investigation project" that looks into the commercialisation of religion and the abuse and exploitation of people's belief systems among others.

The call has received support even among some of the NPC's senior pastors such as Ray McCauley, of the biggest "mega church" in Gauteng. McCauley (Independent Newspapers 2015) went further by suggesting that all churches in general and NPCs in particular, should be regulated. He also made a call to the South African Council

of Churches (SACC), International Federation of Christian Churches (IFCC) and the Christian Indigenous Churches Association (CICA) to intervene and rectify the situation. Moral failure of church leaders has further led to debates of whether theological education is providing the right kind of formative training for leaders of the church (Gundani, Masenya, Maluleke and Phiri 2002:66 – 73).

Therefore, this study explores how the moral lives of leaders in these churches are formed.

1.6 Aim and objectives of the study

1.6.1 Aim of the study

The specific aim of this study is to conduct a comprehensive investigation into moral formation of leaders among the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches in Soweto. This study will seek to identify traditional and non-traditional processes involved in preparing pastors of these churches for ministry and in building their moral lives.

1.6.2 Objectives of the study

- To examine the meaning of morality and moral formation among NPCs;
- To better understand how leaders of NPCs are called, trained and nurtured;
- To examine how the spiritual background and nurturing or lack of nurturing impacts leadership styles of NPCs.

1.7 Main research questions

The study is guided by the following main research questions:

- How are leaders formed and developed within the Pentecostal-Charismatic churches?
- What aspects of morality are given more attention in the process of forming leaders?

1.8 Design and methodology

Full discussion of the research design and methodology followed in order to investigate the problem as formulated above is found in the second chapter. This study combines theoretical and empirical qualitative research methods.

1.9 Chapter outline

The next two chapters will focus on a theoretical overview: chapter two outlines the research methodology and the procedures followed in the study; it further explains the research method and the procedure that will be followed in conducting this study. The chapter addresses questions such as why the researcher chose the methodology, how the research will be conducted, and how will validity and reliability be achieved.

Chapter three introduces the reader to the Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements in general, then trace the beginnings of the movements in South Africa. The chapter will conclude with a focus on the newer Pentecostal and Charismatic churches in South Africa, their leaders, message and theology.

Chapter four will explore the importance of morality and attempt to explain moral formation from the developmental psychology with emphasis on the cognitive-structural theory of Kohlberg. The larger part of the chapter will be on moral formation from Christian theology. Moral formation models will be outlined.

Chapter five will provide a detailed description of the research findings. The final chapter will give an integrated discussion of findings, practical implications, limitations of the study and recommendations.

1.10 Conclusion

This chapter introduced the research by giving the aims and objectives, the research questions and the value of the study. A brief description of the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches is given; research limitations are acknowledged. It is also stated that the study combines both theoretical and empirical qualitative research methods.

CHAPTER 2

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

2.1 Introduction

This chapter outlines the research methodology and the procedures that were followed in conducting this study. As explained in the previous chapter, the central question of this research is concerned with moral formation of leaders, whether moral formation is being intentionally pursued or not? Consequently, investigate what factors are associated with moral formation and how these are or not being fostered among the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches.

2.2 Qualitative research

This research employs a small empirical study among the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches in Soweto Township, using a qualitative approach. This exploratory/descriptive phenomenological approach uses in-depth interviews.

Grobbelaar (2000:89) argues that qualitative research studies the object, namely, a person, within unique and meaningful human situations or interaction. An important aspect of this approach is that, often it is observation that generates the investigation.

Qualitative research is interested in understanding how people interpret their experiences, how they construct their worlds, and what meaning they attribute to their experiences. This tradition of research is lauded for strongly arguing the value of depth over quantity and it works at delving into social complexities in order to truly explore and understand the interactions, processes, lived experiences, and belief systems that are a part of individuals, institutions, cultural groups and even the everyday (O'Leary 2014:130; Dey 1993).

In summary, qualitative research involves immersion in the everyday life of the chosen setting for the study, valuing participants' perspectives of their worlds and seeking to discover those perspectives, viewing inquiry as an interactive process

between the researcher and the participant, being primarily descriptive and relying on people's words as the primary data.

2.3 Exploratory – descriptive research

Research can be exploratory, descriptive or explanatory in nature. This research is both exploratory and descriptive. It is exploratory because there is limited research done on the moral formation of the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic leaders in urban Black townships. Exploratory research investigates the “what” of the matter, but seldom gives a final answer, but what is important is that this type of research can help determine what further research can be done about the problem matter (Neuman 1997).

Neuman (1997:19 – 20) further explains that descriptive research aims at giving the specific details of a situation, and it seeks to determine “how” or “why” the phenomenon comes into being. Descriptive and exploratory research often overlap, as observed by Grobbelaar (2000). “Before a researcher can describe a phenomenon he or she should be clear about the main aspects that should be addressed. Often, therefore, a topic should first be explored before it can be described. The outcome of the investigation should be a detailed picture of the topic concerned” (Grobbelaar 2000:95).

In this study, the researcher found the exploratory – descriptive research method suitable since he intended to familiarise himself with basic facts around moral formation of leaders in newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches: what is being done to form moral leaders, and how is it being done.

2.4 Sampling population

The “target population” is the entire group of persons or set of objects the researcher intends to study. The focus of this research is on Christian leaders in newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches in Soweto. Pentecostal-Charismatics are identified and defined in the first chapter of this research. This study looks at the leaders in these churches, and to be specific, how are they being formed morally.

2.4.1 Purposive sampling

Sampling is the process of selecting elements of a population for inclusion in a research study. Sampling theory distinguishes between two basic sampling approaches: probability (random sampling) and nonprobability sampling (Bless and Higson-Smith 1995:88). This study adopts non-probability sampling procedure.

The reason for non-probability lies with the aim of the researcher, which is to generate a theory. Although there are no formal procedures for generalising from the 'sample' to the population, nonprobability sampling is appropriate where the researcher's aim

is to generate a theory and a wider understanding of social processes (Grobbelaar 2000:159). In non-probability sampling, the researcher's judgment is often used to select those subjects who have characteristics that are relevant to the research.

The non-probability approach will be purposive or judgmental sampling (Gilbert 1993:74). The researcher selects a sample that can be judged to be representative of the total population being investigated. This judgment is made on the basis of available information or the researcher's knowledge about the population (Grobbelaar 2000:159).

In an exploratory research, it is not possible to know the number of subjects needed in advance. Therefore, purposive sampling in a qualitative research enables the researcher to continuously sample until he or she can obtain no newer information.

Due to the overwhelming number of newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches in Soweto, a representative sample of no more than six people will participate. The researcher will purposely select at least six churches with young Christian leaders, thus, the research could possibly have more than six leaders as participants in the study. The principle of sample size (Neuman 1997:222) will apply; that is, the larger the population, the smaller the sampling ratio has to be for the sample to be accurate and the smaller the population, the bigger the sampling ratio has to be.

The churches were identified through the Soweto Ministers Fraternal (SOMIF). The researcher chose six research participants from the identified churches. Permission to collect information from participants and contact information for the participants was obtained from the SOMIF and voluntarily from the participants.

Participants were selected on condition that they were:

- Under the age of 40;
- Senior or assistant pastors in a newer Pentecostal-Charismatic church;
- Coming through the ranks of a newer Pentecostal-Charismatic church;
- In a church that has been in existence for at least five years;
- Available and willing to take part in the research without reward.

In addition, the research also sought to be gender sensitive; however, it proved difficult to find female senior pastors in these churches. Most women, who are pastors, do so as assistant or co-founders with their husbands.

2.5 In-depth interviews

This study uses one main data collection method: in-depth interviews. The advantage of an interview as a data collecting method is that it uses personal contact and interaction between the researcher and the respondent. In this study, the researcher preferred a face-to-face interview. This method has its challenges such as costs, and the possible biasness of the researcher; however, there are a number of advantages.

Face-to-face interviews are flexible; they can provide the researcher with detailed and fresh information that one may not have predicted or anticipated. Unclear questions can be clarified, as follow-up questions can be made immediately. An added advantage is that the researcher can develop a personal relationship with the interviewee for future reference. Lastly, in a face-to-face interview, nonverbal communication can be observed and noted (O'Leary 2014:203).

In-depth interviews specifically, differ from other face-to-face interviews conducted in a survey of a large population, because their main aim is to obtain detailed

information. O'Leary (2014:203) adds that, whereas a survey in which face-to-face interviews are used to collect answers, opinions, motivations or emotions as data, in-depth interviews delve into the reasons behind answers, opinions or emotions given.

The researcher, with permission of the interviewee, uses audio recorder to keep information from interviews. The interviewer was mainly present to record the information and to direct the flow of ideas and to intervene and ask questions (i.e., probe). This technique helps to clarify concepts and problems and allows for the establishment of a list of possible answers or solutions (See Appendix 8.1 for research questions).

2.6 Data analysis

The primary format of storing qualitative data is text-based (Neuman 1997:363). For this research, the text-based data is supplemented by audio recordings. These recorded files will be transcribed, from oral form to textual form, and translated to English where necessary.

Ratcliff (2008) identifies fifteen approaches to qualitative research. In this study, one approach to data analysis is considered: The typological/taxonomic analysis, which is an elaboration or the development of categories stage of preliminary analysis.

According to O'Leary (2014), typological data analysis involves identifying biases and noting overall impressions; reducing, organising, and coding your data; searching for patterns and interconnections; mapping and building themes; building and verifying theories; and drawing conclusions. However, there is no specific one way of analysing text data. This study follows and outlines a basic approach for analysing and interpreting narrative data, often referred to as content analysis.

2.6.1 Identifying biases and noting overall impressions

Qualitative research is non-linear in nature. Data collection and analysis often overlap (Puttergill 2000:246). Therefore, since interpretations are always entwined with a researcher's biases, prejudices, worldviews and paradigms both recognised, conscious and subconscious (O'Leary 2014:307), the researcher will list as many of

his assumptions and preconceived notions as possible. Having recognised the biases, one will carefully read through the data, and get the overall feel for the data as one looks holistically at the data.

2.6.2 Review the data and focus the analysis

The first step in analysis is to review what has been written or collected (Ratcliff 2008) throughout the research, and creating additional notes of clearly recalled but inadequately recorded details of what occurred. The researcher reads and re-reads the text and listens to the audio several times, writes down any impressions he has as he goes through the data. The researcher will also explain the limitations and level of analysis deemed appropriate given the available data in the report.

At this point, the researcher will identify a few key questions that the analysis should address. These will be written down as they will help in focusing the analysis. He organises the data by question to look across all respondents and their answers in order to identify consistencies and differences. This is often done with open-ended questions. He will analyse how all individuals responded to each question. He then puts all the data from each question together. Later, he may explore the connections and relationships between questions.

2.6.3 Coding the data and development of categories

Often, codes are just short abbreviations that stand for categories. The division between a code and a category is a bit arbitrary, and most of the time a code is also a category. In some cases, a code is an embryonic category; the code may 'grow up' to be part of something bigger (the category), but sometimes the code is already a category (Ratcliff 2008). In this research codes will be regarded as categories, and vice-versa.

A second step in qualitative data analysis is to determine the unit of analysis in the field notes (Ratcliff 2008). At this point, the analysis takes a line-by-line examination of all data sources. "This involves systematic drilling of the raw data in order to build up categories of understanding. The idea is to reduce your data and sort it into various themes" (O'Leary 2014:308). A phrase, sentence, or paragraph of field notes may be the unit being considered. This is the crux of qualitative analysis where the researcher will identify themes or patterns and organise them into coherent categories that summarise and bring meaning to the text.

The data will be assembled according to a particular theme or category. The researcher will assess the relative importance of different themes and highlight subtle variations. This will be done within a category or code description. That is, information will be summarised pertaining to one theme, capturing the similarities or differences in people's responses within a category.

One looks at the key ideas being expressed within the category – What are the similarities and differences in the way people responded, including the subtle variations? The researcher has a choice of starting with a list of themes or categories in advance, those from the literature and then searches the data for these themes. These themes may provide direction for what he looks for in the data. That means he identifies the themes before he categorises the data, and search the data for text that matches the themes.

Or, he may read through the text and find the themes or issues that recur in the data. These become his categories. They may be ideas he had not thought about. That allows the categories to emerge from the data. Categories are defined after he has worked with the data or as a result of working with the data. In this study, the researcher has chosen to use both the approaches, which means starting with some preset categories from the literature and adding others as they become apparent.

Abbreviated codes of a few letters, words or symbols may be assigned and placed next to the themes and ideas one find. This will help organise the data into categories. Coding is an ongoing activity throughout a research study, as new data may indicate the need to revise codes.

2.6.4 Drawing conclusions

Links are made between categories and themes are developed. The researcher uses themes and connections to explain the findings. Data is being interpreted, meaning and significance attached to the analysis.

O'Leary (2014:304) observes that "the main game of any form of analysis is to move from raw data to meaningful understanding". That demands balancing creativity and

focus. She warns, “we are not talking about airy-fairy metaphysical exploration. We are talking about science, with all protocols and rigour thereof... there is a real need for researchers to actively work between creativity and rigour. Creativity needs to be managed. You never want the cost of creativity to be credibility” (O’Leary 2014:304). The findings are synthesised and the outline of results is presented.

2.7 Ethical considerations

The proposal for the study, the research question and ethical form were assessed and approved by the Faculty of Theology research committee and ethical committee during the process of acquiring permission to conduct this research. Furthermore, the researcher sought to gain permission from the relevant authorities in the area of investigation. Permission was granted by the Soweto Minister’s Forum. Consequently, the researcher, in this study, has consulted all the relevant authorities in the host institution, and from the participants who are involved in the process of the research. Furthermore, as the researcher anticipates data collection, the researcher respected the participants’ site for research. The following ethical issues were considered:

2.7.1 Informed consent

Research participants were given consent letters. Such letters cover three requirements which relate to the person’s ability or competency, voluntariness and the actual information the researcher is trying to obtain. The participants were given the right to participate voluntarily and the right to withdraw their consent from participating further in the research at any time they wish to do so.

2.7.2 Right of privacy

The researcher undertakes not to publicly link a specific response or behaviour with a particular research participant. Confidentiality will be strictly observed and that the participants’ rights of privacy are not violated. Information about the participants that may be acquired during the research study will not be made available to others without the consent of the participant. Furthermore, the names of the participants are not disclosed.

2.7.3 Avoidance of harm to participants

The researcher has not put the participants at risk, by exposing them to physical, psychological, social, economic or legal harm.

2.8 Identifying biases and noting overall impressions

The researcher notes upfront his biases, prejudices, worldviews and paradigms – both recognised, conscious and subconscious. He is a firm believer in theological training. Having gone through the Baptist Convention College training programme, one may seek to impose his experiences of college life to the participants. Furthermore, the researcher is also a young pastor (36 years at the time of writing) in a congregational church. Congregationalists are democratic in handling church affairs. That may lead the researcher to advocate for a more inclusive leadership style. However, the researcher tried by all means to understand the world of Pentecostal-Charismatic young ministers as it is defined by the participants.

2.9 Validity and reliability

A research must be reliable and valid. That calls for honesty and respect. The researcher ought to be honest with himself or herself, honest with participants involved in the research and honest with the research community. According to Chenitz and Swanson (1986), validity and reliability are critical issues in evaluating research findings.

O'Leary (2014:64) tables credibility indicators as:

- i. Objectivity – conclusions based on observable phenomena; not influenced by emotions, personal prejudices or subjectivities.
- ii. Validity – concerned with truth value, i.e. whether conclusions are 'correct'. Also considers whether methods, approaches, and techniques actually relate to what is being explored.
- iii. Reliability – concerned with internal consistency, i.e. whether data/results collected, measured or generated are the same under the repeated trials.
- iv. Generalisability – whether findings and/or conclusions from a sample, setting or group are directly applicable to a larger population, a different setting or to another group.

- v. Reproducibility – concerned with whether results/conclusions would be supported if the same methodology was used in a different study with the same/similar context.

Credibility refers to establishing that the results of qualitative research are believable from the perspective of the respondents in the research. The researcher will rely on the various approaches in judging the credibility of this study.

First, the researcher enlists the assistance of colleagues. Burnard (1991) maintains that when researchers are generating patterns or themes from qualitative data, they can enhance the validity of categorisation method and guard against researcher bias by enlisting the assistance of a colleague. Conformability is a qualitatively orientated criterion for objectivity, this criterion refers to the degree to which the results could be confirmed or corroborated by others (Trochim 2001).

Secondly, Glaser and Strauss (1967) suggest the process of 'memoing', in that the researcher makes a note of key thoughts, hunches and lines of enquiry during data collection. These can serve as an audit trail (Guba and Lincoln 1989). Thirdly, the researcher undertakes to return to the participants in order to verify some of the research findings (Guba and Lincoln 1981). In case participants disagree on a point, the researcher will make sure to note that in the final analysis, and try by all means to use the direct words of the participants.

Lastly, Melia (1982) refers to the testing out/validation process that occurs in qualitative research where refining and checking the credibility of themes and categories that emerge in one interview can be verified in subsequent interviews. The researcher will check each participant against the other repeatedly, and compared and contrasted again and again. According to Corbin and Strauss (1990) making constant comparisons and asking questions, also assists the researcher in guarding against bias and achieving precision. The testing procedure will be utilised only until the end of analysis in selective coding.

2.10 Research process

The data will be collected, recorded and written. The researcher will read and re-read the text and listen to the audio several times. He will write down impressions as he proceeds through the data and note limitations, if any, to the research. The overarching research question for this study is: How are pastoral leaders developed within the contemporary Pentecostal/Charismatic Churches in Soweto? Consequently, the study will investigate what factors are associated with moral formation and how these are or not being fostered among the same Churches.

This work does not look at gender issues, even though it was clear that most of the pastors in the investigated churches were men. Also, the study concerns itself mostly with the pastor's church life. If it does overlap to personal life it will be in relation to ministry. Lastly, the researcher is aware that these young people, like most youth in Soweto, moral formation is clearly likely to have been shaped by the personal and structural violence of Apartheid, and that their current economic context may have contributed to their moral realities. However, this work will not enter that territory of research, but ask whether effort is put in place to foster moral formation.

The study interviewed not more than six pastors, however, due to the limited nature of the research study, and the fact that saturation was reached, only four pastors will be presented in chapter five.

2.11 Conclusion

This chapter has focused on research methodological procedures. The researcher will use qualitative research design since it provides richness, diversity and contextual depth. The exploratory and descriptive method with all the procedures to be followed was explained. The respectable research standards such as objectivity, reliability, validity, generalisability and reproducibility are considered.

CHAPTER 3

NEWER PENTECOSTAL-CHARISMATIC CHURCHES

This chapter introduces the Pentecostal-Charismatic movements in general, South African Pentecostalism in particular, with emphasis on the newer Pentecostal churches. The focus is on their theology and leadership as it relates to this study.

3.1 Pentecostal and Charismatic movements

The term 'Pentecostalism' refers to certain elements of the Christian life. Usually associated with the Feast of Pentecost and Christ's gift of the Holy Spirit. According to the Acts of the Apostles (Acts 2), the apostles received the full manifestation of the Holy Spirit through prayer. It is also evident that in Acts, charismatic activities were commonplace and were dynamically tailored to meet the needs of the moment. Therefore, everybody in the early church was a Pentecostal. The Pentecostal movement attempts to pattern church life according to the scriptural mode of the Acts of the Apostles in order to re-enact the power evident in the early church (Acts 2).

It all started on 1 January 1901, when Agnes Ozman, a student at the Rev. Charles Parham's Bible School at Topeka, Kansas, USA, after a day of prayer and fasting, felt urged to ask the director of the school to lay hands on her after the manner of the New Testament (Burgess et al 1988:2). Susana and De Petrella (1986:1) explain that the student testified that this prayer gave her an extraordinary and mysterious experience and she began to speak in new tongues. Subsequently, other students had the same experience and they began telling others about it wherever they went, and whenever they could.

The students encountered opposition and persecutions as they were equated to occult groups (Susana and De Petrella 1986:1). But on 9 April 1906, there was another Pentecostal outpouring in Los Angeles, California (Foster 1998:115). The charismatic experience of baptism in the Holy Spirit broke down frontiers and barriers and began to spread in an extraordinary way throughout the world (Susana and De Petrella 1986:1).

It is this history of a “Pentecostal movement from a Black working class church in a Black urban ghetto in early 20th century Los Angeles, which ghetto in turn was rooted in the American Black slave culture of the 19th century” (Anderson 1992:25) which is significant when studying the Pentecostal movement in the third world countries, especially South Africa.

Anderson (1992:25) says the identification of the origins of the Pentecostal movement with Azusa Street William Seymour means that Pentecostalism is identified with the poor and the oppressed, with non-racialism, and with reconciliation- but also with Black leadership, Black power and dignity.

Foster (1998:118 – 121) argues that Seymour stressed genuine Christian love above all else, when he exercised equality and acceptance of each person under God as potential participant in leadership, including women. The black holiness preacher, understood clearly the implications of glossolalia for interracial reconciliation and community.

Significantly, “the Azusa Street mission, and the revival movement, had at its centre a holy man” (Foster 1998:121), Seymour himself. Seymour was known as a man who lived a sanctified life, and this character attracted many to Pentecostalism.

News of the outpouring of the Holy Spirit spread across America and around the world, mainly by word of mouth. Walsh (1974:2) observes that modern Pentecostalism began in the 1900s among non-Catholic groups. These groups, rather than renewing their churches of origin, led to the formation of Pentecostal Churches and to what has been called a third force in Christianity (Walsh 1974:2).

However, as the Pentecostal movement was gaining momentum among the poor who were on the fringes of evangelical Christianity, inside mainline churches were those who desired a spiritual revival, and had interest in the Pentecostal experiences. These “charismatic” Christians received the Pentecostal blessing of baptism in the Spirit while remaining members of their own churches, even though

the term "charismatic" only gradually took over from "Pentecostal" and "neo-Pentecostal" in the late 1960s and early 1970s (Hocken 1981:36).

In the introduction section of the *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, Burgess and McGee (1988:1) write that "since the beginning of this century, Christianity has witnessed the emergence of two great renewal movements of the Spirit: the Pentecostal movement, beginning in 1901, and the charismatic movement that developed several decades later".

Differentiating between the two proves to be difficult, and the terms are often used interchangeably because they have many features in common. However, there are two approaches in differentiating between "Pentecostal" and "Charismatic" (Burgess and McGee 1988:1).

One is theological, which might be along doctrinal lines in particular Spirit baptism (also called the baptism in or of the Holy Spirit), which emphasises the present work of the Spirit through gifts in the life of the individual and the church. However, Pentecostals subscribe to a work of grace subsequent to conversion in which Spirit baptism is evidence by glossolalia (i.e. speaking in tongues). Charismatics however, do not always advocate either the necessity of a second work of grace or the evidence of glossolalia as an affirmation of Spirit baptism (Burgess and McGee 1988:1).

The other difference is ecclesiastical, especially concerning denominational affiliation. "Pentecostals" describe those participating in classical Pentecostal denominations such as the Assemblies of God, the Church of God in Christ etc. Charismatics would characterise persons outside these classical Pentecostal denominations whether they are within mainline denominations or are part of an independent group. The newer Pentecostal-Charismatics churches, discussed in this research have features of both Pentecostals and Charismatics.

Some features of Pentecostal churches include Baptism of the Holy Spirit as something separate from and subsequent to the baptism of water; healing by prayer;

a premium is placed on the book of Acts; emphasis on communion, friendship, care and interest for the members of the churches; faith seen as a personal encounter with Jesus and salvation as a concrete, social and pragmatic experience (Ehianu 2014).

Pentecostal-charismatics emphasise strongly personal and community holiness. As it is seen in the following discussion on South African Pentecostalism.

3.2 South African Pentecostalism

The origins and growth of Pentecostalism in Africa are part of a complex story. Onyinah (2007:307) observes that some of the classical Pentecostal churches were originally established under the auspices of foreign Pentecostal missions. Others were initiated by the indigenous people who had come into contact with gospel tracts that shared the Pentecostal experience and practices.

In Africa in general, African Initiated Churches (AIC) were the first reaction against missionary Christianity in Africa. These churches blended the Bible and the whole spectrum of African tradition and religion in their worship. This appealed to many adherents. However, according to Onyinah (2007:307), AIC's "weaknesses, such as the lack of a theological framework and accountability from the ministers, caused a decline and eventually paved the way for the popularity of the classical pentecostal churches" in Africa.

Nkurunziza (2013:60) further observes that the growth of Pentecostalism in Africa is significantly linked to the way Pentecostals, by means of their spirituality, have attempted to deal with Africans' problems and fears. "These include sickness, poverty, unemployment, loneliness, and more importantly the issues of evil spirits and witchcraft which remain prevailing beliefs in Africa" (Nkurunziza 2013:60).

In South Africa, the Pentecostal Mission began in the first decade of the twentieth century (Watt and Saayman 2003:318), among the extremely poor (Khathide 2002:342). "There existed what proved to be a favourable economic/socio-political/spiritual ecology among the poor in which it could take root and would eventually thrive" (Watt and Saayman 2003:318).

Watt and Saayman (2003) observe that at the time, the country had just emerged from the devastation of the South African War, 1899 – 1902. Many families had been socially and economically dislocated and marginalised. “Their living conditions on the fringes of society were terribly hard and they needed a spirituality to help rebuild their lives. Pentecostal preachers found in these disinherited people a ready audience and a social stratum where they enjoyed extraordinary success” (Watt and Saayman 2003:318).

According to Anderson (1992:7), in South Africa, there are at least three distinct types of African Pentecostal Churches:

1. Pentecostal Mission Churches, so called because of their origins in predominately White ‘mission’ churches, and also sometimes known as ‘Classical Pentecostal Churches’. These churches include *Apostolic Faith Mission* (AFM), *Assemblies of God* (AOG) and the *Full Gospel Church* (FGC).
2. Independent Pentecostal Churches, churches which have exclusively black leadership and are independent of white control; these have risen during the eighties. These Churches include *Grace Bible Church* in Soweto and *Victory Fellowship* of Kwa-Thema. Some of these Churches are a break away from the Pentecostal Mission Churches (Anderson 1992:10).
3. Indigenous Pentecostal-type, also known as ‘Spirit-type’ churches or ‘Zionist-type’ churches, belonging to the more general category of African Independent Churches, and including, amongst others, most indigenous churches which have the words ‘Zion’ or ‘Apostolic’ in their names. These Churches include *Zion Christian Church* (ZCC) and *St John Apostolic Faith Mission*, and they are by far the biggest grouping of black churches in southern Africa (Anderson 1992:11).

In South Africa, modern Pentecostalism owes a great deal to the astonishing revivals under the ministry of Andrew Murray, Jr, (De Gruchy 2005:5). “Murray’s teaching on the baptism of the Holy Spirit as a second experience in the process of salvation,

and the healing of the sick are important features that later became the hall marks of Pentecostalism” (Watt and Saayman 2003:319).

Khathide (2002:343) agrees as he tables two factors that were crucial to the growth and development of Pentecostalism. The first and the most crucial factor in the growth of Pentecostalism is its emphasis on experience. The paramount commitment experience in Pentecostalism is a personal conversion to Jesus Christ as Lord and Savior, and secondary to that is the “glossolalia” (Gerlach and Hine 1968:25-26).

Another key factor in the rapid growth of Pentecostalism is the experience of signs and wonders. “The manifestations of healings and miracles, some of which may be questionable, are believed by Pentecostals to be critical for understanding the growth of the movement” (Khathide 2002:348).

In summarising the critical success factors at the centre of Pentecostalism, Watt and Saayman (2003:322) point out (1) evangelistic zeal, with strong emphasis on liberation (the sinned against are sinners too); (2) spirit baptism and the idea of the gift of enabling power; (3) the priesthood of every believer, the open liturgical structure of a Pentecostal meeting emphasising the participation and giftedness of all (4) the holistic nature of Pentecostalism, including healing and deliverance in a comprehensive process of liberation; and (5) a strong sense of community.

One would also add the emphasis on morals among the Pentecostals. Mofokeng (2012:148), for example, writes that African Independent Churches are well known for their strong emphasis on strict moral observance. “Before baptism, the convert is examined by the elders of the church to ensure that his or her moral behaviour is without fault. On the day of their baptism, before the rite is performed, converts must confess their sins” (Mofokeng 2012:148).

Pentecostals teach church members to abhor adultery, fornication, crime, bribery, corruption, and to abstain from smoking and alcohol. To keep a ‘holy life’ members are encouraged to pray, fast (Mofokeng 2012:148) and fellowship with like-minded believers.

Writing on the impact of an African Pentecostal on South African Society, Anthony Balcomb (2005:342) notes how newspapers reported on the impact that Nicholas Bhengu had on crime in various parts of the country. Bhengu and other Pentecostals preached repentance from sin and encouraged people to a holy living. The Reverend stood on the pulpit and said “crime does not pay, surrender your arms and yourselves to God”. People brought knives, blackjacks, brass knuckles and quantities of stolen goods. Nicholas Bhengu, saw himself as living a holy life (Balcomb 2005:342 – 343).

Indeed, the impact of Pentecostals and Charismatic movements has changed the face of Christianity around the world and ushered in a new era of Christian spirituality. However, there are some potential pitfalls. Richard Foster (1998:130) mentions few. The first peril is the danger of trivialisation. One notices how Pentecostal-Charismatics can quickly turn signs and wonders into superstition and magic religion. Without thinking, some people often focus on the gift rather than the Giver of the gift.

The second peril is the danger of rejecting the rational and the intellectual. The emphasis of the Pentecostal-Charismatic churches is on the emotive side of faith, and in most cases with the neglect of mind and reason. The third peril is the danger of divorcing the gifts of the Spirit from the fruit of the Spirit (Foster 1998:130 – 131). It is possible to move in the realm of ‘spiritual gifts’ (the doing or experience) without the maturing that the ‘fruit of the Spirit’ (the being or the character) brings.

The last peril is the danger of linking ones walk in the Spirit to highly speculative end-time scenarios that lack theological foundation (Foster 1998:131). That is, over reliance on visions and prophecy may isolate the Pentecostal-Charismatics from day-to-day occurrences such as social justice. Perhaps this explains why a movement that started with the poor and the marginalised, is now seen as being irrelevant in most communities.

3.3 The newer Pentecostal and Charismatic Churches

The subjects of investigation in this study, is what Anderson terms as the “newer Pentecostal-Charismatic Churches” (NPCs), found in South Africa’s urban Black townships (Anderson 1992:88). According to Anderson’s classifications, they fall under the Independent Pentecostal Churches banner, as noted in the first chapter. These churches sometimes go by the names such as “ministries”, “independent churches”, “fellowships” or “mega-churches”.

One of the leading African Initiated Churches scholars, Allan Anderson (2002) makes a valid point that Pentecostal Churches of western origin, which have operated in Africa for most of the twentieth century, trace their historical origins to the impetus generated by the Azusa street revival. The connections between this classical Pentecostal movement and the African Initiated Churches have been amply demonstrated (Anderson 1992:22 – 24).

Anderson’s argument is that the newer Pentecostal and Charismatic movement is not fundamentally different from the Holy Spirit movements and the so-called ‘prophet-healing’ and ‘spiritual churches’ that preceded it in the African Initiated/Independent Churches, but it is a continuation of them in a different context (Anderson 2002).

3.3.1 NPC leaders

A brief profile of leaders in NPCs would suffice here. These churches initially, tended to have a younger, more formally educated, and consequently more westernised leadership and membership, including young professionals and middle class urban Africans (Anderson 2002:170). They are generally led by charismatic men, who are respected for their preaching and leadership abilities (Anderson 1992:65). NPC pastors are influential and their attitudes are likely to rub off on their followers. They can profoundly shape the thinking and behaviour of their members.

Examples of NPCs include Mosa Sono, senior pastor of the *Grace Bible Church* in Soweto. He was born in 1961 in Johannesburg and was raised and educated in Soweto. He attended African Faith Mission Central Bible College and Ray

McCauley's Rhema Bible Training Centre in Randburg where he completed a two-year diploma (Anderson 2000:76). The second one is Agankitse Wanka Mogale of *Grace Bible Church* in Garankuwa, went to the University of Fort Hare from 1979 to 1982, where he graduated with a Bachelor of Commerce Degree. Wanka's brother, Batshabeng Mogale of *Divine Hope Bible Centre* in Mabopane, attended the University of Fort Hare and graduated with a Bachelor of Administration. Also, Victor Mokgotlhoa of *Praise Tabernacle Church* in Soshanguve attended Hebron Teacher's College, and later dropped out of his Bachelor of Science degree from the University of Fort Hare.

3.3.2 NPCs leaders and their message

It is observable that these church leaders sometimes travel the continent and intercontinentally, and some produce glossy booklets and broadcast radio and television programmes. They are often linked to wider international networks of independent charismatic preachers, some of which, but by no means all, are dominated by North Americans (Anderson 2002:170) and Nigerians. Most of these leaders are known for preaching the gospel of prosperity, although some like Mosa Sono do so with caution (Anderson 1992:54). Kumalo (2014:224) notes that "central to their message are phrases such as "God's favour", "inheritance", "winners", "conquerors", "the seasons of abundance", "breakthrough", "destiny", "protection", "blessing", "anointing", "abundance", "victory", and "power".

3.3.3 NPC Leaders and their socio-political involvement

On political views, historically, the church through its umbrella body, the South African Council of Churches (SACC) was involved in the community (De Gruchy 2005), playing a major role in addressing many political and social issues (Mabitsela 2003:13), by standing for the truth in solidarity with the poor and the oppressed of South Africa (Soeldner 1989:16 – 19). However, Pentecostal-Charismatic Churches have been seen to be on the sidelines, disconnecting their members from social engagement (Kumalo 2014) due to their generally fundamentalist and dispensationalist theology (Soeldner 1989).

Anderson (2000:77) observes the same reluctance. He writes that when it comes to socio-political issues, Mosa Sono is reluctant to be involved in controversy. He is wary of preachers (especially white charismatics) who stand up and propagate an ideology that has no biblical basis. For most Pentecostals and charismatics, political involvement adds no value to their quest for transforming the world for Jesus.

Balcomb (2005:338) writes of Nicholas Bhengu, one of the respected Pentecostals in South African townships, that he “clearly became disillusioned with the possibility of a political solution to the problems of South Africa and when he became converted to Christ he became convinced that the Gospel was the answer”. Even though Bhengu, instilled self-confidence in Black people, and encouraged equality and unity with the whites, “he did not challenge the status quo; in fact, he was described by African nationalists as a ‘sell-out’... he believed that political activity was futile; and he forbade his members any political affiliation. He believed that liberation would only come from God” (Dubb 1976; Anderson 1992:47).

One may also ask: Could not the fact that the emphasis of Pentecostal-Charismatics was on individualism, be the additional reason for reluctance to get involved in communal socio-economic issues? Khathide (2002) is of the opinion that “because of its intense preoccupation with individuals, Pentecostalism has found it theologically difficult to be concerned about issues affecting societies at the socio-political and economic level”. Of course with the exception of few, including the Reverend Frank Chikane (Chikane 1988).

Chikane lambasted Pentecostal-Charismatics, saying their spirituality “did not address the source of this country’s social abnormalities. It was more of a survival strategy of the victims of society than a strategy to end the victimisation” (Chikane 1988:33; Anderson 1992:34). Keith Warrington (2009), a Pentecostal-charismatic theologian warns that the emphasis upon the experience of the Spirit as benefiting the individual needs to be broadened to include empowering the believer to live in the community of the church and as part of that body to serve the surrounding world.

Recently, Kumalo (2014:225) concludes that “normally, the political views of the founder of the church determine the teaching and attitude of the church towards politics. These vary from church to church. Some take an apolitical stance; others can be overly partisan. Some promote the ambitions of the leader of the church. Politically, therefore, the political impact of these churches varies”.

3.3.4 NPC leaders on morality

On morality, NPC's leaders, like all the Pentecostals have clearly defined ethical codes, even though not written: they are opposed to polygamy, beer drinking and smoking tobacco, use of symbolic objects such as staffs, water, ropes and papers in healing practices. According to Shafranske (1996), church groups establish codes of conduct that regulate individual and social behaviour. With such emphasis on morality, one is bound to ask the reasons for various recent immoral occurrences associated with leaders among the NPC's. That does not mean that there have not been moral failures among other church denominations but the mentioned group has been all over the news for all the wrong reasons.

For example, a KwaZulu-Natal married pastor, whose girlfriend leaked a video showing the naked pastor; or a pastor in Pretoria who fed his congregants grass and petrol. A popular 36-year-old artist and pastor had allegedly promised one of his former backing vocalists, from his native Soweto that he would marry her but ended up opting for a businesswoman in a bid to marry for the third time.

A *Sowetan* newspaper Journalist, Zenoyise Madikwa, asks in her article whether the church has gone soft on "sin" or immorality. She writes:

we have read with disbelief stories of alleged fornication and divorce about charismatic leaders such as Rhema Bible Church Pastor Ray McCauley, Malibongwe Gcwabe, Jabu Hlongwana, Xola Nzo, Prophet Mboro, Benjamin Dube and Keke Phoofolo among others. And it is business as usual for them... Their ministries are still strong (Sowetanlive 2012).

She further quotes Pastor Vusi Dube, the senior founding pastor of the Ethekwini Community Church, who confirms that "marital infidelity and divorce among the clergy was growing at an alarming rate and pastors were getting away with sin" (Sowetanlive 2012). Dube attributes this to the lack of accountability in churches.

There are many stories of immoral leadership, which include abuse of authority, resources and failure to account. In fact, lack of accountability is a sign of the abuse of power. Anderson notes that Pentecostal-Charismatic Churches are highly

patriarchal in leadership and their leaders tend to make unilateral decisions based on the 'leading of the Spirit' (Anderson 2002:86). These leaders have absolute power, and absolute power has a tendency to abuse absolutely. Most of the problems already mentioned have been associated with leaders of these churches and most of them are young people below the age of 40. These developments raise question of how the moral lives of leaders in these churches are formed.

There is wide literature on how various churches train their ministers as preparations for moral leadership (Naidoo 2012; Harold 2012). For example, Baptists believe that a person must first be born again and their Christian character must attest to that; the person must also receive a call and this call must be affirmed by others more especially his/her local pastor and congregation (Matshiga 2001:65, Rinquest 2012:75 –90). Furthermore, in the Baptist congregations, before a person can attend theological training, they must be interviewed by the local church and regional leadership. Even after the completion of their studies they must serve as probationers for two years before ordination.

A somewhat similar process is followed by Methodists and Presbyterian (Naidoo 2012:91 – 105), who both take the recommendation of the residing minister very serious prior to admitting a person to be a pastor. Also among Presbyterians and Methodist a person has to follow all due process such as becoming a youth leader and joining the official preachers group which include taking lessons on preaching and church doctrine.

In the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches, a form of 'spiritual formation' coaching is always given (Pohlmann 2012:193), where in order to receive 'baptism with the holy Spirit' a person must be a believer in Jesus, come in a humble attitude of prayer and then preferably other Spirit-filled believers to assist them by laying on of hands. Is the laying of hands enough to empower one to lead a moral life? Does accepting Jesus Christ as Lord and Savior or "being born again" automatically make one righteous or lead a moral life?

3.4 Conclusion

This chapter sketches the development of the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements as an attempt to pattern church life according to the scriptural mode of the Acts of the Apostles in order to re-enact the power evident in the early church. Although the movement started among the students in USA, in South Africa, the twentieth century economic/socio-political/spiritual ecology among the poor offered a favourable context for the growth of Pentecostal and Charismatic mission. Lately, the movement has totally transformed, focusing largely on middle class, and preaching the “prosperity gospel”. However, the movement is characterised by significant number of moral failures among the leaders. This leads one to ask questions around the moral formation of Pentecostal and Charismatic young leaders. Is morality necessary for the formation of leaders in these churches?

CHAPTER 4

MORAL FORMATION

4.1 Introduction

The newer Pentecostal-Charismatic church, especially the young leadership, faces the challenge of living a life of integrity, one that is consistent with the claimed identity of being a Christian, a Pentecostal-Charismatic for that matter. Moral beliefs and behaviour are not always consistent with claims of being a Christian. When NPC's leaders are not morally upright, they will not be able to disciple others. Furthermore, when church people in general are immoral, Christian faith becomes irrelevant.

This chapter introduces the concept of moral formation, its importance and the relevant theories.

4.2 The importance of morality

In his article, "Morality and Life", Andre van Niekerk (1998:13) argues that morality is important for three reasons. First, it provides an orientation to life for individuals. It is a map to find our way in life. Secondly, morality is the fabric of society, providing the structure and glue that keeps society healthy and functional. Ethics thus holds things together. Thirdly, he says morality is indispensable for the future of life. It helps us to make difficult decisions now in order that life will improve in the future. In short, morality is essential to aspects of life.

4.3 Moral formation from the developmental psychology

Moral formation (development), as a concept, points to the fact that human beings are not born morally mature, and suggests that people grow morally through a sequence of more or less gradual changes (MacQuarrie 1967:396). O'Connell (1998:2) observes the renewed appreciation for the reality of human moral development. "This appreciation is exemplified by, and nurtured by, the field of developmental psychology and, as a component of that field, by models of human development" (O'Connell 1998:45). There are several such models summed up by three major approaches to moral development (see MacQuarrie 1967:396-397).

4.3.1 The psychoanalytic approach

Sigmund Freud (1856-1939), the father of psychoanalysis, developed his theory over a period of about 47 years (Meyer, Moore, Viljoen 2003). For Freud, all the individual's behaviour and thoughts are determined by factors within the personality (psyche). The psyche has a fixed structure (id, ego and superego) which is motivated by psychic energy in the form of drives leading to action. Some of the drives (sex and aggression) clash with the norms of society and for this reason they are repressed. Repressed drives create psychological problems. The forbidden drives are already present in the early years of childhood. The methods the child learns for coping with the conflict between forbidden drives and societal norms have a definite influence on the rest of his/her life. Although Freud's theory allows for social factors, it is often labelled as a biological determinism, meaning that he takes the view that the behaviour of the individual and his development are determined by biological factors (Meyer et al. 2003).

4.3.2 The social-learning theory

Alfred Adler was the first to give adequate attention to the social dimension of human existence (Meyer et al. 2003). Karen Horney, Erich Fromm and Harry Sullivan expanded Adler's work. Socially oriented psychoanalysts rejected the biological determinism of Freudian thinking. Instead, they emphasise the role of social and cultural factors in the development of personality. These theorists understand morality "to involve learned cognitive and behavioral patterns... morality is learned directly through rewards and punishments which condition cognitions and behavior, as well as through imitation of models which provide indirect cues as to what behavior does or does not have positive consequences. Development takes place through training" (Macquarrie 1967:396-397).

4.3.3 The cognitive-structural theory

Cognitive-structural theory will receive an extra overview, especially Kohlberg's theory, because the models in this theory focus on broad range of human functioning and they suggest directly or indirectly potential strategies to address moral failures in leadership.

4.3.3.1 Kohlberg

Jean Piaget work, *The Moral Judgement of the Child*, first published in 1932 is the classic scholarly resource for moral educational theory. Piaget studied moral development in children ranging in age from 6 through 12 by presenting them with moral dilemmas, as well as observing them play. Based on their responses and his observations, he suggested two stages of moral development: moral realism and autonomy. Children develop from heteronomous morality to autonomous morality.

Early on, children operate according to rules prescribed by authority figures. As they grow older, they begin to equate justice with equality and then equity. In other words, as children develop, they define moral judgment as rule-following, treating everyone the same. He believed children's behaviour and interactions with others, sometimes led them to new moral understandings.

Subsequently, Lawrence Kohlberg expanded Piaget's theory and proposed a cognitive-developmental theory of moral reasoning, which suggested that moral principles were universal (Kohlberg 1981:3). Kohlberg suggested six stages of moral development through which persons proceed in a predictable fashion. These stages are characterised by ways of 'knowing' what is moral and what is not. They are developmental stages in moral understanding (O'Connell 1998:7).

Kohlberg's (1981) theory of moral development describes the principle of justice and its development over time as individuals interact with their environment. His theory includes six stages within three levels of moral thinking. These three levels are the pre-conventional level (stages 1 and 2), the conventional level (stages 3 and 4), and the post-conventional level (stages 5 and 6). Kohlberg (1981, 1987) suggested that individuals move sequentially through each stage until they reach stage 6. Individuals in this stage, they attempt to develop principles that are universal and that remain constant among cultures.

The majority of people reach stage 3 or 4, but few proceed to stages 5 and 6. Kohlberg (1987) asserted that individuals cannot move backward after reaching the

next stage and that no stage can be passed over. Each new stage contains elements of an earlier stage, and individuals may stop at any stage. In addition, age does not dictate an individual's stage of moral development (Kohlberg, 1981). According to Kohlberg (1987), it takes approximately five years for an individual to move through one stage. Moral maturity is determined by the reasons an individual give for why something is right or wrong (Kohlberg and Turiel, 1971).

For the purposes of this study, a leader's capacity to make moral choices is related to the individual's level of moral development. In fact, Kohlberg theory suggests one reason for immoral behaviour in leaders as their inability to develop morality without challenging their own reasoning. The following are Kohlberg's levels:

Preconceived level

At this level, individuals are egocentric and concerned with receiving external rewards and avoiding punishments. They obey authority and follow rules to avoid detrimental personal consequences or satisfy immediate self-interests. The basic orientation towards the world is one of taking what one can get. Someone with this orientation in a leadership position would tend to be autocratic toward others and use the position for personal advancement. At this level people are greatly influenced by authority figures, therefore a leader needs a respected model or mentor, someone who will monitor them and hold them accountable. For this study, one may ask questions around mentorship and accountability among the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches.

Conventional level

At this level, people learn to conform to the expectations of good behaviour as defined by colleagues, family, friends and society. People follow the rules, norms and values in the societal, church or denominational culture. If the rules are not to steal, cheat, make false promises, or violate communal laws, a person at this level will attempt to obey. People at the conventional level adhere to the norms of the larger social system. If the social system says it is good to be successful at the expense of integrity and honesty, they will usually go along with that norm also.

Leaders go along with the culture. If the country has a high rate of corruption, these leaders tend to reflect that culture. Such leaders understand fairness in relation to their own needs, not the needs of others. Questions around what is acceptable in terms of behaviour among the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches could assist in determining some of the reasons behind moral failures, because at this level an individual is most concerned about the approval of others.

Post-conventional level

At this level, a leader is guided by an internalised set of principles universally recognised as just and right. People may even disobey rules or laws that violate these principles. These internalised values become more important than the expectations of other people in the church or the community. A leader at this level is a visionary, empowering and committed to serving others and a high cause. The leader balances concern for self with concern for others and the common good, and acts in an independent and moral manner.

4.3.4 Criticism of Kohlberg's theory

Kohlberg's work has had a major impact. His theory has enriched our thinking about how morality develops, has supported an association between cognitive maturity and moral maturity, and has stimulated much research and other theories of moral development. However, Kohlberg has received some criticism.

Kohlberg's former student, Carol Gilligan, challenged his methodology in developing his theory. She did not feel that hypothetical moral dilemmas were accurate representations of the way people grappled with right and wrong in their everyday lives (Gilligan 2004:132). Secondly, she questioned Kohlberg's sample, for he had used mostly men, causing Gilligan to wonder if the resulting theory could accurately represent the moral development of women (Gilligan 2004:132).

Gilligan eventually developed an alternative theory, which was intended to give women a voice. She does deserve credit for introducing some practical real world considerations to the study of moral development. She has made an important

contribution in calling attention to the value of caring and to the need, at times, to live with contradictory moral principles.

However, Gilligan made the same mistake as Kohlberg in emphasising a certain specific value ('justice' for Kohlberg and 'care' for Gilligan). Kretzschmar (2006:10) quoting Spohn (1998), laments that other moral values such as community, honesty, courage and prudence are equally important and not reducible to care and impartiality.

Furthermore, Kohlberg's theory has caused some uneasiness among Christian academics. Wolterstorff (1980) and Vitz (1983) object to Kohlberg's emphasis on the form of moral reasoning rather than on the content of moral behaviour. "They say the stages lack empirical confirmation especially at the post-conventional level, and they criticise Kohlberg for adopting the humanistic assumption that morality develops from within the self rather than being learned by external authority" (Clouse 1985:196).

Kretzschmar (2006:10) agrees that Kohlberg's approach reveals an over-dependence on reason and cautions that morality cannot be achieved by reason alone. "Human reason is not autonomous because people are influenced often unconsciously, by the context in which they live, causing them to arrive at different moral conclusions" (Kretzschmar 2006:10).

Christian writer Susan Johnson (see Kretzschmar 2006:11), has also raised understandable concerns regarding Kohlberg's emphasis on stage and system. Besides being influenced by other people in a social context, moral development is far from being systematic. Christians, as Kretzschmar argues, open themselves to the transformation effected by "walk in the spirit" (Galatians 5:16). Therefore, Kohlberg's morality and Christian morality are diametrically opposed (Clouse 1985:196).

Criticism, and perhaps pain and suffering which resulted in him committing suicide in 1987, led Kohlberg to work on the seventh stage to his theory (Kohlberg and Ryncarz 1990:192). Importantly, Snarey (1995:279) observes Kohlberg's strong

interest in faith that is “in how men or women find meaning or purpose in their lives, often within the context of a religious tradition”. The seventh stage moves beyond considerations of justice. In this stage, adults reflect on the question, “why be moral? Why be just in a universe that appears unjust?” the answer, as Kohlberg suggested, lies in achieving a cosmic perspective, which is a sense of unity with the “cosmos, nature or God” (Kohlberg and Ryncarz 1990:192).

The development of stage 7 is a real shift in Kohlberg thinking, since he earlier noted that moral development and religious belief are not related (Kohlberg 1981:303). He was particularly impressed with the fact that people who have exemplified mature (stage 6) moral reasoning and behaviour, such as Socrates, Ghandi, Martin Luther King Jr., and Mother Theresa, have been people of “deeply religious” faith (Kohlberg 1974:11).

Even though it is out of scope for this study to argue on the relationship of religion (in this case, Christian religion) and moral reasoning, there has been research around the correlation of the two. Brown and Annis (1978) reported a significant positive correlation between moral judgment and literal scriptural belief in undergraduate psychology students. For example, in two doctoral dissertations in which high school students were the subjects, moral reasoning was found to be positively related to religious knowledge (O’gorman 1979), and to religious education (Stoop 1979/1980). Kohlberg (1973) suggested that further study of adult development will depend on the use of more holistic, inclusive and integrated models that attempt to define aspects of human personality and development that are more intangible and dynamic. Interestingly, Kohlberg (1974) offered James Fowler’s model of faith development as an example (Snarey 1991:281).

Kohlberg’s theory, which focused on child moral development, has been helpful in many areas of developmental studies; however its application to adults’ moral formation raises a question (Kretzschmar 2006:11). To assist, Spohn (1988) suggested an approach that focuses on moral development as something that is occurring not only in the past, but also in the future. An example is the approach of Aristotle and Christian theology.

4.4 Moral formation from Christian theology

Moral formation for Christians involves the development of virtues and character to express Christian norms and values (Best & Robra 1997: 55-56). This means that the spiritual encounter of a believer with God cannot be separated from the resultant moral formation of that believer. In essence, moral formation is conversion, not conversion as a once-off affair, but an ongoing process of becoming like Christ which affects the attitudes, character and actions of the believer.

Kretzschmar (2009) explains better the three crucial elements in Christian moral development: grace, choice and application. Moral development for Christians does not come purely as the result of their own efforts and struggle. For Christians, human beings cannot live a fully moral life without God's intervention and help. Moral formation is therefore a gift of grace from God in Christ Jesus (Ephesians 2:8 – 10).

Therefore, grace comes first, then followed by works. "The person who accepts, follows and lives in the company of Jesus is increasingly enabled to live according to not just the letter, but also the spirit of the law (Matthew 5:17:30), and is thus enabled to fulfil the intent of God in their life" (Kretzschmar 2009:29).

The second element of moral formation is that it is a choice. Kretzschmar (2009) is right that a human being's choice determines who they will become, and quite often what people choose destroys them and others. Therefore, Christians can learn to train their desires, by learning to cooperate with God by repeatedly choosing the good and thereby forming moral identity and character (Vest 2000:59, 62). Kretzschmar writes that "the desires of the human heart need to be changed by God (Jeremiah. 31:31-34). Instead of anger, people can choose compassion, instead of greed, generosity, and instead of lust, self-control. Thus, if we learn to desire the right things, we will act in moral ways" (2009:30).

The last essential is the application of the Christian ethic to life. Johnson says "one cannot become a Christian without learning to pray, to confess and repent, to search scriptures, or to seek justice for the socially cast off" (1989:28). Kretzschmar agrees

that once the life of God in the believer has taken root, “the moral teaching of Aristotle is helpful. He taught that moral (or immoral) attitudes and behaviour develop as the result of repeated action” (2009:30). However, one needs not confuse morality with moralism or legalism. Moralism is superficial goodness that is often hypocritical and false. It focuses on acts that appear to be good but are not backed up by an inner righteousness. Moralists are judgmental and legalistic (Kretzschmar 2004:22).

In advising on how Christian character is formed, Macquarie (1967) agrees with Johnson in saying a Christian virtue is acquired “by practicing the Christian life” of prayer, fasting and meditation. He adds that a number of the virtues, such as compassion, truthfulness, hospitality, gentleness is behavioural, and the obvious strategy is to perform actions exemplifying these virtues. In addition, the self-management virtues such as patience, forbearance, self-control, perseverance, must be put to practice in Christian action, and be perused through prayer and meditation.

4.4.1 Moral formation models

Because Christian character is an intricate web of the different types of virtues, Macquarie (1967) says “training in the Christian life involves an interconnected variety of disciplines”. Kretzschmar’s recent article on “Moving from moral failure to moral excellence” (2015), concurs that because of individuality of persons and their contexts, “a multiplicity of methods needs to be built into any approach to moral formation” (2015:3).

One of the models is that of Oliver (2013). Reflecting on “Teaching Open Distance Learning to undergraduates in Theology to become effective change agents”, Oliver (2013) encourages the use of the R2D2 multifaceted teaching method that includes ‘Reading’, ‘Reflecting’, ‘Displaying’ (using visual and other sensory means) and ‘Doing’. This teaching tool stimulates and engages students in creative learning as it encourages the application of theological learning to their attitudes and behaviour.

There are other models of Christian moral formation such as the recent model of Mwambazambi and Banza (2014), who suggested the “Four dimensional conversion process” in which African churches can follow in their discipleship in order to develop

strong, mature and spiritual Christians who would also become spiritual leadership in their communities (2014:2). They argue that real transformation of an individual, can only happen when there is religious conversion, intellectual conversion, moral conversion, and political conversion. They provide practical and intentional ways that may lead to the development of moral leadership.

Mwambazambi and Banza's (2014) model can be compared with that of Kretzschmar (2007). Both models seem to be influenced by the Franciscan emphasis on the conversion of the head (intellect), heart (emotions) and hands (lifestyle and actions). The other writer to emphasise the Franciscan model is Ken Blanchard (Kouzes and Posner 2004), who wrote a chapter on the importance of beliefs (the head), motivation (the heart) and behavior (the hands), and habits (spiritual disciplines) of a leader.

Lamoureux (1999:142) writes of the conversion of mind and heart, fostering integrative thinking, character formation, promoting authentic discipleship, personal appropriation of faith and knowledge, and cultivating a spirituality of the intellectual life. She also writes of the four conversions: the religious (a personal appropriation of faith), moral (internalising 'the norms and values of the Christian faith); cognitive (appropriating knowledge previously learned but not made one's own; and affective (the transformation of the deepest life of feeling).

Another similar model is that of Richardson (2007:147), who studied the ministerial training and theological education in the Methodist church of South Africa. He encourages a focus on the head (knowledge and understanding), heart (values and commitment), hands (practical operational skills) and feet (action and a way of life).

Although not developed from the biblical or theological perspective, Van der Ven's (1998) seven modes of moral formation have been acknowledged by theologians such as Andre van Niekerk (2009). In his book, the *Formation of moral self* (1998), Van der Ven offers seven modes of moral education: discipline, socialisation, transmission, development, clarification, emotional formation and education for character.

Discipline and socialisation are informal educational modes or methods that have their origin in the influence of parents and community life. In contrast transmission, development, clarification and emotional formation are formal educational modes which work through institutions that have been specifically set up for an educational purpose, such as schools and churches.

The last is Kretzschmar's (2007) model. She discusses moral formation based on five areas of conversion, like most of the above mentioned models. She sees "conversion" as an ongoing process that leads to newness of life. Observing the life of John Wesley and how he formed Christian leaders, Bentley writes that the formation of moral character is not an instant event (Bentley 2010:557), it needs a process. I would add that it must be an intentional process. Kretzschmar (2007) writes of the conversion of the head, the heart, the will, relationships and actions.

4.4.2 The five conversions of character formation

Judy Tenelshof (1999:78), the Professor of Christian Education at Talbot School of Theology, writes that morality is concerned with "fairness and harmony between individuals"; "with harmonizing the things inside each individual"; and "with what man was created for or the purpose of life as a whole". She explains that "the first has to do with relationships between people, the second has to do with being aware and understanding one's self, and the third has to do with purpose in relationship to the creator" (Tenelshof 1999:78). A character is, throughout life, formed by how one responds to these three aspects. Leadership specifically is about being fair and honest with others, but that is based on our relationship with God. A moral leader is someone who is in a process of being formed morally.

The conversion of the head

Moral formation process requires conversion of the head. Intellectual conversion includes the abandonment of pride, for it "militates against good relationships with God and with others and it encourages the perpetuation of a false self-image" (Kretzschmar 2007:14). John Wesley, for one, encouraged certain values in leaders. Humility was one of the values entailed (Bentley 2010:563). An arrogant or proud

leader will find it difficult to account to one's peers, and that may lead to an authoritative and personality centred leadership. Kretzschmar (2007:14) suggests that a leader should do a private and communal study, prayer and reflection, as these will assist one to do a rigorous and honest intellectual journey.

The conversion of the heart

Richard Foster writes that all “real formation work is ‘heart work’” (Foster 2009:30). It is from the heart that the mouth speaks and the actions are initiated. “Moral decision-making involves more than just the cognitive aspect; the affective (or emotional) aspects are important parts of Christian and human existence and play a significant role in the judgment of conscious” (Kretzschmar 2007:17). Ezekiel says, “Cast away from you all your transgressions which you have committed and make yourselves a new heart and a new spirit” (18:31). Surely, it takes God to transform the heart, “... I will give you a new heart and put a new spirit within you, and I will remove the heart of stone from your flesh... I will put My Spirit within you and cause you to walk in in my statutes, and you will be careful to obey my ordinances” (36:26 – 27). The renewal of the heart begins with repentance from sin (Ezekiel 18:30), and receiving the new heart which God gives with a new spirit, wrought by the Holy Spirit (Jeremiah 31:34; John 3:5-8).

The conversion of the will

The requirement for the conversion of the will, “is a redeemed will, a will centered on love for God and neighbor” (Kretzschmar 2007:18). Human will can be trained to be directed in the right path. Paul writes “... I discipline my body and make it my slave, so that after I have preached to others, I myself will not be disqualified” (1Corinthians 9:27). Paul speaks of knocking out the bodily impulses to keep them from preventing him from his mission. A leader can find himself or herself having to contend between doing the will of God or hers. Quoting Vest, Kretzschmar writes “what must be renounced is not the will itself, which is the seat of volition and effort, but willfulness which is the arrogant assumption that we are self-contained and self-sufficient; the will that we must embrace is willingness, the receptivity and flexibility to be shaped by God's loving care” (2007:18).

The conversion of relationships

Leadership is about relationships, and how does a leader relate, not only to the church, but the entire immediate community. It is said that John Wesley leadership began with the people, not necessarily an ideology or vision of an individual (Bentley 2010:557). In fact, “Wesley looked for leaders among the people, not above the people, because they had a genuine love and awareness of the realities of daily life. The nature of Wesleyan was that it followed the people...” (Bentley 2010:558). Leaders must have a healthy relationship with the community.

Kretzschmar (2007) suggests that a leader can do well to read the struggle stories of others as these can transform the mind of a leader and consequently the relationships. Secondly, “moral formation requires engagement with life; taking risks, loving and being hurt. Lastly, an honest relationship with God, self-reflection can lead to honest relationship with others (2007:20).

Wesley encouraged the community, by organising people into groups that would support each other, but who would also hold each other accountable in their Christian living and social interaction (Bentley 2010:560). Foster (2009:32) calls these groups “the little church within the church”. He further says “This spiritual formation work produces a certain kind of fellowship, a certain kind of community. It produces a unity of heart and soul and mind, a bond that cannot be broken – a wonder filled-caring and sharing of life together that will carry us through the most difficult circumstances” (Foster 2009:32).

The conversion of the hands

The final test of whether moral formation has taken place is the conversion of the hands. “The conversion of the hands is dependent on the other conversions, namely of the mind, heart, will and relationships” (Kretzschmar 2007:21). It is being aware of our contextual and cultural realities. For example, “Wesley never allowed those who claimed to belong to Christian faith to lose sight of their contextual realities... Wesleyan tradition created real leaders, sometimes from the most unexpected situations and backgrounds, who would in turn change their world for the better” (Bentley 2010:562).

Foster (2009:33) explains this conversion of the hands clearly. He writes of *contemptus mundi*, our being torn loose from all earthly attachments and ambitions, and *amor mundi*, our being quickened to a divine but painful compassion for the world. “In the beginning God plucks the world out of our hearts – *contemptus mundi*. Here we experience a loosening of the chains of attachment to positions of prominence and power... we learn to let go of all control, all managing, all manipulation” (Foster 2009:33).

For believers, becoming relevant in the world will assist with many social ills. No healthy spiritual formation in Christ is possible apart from mission with Christ. Similarly, no transformative mission with Christ is possible apart from formation in Christ. Moral behaviour or transformation springs forth from spiritual formation. It is in ministry, in communities where leaders will prove to be disciples of the Christ. By their fruits, people will know them (Matthew 7:16).

4.5 Conclusion

The chapter has attempted to define moral formation and its theories from both the developmental psychology and theological ethics. It has managed to note that developmental psychology depends overly on reason, and that morality cannot be achieved by reason alone, but also by the context one finds oneself in. For a Pentecostal/Charismatic church leader, that context includes the church community. It is important to note that the Church plays a significant role in moral formation. In fact, some authors such as Schwartz (1999) and Rasmussen (1989) call the Church a moral community. The question that arises is, how do NPCs go about moral formation, especially that of its leaders? How are leaders groomed and developed within the Pentecostal-Charismatic churches? What aspects of morality are given more attention in the process of grooming leaders?

CHAPTER 5

STUDY FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

5.1 Introduction

This chapter focuses on the empirical part of this study. The study combined theoretical and empirical qualitative research methods. Upon receiving permission and assistance from the Soweto Ministers Fraternal chairperson, five pastors were contacted, and they all agreed to take part in the research study. Referrals were obtained and the pastors were contacted by phone, and thereafter informed both telephonically and in person during the interviews about all the necessary information regarding the research and what was required of them.

The pastors agreed on the suggested appointment dates and times for interview meetings. At the start of each interview an effort was made by the researcher to place the participants at ease by reminding them that their names and that of their churches will not be revealed. The researcher, showed interest in the participant's lives and that of their ministries, which made the participants willing to share information to the best of their ability. All pastors gave a positive attitude.

As noted in Chapter Two, the study considered the typological/taxonomic analysis, which is an elaboration or the development of categories stage of preliminary analysis. The study follows and outlines a basic approach for analysing and interpreting narrative data, often referred to as content analysis.

5.2 Findings of the study

5.2.1 Case studies

Pastor #1

Name: the participant will be referred to as Pastor Siphosethu

Gender: Male

Age: 38

Interview setting: Coffee Shop

Date of interview: 13 July 2015

Duration of interview: 59min: 36sec (from 10:30am)

Pastor Siphosethu was, at the time of the study, working at a private company on full-time bases. He studied Bachelor of Theology with a USA based institution. He has a Diploma in Human resources. "I tried studying but I dropped out in a Masters. I registered with Unisa, I dropped out, I registered with SATS and I dropped out, and I think I am not ready". He gave up due to a hectic work schedule, for he also runs several businesses together with his wife of ten years. He is not considering studying theology any soon.

Together with his wife and younger brother, he "started the Church seven years ago... in a school's classroom" and they have since moved to a tent in the same school yard. Before then, he was in a Pentecostal-Charismatic church, and served as a youth pastor, and eventually became one of the assistant pastors, to the day he decided to start his own ministry. On moving out of the home church, he says "I asked for permission from the pastor... they were disappointed... because they needed us to start a branch of the Church... but there was no discussion with us on this vision." Upon announcing their intentions of leaving the Church, there was a break in communication and association.

When asked "what qualifies one to be a leader or pastor", he said "one is the calling that is upon you... two you must have a pastor's heart and love for people..." Pastors need to uphold high moral standards because of pastoral standing in the

community. The researcher asked if he knew of any steps required for one to be a Church pastor, Siphosethu said “No, there was no said steps. What we do is, you can preach and be ordained by the Pastor in the Church... no training, no school... you preach, lead people and ordained. There is no development, the development actually depends on you.” Based on his commitment in the Church, the pastor identified him as a pastoral candidate in the Church.

Siphosethu’s most important Christian principles are righteousness, holiness, and be word based. He goes on to add “Prayer, I have spent a lot of time teaching people to pray for themselves.” However, his prayer life is strained because of his schedule. His major challenge is in balancing life; that is the demands of ministry, work and family.

Siphosethu has had several challenges, but not had a ‘major’ moral failure. “I have always been conscious when it comes to that”. Major moral failures according to him, are extramarital affairs, which may lead to divorce, and monetary-related problems. However, in a case where he has compromised his morals, he expects the congregants and leaders to treat him as a human being; that is with mercy, as he is also fallible. When he has made a mistake he stands up and apologises to the church. And when one has done wrong, he will talk to God first, then his wife.

He has four role models around Soweto, these are all pastors with big churches. He does not mention his previous pastor as one of his role models. One of these role models leads an organisation or structure that ordains and mentors’ ministers. His church ‘submits’ to this structure, the Bishop holds him accountable in case of a known moral failure. As part of this structure he has to be responsible.

He has five people at church who give him feedback in terms of his leadership. He has a church board that looks at his church’s involvement in the community. His involvement is mostly on handing out food parcels, blankets and clothes. He is not yet involved in the ministers fraternal, but he supports the organisation.

Pastor #2

Name: the participant will be referred to as Pastor Omolemo

Gender: Male

Age: 32

Interview setting: Restaurant

Date of interview: 13 July 2015

Duration of interview: 49min: 44 sec (from 12:00 midday)

Pastor Omolemo says he has always known that he was called to preach. "I started preaching when I was nine years old. I was not born again at the time, I was still at an apostolic church (African Independent Church), and they recognized my calling and started to give me a platform to preach..." He then got born again at the age of eleven, and "... when I got born again (in Pentecostal-Charismatic Church), I never had time for baby steps, because I knew the scriptures but didn't know the Lord... but in terms of clarity and knowing what I am called to do, I knew at twelve... I knew the different offices that were there in the kingdom".

At that age, Pastor Omolemo approached his Pentecostal-Charismatic pastor, who "knew from the onset that this boy was called". Their relationship started from there on. "I started to host revivals at the age of 14". He says he believes very much in the art of following, for he has served for twenty years under his pastor. And he has been faithful to his pastor's church and has followed most of his advices. With the assistance of his pastor, he eventually started his own church, and at the time of the interview the church was two months old. Pastor Omolemo says he has a good relationship with the pastor at his former church and still maintains an informal contact with him.

The young pastor is not married. At some point in his life he completed a Diploma in Marketing but could not advance his studies, due to the demands associated with starting a church. He has since resolved not to study marketing further; neither does he want to study theology. Pastor Omolemo intends to study psychology instead. "I kind of looking for a balance in terms of assisting people. My observation is that people have psychological problems than theological problems" he says. When

asked if he thought his scriptural interpretation is up to standard, he was evasive, saying that can be answered by somebody else.

He admires most of the local senior pastors. However, he spends most of his time listening to some Ghanaian church planter sermons on daily basis. He has bought so many sermons on MP3 that it will last him thirty years of sermons, as he says. He models his ministry around the church planter's work, because he believes that his ministry is around church planting. He wants to build a mega church. Most of his sermons are motivated by these sermon audios. He prays three hours a day. Once a week he prays on the mountain and the results are significant in the growth of his ministry.

On what is expected of a pastor in terms of morality, he says being a Christian is more important to him than being a pastor. "... the most fundamental thing to me, that I am pursuing is not to be the greatest pastor, but to be a greatest Christian. I am bound by Christian standards than pastoral standards... I am not moral because I have a Church. I am moral because I am Christian". However, Pastor Omolemo has had a moral failure. He singled out an event that happened when he was still at his pastor's church. He had sexual relationship with his girlfriend before marriage. The girl, out of guilt told the senior pastor. His pastor was supportive to Pastor Omolemo. He did not expose him to the congregation, but encouraged him not to quit ministry and Christianity, but to stand up and continue with preaching.

Pastor Omolemo defines himself as someone who empowers his congregations. He is not authoritative. His church is involved in community service through food parcels and distribution of clothing to the poor. He is not involved in the ministers' fraternal.

Pastor #3

Name: the participant will be referred to as Pastor Ntuthuko

Gender: Male

Age: 31

Interview setting: Restaurant

Date of interview: 14 July 2015

Duration of interview: 47min: 07sec (from 13:10)

Pastor Ntuthuko was “born again” at the age of 11, and says “I got filled with the Holy Spirit round about 1990 or the year thereafter”. Pastor Ntuthuko realised his calling at the age of fifteen (in 1999) when he attended a crusade somewhere in SOWETO. “From there I was silent about it [calling], because I was still in leadership at my former Church. And the next year, I think 2000, I went to talk to an older pastor...” who was not a member of the church Pastor Ntuthuko was in. The discussions were about his calling and what he needs to do thereafter. The advice he got was that he needed to stay at school.

Pastor Ntuthuko did not attend any bible school or study theology. He is a full time lawyer by profession. The advice (“stay in school”) was interpreted to mean studying something else other than Theology. Further, Pastor Ntuthuko thinks that it is not necessary to study Theology, “for me it’s not the main thing in a sense that there is a lot of information and I read a lot. So for me I feel secure in my theological views... having spoken to theologians I mean I discuss with them and I hold my own thoughts, and I disagree a lot with them.”

When asked about the steps he needed to take to be a pastor at his church, he said “no... you feel the calling at your own corner...” Leadership growth rested squarely on his shoulders. Pastor Ntuthuko since left the church, and followed his brother who started a new church. He does not have any relationship with the previous senior pastor.

Pastor Ntuthuko has been serving as an assistant pastor to his brother for a period of seven years. However, he was ordained under a mentorship group in the township. This fellowship group consists of pastors, elders and deacons from different churches. To qualify for ordination in this group is a letter of recommendation from his pastor (brother).

The most important qualities of the pastor are “the love for the people, the love for God, vision, leadership and management”. His roles in the church include organising and managing the day-to-day running of the church. Pastor Ntuthuko’s prayer life is struggling, because he is always tired. He tries to pray only in the morning.

Generally, “I like reading political biographies and I do a lot of self-help books” and that is where he gets some of the sermon ideas.

When it comes to morality, he says “the expectation is that of moral example.” He adds however, that “I don’t think that means to be flawless, but it means you live your life right without scandals.” Interestingly, he thinks that the expectations are decreasing in terms of what people expect from their leaders. He says people are expecting leaders to have shortfalls. Pastor Ntuthuko has had a moral failure. “I have two friends that I share everything with” and those do not include his pastor. He thinks that moral failure is not really bad as compared to how a person handles the failure. “Some pastors try by all means to hide their failures, and sometimes use their authority to suppress the issue; which may harm the Church”.

Pastor Ntuthuko’s role model is an assistant pastor of a local church. He sees similarities between the two of them. His pastor and some friends give him feedback on his preaching, but not all the time, and this feedback is casual. He defines his leadership style as being authoritative.

It was also interesting to hear his views on the relationship between young and senior ministers. He thinks there is a subtle tension between the young and old. Young ministers admire the pastors who lead big churches, but Pastor Ntuthuko feels that these pastors are very much territorial and protective of their pulpits. Only few young ministers are given a chance to preach in other churches other than their own. There is also no intentional mentoring in the churches.

Pastor Ntuthuko’s involvement in the community is through his church. He is not part of the minister’s fraternal. He thinks that the fraternal is for senior pastors only.

Pastor #4

Name: the participant will be referred to as Pastor Tinashe

Gender: Male

Age: 38

Interview setting: His business office

Date of interview: 15 July 2015

Duration of interview: 30min: 48sec (from 12:30 Afternoon)

“As a pastor of a Church that I am leading now, it is about eleven years... I come from a church called... [he names Pentecostal-Charismatic Church] in SOWETO. My spiritual father there is Apostle... [he names the leader]. So I started there, that’s where I basically got born again, I got born again in 1992”. It was at this Pentecostal-Charismatic church that he got baptised and became a youth pastor.

“It was 2002 that I got released. And then 2003 we started a ministry called...” [he named the church]. When asked about support he got and the steps taken to be a pastor, Pastor Tinashe verbatim:

“I think for me, I didn’t go through a formal program, as in mentorship programme or a programme that identifies talent within the church and develops it. But I think, I saw after sometime that my pastor was actually developing me for leadership because of the responsibilities he was giving me and also making sure I’m part of the bigger decision making within the Church even though I was young. So to be honest, I didn’t know that I had a call and I never thought that I will become a pastor. It was after he [the pastor], after they actually came and set down with me and said ‘listen we want you to lead the youth ministry’ and then they started telling that they see that I am called and all of this. For me it was a big, eh how should I say a surprise! Because I was just fellowshiping, going to Church like anybody else, I was active of course helping... wherever they needed help in the Church.”

He later took a difficult decision of leaving the Church, to go and join his evangelist brother who had just started a church in the same township. However, Pastor Tinashe is still “very much close” to his spiritual father, and “he is being mentoring me”.

Pastor Tinashe is the main pastor of his own church since 2003. He defines himself as an Information Technology Specialist. “In actual fact I only went full time in ministry in 2011, so I’ve been sort of working full time as an IT specialist when the ministry was very much at its early stages”. He currently runs his business on part-time basis. He is finishing his Bachelor of Commerce degree in a year. However, he only did his ‘ministerial certificate’ under his pastor’s bible school at his first church. Other than that he has not done any theological training.

The pastor is married with three kids, since 2003. He believes that a pastor must be a person of excellent character and committed to family. Personally, he has never had a “major” moral failure, which is a failure that might have impacted negatively on his ministry. The “minor” failures he has had are shared with God and the wife. At first his prayer struggled, but it has improved since he sorted out his priorities. Pastor Tinashe has written five motivational books on finances, business and health. However, he reads a lot of books on sales and motivations. Pastor Tinashe says he gets his sermon ideas from books, internet research, and prayer.

He admires two local ministers; one is his “spiritual father” or former pastor and the other is his wife’s “spiritual father”. The two are the “go to” people in times of need. Pastor Tinashe gets sermon feedback mostly from his wife, who seems to be an unofficial mediator between the pastor and the church. The pastor sees himself as more authoritative.

Two years before, his church decided to change strategy in terms of ministering to the community. Previously they used to handout food parcels and clothes. That has proved to be very expensive for the Church. He has since decided to focus on skills development, through learner-ships. He is part of the minister’s fraternal, but he has not attended its functions for some time.

5.2.2 Categories identified

It was clear in the second interview, that one is drawn to issues around the “calling into ministry”, “Mentorship or assistance”, “Theological versus other studies”, and

“involvement or lack of involvement in both the general and the Christian community”.

5.2.3 Calling to ministry

Pastor Siphosethu: Based on his commitment in the church, the pastor identified him as a pastoral candidate in the church. He was born in a Pentecostal church, and served as a youth pastor, and eventually became one of the assistant pastors, till the day he decided to start his own ministry.

Pastor Omolemo: He has known since he was nine years old that he has been called to ministry. Everyone, including his pastor confirmed God’s calling over his life.

Pastor Ntuthuko: discovered his calling at the age of fifteen (in 1999). He served in the church quietly, and it was the year 2000 when he shared with someone, other than his senior pastor, on what he needed to do to be a pastor. He does not have a healthy relationship with the previous senior pastor. His success and growth rested squarely on his shoulders.

Pastor Tinashe: did not know that he had a “call from God” to be a pastor, and he never thought of it, until his pastor approached him and asked him to be a youth leader. He is still very much close to his “spiritual father” and mentor.

5.2.4 Mentorship

Pastor Siphosethu: The senior pastor did not take his move from the church well; he was reluctantly released to start his own ministry. But that move cost him a relationship with his pastor. He does not have a particular mentor, but does consult several pastors when he needs help.

Pastor Omolemo: He has good relationship with the pastor at his former church. He now meets with him at least once a month, but it is not a scheduled meeting.

Pastor Ntuthuko: He does not have a healthy relationship with the previous senior pastor, who is his “spiritual father”.

Pastor Tinashe: He is still very much close to his “spiritual father” and mentor.

5.2.5 Theological training

Pastor Siphosethu: He studied Bachelor of Theology with an online USA-based institution. He has a Diploma in Human resources.

Pastor Omolemo: He does not have theological training. He studied for a Diploma in Marketing and he intends to study psychology.

Pastor Ntuthuko: He does not have theological training. He holds a Bachelor of Law degree.

Pastor Tinashe: He does not have a theological training other than a ministerial certificate course he attended under his pastor. He is finishing his Bachelor of Commerce degree.

5.2.6 Community involvement

Pastor Siphosethu: His involvement is mostly on handing out food parcels, blankets and clothes. He is not yet involved in the minister’s fraternal.

Pastor Omolemo: His church is involved in community through food parcels and distribution of clothing to the poor. He is not involved in the minister’s fraternal.

Pastor Ntuthuko: His involvement in the community is through his church. He is not part of the minister’s fraternal. He thinks that the fraternal is for senior pastors only.

Pastor Tinashe: He has since decided to focus on skills development, through learnerships. He is part of the minister’s fraternal, but he has not attended its functions for some time.

5.3 Content analysis

5.3.1 Calling to ministry

One has found that almost all the pastors, embraced Christianity or got born again at a very tender age of nine (Pastor Omolemo), 11 (Pastor Ntuthuko) and others under the ages of 15. Whether they understood or not the consequences of their conversion, it is not clear. An early response to ministerial calling can only be supplemented by a purposeful mentoring of the young persons.

Three out of four of the young pastors interviewed related how their 'pastors' identified them for a leadership role in the Church. In all the cases, this identification is some sort of reward for faithful service in the Church. The pastor identifies the 'gift' or the calling in the young person's life. What is not clear is the specificity of this call. Ian Coffey (2005) asks, "Are leaders born or made?" but observes that in a Christian leadership it is easier to find an answer, because the bible is littered with babies with a destiny. Through the lens of the bible, individuals do not just become leaders; they are called to become leaders. Leonard Sweet (2004) agrees that leaders are neither born nor made, but adds that leaders are summoned. They are called into existence by circumstances, and those who rise to the occasion are leaders.

Insightfully, Gordon Smith (1999), in his book, *Courage and calling*, says we can understand the call of God in three distinctive ways. The first is the general call, which is a call to be a Christian. "The God of creation invites us to respond to his love. This call comes through Jesus, who invites us to be disciples and to know the Father through him. To be Christian is to respond to the call to know and love God and to love and serve others" (1999:9).

Second, is the immediate call, which is the calling that we face each day in response to the multiple demands on our lives. This refers to our immediate duties and responsibilities, such as our day-to-day tasks like being there for our kids when they compete at a soccer field, or help out at our local churches. Thirdly, it is the specific call. Smith (1999) refers to this calling as a defining purpose or mission, a reason for

being. He writes “Every individual is called of God to respond uniquely through service in the world”. Each of us follows and serves God and community differently.

In the interviews with the young pastors, it became evident that that there was no clear, purposeful steps or guidelines followed in grooming and developing young leaders within the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches. As a result, there seems to be no guidance for young ministers on “specific calling”; that is, whether one is called to be an evangelist, a teacher-pastor, an apostle or a prophet.

The encounter with the young ministers in Soweto has further strengthened the observations that in the Pentecostal-charismatic tradition, leadership is described as a “spiritual calling”, and that appropriate spiritual gifts are given for leadership calling (Burgess et al 1988:105). Pentecostal-Charismatics do not view leadership as a purely human characteristic or obtainable skill which can be obtained or acquired through learning or observation (Banks and Ledbetter 2004).

Leadership is based on spiritual power coming from the Holy Spirit, and it emerges in the context of a loving community; one’s leadership is measured by how well the leader is a follower of the church leaders, by extension the follower of God. “The call to a leadership ministry comes from God but is confirmed by the church. The church recognizes the divine call and thus serves as a regulating community for ministry. The Holy Spirit works through the Church, vivifying ministers and consecrating them for specific responsibilities (Acts 31:2 – 3)” (Burgess et al. 1988:105).

David Williams (2006:73) of the University of Fort Hare, observes that “call experiences” in the bible, such as those of Jeremiah and Samuel have a common principle behind them. That is a call to a “specific role” or responsibility. Williams also notes that a call in the prophet’s life came as a culmination of a series of events. Samuel’s calling (1 Samuel 3) for an example, refers back to the prayer of Hannah (1 Samuel 1). The call of God is not an arbitrary thing, it being irrelevant to the one who is called. Samuel, Moses and other prophets had been prepared for their calling.

However, almost all the young pastors were drawn to leadership and left to discover for themselves what their contribution could be in the church. The result is young people who go through a period of 'trial' and 'error' in a process of finding one's reason for being. The one essential quality a leader must have is to be your own person, authentic in every regard. Leadership begins and ends with authenticity. To become authentic, each of us has to develop our own leadership style, consistent with our personality and character.

Unclear purpose leads to frustration, because uncertainty can be unsettling. The result could be the abuse of power as one will demand affirmation from others. Personal self-interest may also creep in. "A self-protective mechanism comes into play once people realise that Christian faith is costly (Kretzschmar 1997:316)".

This frustration can lead to what Khathide (2002:356) has referred to as "fissiparous tendency" among Pentecostals. That is split to form new churches being triggered by the slightest of causes. Khathide says if the gifts of the Spirit are not properly regulated and managed, it could lead to church-splitting tendencies. "Burgeoning leaders who claim to have been "oppressed" or stifled previously by a leader or structure become empowered when they lead a group of members out of an existing church to create the space in a new church where they can 'do what God wants them to do'" (Khathide 2002:356). He sadly concludes that the "leadership in such break-away churches exhibits power-mongering inclinations and may not be necessarily spiritually mature for such demanding tasks" (Khathide 2002:356).

5.3.2 Mentoring and affirmation

As noted above, there is no clear, purposeful steps or guidelines followed in grooming and developing young leaders within the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches. As a result, there are no specific aspects of morality that are given more attention in the process of grooming leaders. Some were identified and given leadership roles such as youth pastor, these include Pastor Siphosethu and Pastor Tinashe, and others had to approach people and seek guidance pertaining to their callings, like Pastor Omolemo and Pastor Ntuthuko. It does not appear that moral

formation is being intentionally pursued. For most of these young ministers, leadership development depended on their own efforts.

The researcher has also found that half the pastors interviewed do not have a healthy relationship with their previous pastors or “spiritual fathers”. The problem seems to arise when the young pastor decides to leave and form his own church (Pastor Siphosethu, Pastor Ntuthuko), even in cases where there has been a better relationship (as in the case with Pastor Omolemo and Pastor Tinashe) there is no sufficient support from the “spiritual father” or structured mentorship programme.

The lack of support can be attributed to several reasons, one may be the fact that by the time a young pastor decides to leave, the senior pastor may have other plans for the young man. Or, there may have developed some tension between the senior pastor and the young pastor. That tension may be due to some sort of popularity of the young minister as compared to the senior pastor, or purely the clash of visions as Pastor Siphosethu eluded.

Whatever the case may be, the conflict between the two pastors disadvantages the young man more than it does the senior pastor. One is left to fend for himself or depend on his peers for counsel. In many cases than not, the young ministers have had moral failures, and they have shared these with their friends or spouses rather than senior ministers who can offer guidance and spiritual counsel (Pastor Siphosethu, Pastor Ntuthuko and Pastor Tinashe).

Affirmation from one’s senior pastor goes a long way in forming a moral leadership. Affirmation is the result of a lifelong mentorship. During the interviews, one found that fifty percent of young ministers do not have a healthy relationship with their original pastors. That cannot be overlooked because most of these young ministers know the importance of having a mentor. In fact, Pastor Omolemo challenged the researcher to observe the difference in growth of churches between the young ministers without mentors and those with. In his own understanding, his success in ministry is directly linked to his health relationship with his pastor.

His observations cannot be far from truth, considering the importance of mentorship. There is actually no better example than the one in Jesus' ministry. Fernando (2002) sketches God's acts of affirmation in the ministry of Jesus Christ (2002:47). At the start of Jesus ministry, "a voice came from heaven, 'you are my beloved Son; with you I am well pleased'" (Mark 1:11). In the text, the voice is obviously that of God. When Jesus was faced with loneliness and discouragement at Caesarea Philippi (Matt. 16:13ff; Mark 8:27ff, Luke 9:18ff), another voice of affirmation came. Even in John 12 when Jesus was contemplating the sacrifice he had to make, God is recorded as having spoken.

Fernando, says these words were important in a sense that, if accepted, they would satisfy three of the most basic human needs (2002:48). By calling Jesus his 'beloved Son', God satisfied the human need for identity. By saying that 'he is pleased with Jesus', God satisfied the need for security. Lastly, by affirming that 'Jesus is the Messiah', God satisfied the human need for significance. That means Jesus had important work to do.

Human beings need words of affirmation regarding identity, security and significance. The researcher is of the view that lack of identity, security and significance can result in young pastors resorting to gimmicks such as feeding people grass, snakes and drinking of petrol. These gimmicks are done to prove to peers and other senior pastors one's significance. If senior pastors among the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches can affirm these young ministers early on, and make them aware that they do not have to prove to others their God-given calling, it can go a long way in building their confidence and boldness in ministry.

Therefore, it is every mentor's duty to practise the Seven Es of enhancing potential by Tony Dungy (2010:165). He says a mentor must **engage**. In other words, one cannot mentor a young person from a distance and without engagement. One has to walk alongside and try to know and understand those they mentor. Secondly, a mentor must **educate**, because mentor leadership is about helping others become the best they can be, most of all teach by example.

Thirdly, a mentor must **equip**, by creating an environment in which others can be productive and excel. Fourthly, a mentor must **encourage**, because it is in their nature to lift others up. Fifthly, a mentor leader has the responsibility to **empower**. That means, letting loose and freely giving others the freedom to be on their own. Sixthly, a mentor leader **energises** and inspires those they lead. Lastly, a mentor leader **elevates** those they mentored, even if they may end up taking their place.

5.3.3 Theological training

There is also no clear indication that these pastors were encouraged to pursue formal theological training. In fact, half of them have been discouraged, either by friends or senior pastors from pursuing theological studies (Pastor Omolemo and Pastor Ntuthuko). Theological studies are seen as irrelevant to ministerial success. There is a lot of information on the internet, motivational books and DVDs, CDs and books by popular preachers. Instead, they have been advised to pursue other degrees, through which they will be able to support themselves.

This has resulted in most of the young pastors pursuing a business career at the beginning of their ministries. These businesses and employment are vital at the beginning of their ministries, because they do not only support the pastors' personal lifestyle, they also support the ministry. Pastor Siphosethu, Pastor Omolemo and Pastor Ntuthuko have used their personal finances to fund the ministry at the beginning. This investment will soon bear good fruits for the pastor and his family. But, this also bears important implication. If the pastor used his money and resources to start the church, that simply means, it is "his church", and in most cases he does as he wishes.

On education, only one out of four of the pastors listed above has a Bachelor of Theology. It is clear that theological education is not at the top of the list of requirements for pastoral leadership among the NPCs. All the pastors contacted had educational qualifications such as Diploma in Human resources, Diploma in Marketing, Bachelor of Law degree and Bachelor of Commerce degree. Three of them do not even intend to study Theology in the future.

There are two aspects that may impact on morals. One is the quality of spiritual formation, which leads to a deepening relationship with God. Leech defines spiritual formation as a process in which we are transformed by, and in, Christ. “In this process we are transformed so that we become more and more to share the Christ nature... it is a process which involves confrontation, exploration and struggle, and its goal is maturity in Christ” (1980:5). Paul states that Christians need to be trained like athletes to live the Christian life (1 Corinthians 9:24 – 27). However, with many NPCs, it seems like personal conversion leads automatically to moral living and social involvement. There is a tendency to believe that in order for the world to be renewed and transformed; individuals first had to be saved. Kretzschmar (1997) observes that this belief encompasses at one and the same time a profound truth and a dangerous assumption. The profound truth being that reconstruction must indeed begin with us, for it is true that transformed persons have the insight and passion that can transform unjust social structures. Nevertheless, it is a dangerous assumption that this is a process that occurs automatically.

The second observation is that the young pastors do not see a need for theological training. A feeling among them is that there is “enough information out there” as Pastor Ntuthuko alluded. Furthermore, there is a fear that theological training will challenge their beliefs, in which they are comfortable. It is clear however, as noted above that Pentecostal-Charismatics do not view leadership as a purely human characteristic or obtainable skill which can be obtained or acquired through learning or observation. This is the danger Foster (1998:130) warned about, that of rejecting rational and the intellectual in favour of the emotive side of faith.

Negativity around rational and intellectual is understandable considering that people who make numbers in NPCs have experienced institutional religion, which did not take ‘feelings’ into consideration. Writing on the declining attendance in mainline Protestant churches, Winseman (2009:31) observes that what increases attendance in conservative Protestant churches “is not that people are holding to more conservative theological or Biblical beliefs. Our research suggests that it is mostly because of the critical but often overlooked importance of the emotional connection”. He adds that neurological research confirms that our emotional connections are far

stronger than our rational connections (Winseman 2009:30). Therefore, for newer Pentecostal-Charismatics, a sermon has to move a person, more than it makes a person to think.

Sepulveda (1989:80) and Khathide (2002:353) also agree that resistance in Pentecostal circles is born out of a perception that the presuppositions of the Enlightenment, in which reason reign supreme, have affected the mission of the church in a negative way. “In some churches, anything that has to do with the intellect is considered ‘unspiritual’. What works takes precedence over well-thought out findings and inquiries. Sadly, this leaves Pentecostal-Charismatics vulnerable to spiritual abuse and has often caused Pentecostal-Charismatics to be gullible victims of spiritual fads, some of which have nothing to do with godliness and the enhancement of strategies for Christian mission, like the eating of grass and snakes.

The other important point in the discussion is that in many African theological colleges, even presently, Theology produced elsewhere is still studied and taught in a non-reflexive way, without the teachers and students appropriating theological truths within their own context and creating new knowledge, insights and applications (Kretzschmar 2002:55). Undigested and contextualised theology is simply a form of intellectual colonisation.

Freire (1970), as quoted by Kretzschmar (2002) rejects the “banking” model of learning where the learners have to absorb the “facts” taught by their teachers and simply regurgitate them in the examinations. Freire (1970:45-59) affirms a “problem solving” model in which learners engage with material and produce new knowledge – a process in which teachers can also be learners, and learners can also be teachers. In this way authentic leaders can be developed (see Kretzschmar 2002:56).

A negative attitude towards theological institutions should not result into a negative attitude towards theological training or learning in general. After observing Moses’ call, Downey (1981:31) concluded that “one may observe that the prophet’s call was essential in order for him to engage in his ministry, but the call did not occur in an educational vacuum.” Being teachable, informal or formal, is one of the marks of

Christian leadership. Wayne Oates (1987) makes that point when he writes “we could have integrity. We could have answerability and steal have hermetically sealed minds, unteachable, hearing only what we want to hear, and selectively screening out anything that does not fit our set of cliches” (1987:21).

He further notes that “un-teachableness is a primary characteristic of the authoritarian leader”. The authoritarian leader hears only what he or she wants to hear. At the root of authoritarian leadership are pride, ignorance and distorted or limited image of God (Kretzschmar 2015:5).

5.3.4 Involvement in the community

The other interesting observation is that of the involvement in the community, in a sense that they are all involve through the handing out food parcels, blankets and clothes and are all not involved in the ministers fraternal or in any advocacy work. Only one pastor (Pastor Tinashe) has since decided to focus on skills development, through learnerships. This is essential to the study because the South African society faces numerous problems, such as unemployment, poverty, violence, homelessness, substance abuse, exploitation and corruption. Kretzschmar (2015:9) writes that young pastors “cannot solve all these problems, but they can be conscientized, inspired and assisted to develop a moral lifestyle”.

In an attempt to explain “why Christian belief often does not issue into Christian action”, Kretzschmar (1997:313) says one reason is Christians, who, due to a very narrow theology, are ignorant of the content and implications of their faith. She blames the phenomenon of “privatization of the Christian faith” for this perspective. This means that the Christian faith is reduced to the private, personal concerns of individuals and separated from the needs and concerns of the wider society in which we live.

She further notes four characteristics of a privatised faith. First, it is faith based on a dualism which separates reality into different spheres: the physical and the spiritual; the secular and the sacred; the public and the private; the saving of souls and social involvement. Secondly, it spiritualises the Gospel. Thus, in relation to passages such

as Luke (4:18 – 20) or Matthew (25:31 – 46), poverty and hunger, for example, are understood in terms of "spiritual" needs only and not also in terms of physical or material needs.

Related to the second characteristic, is that a privatised gospel is acontextual, meaning that Christians sometimes separate their faith from the actual situation in which they live. At times, Christians seek to distance themselves from social evils such as child abuse, physical or emotional battering in marriages, the causes of teenage pregnancy, the causes of poverty, and the lack of land and housing. The last characteristic of a privatised gospel is that of individualism. In fact, Khathide (2002:352) also confirms that because of its intense preoccupation with individuals, Pentecostalism has found it theologically to be concerned about issues affecting societies at the socio-political and economic level. "It has been a long tradition in some Pentecostal circles to consider involvement in socio-political issues as heretical, sinful and taboo (cf. Chikane 1988; Lapoorta 1996)".

Kretzschmar (1997) says a distinction needs to be made between the importance of the individual person and the overemphasis on the individual which results in the ignoring of the community or social aspects of our faith. Young NPC pastors need to be conscientised on this matter, and be urged to revisit their hermeneutics. "The strong inclination to interpret Scripture in an individualist and narrowly spiritual way, as is the norm in Pentecostal theology, limits the theological capacity to be involved in socio-political issues" (Khathide 2002:352).

5.4 Conclusion

In the concluding chapter, case studies were presented and categories identified and the content analysed. Categories are: calling to ministry, theological training, mentorship, and community involvement. The conclusion is that moral formation is not being intentionally pursued, and that has a direct impact on how the young ministers behave and do their ministerial work.

CHAPTER 6

DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Discussion

The findings of this study indicate that most newer Pentecostal-Charismatic church leaders are not adequately mentored and empowered to be church leaders. There is also a lot of confusion when it comes to what needs to be done for one to be a moral spiritual leader. Moral formation is not being intentionally pursued; consequently, that has a direct impact on the gap between what these young ministers believe ought to be (belief) and what they are expected to be doing (action). For example they all believe that they are supposed to be moral examples in their communities, but they find themselves struggling with maintaining a moral lifestyle.

Faith and action cannot be separated. Genuine Christian faith, in all Christian traditions (Foster 2001), is characterised by the non-separation of faith and action. Biblically, faith is not faith at all unless it is accompanied by action (James 2:26). In this regard, Kretzschmar's (1997) article, "The gap between belief and action", is enlightening. She advances different reasons in an attempt to explaining why Christian belief often does not issue in Christian action. The reasons are "a false separation between theological belief and ethical action"; "ignorance and a narrow theology"; "the myth that personal conversion leads automatically to social involvement"; "lack of exposure to different contexts"; "personal Self Interest"; "Group Interests"; and lastly "spiritual immaturity".

On the last point, she says the word "spiritual" refers not to some isolated devotional dimension but to the whole of a person's life as lived in obedience to and empowered by the Spirit of God. She notes three stages of Christian development as described by Gerard Hughes (1985) in the book *God of Surprises*. Using Von Hugel's theory of childhood, adolescence and adulthood, Hughes (1985) says Christians go through institutional stage which stresses acceptance of the beliefs of the church and obedience to the authority of the church; the critical stage, where the believer begins to criticise although remaining faithful; the third stage is called the mystical stage

because it involves a deeper walk with God than that which has been experienced before.

Mystical stage is an adult stage because it requires a degree of Christian maturity. The three stages raise an important factor for all Christians including Pentecostal-Charismatics, of whether one has sought to grow in their experience of God and one's attempt to live out his or her faith at home, work and in the wider society. Otherwise, some people could cling to their 'comfort zones' and refuse to act in accordance with what they believe.

6.2 Experience and cognitive

The gap between faith and action we saw among the young pastors, can be traced to spirituality of Pentecostal-Charismatics. Stephenson (2013), asserts that Pentecostal-Charismatic spirituality (practice) and doctrine (beliefs) should be understood as unavoidably influencing each other's development in a reciprocal relationship. Warrington (2008) presents Pentecostal-charismatic as less a theological system and more a theology that is lived practically and experientially, where life experience and encounter with God are as valuable a hermeneutic as a conceptual theology can be to the more historical traditions. The danger with such spirituality, as Warrington (2008) contends is that in spite of their traditional emphasis on the Holy Spirit, Pentecostal-Charismatics often operate with too narrow a view of the Spirit's activity in the life of the believer. The focus on 'power' and living a victorious life – a *theologia gloriae*- needs to be balanced with a *theologia crucis*, wherein the Spirit is understood as the one who is with us in our human nature, weakness and suffering and who leads us through this into Christlikeness.

Furthermore, the spirituality of Pentecostals tends to reduce the expectation of the Spirit's work to occasional, powerful encounters (or 'experiences') and that does not provide believers with a necessary model of the ongoing, transformative presence of the Holy Spirit in their everyday lives. In addition, the emphasis on the "Experience" has been the most crucial factor in the growth of Pentecostal-Charismatic churches (Khathide 2002:343; Pomerville 1985:79), however, Pentecostal-Charismatics do not consider reason enough. Such emphasis has impact on moral development of its

leaders (Khathide 2002:353; Sepulveda 1989:80). NPCs need to consider both “reason” (belief) and “experience” (action).

Elizabeth Moore (1983) has defined moral education as the process of training persons and helping them increase in their ability to make moral decisions and to act in moral ways. She proposes “cognitive-experiential” view of moral education (1983:175). Her argument is that reason and experience are interrelated and cannot really be separated, and moral education has to do with both cognition and experiencing. Of reason, she writes, “Cognitive knowing and perceiving is clearly affected by person’s mentality, physical condition, motivation and affective feeling. Likewise, anything that comes from or is relevant to experience will inevitably have cognitive dimensions.” Further, on experience, she notes, “the experiential is observed and reflected upon through the cognitive processes of perceiving and knowing”.

6.3 The media of moral formation

Elizabeth Moore’s (1983) observations are true, that moral education or formation touches all the dimensions of persons, such as thinking, attitudes and action. Larry Rasmussen (1995), the professor of social ethics at the Union Theological Seminary wrote about moral formation that touches on the thinking and action. The following moral formation medium suggestions, which can be adopted by Pentecostal-Charismatic churches, are influenced by Rasmussen’s work among others.

6.3.1 Moral exemplars

Every young pastor needs to have what Kohlberg (1987) calls “moral exemplars”. Rasmussen (1995:184) calls them the “cast of moral characters”, the representatives and exemplars of the church. Every society and community has its representative types who teach morality by embodiment and whose morality is learned by imitation. Senior pastors show us how to live in the church.

In the biblical witness story of the Old Testament, Joshua was formed into a credible leader. Besides his ability (Exodus 17:8ff) and faithfulness both to God and Moses, Joshua received a training. In the beginning of the book of Joshua, he is called

“Moses’ servant” (Joshua 1:1) and at the end of the book he is known as the “servant of Yahweh” (Joshua 24:29). Downey (1981:50-51) says leadership requires preparation, and Joshua got it by observation, experience and ordination.

It is in observation that a young pastor is encouraged to “think” and change his or her “attitudes” as Moore (1983) suggested. Kohlberg (1981) argued that when people see moral principles embodied in the action of moral exemplars, principled moral reasoning and behaviour becomes familiar to those who otherwise struggle with the inadequacy of lower stage reasoning. Kohlberg (1981:392) saw in the writings and actions of Martin Luther King Jr, for example, the formation of the principles of justice that are the culmination of moral development.

Writing on moral education, Moore (1983) remarks that thinking is the act of conceiving, imagining, reflecting and judging. In the area of thinking, the educator’s role would be to communicate the content of morality (e.g. biblical and historical understandings of issues and commands, elements of contemporary issues). The educator would also seek to help the students formulate and reformulate their own values against the background of this content.

The other practical thing the NPCs can do is to put together “story-telling” as a moral formation tool and “moral exemplars” method. Pentecostal-Charismatics are strong in storytelling and stories have a way of shaping character. No wonder Jesus Christ used stories more often than not in his teachings. Schwartz (1999) writes of the importance of stories in moral formation. When stories are presented, repeated again and again in the life of the congregation, over time, a pattern develops in which the individual stories are interwoven. These stories are connected to the story – the story of God and God’s people Israel, the story of Jesus and the story of God’s people the church.

According to Schwartz (1999), within the framework of this story, there are woven the moral concepts which shape and guide moral behaviour. The Pentecostal-Charismatic tradition has a rich spectrum of African Pentecostal pioneers such as Job Chiliza, Nicholas Bhengu, Richard Ngidi, Frank Chikane and recently Mosa

Sono. If these men's stories were told and the biblical stories told, people feel increasingly at home in the story of the Bible. It becomes their story, which helps them to describe the totality of their own life, the basic orientation and final point of reference for their emotions, thoughts and behaviour. As a community shaped by the stories, which it carries and in which it lives, a framework is created for the moral behaviour of those who live in it.

6.3.2 Moral action

Rasmussen (1995:183) remarks that practice may or not make perfect, as the saying goes, but it does seem the case that "practice makes morals". Habit (ethos) makes character (ethos), in the language of the Greeks, and character makes the people (ethnos) what it is. NPCs would benefit their young ministers by giving them pastoral or leadership experience early on. They would do well to encourage repeated communal activities, such as taking part in activities against drugs, or being part of a march against corruption, these are morally educative.

The biblical story of Joshua shows that preparation included apprenticeship. Moses was counselled by his father-in-law Jethro, to "select out of all the people, able men who fear God, men of truth, those who hate dishonest gain (Exodus 18:21), in order to share the leadership responsibilities and lighten Moses' load. It is quite possible that Joshua was one of those who were chosen to be part of the intimate circle of Moses. He is called Moses' servant (Exodus 24:13) and he accompanies him to Mount Sinai. He became an apprentice by serving in such a role for almost forty years, and that may have given him necessary experience for leadership. Additionally, for churches, this means special attention to practices. Those who aspire into pastoral life ought to be given immediate responsibilities in their local churches, such as leading the home cells, or new members' class, for morality is learned by taking on specified roles and carrying out the responsibilities tied to them.

NPCs in the townships are still lacking behind in terms of moral formation of young leaders, they are far behind churches such Rhema Bible Church in Randburg and Hatfield Christian Church in Pretoria East with their own leadership training programmes, the latter through the Hatfield Training Centre and the former through

the Rhema Bible Training Centre. The Hatfield Christian Centre's ministerial formation is relevant to this study because the church can be classified as a newer Pentecostal-Charismatic church, and as such like all Pentecostal-Charismatic churches they are rooted in oral tradition rather than literary culture, and such culture is shaped by stories (Hollenweger 1997:18) as I noted earlier.

The Hatfield Centre advocates for a 'holistic ministerial formation' as it is reflected by their 'heads-hands-hearts paradigm' of formation (Neuman 2012:137 – 138). Neuman explains that this process formation, "takes place within the context of community where it is also at its most effective. The process of formation ideally extends beyond the individual to influence every aspect of that individual's life and social context because it is by nature incarnational, i.e. formation takes place within the context of real life" (2012:138).

Youth who leave school are offered the "Year of your life" (YOYL) model, with intentional Christian ethos. Youth from different theological, denominational and cultural backgrounds are drawn to the Pentecostal-Charismatic environment, where they are prepared for life through regular study (heads), practice of servant-hood (hands) and communion with God through prayer and keeping a journal (hearts).

The entrance requirement to Ministry Training School (MTS) is the completion of the YOYL programme for everyone under the ages of 23. All candidates are interviewed by the faculty (Neuman 2012:140). All accepted ministerial students are deployed to existing church structures. Their involvement in these churches, and their involvement in small groups and regular mandatory student-faculty interviews provide the context for relational evaluation (Neumann 2012:140).

Factors that are considered during deployment are (1) a student's character and formation; (2) a student's unique giftedness (spiritual and natural giftedness); (3) a student's formative requirements (areas where candidates require further formation, e.g. pastoral or missional formation). The exposure of students to the communities, brings them closer to social issues. Such experience is priceless for the moral development of a pastoral candidate.

6.3.3 Moral community

The church plays a significant role in moral formation. In fact, some authors such as Schwartz (1999) and Root (1993) call the church a moral community. The church is the moral community that is where moral discussions takes place, because ethical issues are important to her. Also, the church does not only discuss ethical issues, it is a community of common ethical commitment. Choosing to belong to the church means conscious moral choices. Beyond just being a community of moral commitment, the church is the community of common ethical action (Root 1993:195 – 197).

Rasmussen (1995:184) comments that a particular ordering of any church is already both a creation and reflection of its way of life. A polity is already an ethic and is morally formative. How gifts are ordered and roles assigned and carried out is not so much the prelude to relationships with the world around, but already a way of being in it. Structures channel behaviour and, by doing so, form character and conduct. He further notes that morality is learned by taking on specified roles and carrying out the responsibilities tied to them.

The story of Joshua can give light to the importance of a moral community, or the church in moral formation. Numbers (27:18 – 23), records the final stage in Joshua's training for ministry. Downey (1981), calls this passage of scripture "Joshua's official ordination ceremony". It was presided over by Moses at the Lord's command. It is worth observing that: The Lord tells Moses to ordain Joshua because he is "a man in whom is the spirit". Beegle (1972:334) interprets the spirit as being the gift to lead rather than the Holy Spirit. Moses lays his hands upon Joshua and commissions him in the presence of all the people, including Eleazar, the priest.

This event may have been significant in Joshua's life as a leader, because it affirmed him. I noted earlier on the importance of affirmation regarding our identity, security and significance. Leaders who have gone through ordination are expected to behave with high moral standards, and it puts some level of responsibility on their shoulders. The ordination ceremony also proves the importance of polity in a church. The young ministers I encountered in SOWETO showed interest in ordination, and that it being

carried by their pastors in the presence of everyone. But because of strained relationships and lack of mentoring, they end up seeking organisations that would ordain them and by implication hold them accountable.

6.3.4 Moral education: incorporating ethics into spirituality

If the NPCs in particular and the Christian Church in general are to form moral leaders, they have to give specific instruction in the virtues and vices, values and obligation (Rasmussen 1995:185). A number of Christian education scholars, such as Elizabeth Moore (1983) are of the same view.

Moore (1983) says moral content in Christian education is unavoidable, because it is communicated through social structures, relationships, subject matter, and methodologies. “This is not a new idea” writes Moore (1983:177). She recognises the inevitable influence of moral content on public school education, and emphasises the influence of the minister’s moral perspective on his or her role in pastoral care.

The disjunction of ethics and spirituality is due to three common reasons (Burkhardt 2010). The loss of God as object of ethics is the first reason. For many, the object of theology is restricted to the inter-human sphere. Many writings or books leave no room for the discussion of how humanity has to behave towards God. However, through the justification of the sinner, God enables the believer to do what is good (Burkhardt 2010:46).

The loss of God as law giver is the second reason. God is not only excluded as an object of ethics, but also as a law giver who lets people know what they have to do. Where there is no knowledge of God, there also cannot be any real knowledge of the will of God. “Where there is no revelation of God’s will and therefore also no obedience to God’s will, there the spiritual dimension of ethics vanishes” (Burkhardt 2010:47). The loss of specific Christian ethics is the third. Burkhardt writes, “General ethics can be defined as ethics which has everyone, all natural human beings, as its subject. Within this discipline God principally can be the object of ethics but true Christian spirituality cannot really unfold in this context” (2010:47).

Failure to incorporate ethics in spirituality has had dire consequences at least on personal life, academic theology, church life and social life.

Academic theology: For many modern universities and seminaries, spirituality has seldom found its place in the formal courses taught in academic Protestant theological institutions. This is the result of, as observed by Kretzschmar, the Enlightenment, rationalism and modernism, where “spiritual theology and practices such as prayer, liturgy, worship, personal devotions and spiritual retreats were... regarded as improper subjects of the “academic” study of theology” (2005:65). This separation has led to a problem of decision makers who have no moral formation, where thinking is divorced to living.

The life of Blaise Pascal (1623-1662) shows that the study of theology cannot be pursued on the basis of reason alone. Pascal is known as a “classical” mathematician and inventor by trade, but a Christian apologist by choice (Foster 2001:352). At a younger age, he became acquainted with the intellectuals of his day; and he used his intellectual genius to support and defend a reform movement in the Catholic Church known as Jansenism.

Pascal recognised that reason alone was not enough because human beings are more than their intellectual capacities. He wrote “The heart has its reasons, which the reason does not know” (Dowley 1977:485). He is also quoted as having wrote “what a distance there is between knowing God and loving him” (Dowley 1977:485), showing that it is not only important to know God, but also to love him. For it is God who reveals Himself who reaches to us as human beings, and that cannot only be realised by reason but by faith. Pascal dedicated much of his life to serving the poor and wretched of his day. He died at the age of thirty nine.

Social life: The separation of spirituality and ethics has had dire consequences on social life too, where Christian faith becomes irrelevant to its context. “It becomes so heavenly minded that it is no earthly good” (Kretzschmar 2005:66). The privatisation of religion has two characteristics: First, it is dualistic; it seeks to divide reality into two separate spheres; the physical and the spiritual. Second, it is individualistic,

because it emphasises the experience and concerns of individual at the expense of the group, community or society (Kretzschmar 2004:52). It further “dilutes the meaning and it restricts the application of the gospel. Thus, central doctrines such as sin, salvation and mission are conceived of purely in terms of their personal and individual dimensions, rather than also being conceived of in terms of their social dimensions” (Kretzschmar 2004:52). As a result, the focus is on individuals and their sins only, neglecting social sins and struggles of people. “What individuals believe, their experience of God in prayer, the development of their moral character, and their involvement in a Christian community cannot be separated from their social existence” (Kretzschmar 2005:67).

William Seymour’s (1870 – 1922) journey testifies to the fact that spiritual experience cannot be separated from social justice in general or racial reconciliation in particular. “Seymour stood at the forefront of one of the most revolutionary social movements in history, movement intent upon “erasing the color line” (Foster 2001:113). Foster observes that the Azusa Street experience was a ‘supernatural work, a Spirit empowered work, a charismatic work’ (2001:118). He further highlights four factors which were behind the impact of the Azusa experience.

One was that Seymour understood the implications of glossolalia for interracial reconciliation and community, but connecting what was happening at Azusa Street with the Pentecostal experience of Acts where the results was reconciliation between nations and races and cultures (Foster 2001:118 – 119). Secondly, Seymour exercised an inclusive leadership of all persons irrespective of gender and/or colour (Foster 2001:119).

Thirdly, Seymour stressed genuine Christian love above all else, including glossolalia (Foster 2001:120). Lastly, Seymour’s holiness! On this Foster quotes Rev. Glenn Cook as saying “This man... really lived what we had been preaching for years, a sanctified life. It was the wonderful character of this man whom God had chosen that attracted the people to keep coming to this humble meeting” (2001:121). This Christianity was relevant to the issues of the day, and it surely spoke to the

deep needs of many. More than anything, Seymour's interpretation of Acts 2 was directly linked and influenced by his daily social realities.

Church life: Every church leader's goal is to make disciples for the Lord Jesus Christ. That entails moral and spiritual formation. Therefore, it will therefore be impossible for a leader who is not himself or herself a disciple to lead that transformation. Such leaders are happy to see converts who are not disciples, and in most cases leaders in these churches tend to focus on maintenance of the church's status quo rather than on living according to the kingdom values. According to Kretzschmar, "Such churches become self-defensive, safe, cultural 'holy clubs' rather than engaging in demanding, loving and risky ministry. The church becomes a social club, promoting 'get togethers' where members talk only to each other, not caring for strangers, sinners or those in need" (2005:66).

Martin Luther (1483-1546), led the Reformation against a comfortably corrupt church. Luther was ordained in 1507, and after observing that Catholic Church leaders were not being real disciples of the Christ, and they were leading the Church astray, living in luxury and often corrupt. Luther developed a reformed theology and continued to work for the moral and spiritual renewal of the German people. He opposed the practice of indulgences, where people paid for the forgiveness of sins. That led to his most prominent contribution to Christian faith, which is 'justification by faith'.

"Luther's teaching and personal experiences are closely connected. He always proceeds in the same way: from scripture to personal conviction to declaring and preaching" (Dowley 1977:363). Luther's moral standing did not allow him to stand and watch as the Church became complacent. After studying theology "he was sent by his order to the University of Wittenberg to teach moral theology and the bible" (Dowley 1977:362). Luther's teaching of morals could have played a role in the Reformation.

Personal life: The separation of Christian ethics and spirituality has led to many believers struggling to live lives of integrity, a life inconsistent with claims of being

Christian. There is a lot of hypocrisy, where one lives a life totally different from what one preaches. This hypocrisy comes as a result of spiritual bankruptcy and in most cases leaders refuse to seek help. Serving people is demanding; therefore, a leader needs to spend more time in prayer and retreat.

One of the priests who valued prayer is Seraphim of Sarov (1759 – 1833). “Seraphim of Sarov is a shining example of how a life of prayer can transform the human personality, enabling such a person to minister and care for many thousands of people” (Kretzschmar 2005:99). For Seraphim of Sarov ministry is the results of prayer, and it does not replace prayer and the power that comes from the Holy Spirit. “At the core of Seraphim’s teachings was the conviction that a Christian should aim at nothing other than the acquisition of the Holy Spirit” (Mursell 2001:162).

6.4 Recommendations

The research study produced findings that are valuable in enhancing the development of leadership in the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches. Therefore, it is recommended that senior ministers make it their responsibility to develop young leaders. Leadership is about making leaders, more than it is about making followers. Furthermore senior ministers attend courses on “mentorship”, so that they know what it takes to mentor young people. It should be the senior pastors who pursue caring and trusting relationships with young people. Chaddock and McMinn (1999) are of the opinion that shared values and trusting relationship are prerequisites to collaboration.

Secondly, young people must be encouraged to study theology, for faith cannot be separated from the intellect. It is not enough for young pastors in the NPCs to gain understanding in other disciplines and not take their theological training seriously. That has a potential of making these young preachers dependent on televangelists and already cooked sermons they get from tapes. Learning to dig truth for themselves can be of benefit, not only in their Churches but also the communities they are leading in. Apostle Paul shows that the redemption of intellect as an essential part needed by human beings. “Romans 12:2 indicates that the change of mind causes transformation, prevents conformity to worldly life and allows discerning

what the good and perfect will of God is” (Mwambazambi and Banza 2014:4). If Pentecostal-Charismatic churches cannot begin and run their own credible institutions of learning, it is recommended that they form coalitions with like-minded institutions of higher learning.

Moreover, young people are easily motivated when they see that the church utilises its resources in their development. Therefore, there must be educational bursaries from the church, designed specifically for theological students.

Last, it is recommended that Pentecostal-Charismatic churches encourage young people to be involved in the struggle for social justice in their communities. More especially in the age where most political parties, such as the Democratic Alliance and the Freedom Fighters are led by other young people. Foster (2001:172 – 176) suggests that we can be involved in three areas, the first and the most important is in the personal arena. We cannot work for justice and live injustice; we cannot work for peace and live war. So we stand against all forms of pride, envy, anger, sloth, greed, gluttony, and lust within ourselves (Foster 2001:172). Young leaders are to be taught not only to exegete the bible, but to also exegete their communities as social activists.

6.5 Directions for future research

The newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches are a growing phenomenon in black townships, attracting young men and women. This study has certainly laid a foundation by providing useful information regarding the Pentecostal-Charismatic formation of young people into credible leaders. Additional research is of necessity particularly in understanding issues of female leadership. The researcher found a gap in this regard.

Also, additional research is necessary in the area of social and economic justice. Traditionally, much of the church’s activity in the economic sphere has been on a charitable and welfare basis – supporting those economically depressed. However, one recognises that the churches’ charity work is essentially dealing with symptoms, the manifestations, the fruits, rather than the roots of the economic disorder, or that

which systemically sustains the effect of root cause, ensuring the fruit that we have to address through charity. What is the newer Pentecostal-charismatic churches stance in relation to the current government? The South African Council of Churches calls for a “critical solidarity or collaboration”¹, however some people are calling for an opposition stance as it happened with Apartheid. Research is needed in this regard.

6.6 Conclusion

The aim of this study was to conduct a comprehensive investigation into moral formation of leaders in the newer Pentecostal-Charismatic churches. A small empirical study was done in these churches in Soweto, South of Johannesburg, using a qualitative approach (exploratory-descriptive phenomenology). One sought to explore how NPC's leadership is impacted by spiritual formation, healthy relationships, and education.

The research has answered the questions raised by the original research problem or stated purpose of the study and state the conclusions reached. Conclusions arrived at are based on the study's findings. The main conclusions/findings as justified by the data of the study are that:

- There is no specific and purpose driven way of grooming and developing leaders within most of the Charismatic and Pentecostal churches.
- Moral formation is not being intentionally pursued. This has been found to have a direct impact on the manner in which young ministers in NPC generally behave and do their work.
- Young ministers venture into the world of church ministry raw, without any guidance and/or theological/pastoral education/training nor any intention to pursue it later in life.

¹ A Discussion Paper from the SACC to the ANC March 23, 2015

- Theological training is generally seen as irrelevant, and therefore a general trend is that qualifications held by the ministers and those pursued later in life are almost all in other fields other than theology.

The study has managed to identify what might be the main cause for all problems experienced with the pastors in question. Lack of guidance by senior pastors and formal theological training in general appear to be the main culprits.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Anderson, A. 1992. *Bazalwane: African Pentecostals in South Africa*. Pretoria: Unisa Press.

Anderson, A. 2000. *Zion and Pentecost*. Pretoria. UNISA Press.

Anderson, A.H. 2002. The Newer Pentecostal and Charismatic Churches: The shape of Future Christianity in Africa? *The journal of the society for Pentecostal studies*. Volume 24 No 2. Fall, 167-184.

Balcomb, A. O. 2005. *Nicholas Bhengu: the impact of an African Pentecostal on South African society*. Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, pp 337-348.

Banks, R. & Ledbetter B. M. 2004. *Reviewing Leadership: a Christian evaluation of current approaches*. Grand Rapids, Michigan. Baker Academic.

Beegle, D. M. 1972. *Moses, the servant of Yahweh*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans Publishing Company.

Bentley, W. 2010. 'The Formation of Christian Leaders: a Wesleyan approach' in *Koers*, Kretzschmar & Kessler Editors. Vol. 75 no 3. Pages 551-566.

Best, F. T & Robra, M. 1977. *Ecclesiology and Ethics: Ecumenical ethical engagement, moral formation and the nature of the church*. Geneva: WCC Publications.

Brown, M. B. & Annis, L. 1978. Moral development level and religious behavior. *Psychological Reports*, 43:1230.

Bless, C. & Higson-Smith, C. 1995. *Fundamentals of social reserch methods: an African perspective*. Cape Town: Juta.

Burkhardt, H. 2010. Spirituality and Ethics. *European Journal of Theology*, 19:1, 45-49.

Burgess, S. M. & McGee, G. B. 1988. Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements. USA: Regency Zondervan.

Burnard, P. 1991. A method of analysing interview transcripts in qualitative research. *Nurse Education Today* 11, 461-466.

Chaddock, T. P. & McMinn, M. R. 1999. Values affecting collaboration among psychologists and evangelical clergy. *Journal of Psychology and Theology*, 27:319-328.

Chenitz, W. C. & Swanson, J. M. 1986. From Practice to Grounded Theory: qualitative research in nursing. California: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.

Chernick, I. 2015 August 21. Religious Abuse Probe, *The Star*, Front Page.

Chikane, F. 1988. No life of my own. Braamfontein: Skotaville.

Clouse, B. 1985. Moral reasoning and Christian faith. *Journal of psychology and theology*, 13(3):190-198.

Coffey, I. 2005. Foreword. In *Leadership Next*, Gibbs, E., p 7-8. England: Inter-Varsity Press.

Corbin, J. & Strauss, A. 1990. Grounded Theory Research: Procedures, Canons and Evaluative Criteria. *Qualitative Sociology*, 13(1): 3-21.

Daft, R. L. Leadership 5th ed. South-Western, Cengage Learning.

De Gruchy, J. W. 2005. The Church Struggle in South Africa 25th Edition. Minneapolis. Fortress Press.

- Dey, I. 1993. *Qualitative data analysis: a user friendly guide*. London: Routledge.
- Dubb, A.A. 1976. *Community of the saved: An African revivalist church in the Eastern Cape*. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.
- Dowley, T. 1977. *Eerdman's handbook to the history of Christianity*. Berkhamsted: Lion.
- Downey, R. J. 1981. *Old Testament Patterns of Leadership training: Prophets, Priests and Kings*. Pasadena, SWM. MTh in Missiology.
- Dungy, T. 2010. *The Mentor Leader*. Florida: Tyndale.
- Ehianu, W.E. 2014. Growth of Pentecostal Churches in Nigeria: Lessons for World Evangelization. *ERT*, 38:1, 70-80.
- Fernando, A. 2002. *Jesus driven Ministry*. Wheaton, Illinois. Crossway Books.
- Foster, J. R. 2001. *Streams of living water*. New York: Harper One.
- Foster, J. 2009. *Celebration of Discipline*. New York: Harper Collins, 2009
- Freiré, P. 1970. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Hammondsworth: UK Penguin
- Garnett, M. 1980. 'Take your glory Lord', William Duma: his life story. Roodepoort: Baptist House.
- Gerlach, L. P. & Hine, V. H. 1968. Five factors crucial to the growth and spread of a modern religious movement . *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 7(1): 23-40.
- Gilbert, N. (ed). 1993. *Researching social life*. London: Sage.

Gilligan, C. 2004. Recovering Psyche: Reflections on Life-History and History. Annual of Psychoanalysis: Psychoanalysis and Women. Hillsdale, N.J., *The Analytic Press*, 32:131-149.

Glaser, B. G. & Strauss, A. L. 1967. The discovery of grounded theory. Chicago: Aldine.

Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1981). Effective evaluation: Improving the usefulness of evaluation results through responsive and naturalistic approaches. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Guba, E. G. & Lincoln, Y. 1989. Fourth generation evaluation. London: Sage

Gooch, J.O. 2006. John Wesley for the 21st century. Nashville: Upper Room Ministries.

Grobbelaar, M. M. 2000. Research in the social sciences: Only study guide for RSC201-H. Pretoria: UNISA.

Gundani, L.J., Masenya, M., Maluleke, T. & Phiri, I. 2002. The state of theological education in Southern Africa: issues and concerns. *Ministerial Formation*, July/October, 66-73.

Hocken, P. 1981. The Pentecostal-Charismatic Movement as a revival. *Pneuma, The Journal for Pentecostal studies*, Spring, pp 31-47.

Hollenweger, W.J. 1997. Pentecostalism: origins and development worldwide. Peabody: Hendrickson.

Hughes, G. 1985. God of surprises. London: Darton, Longman & Todd.

<http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/kwazulu-natal/flock-okay-with-naked-pastor-s-video-1.1807904#.VTDUmHkcSRI> [Accessed 16 April 2015]

<http://www.iol.co.za/the-star/when-pastors-act-like-snakes-1888150> [Accessed 16 April 2015]

<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2794275/first-congregation-eating-grass-make-close-god-controversial-south-african-preacher-makes-flock-drink-petrol.html> [Accessed 16 April 2015]

<http://www.sowetanlive.co.za/entertainment/2015/01/23/gospel-star-in-marriage-blues---muso-denies-taking-a-third-wife> [Accessed 04 May 2015]

<http://www.sowetanlive.co.za/goodlife/2012/01/10/when-pastors-divorce> [Accessed 04 May 2015]

Johnson, S. 1989. Christian spiritual formation in the church and classroom. Nashville: Abingdon.

Khathide A. G. 2002. Mission in Pentecostalism. *Missionalia* 30:3. November, 339-359

Kumalo, S. R. 2014. Christianity and Political Engagement in Post-Apartheid South Africa, *Political Theology*, 15(3):220-230

Kohlberg, L. 1981. The Philosophy of Moral Development: Moral Stages and the Idea of Justice (Essays on Moral Development, Volume 1). New York: Harper & Row

Kohlberg, L. 1981. The philosophy of moral development: Moral stages and the idea of justice. San Francisco: Harper & Row.

Kohlberg, L. 1987. Child psychology and childhood education: A cognitive-developmental view. New York: Longman

Kohlberg, L. & Turiel, E. 1971. Moral development and moral education. In *Psychology and educational practice*, G. Lesser (ed). Scott Foresman.

Kohlberg, L. 1973. The claim to moral adequacy of a highest stage of moral judgment. *Journal of Philosophy*, 70, 630–646.

Kohlberg, L. & Ryncarz, R. A. 1990. "Beyond justice reasoning: moral development and consideration of a seventh stage". In *Higher Stages of human development*, Alexander, C.N. & Langer, E. J. (eds.), pp 191-207. New York: Oxford University Press.

Kretzschmar, L. 1997. The gap between belief and action: why is it that Christians do not practice what they preach? *Scriptura* 62:311-321.

Kretzschmar, L. 2006. The indispensability of spiritual formation for Christian leaders *Missionalia*, 34(2/3): 338-361.

Kretzschmar, L. 2007. The formation of moral leaders in South Africa: A Christian-ethical analysis of some essential elements. *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 128, 18-36.

Kretzschmar, L. 2015. 'The education of prospective ministers as an invitation to life: moving from moral failure to moral excellence through a process of moral formation', *In die Skriflig* 49(1).

Kretzschmar, L; Bentley, W; and van Niekerk, A (eds). 2009. What is a good life? An introduction to Christian Ethics in 21st century Africa. Kempton Park: AcadSA.

Lamoureux, P., 1999, 'An integrated approach to theological education', *Theological Education* 36(1), 141–156.

Lapoorta, J.J. 1996. Unity or division? The unity struggles of the Black churches within the Apostolic Faith Mission of South Africa. Cape Town: Japie Jimmy Lapoorta

Leech, K. 1980. True prayer: an introduction to Christian Spirituality. London: Sheldon

Mabitsela, L. 2003. Exploratory study of psychological distress as understood by Pentecostal pastors. PhD: University of Pretoria

MacQuarrie, J. (ed) 1967. Dictionary of Christian ethics. London: SCM

Makhanya, G. 1990. History of the Baptists Convention of Southern Africa. In The Barkly West National Awareness Workshop, Hoffmeister, D. & Gurney, B. Eds. Johannesburg: BCSA. 33-42.

Matshiga, D. J. 2001. Christian Education in the Baptist Convention of South Africa with special reference to churches in the Transvaal: A practical theological investigation. PhD: University of Pretoria.

Melia, K. M. 1982. 'Tell it as it is'—qualitative methodology and nursing research: understanding the student nurse's world. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 7 (4): 327–335.

Meyer, W., Moore, C. & Viljoen, H. 2003. Personology: from individual to ecosystem, 3rd Edition. Sandown: Heinemann Publishers (Pty) Ltd

Millard, J. A. 1999. Malihambe- let the Word spread. Pretoria: Unisa Press

Mofokeng, K. 2012. "African Spiritual churches and theological training", in *Between the real and the ideal: Ministerial formation in South African churches*, Naidoo (ed), 146-153. Pretoria: Unisa.

Moore, M. E. 1983. 'Questioning Assumptions: God, Goodness, and Human Nature', in *Moral Development Foundations: Judeo-Christian Alternatives to Piaget/Kohlberg*. Edited by Joy, D.M. Tennessee: Abingdon Press, pp 163-182.

- Mursell, G. 2001. *The story of Christian Spirituality*. Oxford: Lion Publishing.
- Mwambazambi, K. & Banza, A. K., 2014. 'Four-dimensional conversion for spiritual leadership development: A missiological approach for African Churches', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 70(3).
- Naidoo, M. 2012. 'Spiritual formation at the Baptist Convention College of South Africa: A qualitative Study' in *The South African Baptist Journal of Theology*, vol. 21, ages 159-171.
- Neuman, W. L. 1997. *Social research methods: qualitative and quantitative approaches*. 3rd edition. Boston, Mass: Allyn & Bacon.
- Neumann, M. 2012. Ministerial formation in the charismatic context: heads, hearts and hands. In *Between the Real and the Ideal: Ministerial Formation in South African Churches*, Naidoo, M. editor. Pretoria: University of South Africa. 133-145.
- Nkurunziza, C. 2013. Pentecostal Spirituality: A Disregarded cornerstone for the contextualisation of African theologies? *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 145:59-74.
- Oates, W. E. 1987. The Marks of a Christian Leader. *Southwestern Journal of Theology*, 29: 2, 19-22.
- O'Connell, B. 1998. *Solution-Focused Therapy*. London: Sage Publications
- O'Gorman, T.P. 1979. An investigation of moral judgement and religious knowledge scores of catholic high school boys from Catholic and public schools. (Doctoral dissertation, Boston College) *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 40:1365A.
- O'Leary, Z. 2010. *The essential guide to doing your research project*. London: SAGE

Oliver, E. 2013. Teaching Open Distance Learning undergraduates in Theology to become effective change agents. *Verbum et Ecclesia*, 34 (1): 1-7.

Onyinah, O. 2007. African Christianity in the twenty-first century. *Word and World*, 27: 3.

Piaget, J. 1932. *The moral judgement of the child*. London: Paul, Trench, Trubner & Co.

Piantanida, M. & Garman, B. N. 2009. *The qualitative dissertation: a guide for students and faculty*, 2nd edition. California: Corwin.

Pomerville, P. 1985. *The third force in mission: A Pentecostal contribution to contemporary mission theology*. Peabody: Hendrickson Publishers.

Pohlmann, M. H. 2012. 'Spiritual Formation in the light of the Pentecost event (Acts 2:1-4)' in *The South African Baptist Journal of Theology*, Harold G. & Rinquest L. Editors. Vol 21, pages 188-207.

Puttergill, C. 2000. *Strategies of Discovery*. In: Collins, K.J. 2000. *Research in the Social Sciences*. Study guide for RSC201-H. South Africa. UNISA

Rasmussen, L. 1995. Moral Community and Moral Formation. *Ecumenical Review*, Vol. 47, p181-187.

Ratcliff, D. 2008. Qualitative data analysis and the transforming moment. *Transformation*, 25 (July): 116-133

Richardson, N., 2007. 'Ministerial training and theological education in the Methodist Church of South Africa: The road ahead', *Missionalia* 35(2), 131–152.

Rinquest, L. 2012. "Ministerial formation in the Baptist tradition". In *Between the real and the ideal: ministerial formation in South African churches*, Naidoo (ed), 63-74. Pretoria:Unisa.

Root, M. 1994. The unity of the church as a moral community. *The Ecumenical Review*, 46 (2):194-203.

Schwartz, W. 1999. Church and Ethical Orientation. *Ecumenical Review*, Vol. 51 Issue 3, p256-265.

Sepulveda, J. 1989. "Pentecostalism as popular religiosity", in *International Review of Mission* Vol 78 (No. 309):80-88

Shafranske, E.P. (Ed.) (1996). *Religion and the clinical practice of psychology*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.

Snarey, J. 1995. In a communitarian voice: The sociological expansion of Kohlberg's theory, research and practice. In *Moral Development: An introduction*, Kurtinez, W. & Gewirtz, J. (eds.), pp 109-133. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Smith, G. T. 1999. *Courage and Calling*. Downers Grove, Illinois. IVP Books.

Soeldner, T. 1989. Charismatic Churches and the struggle against apartheid: a dispute. *The Christian Century*, January, pp 4-11.

Spohn, C.W. 2004. "Conscience and Moral development". In *Conscience*, Curran C.E. Editor. New York: Paulist Press, 130-150.

Stephenson, C.A. 2013. *Types of Pentecostal theology: method, system, spirit*. Oxford University Press: Oxford.

Steschke, C. W. 2010. When the second man takes the lead: reflections on Joseph Barnabas and Paul of Tarsus and their relationship in the New Testament. In Koers, Kretzschmar, L. & Kessler, V. eds. 75(3):503-525.

Stoop, D. A. 1980. The relation between religious education and the process of maturity through the developmental stages of moral judgments. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 40:3912A.

Susana, L. & De Petrella, V. 1986. The tension between evangelism and social action in the Pentecostal movement. *International Review of Mission*, 75(297): 34-38.

Sweet, L. 2004. *Summoned to lead*. Grand Rapids, Michigan. Zondervan.

Tenelshof, J. 1999. Encouraging the character formation of future Christian leaders. *JETS*, 42(1): 77–90.

Trochim, W. M. K. 2001. *Research methods knowledge base* (2nd ed.). Cincinnati: Atomic Dog Publishing.

Van der Ven, J. A. 1998. *Formation of the moral self*. Grand Rapids, Cambridge: Eerdmans.

Van niekerk, A. 1998. 'Morality and life' in *Questions about life and morality: Christian Ethics in South Africa Today*. Kretzschmar L. & Hulley, L. (eds). Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers. pp13-20.

Van niekerk, A. 2009. 'How good people are formed? In conversation with A. van der Ven', In *What is a good life?* Edited by Kretzschmar, Bentley&van Niekerk. Kempton Park: AcadSA publishing: 101-127.

Vest, N. 2000. *Desiring Life: Benedict on wisdom and the good life*. Boston: Cowley.

Vitz, P. 1983. The Kohlberg phenomenon. *Pastoral Renewal*, 7:63-68.

Walsh, V.M. 1974. A key to Charismatic Renewal in the Catholic Church Holland: Key of David Publications.

Watt, P. & Saayman, W. 2003. South African Pentecostal in Context: Symptoms of a crisis. *Missionalia*, 31(2): 318-333.

Watson, D.L. 1991. Forming Christian disciples: the role of covenant discipleship and class leaders in the congregation. London: Epworth.

Warrington, K. 2008. Pentecostal Theology: A theology of encounter. New York: Continuum.

Williams, D. 2006. Samuel's call and Christian "Prophetic Calling" today, in *The South African Baptist Journal of Theology*. Miller G.G., Rinquest L. Eds. Cape Town. Baptist Union of South Africa.

Winseman, A. L. 2009. Growing an Engaged Church. Washington, DC. Gallup Press.

Wolterstorff, N. 1980. Educating for responsible action. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

Appendix

Interview Questions

Age 25-30 31-35 36-40 41-45

Gender Male Female

Educational level Matric-Diploma Degree-Honors Masters-Doctorate

Church Name _____

The conversion of the heart

- Tell me about yourself... (Family background, siblings' etc.)
- Tell me everything you can remember about your "born again" event?
- What was the next step after this event, in terms of your spiritual journey?
- For you what does it mean to be a Christian or what are the most important principles of being a Christian?
- Share about your "calling" into pastoral ministry?
- In your Church what journey does one take to be a pastor?
- In your understanding what qualifies one to be a leader or pastor?
- What would be the most important principles about the personal life of a pastor?

The conversion of the head

- Are you the main pastor or assistant pastor in your Church?
- What help did you receive from your Church or pastor in advancing your pastoral calling?
- Did you attend a theological institution? Elaborate on your answer:
- Do you think it is importation for one to attend a theological school/ Bible school in order to be a pastor?
- Tell me about your private and communal study, prayer and reflection?
- What kind of books do you read?
- How do you stay cutting edge?
- Where do your sermon ideas come from?

The conversion of the will

- What do you think is your role as a leader in this Church?
- What is the most difficult thing about being a pastor?
- What is the most difficult decision you've ever had to make?
- What is expected of a Pastor in terms of morality and behavior in your Church?
- Have you ever had a moral failure? (you don't have to disclose it)
- How was it handled or how did you handle it? (E.g. shared with mentor, just prayed about it, talked to friend or spouse or shared with the Church leadership?)

The Conversion of Relationships

- Are you married, for how long? How important is your spouse in your ministry? And what role do they play?
- Which Church leaders or role models do you respect? Do you have a particular role model?
- How do you solicit feedback from others on your work?
- How do others define your leadership style?
- What is your leadership style? Is your style fruitful in your ministry?
 - o Do you emphasise authority;
 - o Are you participative (group centered);
 - o Permissive (Free reign)?

The conversion of the hands

- How much do you know about this community?
- Tell me about your involvement in the community?
- How have you specifically helped or been involved in voluntary work in this community?
- How do you enlist the help of others in your work in general?
- Is there anything else you would like to say about Church leadership and moral formation?